237R
B856

THE GENERAL THEOLOGICAL
SEMINARY LIBRARY
CHELSEA SQUARE, NEW YORK II, N. Y.

Society for Promoting Religion
and Learning

ing to the original teaching, uncontaminated by the Romish doctrine that the Pope and his priests can reduce the period of detention in purgatory, and can obtain entrance for a spirit into Heaven before the Last Day.

83, IVERNA COURT,
HIGH STREET, KENSINGTON,
May 1, 1907.

PREFACE TO FIRST EDITION

WHEN I retired, in 1902, after more than thirty years service in Burma, I learnt that the truth of the Life after Death was one of the absorbing topics of the day.

I had never before had the leisure or opportunity to study the subject, and I soon found that no single book gave me the full information which I wanted on the point. I therefore undertook a course of study, and I think others besides myself may be interested in the result.

This explanation will account for the fact that my book is little more than a compilation, and I only claim to have dealt clearly and concisely with the different subjects, and to have made each chapter complete in itself, even at the risk of repetition.

I have to thank the authorities who have given me permission to quote so largely from their works.

The plan of the book has been to show that the belief in an Intermediate State, which was held by the Jews at the time of the birth of Jesus, was upheld and sanctioned by Him, and it was taught by the Apostles, and the early Fathers, and the Undivided Catholic Church, and it has always been taught by the Church of Rome, but with accretions. John Wycliffe, in 1380, broke the continuity of the teaching in the Anglican Church by the mistakes he made in his translation of the Bible, and it is only now that the Church is return-

PREFACE TO SECOND EDITION

In this edition, the Introduction and Conclusion have been altered, and while in the former has been placed all that has been written about pre-Adamite Man and his worship of the serpent, in the latter will be found all the teaching about the Tripartite nature of man and the Natural or Conditional Immortality of the soul.

Chapters IX. and X. have been rearranged, and the full text of the passages from the Apocalypse (which filled twelve pages in the first edition) has been omitted.

A new Chapter XI. has been added, containing a study of the way in which the idea of everlasting "torments" in "hell" originated, together with a refutation of the monstrous doctrine.

Ashton Lodge,
Long Ashton, Bristol.
November 1, 1910.

237 K
B856

64433

WASHINGTON D.C.
PUBLIC
LIBRARY

THE AFTER LIFE

A HELP TO A REASONABLE BELIEF IN THE PROBATION LIFE TO COME

BY

HENRY BUCKLE

OF THE BURMA COMMISSION (RETIRED)

SECOND EDITION

CONSIDERABLY REVISED, AND WITH THE ADDITION OF AN ENTIRELY NEW CHAPTER ON "EVERLASTING PUNISHMENT"

CANTICLE SEMINARY
LIBRARY
NEW YORK

LONDON
ELLIOT STOCK, 62, PATERNOSTER ROW, E.C.
MCMXI

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

PAGE

I. PRE-ADAMITE MAN - - - - - - - 3

II. SERPENT WORSHIP - - - - - - - 11

CHAPTER I

I. THE HEBREW IDEA ABOUT SHEOL - - - - 19

II. THE LOCALITY OF "SHEOL," OR "HADES" - - 22

CHAPTER II

I. THE TEACHING OF JESUS ABOUT HADES - - - 27

II. ALL SPIRITS REMAIN IN THE INTERMEDIATE STATE UNTIL THE SECOND ADVENT OF JESUS, OR THE RESURRECTION ON THE LAST DAY - - - 56

CHAPTER III

I. THE TEACHING OF THE APOSTLES AND ST. LUKE ABOUT HADES - - - - - - - - 63

II. ALL SPIRITS REMAIN IN THE INTERMEDIATE STATE UNTIL THE SECOND ADVENT OF JESUS, OR THE RESURRECTION ON THE LAST DAY - - - 79

CHAPTER IV

THE TEACHING OF THE EARLY FATHERS - - 91

CHAPTER V

PAGE

INNOVATIONS INTRODUCED BY THE CHURCH OF ROME - - - - - - - - - - 99

THE GREAT SCHISM IN THE TWELFTH CENTURY - - 99

THE SECOND SCHISM IN THE SIXTEENTH CENTURY - 100

CHAPTER VI

SOME OF THE MISTAKES AND DIFFICULTIES IN THE LANGUAGE OF THE AUTHORIZED VERSION OF THE NEW TESTAMENT - - - - - - - 107

CHAPTER VII

THE PRESENT DOCTRINE OF THE CHURCH OF ROME 137

CHAPTER VIII

I. THE TEACHING OF THE ANGLICAN CHURCH - - 143

II. SHEOL, HADES, TARTARUS, PARADISE - - - 145

III. HADES IS DIVIDED INTO MANY SPHERES, BOTH FOR THE RIGHTEOUS AND THE WICKED - - - 161

IV. IN THE INTERMEDIATE STATE SPIRITS REMAIN CONSCIOUS, RETAIN THE MEMORY OF THE LIFE ON EARTH, AND ARE SENSIBLE TO PAIN AND PLEASURE 163

V. IN THE INTERMEDIATE STATE THE SINNER, WHO IS WILLING TO BE SAVED, IS GIVEN EVERY OPPORTUNITY OF BECOMING PURIFIED, AND GRADUALLY MADE PERFECT - - - - - - - 166

VI. THERE IS PREACHING AFTER DEATH IN HADES—THE HEATHEN - - - - - - - - - 178

VII. EVERY SPIRIT HAS TO REMAIN IN THE INTERMEDIATE STATE UNTIL THE SECOND ADVENT OF JESUS, OR THE RESURRECTION ON THE LAST DAY, BUT THE CONDITION OF THE FAITHFUL, AND OF ALL THE SAINTS, IS ONE OF PEACE AND HAPPINESS - - 189

CHAPTER IX

THE JUDGMENT ON THE LAST DAY - - - 197

CHAPTER X

PAGE

I. HEAVEN - - - - - - - - - - 217

II. GOD THE FATHER - - - - - - - - 222

CHAPTER XI

A REFUTATION OF THE DOCTRINE THAT SINNERS WILL LIVE FOR EVER AND EVER, AND SUFFER NEVER-ENDING TORMENTS IN WHAT IS CALLED "HELL" - - - - - - - - - 225

THE DOCTRINE - - - - - - - - 225

I. TEACHING OF SOME EARLY FATHERS - - - 225

II. TEACHING OF SOME LATER PREACHERS - - - 229

III. TEACHING OF THE CHURCH IN ROME - - - 237

IN ENGLAND - - - - - - - - 241

ON THE CONTINENT - - - - - - - 257

IV. POPULAR IDEA OF HELL - - - - - - 259

V. RESULT OF THESE VIEWS - - - - - 264

VI. THE REFUTATION - - - - - - - 270

VII. THE OLD TESTAMENT - - - - - - 273

VIII. THE TEACHING OF JESUS - - - - - 277

IX. THE TEACHING OF THE APOSTLES - - - - 279

X. ETERNAL DAMNATION IS NOT NOW CONSTANTLY PREACHED - - - - - - - - - 282

CHAPTER XII

CONCLUSION - - - - - - - - 295

THE TRIPARTITE NATURE OF MAN - - - - 300

THE NATURAL OR CONDITIONAL IMMORTALITY OF THE SOUL - - - - - - - - - 306

APPENDIX

AUTHORS QUOTED: THE TITLES OF THEIR WORKS AND DATES OF PUBLICATION, WITH THE PUBLISHERS' NAMES - - - - - - - 323

INTRODUCTION

PRE-ADAMITE MAN

THE AFTER LIFE

INTRODUCTION

Pre-Adamite Man

N the seventeenth century, Bishop Usher,[1] calculating rom the chronology of the Bible, fixed the date of ne creation of the earth as 4004 B.C., but this has ow been universally repudiated. Antiquity of man.

Writing in 1863, Sir Charles Lyell said: "Since the ommencement of the present century, the occasional ccurrence, in various parts of Europe, of the bones f man or the works of his hands, in cave breccias and alactites, associated with the remains of the extinct yæna, bear, elephant, or rhinoceros, has given rise o a suspicion that the date of Man must be carried ack further than we had heretofore imagined. . . . f late years we have obtained convincing proofs that ne mammoth and many other extinct mammalian pecies, very common in caves, occur also in undis-urbed alluvium, embedded in such a manner with orks of art, as to leave no room for doubt that man nd the mammoth co-existed."[2]

Human civilization in Europe has passed through our distinct stages, which have been named as follows:

1. The Stone Age, which is divided into the alaeolithic, or rough-hewn stone age, and the Neo-thic, or polished stone age.

2. The Copper Age.

[1] "Annales Veteris et Novi Testamenti," published 1650-54; "Chronologia Sacra," Oxford, 1660.

[2] "Antiquity of Man," by Sir C. Lyell, 1863, pp. 1, 2. (John urray.)

3. The Bronze Age.
4. The Iron Age.

The evidence of the antiquity of man is generally arranged under the following heads :[1]

1. Flints worked into stone implements.
2. The Bone Caves.
3. The Peat Mosses.
4. The Kitchen-middens.
5. The Lake dwellings, and
6. The Nuraghi of Sardinia.

Many attempts have been made to estimate from the above the date of the first appearance of man in Europe, but the only result is the saying, " God is eternal, but man is indeed old."

The Higher Criticism of the Old Testament.

Before proceeding to draw conclusions from the account of the Creation found in Genesis, I must protest against the Higher Criticism of the Old Testament,[2] which has affirmed that the first of the two Creation narratives corresponds closely to the great Assyrian Epic of Creation, of which a copy was found among the ruins of Nineveh. The second resembles the more ancient narrative which comes to us from the Accadians, written perhaps 2,000 years before Abraham left Ur of the Chaldees. The great antiquity of the two Babylonian poems makes it certain that they were earlier than Genesis.

Dr. Driver,[3] Canon of Christ Church, Oxford, has gone much deeper into these questions than was possible in a school text book, but the result is the same.

The two German writers, Wellhausen[4] and Kuenen,[5]

[1] " Man before Metals," by Joly, 1883. (Kegan Paul, Trench.)

[2] " Lessons from the Old Testament : Senior Course," by Rev. M. G. Glazebrook, late head-master of Clifton College.

[3] " Commentary on the Book of Genesis," by Dr. S. R. Driver, 1904. (Methuen.)

[4] " Sketch of the History of Israel and Judah," by Professor Wellhausen, third edition, 1891. (Adam and Charles Black, London.)

[5] " Religion of Israel," by Dr. Kuenen, translated from the Dutch by A. H. May, 1873 (Theological Translation Fund), quoted in New ' Biblical Guide,' by Rev. John Urquhart, 1899. (S. W. Partridge and Co.)

have, I believe, gone beyond any English critics, and they assert that there is nothing to be relied on in the History of Israel before 800 B.C., when Hosea and Amos wrote, and they protest that all the history contained in the books named after Moses and Joshua is incredible.

Dr. Kuenen[1] said there has been no revelation from God, and there is no difference between the origin of the religion of Israel and any of the other religions of the world.[2]

In denying that Moses wrote the Pentateuch, the later critics have gone astray from the teaching of Jean Astruc and Professor Eichhorn of Göttingen, the Father of their so-called science, in the same way that Darwin's disciples have exceeded his teaching.

Darwin.

It is a common saying now that Darwin *proved* the descent of human beings from monkeys, whereas, in writing to George Bentham, on May 22, 1863, Darwin said : " The belief in natural selection must at present be grounded entirely on general considerations. When we descend to details we *cannot prove* that a single species has changed."[3]

Truth of the Bible record.

I do not consider that the critics are warranted in holding that the Hebrew accounts of the Creation, the Fall, and the Flood, are founded on earlier Assyrian, Babylonian, and Chaldean narratives, and I think it more probable that the true accounts were handed down by tradition in Abraham's branch of the human family, and that distorted accounts were adopted by the races mentioned.

The researches of Dr. Glaser[4] in Arabia have brought to light an ancient civilization, whose monuments seem

[1] " Religion of Israel," by Dr. Kuenen, translated from the Dutch by A. H. May, 1873 (Theological Translation Fund), quoted in ' New Biblical Guide,' by Rev. John Urquhart, 1899. (S. W. Partridge and Co.)

[2] " A Study on the Pentateuch : Introductory on Dr. Kuenen's ' Religion of Israel,' " by Rev. R. P. Stebbins, D.D., 1881, p. 9. (George H. Ellis, Boston.)

[3] *National Review*, September, 1895.

[4] " New Biblical Guide," by Rev. John Urquhart, 1899, pp. 132-137. (S. W. Partridge and Co.)

to show that the use of the Hebrew writing goes back to a remote antiquity, and that the Book of Job may have existed, as we have it now, before the time of Moses.

It is therefore quite possible that Abraham's family may have possessed records on clay cylinders or tablets of an earlier date than those found in Babylon and elsewhere, which were buried or lost during the subsequent wanderings, and their discovery would at once upset the theory now set up.

"The Sinaitic survey and the researches of Professor Palmer, of Mr. Trumbull, and of others, have led scholarship past the quibblings of Colenso, and have disclosed the marvellous fidelity of the narrative of Israel's memorable journeyings."[1]

Dr. Bickell writes: "It is a fact well worthy of remark, that the great historical discoveries of our epoch in a way join hands to defend the Mosaic authorship of the Pentateuch. While Egyptology makes us acquainted with the condition of Egypt even to the minutest details, and thus proves the authenticity of that Book, by compelling us to admit that its author must, like Moses, have lived in the valley of the Nile, Assyriology demonstrates the falsity of the hypothesis of various original sources, and proves the unity of this fundamental writing of Divine revelation."[2]

Population of the earth before Adam. Gen. ii. 7-22.

Turning now to the Bible record, I adhere to the account of the creation of Adam and Eve *on the sixth "day,"* in 4157 B.C., according to the Hebrew text, or 5328 B.C., according to the Septuagint Version.[3]

The Pre-Adamite men and women probably appeared on the earth towards the close of the Tertiary period, or the fifth "day."

Gen. i. 26, 27. 'And God said, Let us make *Adam* (a red man) in our image, after our likeness: and let them have dominion over the fish of the sea, etc.

'So God created *ha-Adam* (*the* red man) in his own image, in the image of God created he him."

[1] New Biblical Guide," by Rev. John Urquhart, 1899, p. 137. (S. W. Partridge and Co.)

[2] *Ibid.*

[3] "Commentary on the Book of Genesis," by Dr. S. R. Driver. 1904. (Methuen.)

We see here a threefold suggestion that there were human beings already on the earth, of other than a red colour, and not made in the image or likeness of God.

If these Hebrew words had always been transliterated in this way, it would never have been taught that Adam was "*the first man*," and no scepticism would have been caused by the discovery that numerous races of men preceded Adam on the earth.

We are told again of these previously existing people in the account of the exile of Cain :

'And Cain said unto the Lord, My punishment is greater than I can bear. Gen. iv. 13, 14.

'Behold, Thou hast driven me out this day from the face of the earth ; and from Thy face shall I be hid ; and I shall be a fugitive and a vagabond in the earth ; and it shall come to pass that everyone that findeth me shall slay me.'

This clearly points to the presence on the earth of human beings other than Adam's family, and the Higher Criticism, while admitting the fact, meets the difficulty by saying that "Cain and Abel are not mere individuals, but types representing two kinds of men—the settled, pastoral people, and the wandering Arabs of the desert."[1]

There is no sufficient warrant for this view, and the critics have adopted it only because they saw no other way out of the difficulty.

'And Cain went out from the presence of the Lord, and dwelt in the land of Nod, on the east of Eden. And Cain knew his wife, and she conceived and bare Enoch : and he builded a city.' Gen. iv. 16, 17.

Now, in the first place, Cain's possession of a wife presupposes some previously existing people, unless he married a sister, as is, I know, taught in some Sunday schools ; and, besides, Cain and his family could not have built a city.

Every difficulty, however, is solved if we admit that there were to the east of Eden human beings of a lower type than the Adamites, and the appearance among them of Cain, the Adamite, and his taking one

[1] "Lessons from the Old Testament : Senior Course," by the Rev. M. G. Glazebrook, late head-master of Clifton College.

of their women to be his wife, may very naturally have induced them to accept him as their chief, and under his guidance they built a city.

Gen. vi. 2. The statement, "that the sons of God saw the daughters of men that they were fair; and they took them wives of all which they chose," has been explained in many ways.

The simplest explanation is that the Adamite women intermarried with the sons or servants of the gods—false gods as distinguished from "the living God,"[1] who may have been the previously existing negroes, or some of Cain's descendants.

There is another Hebrew word, "Îsh," which is the generic term for man, or mankind in general, including the Adamite.

In the Hebrew Bible, the expressions *B'nê Adam*, *B'nê ha-Adam* (sons of Adam, sons of *the* Adam), and *B'nê Îsh* (sons of Îsh), occur forty-five and six times respectively, and it seems clear that, in the following passages, "the sons of Îsh" and "Îsh" were the non-Adamites.

It may properly be assumed that the previously existing people, here referred to, were inferior to the Adamites, but the translators of the Authorized Version have rendered the phrase "sons of Adam" as designating a lower race of men, and "sons of Îsh" as designating a higher.

Ps. xlix. 1, 2. * A.V. low and high. 'Hear this, all ye people; give ear, all ye inhabitants of the world: Both sons of Adam and sons of man* (Îsh), rich and poor, together.'

P. lxii. 9. † A.V. men of low degree, and men of high degree. 'Surely sons of Adam are vanity, and sons of man† (Îsh) are a lie.'

Isa. ii. 9. ‡ A.V. the mean man, and the great man. 'The Adamite boweth down like as man‡ (Îsh) humbleth himself.'

[1] "Adam and the Adamite," by Dominick M'Causland, Q.C., LL.D., 1872, pp. 156-200. (Macmillan.)

'And the Adamite shall bow down, and the man* (Îsh) shall humble himself.' Isa. v. 15. * A.V. the mean man, and the mighty man.

"Scripture revelation was given to instruct us as to the origin and history of the first Adam and his race, to render intelligible the advent and the office of the second Adam, and it scrupulously adheres to that theme, to the exclusion of all collateral matters; so that the allusions to the non-Adamite are, as might have been expected, few and indirect, being introduced only when necessarily connected with the primary subject. In illustration of this economy of the Bible revelations, we may remark that neither Moses nor the prophets make any allusion to the Negro, though the Israelites in Egypt must have been brought into contact with them. . . .

"While salvation is proclaimed to the heathen, it is proclaimed by faith in Christ, to be preached by Adamite missionaries."[1]

Evolution

The teaching of the day seems to be that the Creation narratives cannot be understood literally, and that the appearance of all living forms on the earth must be attributed to evolution. After considerable study of the subject, my own judgment is that this theory is "non-proven," but, on the supposition that it may be correct as regards the making of *Îsh on the fifth day*, I point out that Darwin's[2] idea was that the Ancestors of Mankind may have branched off, in the first or earliest part of the Tertiary period, from a species of the Catarrhine group of apes, which are long since extinct.

"It must not be supposed," he said, "that the divergence of Man from his Simian ancestors can be traced back to any one pair of progenitors."[3] The

[1] "Adam and the Adamite," by Dominick M'Causland, Q.C., LL.D., 1872, pp. 185, 295. (Macmillan.)
[2] "Descent of Man," by Darwin, 1871. (John Murray.)
[3] *Ibid.*, p. 608.

process of evolution was going on in every part of the world, and, in those parts inhabited by this species of apes, human beings were evolved, about the same time, similar to each other, but with well marked diversities.

This is sufficient to account for the difference to be found in the aborigines of different parts of the world, and these again have no doubt been modified by crossing with members of the Caucasian and Mongolian families.

The Negro type.

I believe it is generally admitted that, if Man evolved[1] from lower anthropoid ancestors, it is probable that the New Beings resembled the Negro, rather than the Caucasian or Mongolian. This may also have been the case if the appearance of these First Beings was due to a special act of creation, and not to evolution.

There is no possible means of discovering for how many centuries the world was inhabited by these Negroes before the appearance of Adam, but we know that a high state of civilization had been reached in Egypt 6,000 years before Christ.

The Mongolian type.

The marriage of the Adamite Cain, who was a Caucasian, with a Negro, may possibly have resulted in the production[2] of the Mongolian type, and Cain's descendants may have continued the migration towards the East, which *he* had commenced; they may in this way have travelled through Central Asia, Siberia, and China, leaving colonists as they went, until they reached Behring Straits.[3] The Straits are still passable by crossing in canoes from island to island, and they may in this way have become the ancestors of the North American Indians, who are Mongolians; a party may also have found their way to Greenland, where the same type is found.

[1] Sir H. Rawlinson. [2] See Philippson and Knobel.
[3] "China's Place in Philology," by Edkins, 1871. (Trübner and Co.)

At this stage the easterly migration must perforce have ceased, but parties may have turned south in search of a more congenial climate, and have become the ancestors of the Incas of Peru, and the Aztecs of Mexico.[1]

M. Peschel also connects the inhabitants of China with the American tribes, and he says: "The Asiatic and American tribes of Behring Straits are so much alike as to be mistaken for one another."[2]

Satan and Serpent worship.

As far as we know no revelation from God had been made to these "Evolved Beings," and I have wondered whether it may not be that Satan thought he saw his opportunity to set up a kingdom on earth in opposition to God, and that with this object he taught these Negroes, in all quarters of the world where they had been evolved, or to which parties of them had travelled, to worship him as their God, in the image which he afterwards assumed in the Garden of Eden.

Dr. James Fergusson, D.C.L., F.R.S., M.R.A.S., etc., in 1873, after visiting India, wrote: Serpent Worship, "if not the oldest, ranks at least among the earliest forms through which the human intellect sought to propitiate the unknown powers. Traces of its existence were found not only in every country of the old world; but before the new was discovered by us, the same strange idolatry had long prevailed there, and even now the worship of the Serpent is found lurking in out-of-the-way corners of the globe, and startles us at times with the unhallowed rites which seem generally to have been associated with its prevalence. . . .

"When we first meet Serpent Worship, either in the Wilderness of Sinai, the Groves of Epidaurus, in Sarmatian huts, or Indian Temples, the Serpent is always the Agathodæmon, the bringer of health and good fortune. His worship may have originated in fear,

[1] "History of the Conquest of Mexico," by W. H. Prescott, 1874, p. 329. (G. Routledge and Sons.)

[2] "The Races of Man," by O. Peschel, 1876. (Beccles, London.)

but long before we become practically acquainted with it, it had passed to the opposite extreme among its votaries. . . . Love and admiration, more than fear or dread, seem to be the main features of this faith, and there are so many unexpected features which are at the same time common to it all the world over, that it seems more reasonable to suspect a common origin."[1]

Serpent Worship in Africa.

Serpent Worship has always been at home in Africa, where it "now flourishes in all its pristine vigour," and

In Asia.

it has always been known in China.[2]

Dr. Fergusson says, it "certainly did prevail in the Central Provinces of India at one time, and it is still to be found in all the hilly countries south of the Vindhya Hills, from Canara to Cuttack, and in Cashmere, and Nepaul."[3]

Num. xxi. 9.

With the Brazen Serpent in the Wilderness, we have the first record "of actual worship being performed to the Serpent" by the Jews, and it may be noticed that the Serpent was adored because of its supposed healing powers.[4]

2 Kings xviii. 4.

This Brazen Serpent was preserved in the Temple until King Hezekiah "brake it in pieces" because "the children of Israel did burn incense to it."

There is no further trace of Serpent Worship among the Jews, but it cropped up again among the Christian sect of Ophites, who quoted "the Gospels to prove that Christ was an imitation of the serpent, because it is said, 'As Moses lifted up the serpent in the wilderness, even so must the Son of man be lifted up.'"[5]

In America.

"In America," Dr. Fergusson declares, "it is certain that there existed extreme veneration for the serpent before its discovery by Columbus." It is "impossible to read the numerous evidences which Müller has collected together with so much industry

[1] "Tree and Serpent Worship," by James Fergusson, D.C.L., F.R.S., M.R.A.S., etc., 1873, pp. 1, 3. (India Office.)
[2] *Ibid.*, p. 34.
[3] *Ibid.*, p. 84.
[4] *Ibid.*, p. 8.
[5] *Ibid.*, p. 9.

not to feel convinced that Serpent Worship did prevail all over the continent."[1]

Serpent Worship in Europe.

In Greek mythology, the "Serpent himself represents Æsculapius, and is the indispensable concomitant of Hygeia."[2]

Dr. Fergusson adds that "Serpent Worship certainly prevailed to a greater or less extent during the whole period of Grecian history."[3]

"The Edda seems sufficient to prove that a form of Serpent Worship did certainly prevail in Scandinavia in the early centuries of the Christian era; and nothing seems more probable or more in accordance with Pictish traditions, than that it should have passed thence into Scotland, and should have left its traces everywhere between the Orkneys and the Firths."[4]

Miss Gordon Cumming gave a brief description of the Loch Nell Serpent. "The mound is situated upon a grassy plain and the tail of the serpent rests near the shore of Loch Nell. The head forms a circular cairn on which there still remains some trace of an altar. The mound has been formed in such a position that the worshippers, standing at the altar, would naturally look eastward, directly along the whole length of the great reptile, and across the dark lake to the triple peaks of Ben Cruachan."[5]

In Highland County, Ohio, there is a similar Serpent mound, 1,254 feet in length, near the three forks of the river, and General Forlong, comparing the two, wrote, "A spot overlooking three streams being even more sacred than that which looks on to a hill with three cones, as does the serpent of Loch Nell. Three rivers form a Tri-Moorti of awful and sublime import."[6]

[1] "Tree and Serpent Worship," by James Fergusson, D.C.L., F.R.S., M.R.A.S., etc., 1873, p. 40. (India Office.)
[2] *Ibid.*, p. 8. [3] *Ibid.*, p. 13. [4] *Ibid.*, p. 33.
[5] *Good Words*, March, 1872, by Miss Gordon Cumming. *The Century Magazine*, April, 1890, by F. W. Putnam.
[6] "Rivers of Life," 1883, by Major-General Forlong. (B. Quaritch.) *The Century Magazine*, April, 1890, by F. W. Putnam.

The scheme of Creation.

I imagine that the object of the formation of Adam and Eve may have been the peopling of the earth with a race of superior human beings who, having earned the right to higher powers by perfect obedience to God, would act as His agents in making Him known to the people who had been deceived by Satan.

The Fall.

Satan, no doubt, understood that the appearance of Adam threatened the stability of his earthly kingdom, and he seized the first opportunity to bring about his fall, and so ruined his chance of being allowed to eat of the tree of life.

By his fall, Adam struck a severe blow to the design of his creation, from which, however, he and his descendants could perhaps have recovered if they had been willing to give implicit obedience to God's commands.

Commencing, however, with Adam's eldest son, Cain, the history of that portion of Adam's descendants who are known as " the chosen people " is one long record of disobedience and rebellion against God, so that God's fair scheme came to nought.

Belief of the Jews.

In the following pages I propose to show that, before the birth of Jesus, the Jews believed that the spirits of all the dead went to Sheol (Hades), the just to Abraham's bosom, and the lost to a place of punishment ; but this, in the majority of cases, was of only temporary duration.

Teaching of Jesus.

Jesus taught in the Parable that Lazarus was in Paradise, which was the same as Abraham's bosom, and the rich man was in torments* in another sphere of Hades.

* R.V. in anguish.

He also told the thief on the cross that he should be with Him, the same day, in Paradise.

Chap. II.

Throughout His ministry, Jesus often referred to the Life after Death in His Parables and other teaching, and we now see that He upheld the established belief in an Intermediate Life, between Death and the Resurrection.

The passages from the Gospels, which I have collected in the second chapter, show the teaching of Jesus to have been that—

1. 'No man hath seen God at any time,' and therefore it is certain that all spirits must remain in Hades until the second Advent of Jesus, or the Last Day. John i. 18; iii. 13; vi. 46. 1 John iv. 12.

2. There are different spheres in Hades, both for the righteous and the wicked.

3. The spirits are alive and conscious.

4. There is provision for purification, and penitence is followed by forgiveness.

Teaching of the Apostles. Chap. III.

The Apostles carried on this teaching about Hades, and they taught that all spirits remain there until the second Advent of Jesus, or the Last Day, but the wicked are given every opportunity of becoming purified, and gradually made perfect.

Teaching of the early Fathers.

The early Fathers taught the same, and this continued to be the teaching of the one undivided Catholic Church until the Great Schism in the twelfth century, when the Greek Church finally seceded from Rome because of the innovations regarding Purgatory, which had been introduced by successive Popes.

This was followed in the sixteenth century by the Second Schism of the Western Churches.

Wycliffe's Bible.

Nearly two centuries before this, in A.D. 1380, John Wycliffe had published his translation of the Bible, and he then struck a great blow at the Romish teaching about Purgatory by using the one word "Helle" in place of Gehenna, Hades, and Tartarus, as in the original.

Books of Homilies.

This mistake was no doubt the origin of the teaching of the two books of Homilies, which were printed in 1547 and 1563, and which laid down that "the soul of man, passing out of the body, goeth straightways either to heaven or else to helle."

Authorized Version.

This mistake was repeated in the Authorized Version of the Bible, which was published in 1611, and the doctrine of immediate judgment after death was the one most generally accepted up to quite recent times.

Anglican Church teaching of to day.

Within the last century, the original teaching of Jesus and His Apostles has been revived, and the following is the present doctrine of the Anglican Church:

1. That there is an Intermediate State between Death and the Resurrection.

2. That there are different spheres in the Intermediate State, both for the righteous and the wicked.

3. That, in the Intermediate State, spirits remain conscious, retain the memory of the life on earth, and are sensible to pain and pleasure.

4. In the Intermediate State, the sinner who is willing to be saved is given every opportunity of becoming purified and gradually made perfect.

5. That there is preaching in the Intermediate State.

6. That every spirit has to remain in the Intermediate State until the second Advent of Jesus, or the Resurrection on the Last Day, but the condition of the faithful, and of all the saints, is one of peace and happiness.

The Second Coming, the Judgment, and Heaven.

I have also collected the passages of Scripture which speak of the Second Coming of Jesus, and the Judgment at the Last Day, and Heaven, to which the righteous will then be translated.

CHAPTER I

I.—THE HEBREW IDEA ABOUT SHEOL.
II.—THE LOCALITY OF "SHEOL," OR "HADES."

CHAPTER I

I.—The Hebrew Idea about Sheol.

The old Hebrew idea about the life after death was that all spirits, both of the just and unjust, went to a dim underworld called Sheol, and remained there throughout all eternity.[1]

The existence in Sheol, although conscious, was hopeless, 'for there is no work, nor device, nor knowledge, nor wisdom,' and in Sheol 'who shall give thee thanks?' Eccles. ix. 10. Ps. vi. 5.

For the sinner, however, Sheol contained sorrows and pains, and we read: 'Drought and heat consume the snow-waters: so doth Sheol those which have sinned.' Job xxiv. 19.

Isaiah and the later prophets revealed something more of the life beyond the grave, and so the Jews came to believe in a resurrection, and to dream of a heaven and a place of punishment for sinners.[2]

At the time of the birth of Jesus the Jews generally, with the exception of the Sadducees, 'which say that there is no resurrection,' believed that the spirits of all the dead went to Sheol—the just to a place of rest and happiness, known as Abraham's bosom, or the Garden of Eden, or Paradise, and the lost to the lowest Sheol, which was a place of punishment. Matt. xxii. 23. Ezek. xxxii. 17-32. Deut. xxxii. 22.

[1] "Exposition of the XXXIX. Articles," by Bishop Edward Harold Browne, 1882, p. 80 (Article III.). (Longmans, Green and Co.)
"The Future State," by Dr. J. A. Dorner, translated by Rev. Newman Smyth, 1883, p. 50.
"The Intermediate State and the Last Things," by Rev. G. S. Barrett, D.D., 1898, p. 15. (Elliot Stock.)

[2] "Whither; or, The Condition of the Soul after Death," by Rev. J. R. Porte, D.D., 1904, p. 21. (Sampson Low, Marston and Co.)

"SHEOL."

According to Buxtorff's Hebrew Concordance, the word "sheol" occurs sixty-five times in the Hebrew Bible, and a marginal note to Genesis xxxvii. 35, in the Revised Version of the Old Testament, explains that "sheol" is "the name of the abode of the dead, answering to the Greek Hades" (Acts ii. 27).

In the Authorized Version of the Old Testament the word "sheol" has been translated "hell" in thirty-one passages, "the grave" in thirty-one passages, and "the pit" in three passages.

HELL.

Deut. xxxii. 22. 1. 'For a fire is kindled in mine anger, and shall burn unto the lowest hell (sheol).'

2 Sam. xxii. 6. 2. 'The sorrows of hell (sheol) compassed me about.'

Job xi. 8. 3. 'Deeper than hell (sheol); what canst thou know?'

Job xxvi. 6. 4. 'Hell (sheol) is naked before him.'

Ps. ix. 17. 5. 'The wicked shall be turned into hell (sheol).'

Ps. xvi. 10. 6. 'For thou wilt not leave my soul in hell (sheol).'

Ps. xviii. 5. 7. 'The sorrows of hell (sheol) compassed me about.'

Ps. lv. 15. 8. 'Let death seize upon them, and let them go down quick into hell (sheol).'

Ps. lxxxvi. 13. 9. 'For great is thy mercy toward me: and thou hast delivered my soul from the lowest hell (sheol).'

Ps. cxvi. 3. 10. 'The sorrows of death compassed me, and the pains of hell (sheol) gat hold upon me.'

Ps. cxxxix. 8. 11. 'If I make my bed in hell (sheol), behold, thou art there.'

Prov. v. 5. 12. 'Her feet go down to death; her steps take hold on hell (sheol).'

Prov. vii. 27. 13. 'Her house is the way to hell (sheol).'

Prov. ix. 18. 14. 'But he knoweth not that the dead are there; and that her guests are in the depths of hell (sheol).'

Prov. xv. 11. 15. 'Hell (sheol) and destruction are before the Lord.'

Prov. xv. 24. 16. 'The way of life is above to the wise, that he may depart from hell (sheol) beneath.'

Prov. xxiii. 14. 17. 'Thou shalt beat him with the rod, and shalt deliver his soul from hell (sheol).

Prov. xxvii. 20. 18. 'Hell (sheol) and destruction are never full.'

Isa. v. 14. 19. 'Therefore hell (sheol) hath enlarged herself.'

Isa. xiv. 9. 20. 'Hell (sheol) from beneath is moved for thee to meet thee at thy coming.'

Isa. xiv. 15. 21. 'Yet thou shalt be brought down to hell (sheol).'

Isa. xxviii. 15. 22. 'And with hell (sheol) are we at agreement.'

Isa. xxviii. 18. 23. 'And your agreement with hell (sheol) shall not stand.'

24. 'And didst debase thyself even unto hell (sheol).' Isa. lvii. 9.
25. 'When I cast him down to hell (sheol).' Ezek. xxxi. 16.
26. 'They also went down into hell (sheol) with him.' Ezek. xxxi. 17.
27. 'The strong among the mighty shall speak to him out of the midst of hell (sheol).' Ezek. xxxii. 21.
28. 'And they shall not lie with the mighty that are fallen of the uncircumcised which are gone down to hell (sheol).' Ezek. xxxii. 27.
29. 'Though they dig into hell (sheol).' Amos ix. 2.
30. 'Out of the belly of hell (sheol) cried I. Jonah ii. 2.
31. 'Who enlargeth his desire as hell (sheol).' Hab. ii. 5.

THE GRAVE.

1. 'And he said, For I will go down into the grave (sheol) unto my son mourning.' Gen. xxxvii. 35.
2. 'Then shall ye bring down my grey hairs with sorrow to the grave (sheol).' Gen. xlii. 38.
3. 'Ye shall bring down my grey hairs with sorrow to the grave (sheol).' Gen. xliv. 29.
4. 'And thy servants shall bring down the grey hairs of thy servant our father with sorrow to the grave (sheol).' Gen. xliv. 31.
5. 'He bringeth down to the grave (sheol), and bringeth up.' 1 Sam. ii. 6.
6. 'And let not his hoar head go down to the grave (sheol) in peace.' 1 Kings ii. 6.
7. 'But his hoar head bring thou down to the grave (sheol) with blood.' 1 Kings ii. 9.
8. 'So he that goeth down to the grave (sheol) shall come up no more.' Job vii. 9.
9. 'O that thou wouldest hide me in the grave (sheol). Job xiv. 13.
10. 'If I wait, the grave (sheol) is mine house.' Job xvii. 13.
11. 'And in a moment go down to the grave (sheol).' Job xxi. 13.
12. 'Drought and heat consume the snow waters: so doth the grave (sheol) those which have sinned.' Job xxiv. 19.
13. 'In the grave (sheol) who shall give thee thanks?' Ps. vi. 5.
14. 'O Lord, thou hast brought up my soul from the grave (sheol).' Ps. xxx. 3.
15. 'Let the wicked be ashamed, and let them be silent in the grave (sheol).' Ps. xxxi. 17.
16. 'Like sheep they are laid in the grave (sheol).' Ps. xlix. 14.
17. 'And their beauty shall consume in the grave (sheol).' Ps. xlix. 14.
18. 'But God will redeem my soul from the power of the grave (sheol).' Ps. xlix. 15.
19. 'And my life draweth nigh unto the grave (sheol).' Ps. lxxxviii. 3.
20. 'Shall he deliver his soul from the hand of the grave (sheol)?' Ps. lxxxix. 48.
21. 'Our bones are scattered at the grave's (sheol) mouth.' Ps. cxli. 7.
22. 'Let us swallow them up alive as the grave (sheol).' Prov. i. 12.
23. 'The grave (sheol) and the barren womb.' Prov. xxx. 16.
24. 'For there is no work, nor devise, nor knowledge, nor wisdom, in the grave (sheol).' Eccles. ix. 10.

S. of Sol. viii. 6. 25. 'For love is strong as death; jealousy is cruel as the grave (sheol).'

Isa. xiv. 11 26. 'Thy pomp is brought down to the grave (sheol).'

Isa. xxxviii. 10. 27. 'I said in the cutting off of my days, I shall go to the gates of the grave (sheol).'

Isa. xxxviii. 18. 28. 'For the grave (sheol) cannot praise thee.'

Ezek. xxxi. 15. 29. 'In the day when he went down to the grave (sheol).'

Hos. xiii. 14. 30. 'I will ransom them from the power of the grave (sheol).'

Hos. xiii. 14. 31. 'O grave (sheol), I will be thy destruction.'

THE PIT.

Num. xvi. 30. 1. 'And they go down quick into the pit (sheol).'

Num. xvi. 33. 2. 'They, and all that appertained to them, went down alive into the pit (sheol).'

Job. xvii. 16. 3. 'They shall go down to the bars of the pit (sheol), when our rest together is in the dust.'

II.—THE LOCALITY OF "SHEOL," OR "HADES."

A great many of the quotations from the Old Testament, collected under the head of "sheol," prove that the belief in ancient times was that "sheol" was below the earth.

Jesus confirmed this opinion of the Jews when He said to certain of the Scribes and Pharisees:

Matt. xii. 40. 'For as Jonas was three days and three nights in the whale's belly; so shall the Son of man be three days and three nights in the heart of the earth.'

St. Paul wrote to the same effect in two of his Epistles:

Eph. iv. 9, 10. '(Now that He ascended, what is it but that He also descended first into the lower parts of the earth?

'He that descended is the same also that ascended up far above all heavens, that He might fill all things.)'

Phil. ii. 10. * R.V. in the name of Jesus. 'That at the name of Jesus* every knee should bow, of *things* in heaven, and *things* in earth, and *things* under the earth.'

St. John also, in the Revelation, showed that he was of the same belief:

Rev. v. 3. 'And no man in heaven, nor in earth, neither under the earth, was able to open the book, neither to look thereon.'

'And every creature which is in heaven, and on the earth, and under the earth, and such as are in the sea, and all that are in them, heard I saying, Blessing, and honour, and glory, and power, *be* unto Him that sitteth upon the throne, and unto the Lamb for ever and ever.' Rev. v. 1.

There is no doubt that the early Fathers taught that "Hades" was situated beneath the earth they stood upon.

CHAPTER II

I.—THE TEACHING OF JESUS ABOUT HADES.

II.—ALL SPIRITS REMAIN IN THE INTERMEDIATE STATE UNTIL THE SECOND ADVENT OF JESUS, OR THE RESURRECTION ON THE LAST DAY.

CHAPTER II

I.—The Teaching of Jesus about Hades.

In the Parable of the Rich Man and Lazarus, Jesus, speaking to Jews, confirmed and sanctioned the current belief, and He explained that, while Lazarus was comforted in Abraham's bosom, the rich man was in torments* in hell.† He said that between Abraham and the place of torment there was a great gulf fixed, "so that they which would pass from hence to you cannot; neither can they pass to us, that would come from thence." Luke xvi. 19-31.

* R.V. in anguish.
† R.V. Hades.

The parable further teaches that the rich man remembered the incidents of his past life, and was anxious to help his brethren, who were still on earth; and, lastly, we are told that Abraham knew of the teaching of Moses and the prophets, although he died long before their time.

Among the last seven words spoken by Jesus on the cross were those addressed to the thief who was crucified with Him: 'Verily I say unto thee, To-day shalt thou be with Me in Paradise.' Luke xxiii. 43.

The Jews who heard this naturally understood that "Paradise" was the same as "Abraham's bosom," and it is certain that "Paradise" cannot mean "heaven," because Jesus said to Mary Magdalene, after His Resurrection: "I am not *yet* ascended to My Father." John xx. 17.

Jesus spoke this parable to a number of His disciples, who all believed in an Intermediate State under

the name of either Sheol or Hades; and as it was narrated in the plainest language, there can be no doubt that the hearers understood it as confirming the ancient doctrine.

Nevertheless, Mr. W. Tupman[1] said it "may be taken to represent the cutting off of the Jews, who were rich above all others, because 'unto them were committed the oracles of God'"; and, again, the Jews "despised the poor man, who may represent the Gentiles, treating them as dogs": "The Jews were cut off and tormented because they obeyed not."

The following are the only other occasions on which the Gospels record that Jesus actually mentioned Hades:

Matt. xi. 23. Luke x. 15. * R.V. Hades.

'And thou Capernaum, which are exalted unto heaven, shalt be brought down to hell.'*

Matt. xvi. 18. * R.V. Hades.

'And upon this rock I will build My church; and the gates of hell* shall not prevail against it.'

Although the Gospels only contain a record of these three occasions on which Jesus actually mentioned Hades, it is certain that He often referred to the State after death, and both by His words and His actions (in talking to Moses and Elijah at His transfiguration) He taught that Hades is divided into many spheres; that spirits are conscious; that they have opportunities of becoming purified; and that they all remain in the Intermediate State until His second Advent, or the Resurrection on the Last Day.

Matt. v. 11, 12.

'Blessed are ye, when *men* shall revile you, and persecute *you*, and shall say all manner of evil against you falsely, for My sake.

'Rejoice, and be exceeding glad: for great *is* your reward in heaven: for so persecuted they the prophets which were before you.'

Bishop Ellicott, in his "Commentary," says: "Literally, *in the heavens*, as in the phrase, 'the kingdom of

[1] "The Faith or Heresy—Which is it? An Examination of Conditional Immortality," by Mr. W. Tupman, 1899, p. 10. (Digby, Long, and Co.)

heaven,' the plural being used possibly with reference to the Jewish belief in three or seven heavens, more probably as implying, in its grand vagueness (like the 'many mansions'), the absence of any space-limits to the promised reward." 2 Cor. xii. 2. John xiv 2.

I have quoted the above passage in this place because, no doubt, the promised reward commences in the Intermediate State, which is thus seen to consist of different spheres, as sinners cannot be in the same sphere as the spirits here referred to.

'Agree with thine adversary quickly, whiles thou art in the way with him; lest at any time the adversary deliver thee to the judge, and the judge deliver thee to the officer, and thou be cast into prison. Matt. v. 25, 26.

'Verily I say unto thee, Thou shalt by no means come out thence, till thou hast paid the uttermost farthing. Luke xii. 58, 59.

The word "prison" is that used in, "By which also he went and preached unto the spirits in prison." 1 Pet. iii. 19.

It is clear that St. Peter referred to spirits in Hades, and this passage must also refer to the same place or state.

The teaching is that recovery from the unhappy sphere of Hades is most difficult, but *not* impossible.

'For if ye forgive men their trespasses, your heavenly Father will also forgive you: Matt. vi. 14, 15.

'But if ye forgive not men their trespasses, neither will your Father forgive your trespasses.'

This surely teaches that repentant sinners can find forgiveness in Hades as well as on earth.

'Ask, and it shall be given you; seek, and ye shall find; knock, and it shall be opened unto you.

'For every one that asketh receiveth; and he that seeketh findeth; and to him that knocketh it shall be opened

'Or what man is there of you, whom if his son ask bread, will he give him a stone? Matt. vii. 7-12.

'Or if he ask a fish, will he give him a serpent? Matt. xxi. 22. Mark xi. 24.

'If ye then, being evil, know how to give good gifts unto your children, how much more shall your Father which is in heaven give good things to them that ask Him? Luke xi. 9-13.

'Therefore all things whatsoever ye would that men should do to you, do ye even so to them: for this is the law and the prophets.'

"The three words imply distinct degrees of intensity. There is the 'asking' in the spoken words of prayer; the 'seeking' in the efforts and labours which are acted prayers; the 'knocking' at the gate with the urgent importunity which claims admission into our Father's house."[1]

"The words are absolute and unqualified." If "we ask, as Christ has taught us, in His name, and according to His spirit," we *shall* receive.[2]

Matt. vii. 13-20.

'Enter ye in at the strait gate: for wide *is* the gate, and broad *is* the way, that leadeth to destruction, and many there be which go in thereat:

'Because strait *is* the gate, and narrow *is* the way, which leadeth unto life, and few there be that find it.

'Beware of false prophets, which come to you in sheep's clothing, but inwardly they are ravening wolves.

'Ye shall know them by their fruits. Do men gather grapes of thorns, or figs of thistles?

'Even so every good tree bringeth forth good fruit; but a corrupt tree bringeth forth evil fruit.

'A good tree cannot bring forth evil fruit, neither *can* a corrupt tree bring forth good fruit.

'Every tree that bringeth not forth good fruit is hewn down, and cast into the fire.

'Wherefore by their fruits ye shall know them.'

"The picture is a dark one. . . . If there is any wider hope, it is found in hints and suggestions of the possibilities of the future; in the fact that the words are emphatically present; in the belief that the short span of this life is not necessarily the whole of the discipline of a soul made for eternity; and that the new life, nascent, and feeble, and stunted here, may be quickened by some new process of education into higher energies."[3]

1 Pet. iii. 19; iv. 6.

I go farther than this, and say distinctly that there must be an Intermediate State, where the heathen and children are taught, and the many gracious messages left by Jesus must mean that there is still hope there for any sinner who repents.

[1] "A Bible Commentary for English Readers," by various writers, edited by Bishop C. J. Ellicott, D.D. (Cassell and Co.) [2] *Ibid.* [3] *Ibid.*

'Not every one that saith unto me, Lord, Lord, shall enter into the kingdom of heaven; but he that doeth the will of My Father which is in heaven. Matt. vii. 21-23.

'Many will say to Me in that day, Lord, Lord, have we not prophesied in Thy name? and in Thy name have cast out devils? and in Thy name done many wonderful works?

'And then will I profess unto them, I never knew you; depart from Me, ye that work iniquity.

'Strive to enter in at the strait gate: for many, I say unto you, will seek to enter in, and shall not be able. Luke xiii. 24-30.

'When once the Master of the house is risen up, and hath shut to the door, and ye begin to stand without, and to knock at the door, saying, Lord, Lord, open unto us; and He shall answer and say unto you, I know you not whence ye are:

'Then ye shall begin to say, We have eaten and drunk in Thy presence, and Thou hast taught in our streets.

'But He shall say, I tell you, I know you not whence ye are; depart from Me, all *ye* workers of iniquity.

'There shall be weeping and gnashing of teeth, when ye shall see Abraham, and Isaac, and Jacob, and all the prophets, in the kingdom of God, and you *yourselves* thrust out.

'And they shall come from the east, and *from* the west, and from the north, and *from* the south, and shall sit down in the kingdom of God.

'And, behold, there are last which shall be first, and there are first which shall be last.'

This clearly points to the consciousness of spirits in Hades, and to the retention of the memory of the life on earth.

'And I say unto you, That many shall come from the east and west, and shall sit down with Abraham, and Isaac, and Jacob, in the kingdom of heaven. Matt. viii. 11, 12. Luke xiii. 28.

'But the chidren of the kingdom shall be cast out into outer darkness: there shall be weeping and gnashing of teeth.'

While the words "weeping and gnashing of teeth" are admitted to be naturally connected with "the misery of those who are excluded from the joy and blessedness of the completed kingdom, and that is, doubtless, what they ultimately point to," it is held that they may also refer to "the children of the kingdom"—*i.e.*, the Israelites—being left "in the 'outer darkness' when they were self-excluded from fellowship with that Church—the Church of Christ—and its work among the nations."[1]

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

This is one of the many terms used in connection with the final lot of unrepentant sinners.

Matt. x. 24.
Luke vi. 40.
John xiii. 16.
John xv. 20.
* R.V. every one when he is perfected:

'The disciple is not above *his* Master, nor the servant above his Lord' (Matthew).

'The disciple is not above his master: but every one that is perfect* shall be as his Master' (Luke).

The passage in Luke may be held to point to the disciple going to Hades, as his Master would go, and there preaching the good tidings.

The more common interpretation is that the disciple, like his Master, should teach and not judge.

Matt. x. 28.
Luke xii. 4, 5.
* R.V. Gehenna.

'And fear not them which kill the body, but are not able to kill the soul: but rather fear Him which is able to destroy both soul and body in hell.'*

Jas. iv. 12.

In James we read: 'There is one Lawgiver, who is able to save and to destroy.'

I have found nearly one hundred different terms used as types of the final place of destruction of unrepentant sinners, and the above is the only occasion, on which Gehenna was so used. On other occasions, Gehenna, or the Valley of Hinnom, was pointed to as the place where the dead body might be thrown after death, as a punishment inflicted by a court of law.

The "soul" is the "life," and this distinctly teaches that man is *not* immortal by nature, but God *has* the power to *destroy* both the "life" and the spirit body of all unrepentant sinners at the Final Judgment on the Last Day.

Matt. x. 29-31.

'Are not two sparrows sold for a farthing? and one of them shall not fall on the ground without your Father.

'But the very hairs of your head are all numbered.

'Fear ye not, therefore, ye are of more value than many sparrows.

Matt. xi. 28-30.

'Come unto Me all *ye* that labour and are heavy laden, and I will give you rest.

'Take My yoke upon you, and learn of Me; for I am meek and lowly in heart: and ye shall find rest unto your souls.

'For My yoke *is* easy, and My burden is light.'

'For God so loved the world, that He gave His only begotten Son, that whosoever believeth in Him should not perish, but have everlasting life.*
'For God sent not His Son into the world to condemn the world; but that the world through Him might be saved.'

John iii. 16, 17.
* R.V. eternal life.

How is it possible to believe that Jesus left the above loving and gracious messages to men of all nations, and of all times, but, nevertheless, daily sentences to immediate, never-ending torments in material flames all those whose spirits leave their earthly envelopes without coming to Him, although many of them never heard of Him?

This is, however, the teaching of the Church of Rome of to-day, and it was taught by the two books of Homilies in 1547 and 1563.

I declare, in spite of this, that the sentence is so antagonistic to the message that it cannot be pronounced by Jesus.

Again, how is it possible to believe that Jesus said:

'Suffer little children, and forbid them not, to come unto Me: for of such is the kingdom of heaven,'

Matt. xix. 14. Mark x. 14. Luke xviii. 16.

and, at the same time, to credit the doctrine that the spirit of every child dying unbaptized is committed to the said flames?

Still, this is taught to-day, I know, by some of the country clergy of England.

I say this teaching is not only false, but it is disloyal to God, and cruel to simple human beings, who think the minister in the pulpit must know the truth.

The inference to be drawn from Scripture is that God's love for every human spirit does not cease when it quits this earth, but follows it into the Intermediate State, and continues until the Last Day.

'He that receiveth you receiveth Me, and he that receiveth Me receiveth Him that sent Me.
'He that receiveth a prophet in the name of a prophet shall receive a prophet's reward; and he that receiveth a righteous man in the name of a righteous man shall receive a righteous man's reward.

Matt. x. 40-42. Mark ix. 41.

'And whosoever shall give to drink unto one of these little ones a cup of cold *water* only in the name of a disciple, verily I say unto you, he shall in no wise lose his reward.'

This reward may consist of admission to the happiest sphere of Hades, which is called Paradise.

Matt. xii. 18-21.

'Behold My servant, whom I have chosen; my beloved, in whom My soul is well pleased: I will put my spirit upon him, and he shall shew judgment to the Gentiles.

'He shall not strive, nor cry; neither shall any man hear his voice in the streets.

'A bruised reed shall he not break, and smoking flax shall he not quench, till he send forth judgment unto victory.

'And in his name shall the Gentiles trust.'

In quoting this passage I am supported by Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary," which says: "What is implied is that this tender compassion was to characterize the whole work of the Christ *until the time of final judgment should arrive*, and truth should at last prevail."

I have put in italics the sentence which teaches that the attempt to save sinners will be continued in the Intermediate State; even a "bruised reed," "which is the type of one broken by the weight of sorrow, or care, or sin," will not fail to receive the most gentle assistance to enable it to recover itself.

Matt. xii. 31, 32. Mark iii. 28, 29. Luke xii. 10. 1 John v. 16.

'Wherefore I say unto you, All manner of sin and blasphemy shall be forgiven unto men: but the blasphemy *against* the *Holy* Ghost shall not be forgiven unto men.

'And whosoever speaketh a word against the Son of man, it shall be forgiven him: but whosoever speaketh against the Holy Ghost, it shall not be forgiven him, neither in this world, neither in the *world* to come.'

"Our Lord's words, it may be noted, clearly imply that some sins wait for their full forgiveness, the entire cancelling of the past, till the time of that 'age to come' which shall witness the great and final Advent. Does this imply that repentance, and therefore pardon, may come in the state that follows death? We know not, and ask questions that we cannot answer; but the words at least check the harsh, dogmatic answer in the negative. If one sin only is thus excluded from forgiveness in that 'coming age,' other sins cannot

stand on the same level, and the darkness behind the veil is lit up with at least a gleam of hope."[1]

I hold that this passage, when read with other passages from the Gospels which I have collected, makes it clear that repentance, at any time before the Last Day, will be followed by forgiveness, in the Intermediate State.

Matt. vi. 14, 15, xii. 18-21, xviii. 21, 22, xxi. 22, vii. 7. Luke xv. 3-7. John i. 29, iii. 16, 17, xii. 32.

'Then certain of the scribes and of the Pharisees answered, saying, Master, we would see a sign from Thee. Matt. xii. 38-40.

'But He answered and said unto them, An evil and adulterous generation seeketh after a sign; and there shall no sign be given to it, but the sign of the prophet Jonas: Matt. xvi. 4. Jonah i. 17.

'For as Jonas was three days and three nights in the whale's belly; so shall the Son of man be three days and three nights in the heart of the earth.'

"The purely chronological difficulty is explained by the common mode of speech among the Jews, according to which, any part of a day, though it were but a single hour, was for legal purposes considered as a whole."[2] 1 Sam. xxx. 12, 13.

'Again, the kingdom of heaven is like unto a net, that was cast into the sea, and gathered of every kind: Matt. xiii. 47-50.

'Which, when it was full, they drew to shore, and sat down, and gathered the good into vessels, but cast the bad away.

'So shall it be at the end of the world: the angels shall come forth, and sever the wicked from among the just.

'And shall cast them into the furnace of fire: there shall be wailing and gnashing of teeth.'

Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" points out that "in the actual work of the kingdom the very casting of the net may change, and is meant to change, the nature of the fish that are taken in its meshes, and, therefore, that those that remain 'bad' are so in the end by the result of their own will."

The above passage contains three of the hundred terms used in the New Testament as types of the final destruction of unrepentant sinners, viz.:

1. Being cast away like bad fish.
2. Being cast into the furnace of fire.
3. Where there is wailing and gnashing of teeth.

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)
[2] *Ibid.*

Matt. xvi. 18-20.
* R.V. Hades.

'And I say also unto thee, That thou art Peter, and upon this rock I will build My church; and the gates of hell* shall not prevail against it.

'And I will give unto thee the keys of the kingdom of heaven: and whatsoever thou shalt bind on earth shall be bound in heaven: and whatsoever thou shalt loose on earth shall be loosed in heaven.

'Then charged He His disciples that they should tell no man that He was Jesus the Christ.'

The promise here made to Peter, beginning with the words, "and whatsoever thou shalt bind on earth," was afterwards "extended not only to the other Apostles, but to the whole society of which they were the representatives. . . . It was binding or loosing, directly as interpreting the Law, only secondarily and indirectly as punishing or pardoning."[1]

Matt. xviii. 18.

The power that was given to the Apostles at the appearance of Jesus after His crucifixion is "immediately connected with the representative character of the disciples as Apostles sent by Christ, as He was Himself sent by His Father, and its validity is dependent upon their reception of the Holy Ghost, by whom Christ Himself is present in them."[2]

John xx. 21-23.

'Then said Jesus to them again, Peace be unto you: as *My* Father hath sent Me, even so send I you.

'And when He had said this, He breathed on *them*, and saith unto them, Receive ye the Holy Ghost:

'Whose soever sins ye remit, they are remitted unto them; *and* whose soever *sins* ye retain, they are retained.'

"God has promised forgiveness wherever there is repentance. . . . It results from every declaration of forgiveness made in the name of the Father through Jesus Christ, that hearts which in penitence accept it receive remission of their sins, and that the hardness of the hearts which wilfully reject it is by their rejection increased, and the very words by which their sins would be remitted become the words by which they are retained."[3]

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)
[2] *Ibid.* [3] *Ibid.*

With regard to the passage on which the claims of the Church of Rome are founded—

'And Jesus answered and said unto him, Blessed art thou, Simon Bar-jona: for flesh and blood hath not revealed *it* unto thee, but My Father which is in heaven. Matt. xvi. 17-19.

'And I say also unto thee, That thou art Peter, and upon this rock I will build My church; and the gates of hell* shall not prevail against it. * R.V. Hades

'And I will give unto thee the keys of the kingdom of heaven: and whatsoever thou shalt bind on earth shall be bound in heaven: and whatsoever thou shalt loose on earth shall be loosed in heaven—'

it is said: "(1) that it is at least doubtful . . . whether the man Peter was the rock on which the Church was to be built; (2) that it is doubtful . . . whether Peter was ever in any real sense Bishop of the Church of Rome, or in any way connected with its foundation; (3) that there is not a syllable pointing to the transmission of the power conferred on him to his successors in that supposed episcopate; (4) . . . the power was not given to him alone, but equally to all the disciples; (5) that the power of the keys, no less than that of 'binding' and 'loosing,' was not sacerdotal, but belonged to the office of a scribe or teacher."[1]

'And after six days Jesus taketh Peter, James, and John his brother, and bringeth them up into an high mountain apart. Matt. xvii. 1-3. Mark ix. 2-4. Luke ix. 30, 31.

'And was transfigured before them: and His face did shine as the sun, and His raiment was white as the light.

'And, behold, there appeared unto them Moses and Elias† talking with Him.' † R.V. Elijah.

Peter was one of the three disciples who were present at this time, and he afterwards wrote:

'For we have not followed cunningly devised fables, when we made known unto you the power and coming of our Lord Jesus Christ, but were eye-witnesses of His majesty.' 2 Pet. i. 16.

The appearance of Moses and Elijah teaches us several things.

In the first place, it is clear that they were still in the Intermediate State.

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

They appeared in their spirit-bodies, which resembled their appearance while on earth.

They were conscious, were able to converse with Jesus, and, according to Luke, knew what was about to take place in Jerusalem.

Matt. xviii. 21, 22, vi. 14. Mark xi. 25, 26. Luke xvii. 4.

'Then came Peter to Him, and said, Lord, how oft shall my brother sin against me, and I forgive him? till seven times?

'Jesus saith unto him, I say not unto thee, Until seven times: but, Until seventy times seven.'

Amos i. 3.

"Seven" was the sacred number, and in going so far beyond the "three transgressions and for four" of the Old Testament, Peter no doubt thought he had reached the limit.

The answer of Jesus showed that, so long as a sinner truly repents, the forgiveness of God has *no* limit.

Matt. xviii. 33-35, vi. 15. Mark xi. 26.

'Shouldest not thou also have had compassion on thy fellowservant, even as I had pity on thee?

'And his lord was wroth, and delivered him to the tormentors, till he should pay all that was due unto him.

'So likewise shall My heavenly Father do also unto you, if ye from your hearts forgive not every one his brother their trespasses.'

The word translated "tormentors" does not necessarily mean those who actually inflict torture, but it is applied also to the keepers of a prison.[1]

Matt. v. 25, 26.

The teaching is the same as in a previous passage, that recovery from the unhappy sphere of Hades is most difficult, but *not* impossible.

Matt. xix. 23-26. Mark x. 23-27. Luke xviii. 24-27.

'Then said Jesus unto His disciples, Verily I say unto you, That a rich man shall hardly enter into the kingdom of heaven.

'And again I say unto you, It is easier for a camel to go through the eye of a needle, than for a rich man to enter into the kingdom of God.

'When His disciples heard *it*, they were exceedingly amazed, saying, Who then can be saved?

'But Jesus beheld *them*, and said unto them, With men this is impossible; but with God all things are possible.'

Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" says: "There is no reason to think that the comparison, even if it was not

[1] "Future Retribution," by Rev. C. A. Row, 1887, p. 248. (William Isbister, Limited.)

already proverbial, would present the slightest difficulty to the minds of the disciples. Like all such comparisons, it states a general fact—the hindrance which wealth presents to the higher growths of holiness—in the boldest possible form, in order to emphasize its force, and leaves out of sight the limits and modifications with which it has to be received."

In Mark we find an explanatory and softened statement: "How hard is it for them that trust in riches to enter into the kingdom of God!" Mark x. 24.

It is thought that "a marginal note, added by someone who felt as the disciples felt, has here found its way into the text."

'For the kingdom of heaven is like unto a man *that is* an householder, which went out early in the morning to hire labourers into his vineyard. Matt. xx. 1-16.

'And when he had agreed with the labourers for a penny a day, he sent them into his vineyard.

'And he went out about the third hour, and saw others standing idle in the market-place.

'And he said unto them: Go ye also into the vineyard, and whatsoever is right I will give you. And they went their way.

'Again he went out about the sixth and ninth hour, and did likewise.

'And about the eleventh hour he went out, and found others standing idle, and saith unto them, Why stand ye here all the day idle?

'They say unto him, Because no man hath hired us. He saith unto them, Go ye also into the vineyard; and whatsoever is right, *that* shall ye receive.

'So when even was come, the lord of the vineyard saith unto his steward, Call the labourers, and give them *their* hire, beginning from the last unto the first.

'And when they came that were hired about the eleventh hour, they received every man a penny.

'But when the first came, they supposed that they should have received more; and they likewise received every man a penny.

'And when they had received *it*, they murmured against the good man of the house.

'Saying, These last have wrought *but* one hour, and thou hast made them equal unto us, which have borne the burden and heat of the day.

'But he answered one of them, and said, Friend, I do thee no wrong: didst not thou agree with me for a penny?

'Take *that* thine *is*, and go thy way: I will give unto this last, even as unto thee.

'Is it not lawful for me to do what I will with mine own? Is thine eye evil, because I am good?

'So the last shall be first, and the first last: for many be called, but few chosen.'*

* R.V. the last sentence is omitted.

"The labourers in the vineyard, who did their work, and bore the burden and heat of the day, did not altogether lose their reward because they murmured against the larger generosity, the considerate equity, of the lord of the vineyard."[1]

In Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" I find under the words, "So the last shall be first." "This, then, is the great lesson of the parable, and it answers at once the question whether we are to see in it the doctrine of an absolute equality in the blessedness of the life to come. There, also, there will be some first, some last, but the difference of degree will depend, not on the duration of service, nor even on the amount of work done, but on the character and temper of the worker; and": "No disciple who had entered into his Master's spirit would grudge the repentant thief his rest in Paradise. No consistent Christian thinks that he ought to have some special reward because he sees a death-bed repentance crowned by a peace, the foretaste of eternal life, as full and assured as his own."

Luke xxiii. 43.

Matt. xxi. 22, vii. 7. Mark xi. 24. Luke xi. 9-13.

'And all things, whatsoever ye shall ask in prayer, believing, ye shall receive.'

This passage, again, shows the unlimited love of God, and His readiness to forgive if only asked to do so.

Matt. xxii. 1-14.

'And Jesus answered and spake unto them again by parables, and said:

'The kingdom of heaven is like unto a certain king, which made a marriage for his son.

'And sent forth his servants to call them that were bidden to the wedding: and they would not come.

'Again, he sent forth other servants, saying, Tell them which are bidden, Behold, I have prepared my dinner: my oxen and *my* fatlings *are* killed, and all things *are* ready: come unto the marriage.

---

1 "The Spirits in Prison," by Dean E. H. Plumptre, D.D., 1884, p. 62. (William Isbister, Limited.)

'But they made light of *it*, and went their ways, one to his farm, another to his merchandise:

'And the remnant took his servants, and entreated *them* spitefully, and slew *them*.

'But when the king heard *thereof*, he was wroth: and he sent forth his armies, and destroyed those murderers, and burned up their city.

'Then saith he to his servants, The wedding is ready, but they which were bidden were not worthy.

'Go ye therefore into the highways, and as many as ye shall find, bid to the marriage.

'So those servants went out into the highways, and gathered together all as many as they found, both bad and good: and the wedding was furnished with guests.

'And when the king came in to see the guests, he saw there a man which had not on a wedding garment:

'And he saith unto him, Friend, how camest thou in hither not having a wedding garment? And he was speechless.

'Then said the king to the servants, Bind him hand and foot, and take him away, and cast *him* into outer darkness; there shall be weeping and gnashing of teeth.

'For many are called, but few *are* chosen.'

"It is not said even of the man that had not on a wedding garment that the door which was shut upon him would never again be opened, and that he was to be left for ever in the outer darkness. The terms of the parable would be satisfied by his exclusion from the joy and triumph symbolized by the first resurrection. If admitted at all, it must be after a long discipline of suffering, and under the eternal conditions that there must be a wedding garment."[1] Rev. xx. 6.

If this parable refers to any time before the Last Day, I certainly agree with Dean Plumptre. The order of the king, however, is that the man, "who had not on a wedding garment," should be bound and cast into "outer darkness," which is one of the hundred terms used in the New Testament as types of the place of the final destruction of unrepentant sinners.

'For in the resurrection they neither marry, nor are given in marriage, but are as the angels of God in heaven. Matt. xxii. 30-32. Mark xii. 25.

'But as touching the resurrection of the dead, have ye not read that which was spoken unto you by God, saying, Luke xx. 34. 38.

[1] "The Spirits in Prison," by Dean E. H. Plumptre, D.D., 1884, p. 62. (William Isbister, Limited.)

'I am the God of Abraham, and the God of Isaac, and the God of Jacob? God is not the God of the dead, but of the living.'

We are told here one feature of the life in heaven—that there will be no marriage; but nothing is said about individual recognition, which would seem to be probable if the appearances of spirits in spirit-bodies, which I have collected in my Conclusion, are considered.

The expression "*I am*," not "*I was*," the God of Abraham, the God of Isaac, and the God of Jacob, shows that these three men were still alive in the Intermediate State, and conscious.

Matt. xxiv. 42-51.

'Watch therefore: for ye know not what hour your Lord doth come.

'But know this, that if the good man of the house had known in what watch the thief would come, he would have watched, and would not have suffered his house to be broken up.

'Therefore be ye also ready; for in such an hour as ye think not the Son of man cometh.

'Who then is a faithful and wise servant, whom his lord hath made ruler over his household, to give them meat in due season?

'Blessed *is* that servant, whom his lord when he cometh shall find so doing.

'Verily I say unto you, That he shall make him ruler over all his goods.

'But and if that evil servant shall say in his heart, My lord delayeth his coming;

'And shall begin to smite *his* fellow-servants, and to eat and drink with the drunken;

'The lord of that servant shall come in a day when he looketh not for *him*, and in an hour that he is not aware of.

'And shall cut him asunder, and appoint *him* his portion with the hypocrites: there shall be weeping and gnashing of teeth.'

"The words 'He shall make him ruler' are noteworthy as among the indications that the work of the faithful servant does not cease, either after his own removal from his earthly labour, or even after the final consummation of the kingdom. Over and above the joy of the beatific vision, or what is figured to us as the peace of Paradise, there will still be a work to be done

analogous to that which has been the man's training here, and in it there will be scope for all the faculties and energies that have been thus disciplined and developed."[1]

"Cut him asunder" is an Eastern form of punishment, and this expression is one of nearly one hundred different terms used in the New Testament as types of the final punishment of unrepentant sinners at the Last Day.

'Then shall the kingdom of heaven be likened unto ten virgins, which took their lamps, and went forth to meet the bridegroom. Matt. xxv 1-13.

'And five of them were wise, and five *were* foolish.

'They that *were* foolish took their lamps, and took no oil with them:

'But the wise took oil in their vessels with their lamps.

'While the bridegroom tarried, they all slumbered and slept.

'And at midnight there was a cry made, Behold, the bridegroom cometh; go ye out to meet him.

'Then all those virgins arose, and trimmed their lamps.

'And the foolish said unto the wise, Give us of your oil; for our lamps are gone out.* * R.V. are going out.

'But the wise answered, saying, *Not so;* lest there be not enough for us and you: but go ye rather to them that sell, and buy for yourselves.

'And while they went to buy, the bridegroom came; and they that were ready went in with him to the marriage: and the door was shut.

'Afterward came also the other virgins, saying, Lord, Lord, open to us.

'But he answered and said, Verily I say unto you, I know you not.

'Watch therefore, for ye know neither the day nor the hour wherein the Son of man cometh.'

"It is not said even of the foolish virgins that the door which was shut upon them would never again be opened, and that they were to be left for ever in the outer darkness. The terms of the parable would be satisfied by their exclusion from the joy and triumph symbolized by the first resurrection. If admitted at all, it must be after a long discipline of suffering, and under the eternal conditions that there must be the burning Rev. xx. 6

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

lamp ; that there is no heaven possible without holiness."[1]

(See my remarks on Matt. xxii. 1-14.)

Matt. xxv. 14-30.

'For *the kingdom of heaven is* as a man travelling into a far country, *who* called his own servants, and delivered unto them his goods.

'And unto one he gave five talents, to another two, and to another one ; to every man according to his several ability ; and straightway took his journey.

'Then he that had received the five talents went and traded with the same, and made *them* other five talents.

'And likewise he that *had received* two, he also gained other two.

'But he that had received one went and digged in the earth, and hid his lord's money.

'After a long time the lord of those servants cometh, and reckoneth with them.

'And so he that had received five talents came and brought other five talents, saying, Lord, thou deliveredst unto me five talents : behold, I have gained beside them five talents more.

'His lord said unto him, Well done, *thou* good and faithful servant : thou hast been faithful over a few things, I will make thee ruler over many things : enter thou into the joy of thy lord.

'He also that had received two talents came and said, Lord, thou deliveredst unto me two talents : behold, I have gained two other talents beside them.

'His lord said unto him, Well done, good and faithful servant ; thou hast been faithful over a few things, I will make thee ruler over many things : enter thou into the joy of thy lord.

'Then he which had received the one talent came and said, Lord, I knew thee that thou art an hard man, reaping where thou hast not sown, and gathering where thou hast not strawed :

'And I was afraid, and went and hid thy talent in the earth : lo, *there* thou hast *that is* thine.

'His lord answered and said unto him, *Thou* wicked and slothful servant, thou knewest that I reap where I sowed not, and gather where I have not strawed :

'Thou oughtest therefore to have put my money to the exchangers, and *then* at my coming I should have received mine own with usury.

'Take therefore the talent from him, and give *it* unto him which hath ten talents.

'For unto every one that hath shall be given, and he shall have abundance : but from him that hath not shall be taken away even that which he hath.

'And cast ye the unprofitable servant into outer darkness : there shall be weeping and gnashing of teeth.'

[1] "The Spirits in Prison," by Dean E. H. Plumptre, D.D., 1884, pp. 62, 63. (William Isbister, Limited.)

"Here again, as in chapter xxiv. 47, we have a glimpse given us into the future that lies behind the veil. So far as the Parable brings before us prominently either the final judgment or that which follows upon each man's death, we see that the reward of faithful work lies not in rest only, but in enlarged activity. The world to come is thus connected by a law of continuity with that in which we live; and those who have so used their 'talents' as to turn many to righteousness may find new spheres of action, beyond all our dreams, in that world in which the ties of brotherhood that have been formed on earth are not extinguished, but, so we may reverently believe, multiplied and strengthened."[1]

Matt. xxv. 31-46.

'When the Son of man shall come in His glory, and all the holy angels with Him, then shall He sit upon the throne of His glory:

'And before Him shall be gathered all nations: and He shall separate them one from another, as a shepherd divideth *his* sheep from the goats:

'And He shall set the sheep on His right hand, but the goats on the left.

'Then shall the King say unto them on His right hand, Come, ye blessed of My Father, inherit the kingdom prepared for you from the foundation of the world:

'For I was an hungred, and ye gave Me meat: I was thirsty, and ye gave Me drink: I was a stranger, and ye took me in:

'Naked, and ye clothed Me: I was sick, and ye visited Me: I was in prison, and ye came unto me.

'Then shall the righteous answer Him, saying, Lord, when saw we Thee an hungred, and fed *Thee?* or thirsty, and gave *Thee* drink?

'When saw we Thee a stranger, and took *Thee* in? or naked, and clothed *Thee?*

'Or when saw we Thee sick, or in prison, and came unto Thee?

'And the King shall answer and say unto them, Verily I say unto you, Inasmuch as ye have done *it* unto one of the least of these My brethren, ye have done *it* unto Me.

'Then shall he say also unto them on the left hand, Depart from Me, ye cursed, into everlasting fire,* prepared for the devil and his angels:

* R.V. eternal fire.

'For I was an hungred, and ye gave Me no meat: I was thirsty, and ye gave Me no drink:

'I was a stranger, and ye took Me not in: naked, and ye clothed Me not: sick, and in prison, and ye visited Me not.

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

'Then shall they also answer Him, saying, Lord, when saw we Thee an hungred, or athirst, or a stranger, or naked, or sick, or in prison, and did not minister unto Thee ?

'Then shall He answer them, saying, Verily I say unto you, Inasmuch as ye did *it* not to one of the least of these, ye did *it* not to Me.

* R.V. eternal punishment.

'And these shall go away into everlasting punishment :* but the righteous into life eternal.'

This passage clearly refers to the Last Day, and it is only quoted in this chapter because the majority of those who are to be judged must be spirits waiting in the Intermediate State, and it shows that they are conscious, and retain the memory of the life on earth.

Matt. xxvii. 52, 53.

'And the graves were opened ; and many bodies of the saints which slept arose,

'And came out of the graves after His resurrection, and went into the holy city, and appeared unto many.'

In Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary," attention is called to the fact that these appearances occurred *after* our Lord's resurrection, and it has been thought that the saints referred to were those who, believing in Jesus, had passed to their rest before His crucifixion.

The appearances certainly prove that spirits remain conscious after death.

Matt. xxviii. 19, 20. Mark xvi. 15.

'Go ye therefore, and teach all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Ghost :

'Teaching them to observe all things whatsoever I have commanded you : and, lo, I am with you always, *even* unto the end of the world. Amen.'

Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" points out that it is "interesting that this full declaration of the universality of the Gospel should be specially recorded in the Gospel (Matthew) written . . . specially for Jews."

The Gospel, or good tidings, being intended for the whole creation, how can it be imagined that all those who have died without having heard it are even now undergoing torments in what is called "Hell" ?

When put in this way the idea is preposterous, but this was the doctrine taught until quite lately.

An Intermediate State is a necessary complement to the above message.

'For every one shall be salted with fire, and every sacrifice shall be salted with salt.' — Mark ix. 49. Lev. ii. 13. Ezek. xliii. 24.

It is explained in Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" "that 'fire' represents the righteousness of God manifested as punishing and chastising—the discipline, in other words, of suffering. Of that discipline, our Lord says, 'every one' shall be a partaker. He shall thus be 'salted with fire,' for the tendency of that fire, the aim of the sufferings which it represents, is to purify and cleanse."

The ritual prescribed that "salt," as the natural symbol of incorruption, should be added to every sacrifice. — Lev. ii. 13.

In this passage it is declared that "salt," the purifying grace of the Eternal Spirit, is needed that the sacrifice of the spirit, soul, and body may be acceptable.

'Which devour widows' houses, and for a pretence make long prayers: these shall receive greater damnation.'* — Mark xii. 40. * R.V. condemnation.

The teaching here that all human spirits do not suffer equal condemnation shows that there are different unhappy spheres in the Intermediate State.

'And that servant, which knew his lord's will, and prepared not *himself*, neither did according to his will, shall be beaten with many *stripes*. — Luke xii. 47 48.

'But he that knew not, and did commit things worthy of stripes, shall be beaten with few *stripes*. For unto whomsoever much is given, of him shall be much required: and to whom men have committed much, of him they will ask the more.'

Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" says the words "his Lord's will" "included the use of all gifts and opportunities, as in the Parables of the Pounds and the Talents, with faithfulness and activity in using them."

The second verse is constantly quoted as appropriate to the heathen and others who have never had an opportunity of learning.

Whatever else this passage teaches, it clearly points to different spheres in the unhappy part of Hades.

Luke xiii. 6-9.

'He spake also this parable: A certain *man* had a fig-tree planted in his vineyard; and he came and sought fruit thereon, and found none.

'Then said he unto the dresser of his vineyard, Behold, these three years I come seeking fruit on this fig-tree, and find none: cut it down; why cumbereth it the ground?

'And he answering said unto him, Lord, let it alone this year also, till I shall dig about it, and dung *it:*

'And if it bear fruit, *well:* and if not, *then* after that thou shalt cut it down.'

The before-mentioned "Commentary" says: "(1) The vineyard is uniformly, in the parabolic language of Scripture, the symbol of Israel." "(2) The owner of that vineyard is none other than the great King, the Lord of Hosts." (3) The context points to the fig-tree "being the symbol of the individual soul, which, inheriting its place in a Divine order, is as a tree planted in the garden of the Lord." (4) The three years "represent, as the symbol of completeness, the full opportunities given to men, the calls to repentance and conversion which come to them in the several stages of their lives in youth, manhood, age." "(5) The dresser of the vineyard is the Lord Jesus Himself."

I quote this passage, as it may include improvement in Hades.

Luke xiv. 7-11.

'And He put forth a parable to those which were bidden, when He marked how they chose out the chief rooms; saying unto them,

'When thou art bidden of any man to a wedding, sit not down in the highest room; lest a more honourable man than thou be bidden of him;

'And he that bade thee and him come and say to thee, Give this man place; and thou begin with shame to take the lowest room.

'But when thou art bidden, go and sit down in the lowest room; that when he that bade thee cometh, he may say unto thee, Friend, go up higher: then shalt thou have worship in the presence of them that sit at meat with thee.

'For whosoever exalteth himself shall be abased; and he that humbleth himself shall be exalted.'

"Even the abasement of those who came seeking in their pride the chief places in the kingdom did not, in

the feasts of heaven any more than in the feasts of earth, necessarily imply exclusion from it. The lowest place, and the shame and humiliation of accepting it, might be for such persons the beginning of better things."[1]

Luke xv. 3-7. See Matt. xviii. 12-14.

'And He spake this parable unto them, saying,
'What man of you, having an hundred sheep, if he lose one of them, doth not leave the ninety and nine in the wilderness, and go after that which is lost, until he find it?
'And when he hath found *it*, he layeth *it* on his shoulders, rejoicing.
'And when he cometh home, he calleth together his friends and neighbours, saying unto them, Rejoice with me; for I have found my sheep which was lost.
'I say unto you, that likewise joy shall be in heaven over one sinner that repenteth, more than over ninety and nine just persons, which need no repentance.'

I cannot see that there is anything to limit this gracious seeking and recovering of lost sinners to this earth, and I believe the same action will go on in the Intermediate State until the Last Day.

Luke xv. 8-10.

'Either what woman having ten pieces of silver, if she lose one piece, doth not light a candle, and sweep the house and seek diligently till she find *it*?
'And when she hath found *it*, she calleth *her* friends and *her* neighbours together, saying, Rejoice with me; for I have found the piece which I had lost.
'Likewise, I say unto you, there is joy in the presence of the angels of God over one sinner that repenteth.'

The teaching here is the same as in the Parable of the Lost Sheep.

Luke xv. 11-32.

'And He said, A certain man had two sons:
'And the younger of them said to *his* father, Father, give me the portion of goods that falleth *to me*. And he divided unto them *his* living.
'And not many days after the younger son gathered all together, and took his journey into a far country, and there wasted his substance with riotous living.
'And when he had spent all, there arose a mighty famine in that land; and he began to be in want.
'And he went and joined himself to a citizen of that country; and he sent him into his fields to feed swine.
'And he would fain have filled his belly with the husks that the swine did eat: and no man gave unto him.
'And when he came to himself, he said, How many hired

[1] "The Spirits in Prison," by Dean E. H. Plumptre, D.D., 1884, p. 62. (William Isbister, Limited.)

servants of my father's have bread enough and to spare, and I perish with hunger!

'I will arise and go to my father, and will say unto him, Father, I have sinned against heaven, and before thee,

'And am no more worthy to be called thy son: make me as one of thy hired servants.

'And he arose, and came to his father. But when he was yet a great way off, his father saw him, and had compassion, and ran, and fell on his neck, and kissed him.

'And the son said unto him, Father, I have sinned against heaven, and in thy sight, and am no more worthy to be called thy son.

'But the father said to his servants, Bring forth the best robe, and put *it* on him; and put a ring on his hand, and shoes on *his* feet:

'And bring hither the fatted calf, and kill *it;* and let us eat, and be merry:

'For this my son was dead, and is alive again; he was lost, and is found. And they began to be merry.

'Now his elder son was in the field: and as he came and drew nigh to the house, he heard music and dancing.

'And he called one of the servants, and asked what these things meant.

'And he said unto him, Thy brother is come; and thy father hath killed the fatted calf, because he hath received him safe and sound.

'And he was angry, and would not go in: therefore came his father out, and intreated him.

'And he answering said to his father, Lo, these many years do I serve thee, neither trangressed I at any time thy commandment: and yet thou never gavest me a kid, that I might make merry with my friends:

'But as soon as this thy son was come, which hath devoured thy living with harlots, thou hast killed for him the fatted calf.

'And he said unto him, Son, thou art ever with me, and all that I have is thine.

'It was meet that we should make merry, and be glad: for this thy brother was dead, and is alive again; and was lost, and is found.'

"The elder son, who murmured at the welcome given to the repentant prodigal, was not, therefore, shut out from the father's house, but was reminded, rather, that he was ever with that father, and that he had, and might, if he would, evermore enjoy his full share of the inheritance."[1]

Luke xvi. 19-31. 'There was a certain rich man, which was clothed in purple and fine linen, and fared sumptuously every day:

[1] "The Spirits in Prison," by Dean E. H. Plumptre, D.D., 1884, p. 62. (William Isbister, Limited.)

'And there was a certain beggar named Lazarus, which was laid at his gate, full of sores.

'And desiring to be fed with the crumbs which fell from the rich man's table: moreover the dogs came and licked his sores.

'And it came to pass that the beggar died, and was carried by the angels into Abraham's bosom: the rich man also died, and was buried;

'And in hell* he lift up his eyes, being in torments, and seeth Abraham afar off, and Lazarus in his bosom. * R.V. Hades.

'And he cried and said, Father Abraham, have mercy on me, and send Lazarus, that he may dip the tip of his finger in water, and cool my tongue; for I am tormented in this flame.† † R.V. in anguish.

'But Abraham said, Son, remember that thou in thy lifetime receivedst thy good things, and likewise Lazarus evil things: but now he is comforted, and thou art tormented.‡ ‡ R.V. in anguish.

'And beside all this, between us and you there is a great gulf fixed: so that they which would pass from hence to you cannot; neither can they pass to us, that *would come* from thence.

'Then he said, I pray thee therefore, father, that thou wouldest send him to my father's house:

'For I have five brethren; that he may testify unto them, lest they also come into this place of torment.

'Abraham saith unto him, They have Moses and the prophets; let them hear them.

'And he said, Nay, father Abraham: but if one went unto them from the dead, they will repent.

'And he said unto him, If they hear not Moses and the prophets, neither will they be persuaded, though one rose from the dead.'

The teaching in this parable, which was spoken to men who all believed in Sheol, or Hades, was clearly a confirmation of the existing doctrine, and it emphasized the bitter anguish of the rich man who was in the unhappy sphere of Hades.

Irenæus, who taught in the second century after Christ, interpreted the parable according to its simple language, and I hold it is monstrous for men now to say that it had no reference to the Intermediate State, but was a prophecy of the future of the Jews.

'For the Son of man is come to seek and to save that which was lost.' Luke xix. 10.

These words were spoken by Jesus when He stayed in the house of Zacchæus, "which was the chief among the publicans, and he was rich."

On a previous occasion, Jesus had spoken these Matt. xviii. 11.

words, with the exception of "to seek," with reference to a "little child."

There is no reason why these words should be held to apply only to this world, and I hold that the seeking and saving will be continued in the Intermediate State.

Luke xix. 12-27.

'He said therefore, A certain nobleman went into a far country to receive for himself a kingdom, and to return.

'And he called his ten servants, and delivered them ten pounds, and said unto them, Occupy till I come.

'But his citizens hated him, and sent a message after him, saying, We will not have this *man* to reign over us.

'And it came to pass, that when he was returned, having received the kingdom, then he commanded these servants to be called unto him, to whom he had given the money, that he might know how much every man had gained by trading.

'Then came the first, saying, Lord, thy pound hath gained ten pounds.

'And he said unto him, Well, thou good servant: because thou hast been faithful in a very little, have thou authority over ten cities.

'And the second came, saying, Lord, thy pound hath gained five pounds.

'And he said likewise to him, Be thou also over five cities.

'And another came, saying, Lord, behold, *here is* thy pound, which I have kept laid up in a napkin:

'For I feared thee, because thou art an austere man: thou takest up that thou layedst not down, and reapest that thou didst not sow.

'And he saith unto him, Out of thine own mouth will I judge thee, *thou* wicked servant. Thou knewest that I was an austere man, taking up that I laid not down, and reaping that I did not sow:

'Wherefore then gavest not thou my money into the bank, that at my coming I might have required mine own with usury?

'And he said unto them that stood by, Take from him the pound, and give *it* to him that hath ten pounds.

'(And they said unto him, Lord, he hath ten pounds.)

'For I say unto you, That unto every one which hath shall be given; and from him that hath not, even that he hath shall be taken away from him.

'But those mine enemies, which would not that I should reign over them, bring hither, and slay *them* before me.'

"'Have thou authority over ten cities.' The reward of faithfulness in this life, and probably in the life to come, will be found in yet wider opportunities for work in God's service. 'Authority over ten cities' must have something corresponding to it,

some energy and work of guidance, in the realities of the unseen world, and cannot simply be understood as fulfilled in the beatific vision, or the life of ceaseless praise and adoration."[1]

'And Jesus said unto him, Verily I say unto thee, To-day shalt thou be with Me in Paradise.' Luke xxiii. 43.

It is certain that "Paradise" is a sphere of Hades, and not heaven, because Jesus said to Mary Magdalene, on the Sunday morning after His resurrection: "I am *not yet* ascended to My Father." John xx. 17.

'And when Jesus had cried with a loud voice, He said, Father, into Thy hands I commend My spirit: and having said thus, He gave up the ghost.' Luke xxiii. 46.

This passage is quoted to lay stress on the fact that the cry was, "I commend My *spirit*," and not my *soul*, which would have been in accordance with the mistaken thought even of to-day.

'The next day John seeth Jesus coming unto him, and saith, Behold the Lamb of God, which taketh away the sin of the world.' John i. 29.

'For God so loved the world, that He gave His only begotten Son, that whosoever believeth in Him should not perish, but have everlasting life.* John iii. 16, 17.

'For God sent not His Son into the world to condemn the world; but that the world through Him might be saved.' * R.V. eternal life.

I quote these two passages, because they seem to be a complete answer to Calvin's doctrine that the vast majority of mankind will be tormented for ever and ever in material flames of fire to satisfy the outraged dignity of God.

'And as Moses lifted up the serpent in the wilderness, even so must the Son of man be lifted up: John iii. 14, 15.

'That whosoever believeth in Him should not perish, but have eternal life.'

"Perish" is one of the many terms used as types of the final destruction of unrepentant sinners, and as many have no chance of knowing, and so of believing in, Him on this earth, it is clear that they must have

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

their opportunity in the Intermediate State, or they cannot escape perishing.

John v. 24-29.
* R.V. eternal life.
† R.V. Judgment.

'Verily, verily, I say unto you, He that heareth My word, and believeth on Him that sent Me, hath everlasting life,* and shall not come into condemnation†; but is passed from death unto life.

'Verily, verily, I say unto you, The hour is coming, and now is, when the dead shall hear the voice of the Son of God: and they that hear shall live.

'For as the Father has life in Himself; so hath He given to the Son to have life in Himself;

'And hath given Him authority to execute judgment also, because He is the Son of man.

'Marvel not at this: for the hour is coming, in the which all that are in the graves shall hear His voice,

'And shall come forth; they that have done good, unto the resurrection of life; and they that have done evil, unto the resurrection of damnation.'‡

‡ R.V. Judgment.

The words "the dead shall hear" certainly teach that the spirits in Hades are conscious, and "they that hear shall live" contain a promise of forgiveness to repentant sinners.

John viii. 56.

'Your father Abraham rejoiced to see My day: and he saw *it*, and was glad.'

"Our Lord reveals here a truth of the unseen world that is beyond human knowledge or explanation. From that world Abraham was cognizant of the fact of the Incarnation, and saw in it the accomplishment of the promise which had brought joy to shepherds watching their flocks, as the patriarch had watched his; there came an angel, as angels had come to him, and a multitude of the heavenly host, exulting in the good news to men. In that joy Abraham had part. The truth comes as a ray of light across the abyss which separates the saints in heaven (in Paradise, a sphere of Hades) from saints on earth. As in the parable, where Lazarus is in Abraham's bosom, the rich man is represented as knowing and caring for his brethren on earth, so here the great patriarch is spoken of as knowing and rejoicing in the fact of the Incarnation. The faculty of reason cannot explain how it is, but the faculty of faith can receive the truth that

Luke xvi. 19-31.

there is a 'communion of saints,' and finds in it a comfort which robs separation of its bitterness, and a power which strengthens all the motives to a holy and devoted life."[1] Heb. xii. 1

'And I, if I be lifted up from the earth, will draw all *men* unto me.' John xii. 32. John iii. 14. John viii. 28.

This passage is quoted as proving the unlimited love of God towards men, and as the words 'all men' include every human being who has ever lived upon this earth, there must be consciousness and teaching in the Intermediate State, as many millions have never heard of Him, who is eager to draw them to Himself.

'I am the true vine, and My Father is the husbandman. John xv. 1-6.
'Every branch in Me that beareth not fruit He taketh away: and every *branch* that beareth fruit, He purgeth it, that it may bring forth more fruit.
'Now ye are clean through the word which I have spoken unto you.
'Abide in Me, and I in you. As the branch cannot bear fruit of itself, except it abide in the vine; no more can ye, except ye abide in Me.
'I am the vine, ye *are* the branches: He that abideth in Me, and I in him, the same bringeth forth much fruit: for without Me ye can do nothing.
'If a man abide not in Me, he is cast forth as a branch, and is withered; and men gather them, and cast *them* into the fire, and they are burned.'

This metaphor, in which Jesus is the Vine and human beings are the branches, is carried on from this life on earth, through the life in Hades, to the Day of Final Judgment.

The branches are purged—*i.e.*, pruned and trained—both on earth and in Hades. The branch that is worthless when that Great Day arrives is, we are told, to be gathered with other similar withered branches into a bundle, and burned.

The clear meaning here is that all human spirits which are unrepentant and disbelieving, and therefore *worthless*, will, on that Day, be destroyed by what is figuratively called "fire."

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

John xx. 17. 'Jesus saith unto her, Touch Me not; for I am not yet ascended to My Father: but go to My brethren, and say unto them, I ascend unto My Father, and your Father; and *to* My God, and your God.'

Jesus had told the thief on the cross that he should be with Him in Paradise on the Friday; and as on this, the Sunday morning, He told Mary Magdalene He had not yet ascended to heaven, it is clear that He had been during the interval in Hades, and that Paradise is a sphere of Hades.

II.—All Spirits remain in the Intermediate State until the Second Advent of Jesus, or the Resurrection on the Last Day.

Matt. x. 15. Matt. xi. 20-24. Luke x. 13-15. 'Verily I say unto you, It shall be more tolerable for the land of Sodom and Gomorrha *in the day of judgment*, than for that city. . . .'

'Then began He to upbraid the cities wherein most of His mighty works were done, because they repented not:

'Woe unto thee, Chorazin! woe unto thee, Bethsaida! for if the mighty works, which were done in you, had been done in Tyre and Sidon, they would have repented long ago in sackcloth and ashes.

'But I say unto you, It shall be more tolerable for Tyre and Sidon *at the day of judgment*, than for you.

'And thou, Capernaum, which art exalted unto heaven, shalt be brought down to hell:* for if the mighty works, which have been done in thee, had been done in Sodom, it would have remained until this day.

* R.V. Hades.

'But I say unto you, That it shall be more tolerable for the land of Sodom *in the day of judgment*, than for thee.'

Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" says: "The phrase —'in the day of judgment'—like the Old Testament 'day of the Lord,' is wider in its range than the thoughts we commonly connect with it, and includes the earlier and more earthly judgments, as well as that which is the great consummation of them all."

These passages point to the Day of Judgment as the time when the final punishment of sin will be awarded, although three of these villages—Chorazin, Bethsaida, and Capernaum—have been completely obliterated.

'All things are delivered unto Me of My Father: and *no man knoweth* the Son, but the Father; *neither knoweth any man the Father*, save the Son, and *he* to whomsoever the Son will reveal *Him*.' Matt. xi. 27. Luke x. 22.

This is the same teaching as in S. John's Gospel: "No man hath ascended up to heaven." John iii. 13.

'Another parable put He forth unto them, saying, The kingdom of heaven is likened unto a man which sowed good seed in his field:

'But while men slept, his enemy came and sowed tares among the wheat, and went his way.

'But when the blade was sprung up, and brought forth fruit, then appeared the tares also.

'So the servants of the householder came and said unto him, Sir, didst not thou sow good seed in thy field? from whence then hath it tares?

'He said unto them, An enemy hath done this. The servants said unto him, Wilt thou then that we go and gather them up?

'But he said, Nay; lest while ye gather up the tares, ye root up also the wheat with them.

'Let both grow together until the *harvest:* and in the time of *harvest* I will say to the reapers, Gather ye together first the tares, and bind them in bundles to *burn them:* but gather the wheat into my barn.' Matt. xiii. 24-30, 36-43, 49, 50, iii. 12.

* * * * *

'Then Jesus sent the multitude away, and went into the house: and His disciples came unto Him, saying, Declare unto us the parable of the tares of the field.

'He answered and said unto them, He that soweth the good seed is the Son of man;

'The field is the world; the good seed are the children of the kingdom; but the tares are the children of the wicked *one:*

'The enemy that sowed them is the devil; the harvest is the end of the world; and the reapers are the angels.

'As therefore the tares are gathered and burned in the fire; so shall it be in the end of this world.

'The Son of man shall send forth His angels, and they shall gather out of His kingdom all things that offend,* and them which do iniquity;

'And shall cast them into a furnace of fire: there shall be wailing and gnashing of teeth.

'*Then* shall the righteous shine forth as the sun in the kingdom of their Father. Who hath ears to hear, let him hear. Prov. iv. 18. Dan. xii. 3.

* R.V. cause stumbling.

* * * * *

'So shall it be at the end of the world: the angels shall come forth, and sever the wicked from among the just,

'And shall cast them into the furnace of fire: there shall be wailing and gnashing of teeth.'

The binding the tares in bundles and burning them, and the gathering of "all things that offend,† and them which do iniquity," "*in the end of the world*," and

† R.V. cause stumbling.

casting them into a furnace of fire, are types of the final destruction of unrepentant sinners at the Last Day.

Until the second Advent of Jesus, the good and the bad will grow together in different spheres in Hades.

Matt. xvi. 27. Mark viii. 38. Luke ix. 26.

'For the Son of man shall come in the glory of His Father with His angels; and *then* He shall reward every man according to his works.'

This clearly teaches that the *final* rewards will not be distributed until *after* the Second Coming of Jesus.

Matt. xvii. 1-3. Mark ix. 2-4. Luke ix. 28-30.

'And after six days Jesus taketh Peter, James, and John his brother, and bringeth them up into an high mountain apart.

'And was transfigured before them: and His face did shine as the sun, and His raiment was white as the light.

'And, behold, there appeared unto them Moses and Elias talking with him.'

This passage is quoted again because it proves that Moses and Elijah were still in the Intermediate State.

Matt. xix. 27-30, xx. 16. Mark x. 28-31. Luke xviii. 28-30, xxii. 28-30, xiii. 30.

'Then answered Peter and said unto Him, Behold, we have forsaken all, and followed Thee; what shall we have therefore?

'And Jesus said unto them, Verily I say unto you, That ye which have followed Me, *in the regeneration* when the Son of man shall sit in the throne of His glory, ye also shall sit upon twelve thrones, judging the twelve tribes of Israel.

'And every one that hath forsaken houses, or brethren, or sisters, or father, or mother, or wife, or children, or lands, for My name's sake, shall receive an hundredfold, and shall inherit everlasting life.*

'But many *that are* first shall be last; and the last *shall be* first.'

* R.V. Eternal life.

The phrase, "in the regeneration," like the phrase, "the times of restitution† of all things," refers to the Second Advent of Jesus, and it is not until *then* that even the Apostles will receive their full reward.

† R.V. restoration. Acts. iii. 21.

Matt. xxii. 29-32. Mark xii. 24-27.

'Jesus answered and said unto them, Ye do err, not knowing the scriptures, nor the power of God.

'For in the resurrection they neither marry, nor are given in marriage, but are as the angels of God in heaven.

'But as touching the resurrection of the dead, have ye not read that which was spoken unto you by God, saying,

'I am the God of Abraham, and the God of Isaac, and the

God of Jacob ? God is not the God of the dead, but of the living.'

' And Jesus answering said unto them, The children of this world marry, and are given in marriage : Luke xx. 34-38.

' But they which shall be accounted worthy to obtain that world, and the resurrection from the dead, neither marry, nor are given in marriage :

' Neither can they die any more : for they are equal unto the angels ; and are the children of God, being the children of the resurrection.

' Now that the dead are raised, even Moses shewed at the bush, when he calleth the Lord the God of Abraham, and the God of Isaac, and the God of Jacob.

' For he is not a God of the dead, but of the living : for all live unto Him.'

These passages, and particularly that from Luke, show that " the resurrection " is in the future, and that Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob are still in the Intermediate State, and they are alive.

' *When* the Son of man shall come in His glory, and all the holy angels with Him, *then* shall He sit upon the throne of His glory :

' And before Him shall be gathered all nations : and He shall separate them one from another, as a shepherd divideth *his* sheep from the goats.

' And He shall set the sheep on His right hand, but the goats on the left. Matt. xxv. 31-46. Mark viii. 38, xiii. 26, 27. Luke ix. 26, xiii. 24-30, xxi. 27.

' *Then* shall the King say unto them on His right hand, Come, ye blessed of My Father, inherit the kingdom prepared for you from the foundation of the world :

' For I was an hungred, and ye gave Me meat : I was thirsty, and ye gave Me drink : I was a stranger, and ye took Me in :

' Naked, and ye clothed Me : I was sick, and ye visited Me : I was in prison, and ye came unto Me.

' *Then* shall the righteous answer Him, saying, Lord, when saw we Thee an hungred, and fed *Thee ?* or thirsty, and gave *Thee* drink ?

' When saw we Thee a stranger, and took *Thee* in ? or naked, and clothed *Thee ?*

' Or when saw we Thee sick, or in prison, and came unto Thee ?

' And the King shall answer and say unto them, Verily I say unto you, Inasmuch as ye have done *it* unto one of the least of these My brethren, ye have done *it* unto Me.

' *Then* shall He say also unto them on the left hand, Depart from Me, ye cursed, into everlasting fire,* prepared for the devil and his angels : * R.V. eternal fire.

' For I was an hungred, and ye gave Me no meat : I was thirsty, and ye gave Me no drink :

' I was a stranger, and ye took Me not in : naked, and ye clothed Me not : sick, and in prison, and ye visited Me not.

' *Then* shall they also answer Him, saying, Lord, when

saw we Thee an hungred, or athirst, or a stranger, or naked, or sick, or in prison, and did not minister unto Thee ?

'Then shall He answer them, saying, Verily I say unto you, Inasmuch as ye did *it* not to one of the least of these, ye did *it* not to Me.

'And these shall go away into everlasting punishment*: but the righteous into life eternal.'

* R.V. eternal punishment.

This seems completely to disprove the teaching of the Church of Rome that those dying with the guilt of mortal sin unabsolved are *at once* thrown into the fire prepared for the devil and his angels.

John i. 18. Matt. xi. 27. Luke x. 22.

'*No man* hath seen God at *any* time ; the only begotten Son, which is in the bosom of the Father, He hath declared *him*.'

John iii. 13. Prov. xxx. 4.

'And *no man* hath ascended up to heaven, but He that came down from heaven, *even* the Son of man which is in heaven.'

John v. 28, 29.

'Marvel not at this : for the hour is coming, in the which all that are in the graves shall hear His voice,

'And shall come forth ; they that have done good, unto the resurrection of life ; and they that have done evil, unto the resurrection of damnation.'†

† R.V. judgment.

This shows that the resurrection is in the future, and therefore "all that are in the graves" must still be in the Intermediate State.

John vi. 39, 40, 46.

'And this is the Father's will which hath sent Me, that of all which he hath given Me I should lose nothing, but should raise it up again at the last day.

'And this is the will of Him that sent Me, that every one which seeth the Son, and believeth on Him, may have everlasting life :‡ and I will raise him up at the last day.'

‡ R.V. eternal life.

John xx. 17.

'*Not that any man* hath seen the Father, save He which is of God, He hath seen the Father.'

'Jesus saith unto her, Touch Me not ; for I am not yet ascended to My Father : but go to My brethren, and say unto them, I ascend unto My Father, and your Father ; and *to* My God, and your God.'

Jesus here taught that at death the spirit does not naturally ascend at once to heaven.

CHAPTER III

I.—THE TEACHING OF THE APOSTLES AND ST. LUKE ABOUT HADES.

II.—ALL SPIRITS REMAIN IN THE INTERMEDIATE STATE UNTIL THE SECOND ADVENT OF JESUS, OR THE RESURRECTION ON THE LAST DAY.

CHAPTER III

I.—The Teaching of the Apostles and St. Luke about Hades.

1. 'Because Thou wilt not leave my soul in hell, neither wilt Thou suffer Thine Holy One to see corruption.' Acts ii. 27.

2. 'He seeing this before spake of the resurrection of Christ, that His soul was not left in hell, neither His flesh did see corruption.' Acts ii. 31.

3. '*I am* He that liveth, and was dead; and, behold, I am alive for evermore, Amen; and have the keys of hell and of death.' Rev. i. 18.

4. 'And I looked, and behold a pale horse: and his name that sat on him was Death, and Hell followed with him. And power was given unto them over the fourth part of the earth, to kill with sword, and with hunger, and with death, and with the beasts of the earth.' Rev. vi. 8.

5. 'And the sea gave up the dead which were in it; and death and hell delivered up the dead which were in them: and they were judged every man according to their works. Rev. xx. 13, 14.

6. 'And death and hell were cast into the lake of fire. This is the second death.'

In the Revised Version the word "Hades" is found in the above six verses in place of "Hell."

The reason that the Apostles did not lay more stress on the continuance of life in Hades has been explained by the undoubted fact that they expected the immediate return of Jesus, and Hades, therefore, had not the same importance to them as it has since acquired.

'That he may take part of this ministry and apostleship, from which Judas by transgression fell, that he might go to his own place.' Acts i. 25.

This passage may perhaps be read as teaching that, after death, the spirit naturally finds its way to the sphere of Hades, which is appropriate to its spiritual state.

Acts ii. 21. 'And it shall come to pass, *that* whosoever shall call on the name of the Lord shall be saved.'

This is a continuation of the teaching of Jesus, that no cry of a penitent sinner will be overlooked, and that the mercy of God is without limit.

Acts ii. 24-27. 'Whom God hath raised up, having loosed the pains of death: because it was not possible that He should be holden of it.

'For David speaketh concerning Him, I foresaw the Lord always before my face, for He is on my right hand, that I should not be moved:

'Therefore did my heart rejoice, and my tongue was glad; moreover also my flesh shall rest in hope:

'Because Thou wilt not leave my soul in hell,* neither wilt thou suffer Thine Holy One to see corruption.'

* R.V. Hades.

This was the first public witness to the stupendous fact of the Resurrection of Jesus, and it amounted to a denial of the story invented by the chief priests to the effect that the body of Jesus had been removed by His disciples while the Roman soldiers of the watch slept.

Matt. xxviii 11-15.

"Because it was not possible." "The moral impossibility was, we may say, twofold. The work of the Son of Man could not have ended in a failure and death, which would have given the lie to all that He had asserted of Himself. Its issue could not run counter to the prophecies which had implied with more or less clearness a victory over death. The latter, as the sequel shows, was the thought prominent in St. Peter's mind."[1]

Acts ii. 39. 'For the promise is unto you, and to your children, and to all that are afar off, *even* as many as the Lord our God shall call.'

This shows that *all* people are included in the promise, and therefore those who do not hear the name of Jesus Christ while they are on earth must hear it, and be taught, in the Intermediate State.

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

'Repent ye therefore, and be converted, that your sins may be blotted out, when the times of refreshing shall come from the presence of the Lord; Acts iii. 19-21.

'And He shall send Jesus Christ, which before was preached unto you:

'Whom the heaven must receive until the times of restitution* of all things, which God hath spoken by the mouth of all His holy prophets since the world began.' * R.V. restoration. Mark ix. 12. Acts i. 6.

This passage expresses "the idea of a state in which 'righteousness,' and not 'sin,' shall have dominion over a redeemed and new-created world; and that idea suggests a wider hope as to the possibilities of growth in wisdom and holiness, or even of repentance and conversion, in the unseen world, than that with which Christendom has too often been content."[1]

'Ye are the children of the prophets, and of the covenant which God made with our fathers, saying unto Abraham, And in thy seed shall all the kindreds of the earth be blessed. Acts iii. 25, 26.

'Unto you first God, having raised up His Son Jesus, sent Him to bless you, in turning away every one of you from his iniquities.'

St. Paul afterwards recognized the truth of this point of St. Peter's teaching—namely, that "all nations" were included in the promise made to Abraham. Gal. iii. 8.

It follows, therefore, that the spirits of the dead millions of heathen and others, who had never heard the Name of Jesus while they were on earth, must hear it in the Intermediate State.

'And they stoned Stephen, calling upon *God*, and saying, Lord Jesus, receive my spirit.' Acts vii. 59.

The cry of Jesus on the cross was: 'Father, into Thy hands I commend My *spirit*.' Luke xxiii. 46.

Here Stephen cried: 'Lord Jesus, receive my *spirit*.'

These two instances should be sufficient to correct the misuse of the word "soul."

'And He commanded us to preach unto the people, and to testify that it is He which was ordained of God *to be* the Judge of quick and dead. Acts x. 42, 43.

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

'To him give all the prophets witness, that through His name whosoever believeth in Him shall receive remission of sins.'

This "remission of sins" must apply to the Intermediate State, as well as to this earth, because many millions have never heard that Name until they entered the Intermediate State.

Acts xiii. 38, 39. 'Be it known unto you therefore, men *and* brethren, that through this man is preached unto you the forgiveness of sins:

'And by Him all that believe are justified from all things, from which ye could not be justified by the law of Moses.'

St. Paul here clearly taught that the promise of forgiveness was absolute and without limit to all that believe, and the promise must have extended to the Intermediate State, where those who had never heard the Name on earth would be taught to believe.

Acts xxvi. 6, 7. 'And now I stand and am judged for the hope of the promise made of God unto our fathers:

'Unto which *promise* our twelve tribes, instantly serving *God* day and night, hope to come. For which hope's sake, King Agrippa, I am accused of the Jews.'

This passage is quoted because "the promise" includes the resurrection from the dead, and this implies an Intermediate State between Death and the Last Day.

Rom. ii. 1-16. 'Therefore thou art inexcusable, O man, whosoever thou art that judgest: for wherein thou judgest another, thou condemnest thyself; for thou that judgest doest the same things.

'But we are sure that the judgment of God is according to truth against them which commit such things.

'And thinkest thou this, O man, that judgest them which do such things, and doest the same, that thou shalt escape the judgment of God?

'Or despiseth thou the riches of His goodness and forbearance and longsuffering; not knowing that the goodness of God leadeth thee to repentance?

'But after thy hardness and impenitent heart treasurest up unto thyself wrath against the day of wrath and revelation of the righteous judgment of God;

'Who will render to every man according to his deeds:

To them who by patient continuance in well doing seek for glory and honour and immortality, eternal life:

'But unto them that are contentious, and do not obey the truth, but obey unrighteousness, indignation and wrath,

'Tribulation and anguish, upon every soul of man that doeth evil, of the Jew first, and also of the Gentile;

'But glory, honour, and peace, to every man that worketh good, to the Jew first, and also to the Gentile:

'For there is no respect of persons with God.

'For as many as have sinned without law shall also perish without law: and as many as have sinned in the law shall be judged by the law;

'(For not the hearers of the law *are* just before God, but the doers of the law shall be justified.

'For when the Gentiles, which have not the law, do by nature the things contained in the law, these, having not the law, are a law unto themselves:

'Which shew the work of the law written in their hearts, their conscience also bearing witness, and *their* thoughts the meanwhile accusing or else excusing one another;)

'In the day when God shall judge the secrets of men by Jesus Christ according to My gospel.'

"According to his deeds." "The Apostle here lays down with unmistakable definiteness and precision the doctrine that *works*, what a man has *done*, the moral tenor of his life, will be the standard by which he will be judged at the Last Day. There can be no question that this is the consistent doctrine of Scripture."[1]

Matt. xvi. 27, xxv. 31 *et seq.*
2 Cor. v. 10.
Gal. vi. 7 *et seq.*
Eph. vi. 8.
Col. iii. 24.
Rev. ii. 23, xx. 12, xxii. 12.

There is another side, however, to the theology of St. Paul. He teaches that, "in consideration, not of any fulfilment of the Law, but that the main tenor and direction of a man's life has been right as proved by his faith in Christ, the grace of God is extended towards him, and makes up that in which he is behind. Though not deserving, in a strict sense, the bliss of the Messianic kingdom, the believer is, nevertheless, admitted to it on account of his belief in the great Head of that kingdom, and his participation through that faith in the Christian scheme."[2]

The words, "will render to every man according to his deeds," are often quoted as proving that there are different spheres in Hades, both for the righteous and the wicked.

Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary"[3] says: "Jew and Gentile alike will be judged, each by the method proper

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)
[2] *Ibid.* [3] *Ibid.*

to his case—the Jew by the written Law against which he has sinned, the Gentile by the unwritten law of conscience against which he, too, has sinned. The mere hearing of the Law will bring no exemption to the Jew; and, on the other hand, the Gentile, who, at the dictates of conscience, acts as if he were subject to law, shall have the full benefit that law can give him. In fact, his conscience is to him a law."

This, no doubt, is a correct exposition of St. Paul's teaching, which was applicable to the expected speedy return of Jesus, and the near approach of the Final Judgment.

Too much stress, however, appears to be laid on the Mosaic Law, which has been superseded by the Law of Christ; and the words, "as many as have sinned without law," would seem to be more applicable now to the heathen as opposed to those professing Christianity.

Rom. viii. 22, 23.

'For we know that the whole creation groaneth and travaileth in pain together until now.

'And not only *they*, but ourselves also, which have the firstfruits of the Spirit, even we ourselves groan within ourselves, waiting for the adoption, *to wit*, the redemption of our body.'

I see no reason why "the whole creation," or "every creature," according to the margin, should not be held to include the spirits in the Intermediate State.

Rom. xiv. 8-12.

'For whether we live, we live unto the Lord; and whether we die, we die unto the Lord: whether we live therefore, or die, we are the Lord's.

'For to this end Christ both died, and rose, and revived, that He might be Lord both of the dead and the living.

'But why dost thou judge thy brother? or why dost thou set at nought thy brother? for we shall all stand before the judgment seat of Christ.

'For it is written, *As* I live, saith the Lord, every knee shall bow to me, and every tongue shall confess to God.

'So then every one of us shall give account of himself to God.'

This certainly points to consciousness in the Intermediate State.

'Now he that planteth and he that watereth are one: and every man shall receive his own reward according to his own labour. 1 Cor. iii. 8-15.

'For we are labourers together with God: ye are God's husbandry, *ye are* God's building.

'According to the grace of God which is given unto me, as a wise masterbuilder, I have laid the foundation, and another buildeth thereon. But let every man take heed how he buildeth thereupon.

'For other foundation can no man lay than that is laid, which is Jesus Christ.

'Now if any man build upon this foundation gold, silver, precious stones, wood, hay, stubble;

'Every man's work shall be made manifest: for the day shall declare it, because it shall be revealed by fire; and the fire shall try every man's work of what sort it is.

'If any man's work abide which he hath built thereupon, he shall receive a reward.

'If any man's work shall be burned, he shall suffer loss: but he himself shall be saved; yet so as by fire.'

The Church of Rome quotes this passage as proof of the doctrine of Purgatory, *which it teaches;* but Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" points out that "the whole passage, and especially the reference to fire, is to be regarded as metaphorical, and not to be understood in a literal and physical sense."

The reference to "the day" in verse 13 seems to point clearly to the fact that no man's work shall be finally judged until the Last Day, and, therefore, until then all spirits—except those that rise at the second Advent—must remain in the Intermediate State.

'To deliver such an one unto Satan for the destruction of the flesh, that the spirit may be saved in the day of the Lord Jesus.' 1 Cor. v. 5. See Job ii. 4-10.

The reference to "the day of the Lord Jesus" points to there being no Final Judgment before the Last Day.

'For now we see through a glass, darkly; but then face to face: now I know in part; but then shall I know even as also I am known.' 1 Cor. xiii. 12. See Numb. xii. 8.

The word "then" clearly points to the Last Day. Until that Day the spirits in the Intermediate State will evidently not know everything.

1 Cor. xv. 28, 29.

'And when all things shall be subdued unto Him, then shall the Son also Himself be subject unto Him that put all things under Him, that God may be all in all.

'Else what shall they do which are baptized for the dead, if the dead rise not at all? why are they then baptized for the dead?'

This is "an allusion to the wholly unauthorized, and perhaps purely local, custom of having *a survivor baptized by proxy* for a Christian, who, from the bad practice of *deferring* baptism in the hope of wiping away all intermediate sins by one act, had died before he could be baptized."[1]

Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" says: "Does St. Paul, then, by what he here says, sanction the superstitious practice? Certainly not." It was an "*argumentum ad hominem*. The practice known as baptism for the dead was absurd if there be no resurrection. To practise it and to deny the doctrine of the resurrection was illogical."

1 Cor. xv. 35-50.

'But some *man* will say, How are the dead raised up? and with what body do they come?

'*Thou* fool, that which thou sowest is not quickened, except it die:

'And that which thou sowest, thou sowest not that body that shall be, but bare grain, it may chance of wheat, or of some other *grain*:

'But God giveth it a body as it hath pleased Him, and to every seed His own body.

'All flesh *is* not the same flesh: but *there is* one *kind of* flesh of men, another flesh of beasts, another of fishes, *and* another of birds.

'*There are* also celestial bodies, and bodies terrestrial: but the glory of the celestial *is* one, and the *glory* of the terrestrial *is* another.

'*There is* one glory of the sun, and another glory of the moon, and another glory of the stars: for *one* star differeth from *another* star in glory.

'So also *is* the resurrection of the dead. It is sown in corruption; it is raised in incorruption:

'It is sown in dishonour; it is raised in glory: it is sown in weakness; it is raised in power:

'It is sown a natural body; it is raised a spiritual body. There is a natural body, and there is a spiritual body.

---

[1] "Texts Explained," by Dean F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1899, p. 196. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

'And so it is written, The first man Adam was made a living soul; the last Adam *was made* a quickening spirit. Genesis ii. 7.

'Howbeit that *was* not first which is spiritual, but that which is natural; and afterward that which is spiritual.

'The first man *is* of the earth, earthy: the second man *is* the Lord from heaven.

'As *is* the earthy, such *are* they also that are earthy: and as *is* the heavenly, such *are* they also that are heavenly.

'And as we have borne the image of the earthy, we shall also bear the image of the heavenly.

'Now this I say, brethren, that flesh and blood cannot inherit the kingdom of God; neither doth corruption inherit incorruption.'

This wonderful passage seems to teach, among other things, that all spirits remain waiting somewhere until the second Advent of Jesus, or the Resurrection at the Last Day.

'Behold I show you a mystery; We shall not all sleep, but we shall all be changed, 1 Cor. xv. 51-58.

'In a moment, in the twinkling of an eye, at the last trump: for the trumpet shall sound, and the dead shall be raised incorruptible, and we shall be changed.

'For this corruptible must put on incorruption, and this mortal ***must*** put on immortality.

'So when this corruptible shall have put on incorruption, and this mortal shall have put on immortality, then shall be brought to pass the saying that is written, Death is swallowed up in victory.

'O death, where *is* thy sting? O grave, where *is* thy victory?

'The sting of death *is* sin; and the strength of sin *is* the law.

'But thanks *be* to God, which giveth us the victory through our Lord Jesus Christ.

'Therefore, my beloved brethren, be ye steadfast, unmovable, always abounding in the work of the Lord, forasmuch as ye know that your labour is not in vain in the Lord.'

St. Paul evidently thought that Jesus would come again during the lifetime of some to whom he was writing. The righteous dead would *not* come down from heaven, he taught, but would be raised from the Intermediate State, where they had been waiting.

'For which cause we faint not; but though our outward man perish, yet the inward *man* is renewed day by day. 2 Cor. iv. 16-18.

'For our light affliction, which is but for a moment, worketh for us a far more exceeding *and* eternal weight of glory;

'While we look not at the things which are seen, but at the things which are not seen: for the things which are seen *are* temporal; but the things which are not seen *are* eternal.'

"The inward man," the higher spiritual life, is "day by day" gaining fresh energies.

"The things which are not seen" (the very phrase of Heb. xi. 1) "are the objects of faith, immortality, eternal life, the crown of righteousness, the beatific vision. These things are subject to no time-limits, and endure through all the ages of God's purposes."[1]

2 Cor. ix. 6. 'But this *I say*, He which soweth sparingly shall reap also sparingly; and he which soweth bountifully shall reap also bountifully.'

This passage seems to point to different spheres in the Intermediate State, where degrees of reward are reaped.

2 Cor. xii. 1-5. 'It is not expedient for me doubtless to glory. I will come to visions and revelations of the Lord.

'I knew a man in Christ above fourteen years ago, (whether in the body, I cannot tell; or whether out of the body, I cannot tell: God knoweth;) such an one caught up to the third heaven.

'And I knew such a man, (whether in the body, or out of the body, I cannot tell: God knoweth;)

'How that he was caught up into paradise, and heard unspeakable words, which it is not lawful for a man to utter.

'Of such an one will I glory: yet of myself I will not glory, but in mine infirmities.'

Whatever else may be taught by St. Paul in these marvellous words, it is certain that he means us to understand that the spirits, waiting in that sphere of the Intermediate State which he called Paradise, are conscious and are able to converse.

Gal. vi. 7, 8. 'Be not deceived; God is not mocked: for whatsoever a man soweth, that shall he also reap.

'For he that soweth to his flesh shall of the flesh reap corruption; but he that soweth to the Spirit shall of the Spirit reap life everlasting.'*

* R.V. Eternal life.

This passage, also, points to different spheres in the Intermediate State.

Eph. iv. 7-13. 'But unto every one of us is given grace according to the measure of the gift of Christ.

'Wherefore He saith, when He ascended up on high, He led captivity captive, and gave gifts unto men.

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

'(Now that He ascended, what is it but that He also descended first into the lower parts of the earth ?

'He that descended is the same also that ascended up far above all heavens, that He might fill all things.)

'And He gave some, apostles ;* and some, prophets ; and some, evangelists ; and some, pastors and teachers ;

'For the perfecting of the saints, for the work of the ministry, for the edifying† of the body of Christ :

'Till we all come in the unity of the faith, and of the knowledge of the Son of God, unto a perfect man, unto the measure of the stature of the fulness of Christ :'

* R.V. to be apostles.

† R.V. build-up of.

See Ps. lxviii. 18.

Verse 8 is quoted by those who believe that, since the Resurrection of Jesus, the faithful are no longer detained in Hades, but are admitted into heaven immediately after death.

The true explanation of the passage is that He made a show of the "principalities and powers," openly "triumphing over them" in the Cross.[1]

Col. ii. 15.

This passage is held by many to prove all the assumptions I have made about the Intermediate State, including the preaching to waiting spirits being continued till the Last Day.

'Not with eyeservice, as menpleasers ; but as the servants of Christ, doing the will of God from the heart ;

'With good will doing service, as to the Lord, and not to men :

'Knowing that whatsoever good thing any man doeth, the same shall he receive of the Lord, whether *he be* bond or free.'

Eph. vi. 6-8.

The last verse may be understood as pointing to different spheres in the Intermediate State.

'Being confident of this very thing, that He which hath begun a good work in you will perform *it*† until the day of Jesus Christ.'

Philip. i. 6.

† R.V. perfect it.

"The day of Jesus Christ" is the day of the Final Judgment, and this passage clearly points to purification in the Intermediate State.

'For to me to live *is* Christ, and to die *is* gain.

'But if I live in the flesh, this *is* the fruit of my labour : yet what I shall choose I wot not.

'For I am in a strait betwixt two, having a desire to depart, and to be with Christ ; which is far better :

'Nevertheless to abide in the flesh *is* more needful for you.'

Philip. i. 21-24.

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

No one can doubt that St. Paul believed that after death he would be conscious, and in communion with Christ.

Philip. ii. 9-15. 'Wherefore God also hath highly exalted Him, and given Him a name which is above every name:

See Eph. i. 20, 21. 'That at the name of Jesus every knee should bow, of *things* in heaven, and *things* in earth, and *things* under the

Rev. v. 13. earth;

'And *that* every tongue should confess that Jesus Christ *is* Lord, to the glory of God the Father.

'Wherefore, my beloved, as ye have always obeyed, not as in my presence only, but now much more in my absence, work out your own salvation with fear and trembling.

'For it is God which worketh in you both to will and to do of *his* good pleasure.

'Do all things without murmurings and disputings:

'That ye may be blameless and harmless, the sons of God, without rebuke, in the midst of a crooked and perverse nation, among whom ye shine as lights in the world.'

Verse 10 clearly shows that "things under the earth," by which I understand spirits in Hades, are conscious, and have the power of speech of some description.

Philip. iii. 8-14. 'Yea doubtless, and I count all things *but* loss for the excellency of the knowledge of Christ Jesus my Lord: for whom I have suffered the loss of all things, and do count them *but* dung, that I may win Christ,

'And be found in Him, not having mine own righteousness, which is of the law, but that which is through the faith of Christ, the righteousness which is of God by faith:

'That I may know Him, and the power of His resurrection, and the fellowship of His sufferings, being made conformable unto His death;

'If by any means I might attain unto the resurrection of the dead.

'Not as though I had already attained, either were already perfect: but I follow after, if that I may apprehend that for which also I am apprehended of Christ Jesus.

'Brethren, I count not myself to have apprehended: but *this* one thing *I do*, forgetting those things which are behind, and reaching forth unto those things which are before,

'I press toward the mark for the prize of the high calling of God in Jesus Christ.'

I think the words, "If by any means I might attain unto the resurrection of the dead," show that St. Paul knew he would have to wait in the Intermediate State before he could win "the prize."

'For it pleased *the Father* that in Him should all fulness dwell; Col. i. 19-21.
'And, having made peace through the blood of His cross, by Him to reconcile all things unto Himself; by Him, *I say*, whether *they be* things in earth, or things in heaven.
'And you, that were sometime alienated and enemies in *your* mind by wicked works, yet now hath He reconciled.'

"To reconcile all things unto Himself." By *all things* I understand all spirits that have ever been on the earth, and it is, therefore, certain that there must be preaching in the Intermediate State to enable the millions of spirits of the heathen and others to be reconciled to Jesus.

'For God hath not appointed us to wrath, but to obtain salvation by our Lord Jesus Christ, 1 Thess. v. 9, 10.
'Who died for us, that, whether we wake or sleep, we should live together with Him.'

Whether we wake (are alive) or sleep (are dead), we should *live* together with Him.

The continuance of life after death is here clearly taught.

'And the very God of peace sanctify you wholly; and *I pray God* your whole spirit and soul and body be preserved blameless unto the coming of our Lord Jesus Christ.' 1 Thess. v. 23.

This verse is always quoted as proving the Tripartite nature of man.

The soul is distinctly a function of the body, and together they form "the flesh" of Scripture.

It is the "soul," with its dormant, or quickened spirit, in its spirit-body, which awaits in the Intermediate State the second Advent of Jesus, or the Last Day.

'For this is good and acceptable in the sight of God our Saviour: 1 Tim. ii. 3-6.
'Who will have all men to be saved, and to come unto the knowledge of the truth.
'For *there is* one God, and one mediator between God and men, the man Christ Jesus;
'Who gave Himself a ransom for all, to be testified in due time.'

"Redemption is universal, yet conditional; all *may* be saved, yet all *will* not be saved, because

all will not conform to God's appointed conditions."[1]

1 Tim. iv. 10. 'For therefore we both labour and suffer reproach, because we trust in the living God, who is the Saviour of all men, specially of those that believe.'

While the above words "warn us from entertaining any hopes of a universal redemption, such a saying as this seems to point to the blessed Atonement mystery as performing a work whose consequences reach far beyond the limits of human thought, or even of sober speculation."[2]

Heb. i. 13, 14. Ps. cx. 'But to which of the angels said He at any time, Sit on My right hand, until I make thine enemies thy footstool?

'Are they not all ministering spirits, sent forth to minister for them who shall be heirs of salvation?'

Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" says: "This word 'minister' is usually applied to those who stood before God in His earthly sanctuary: so here it is fitly used of the nobler offices of the unseen world."

Heb. iv. 1-16. 'Let us therefore fear, lest, a promise being left *us* of entering into His rest, any of you should seem to come short of it.

'For unto us was the gospel preached, as well as unto them: but the word preached did not profit them, not being mixed with faith in them that heard *it*.

'For we which have believed do enter into rest, as He said, As I have sworn in My wrath, if they shall enter into My rest: although the works were finished from the foundation of the world.

'For He spake in a certain place of the seventh *day* on this wise, And God did rest the seventh day from all His works.

'And in this *place* again, If they shall enter into My rest.

'Seeing therefore it remaineth that some must enter therein, and they to whom it was first preached entered not in because of unbelief:

'Again, He limiteth a certain day, saying in David, To-day, after so long a time; as it is said, To-day if ye will hear his voice, harden not your hearts.

'For if Jesus had given them rest, then would He not afterward have spoken of another day.'

---

[1] Ellicott, quoted in "Texts Explained," by Dean F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1899, p. 278. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

[2] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

'There remaineth therefore a rest to the people of God.
'For he that is entered into his rest, he also hath ceased from his own works, as God *did* from His.
'Let us labour therefore to enter into that rest, lest any man fall after the same example of unbelief.
'For the word of God *is* quick, and powerful, and sharper than any two-edged sword, piercing even to the dividing asunder of soul and spirit, and of the joints and marrow, and *is* a discerner of the thoughts and intents of the heart.
'Neither is there any creature that is not manifest in His sight: but all things *are* naked and opened unto the eyes of Him with whom we have to do.
'Seeing then that we have a great high priest, that is passed into the heavens, Jesus the Son of God, let us hold fast *our* profession.
'For we have not an high priest which cannot be touched with the feeling of our infirmities; but was in all points tempted like as *we are, yet* without sin.
'Let us therefore come boldly unto the throne of grace, that we may obtain mercy, and find grace to help in time of need.'

"'Lest a promise being left us.' Here it is simply said that such a promise remains unexhausted, waiting for complete fulfilment."[1]

"'Any of you should seem to come short of it.' St. Paul refers to the judge who witnesses and declares the failure. 'Lest any one . . . be held (or be adjudged) to have come short of the promise.'"[2]

'And as it is appointed unto men once to die, but after this the judgment.' Heb. ix. 27.

In the Revised Version this passage reads, "And inasmuch as it is appointed unto men once to die, and after this cometh *judgment*"—*not the* judgment.[3] Canon Luckock explains the meaning to be that after death there is a judgment or crisis by which the place of the spirit in Hades is determined. Page 158.

This verse is quoted by those who believe that spirits will be judged immediately after death, and then admitted into heaven, or cast into everlasting flames.

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)
[2] *Ibid.*
[3] "The Intermediate State," by Canon H. M. Luckock, D.D., 1890, p. 22. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

Heb. xi. 13-16.

'These all died in faith, not having received the promises, but having seen them afar off, and were persuaded of *them*, and embraced *them*, and confessed that they were strangers and pilgrims on the earth.

'For they that say such things declare plainly that they seek a country.*

* R.V. a country of their own.

'And truly, if they had been mindful of that *country* from whence they came out, they might have had opportunity to have returned.

'But now they desire a better *country*, that is, an heavenly: wherefore God is not ashamed to be called their God: for He hath prepared for them a city.'

"It will be easy to see how each one for himself (of the patriarchs) would be led to regard the state of wandering in which he spent his life as an emblem of a state of earthly waiting for an enduring home; the sojourning in the land was a constant symbol of the sojourning upon earth. Hence the same language is used from age to age after Canaan is received as an inheritance."[1]

Heb. xii. 5-11.

'And ye have forgotten the exhortation which speaketh unto you as unto children, My son, despise not thou the chastening of the Lord, nor faint when thou art rebuked of Him:

'For whom the Lord loveth He chasteneth, and scourgeth every son whom He receiveth.

'If ye endure chastening, God dealeth with you as with sons; for what son is he whom the father chasteneth not?

'But if ye be without chastisement, whereof all are partakers, then are ye bastards, and not sons.

'Furthermore we have had fathers of our flesh which corrected us, and we gave them reverence: shall we not much rather be in subjection unto the Father of spirits, and live?

'For they verily for a few days chastened us after their own pleasure; but He for *our* profit, that *we* might be partakers of His holiness.

'Now no chastening for the present seemeth to be joyous, but grievous: nevertheless afterward it yieldeth the peaceable fruit of righteousness unto them which are exercised thereby.'

This "chastening" may be continued in the Intermediate State, after the spirit, which would not "endure" it on earth, has left its body.

1 Pet. v. 10.

'But the God of all grace, who hath called us unto His eternal glory by Christ Jesus, after that ye have suffered a while, make you perfect, stablish, strengthen, settle *you*.'

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

St. Peter may have had in his mind the "perfecting" of the spirits in Hades as well as the men still on earth.

'The Lord is not slack concerning His promise, as some men count slackness; but is longsuffering to us-ward, not willing that any should perish, but that all should come to repentance.' 2 Pet. iii. 9.

"Not willing that any should perish, but that all should come to repentance."

These words must include repentance in the Intermediate State, because there is no salvation except through the Name of Jesus, which Name many millions have never heard on earth.

'If any man see his brother sin a sin *which is* not unto death, he shall ask, and he shall give him life* for them that sin not unto death. There is a sin unto death: I do not say that he shall pray for it.
'All unrighteousness is sin: and there is a sin not unto death.' 1 John v. 16, 17.
* R.V. God will give him life.

It is on this passage that the Church of Rome rests its dogma that mortal sin is the "sin unto death," and venial sin is the "sin which is not to death."

Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" remarks that to so divide sins, on the authority of this passage, "is to misunderstand the whole argument of the Epistle, and to seduce the conscience. St. John only means that, though prayer can do much for an erring brother, there is a wilfulness against which it would be powerless; for even prayer is not stronger than free-will."

It is clear that the "death" here referred to is the "second death" of the Last Day to which unrepentant sinners will be sentenced.

II.—All Spirits remain in the Intermediate State until the Second Advent of Jesus, or the Resurrection on the Last Day.

'Men *and* brethren, let me freely speak unto you of the patriarch David, that he is both dead and buried, and his sepulchre is with us unto this day.
'Therefore being a prophet, and knowing that God had sworn with an oath to him, that of the fruit of his loins, Acts ii. 29-35.

according to the flesh, He would raise up Christ to sit on his throne ;

' He seeing this before spake of the resurrection of Christ, that His soul was not left in hell,* neither His flesh did see corruption.

* R.V. Hades.

' This Jesus hath God raised up, whereof we all are witnesses.

Matt. xxii. 44. ' Therefore being by the right hand of God exalted, and having received of the Father the promise of the Holy Ghost, He hath shed forth this, which ye now see and hear.

Ps. cx. 1. ' For David is *not ascended into the heavens :* but he saith himself, The LORD said unto my Lord, Sit thou on my right hand,

' Until I make thy foes thy footstool.'

In Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" it is pointed out that "there is, when we remember what had passed but seven weeks before, something very striking in the reproduction by St. Peter of the very words by which our Lord had brought the scribes to confess their ignorance of the true interpretation of the Psalmist's mysterious words. Those who were then silenced are now taught how it was that David's Son was also David's Lord."

Ps. cx. 1.

Matt. xxii. 44.

1 Cor. i. 4-8. ' I thank my God always on your behalf, for the grace of God which is given you by Jesus Christ ;

' That in every thing ye are enriched by Him, in all utterance, and *in* all knowledge ;

' Even as the testimony of Christ was confirmed in you :

' So that ye come behind in no gift ; *waiting for the coming* of our Lord Jesus Christ :

' Who shall also confirm you *unto the end, that ye may be* blameless in the day of our Lord Jesus Christ.'

It is true that St. Paul expected "the coming of our Lord Jesus Christ" to take place very soon, but, still, the promise that He "shall also confirm you unto the end" must apply to the spirits in Hades, as well as to men on earth. The teaching clearly is that it was to the Day of this coming that men were to look for the great reward.

1 Cor. xv. 21-26. ' For since by man *came* death, by man *came* also the resurrection of the dead.

See 1 Thess. iv. 13, 17. ' For as in Adam all die, even so in Christ shall all be made alive.

Rev. xx. 1-15. ' But every man in his own order : Christ the firstfruits ; afterward they that are Christ's *at His coming.*

'Then *cometh* the end, when He shall have delivered up the kingdom to God, even the Father; when He shall have put down all rule and all authority and power.

'For He must reign, till He hath put all enemies under His feet.

'The last enemy *that* shall be destroyed *is* death.'

In Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" I find: "There is to be a sequence in the resurrection of the dead, and St. Paul explains this by the three groups: (1) Christ Himself, the firstfruits; (2) the faithful in Christ at His coming; (3) all the rest of mankind at the end, when the final judgment takes place. The interval between these latter two, as to its duration, or where or how it will be spent, is not spoken of here."

'If after the manner of men I have fought with beasts at Ephesus, what advantageth it me, *if the dead rise not?* let us eat and drink; for to-morrow we die.' 1 Cor. xv. 32. See Isa. xxii. 13.

The words in the last sentence recall "an inscription on a statue at Anchiale, a town in Cilicia, which was St. Paul's native province: 'Sardanapalus, the son of Anacyndraxes, built Anchiale and Tarsus in one day. Stranger, eat, drink, and play, for all the rest is not worth this.' The figure is represented as making a contemptuous motion with its fingers."[1]

St. Paul is really arguing the truth of the Resurrection, and he says, "if the dead rise not," our conduct is illogical.

'For we know that if our earthly house of *this* tabernacle were dissolved, we have a building of God, an house not made with hands, eternal in the heavens. 2 Cor. v. 1-10.

'For in this we groan, earnestly desiring to be clothed upon with our house which is from heaven:

'If so be that being clothed we shall not be found naked.

'For we that are in *this* tabernacle do groan, being burdened: not for that we would be unclothed, but clothed upon, that mortality might be swallowed up of life.

'Now he that hath wrought us for the selfsame thing *is* God, who also hath given unto us the earnest of the Spirit.* * Compare Phil. i. 21-25.

'Therefore *we are* always confident, knowing that, whilst we are at home in the body, we are absent from the Lord:

'(For we walk by faith, not by sight:)

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

'We are confident, *I say*, and willing rather to be absent from the body, and to be present with the Lord.

'Wherefore we labour, that, whether present or absent, we may be accepted of Him.

'For *we must all appear* before the judgment seat of Christ; that every one may receive the things *done* in *his* body, according to that he hath done, whether it *be* good or bad.'

Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" explains verse 8 as: "We are content, if death comes before the coming of the Lord, to accept death; for even though it does not bring with it the glory of the resurrection body, it does make us at home with Christ among the souls who wait for the resurrection."

Eph. i. 9-12

'Having made known unto us the mystery of His will, according to His good pleasure which He hath purposed in Himself:

'That in the dispensation of *the fulness of times* He might gather together in one all things in Christ, both which are in heaven, and which are on earth; *even* in Him:

'In whom also we have obtained an inheritance, being predestinated according to the purpose of Him who worketh all things after the counsel of His own will:

'That we should be to the praise of His glory, who first trusted in Christ.'

The following passage is quoted in explanation of verse 10:

Col. i. 16-20.

'For by Him were all things created, that are in heaven, and that are in earth, visible and invisible, whether *they be* thrones, or dominions, or principalities, or powers: all things were created by Him, and for Him:

'And He is before all things, and by Him all things consist.

'And He is the Head of the body, the Church: who is the beginning, the firstborn from the dead; that in all *things* He might have the pre-eminence.

'For it pleased *the Father* that in Him should all fulness dwell;

'And, having made peace through the blood of His cross, by Him to reconcile all things unto Himself; by Him, *I say*, whether *they be* things in earth, or things in heaven.'

These two passages seem to be a sufficient answer to Calvin's awful doctrine that the majority of mankind were doomed to suffer everlasting torments in material flames.

Phil. i. 6. * R.V. will perfect it.

'Being confident of this very thing, that He which hath begun a good work in you will perform* *it until the day of Jesus Christ.*'

This perfecting of the "good work" must be continually carried on in the Intermediate State.

'And this I pray, that your love may abound yet more and more in knowledge and *in* all judgment;
'That ye may approve things that are excellent; that ye may be sincere and without offence *till the day of Christ.*' Phil. i. 9, 10.

This passage, also, must point to the life in the Intermediate State, as well as to the life on earth.

'*When* Christ, *who is* our life, shall appear, *then* shall ye also appear with Him in glory.' Col. iii. 4.

Compare:

'Who shall change our vile body, that it may be fashioned like unto His glorious body, according to the working whereby He is able even to subdue all things unto Himself.' Phil. iii. 21.
'Behold, what manner of love the Father hath bestowed upon us, that we should be called the sons of God: therefore the world knoweth us not, because it knew Him not.
'Beloved, now are we the sons of God, and it doth not yet appear what we shall be: but we know that, *when* He shall appear, we shall be like Him; for we shall see Him as He is.' 1 John iii. 1, 2.
'But I would not have you to be ignorant, brethren, concerning them which are asleep, that ye sorrow not, even as others which have no hope.
'For if we believe that Jesus died and rose again, even so them also which sleep in Jesus will God bring with Him.
'For this we say unto you by the word of the Lord, that we which are alive *and* remain unto the coming of the Lord *shall not prevent** them which are asleep.
'For the Lord Himself shall descend from heaven with a shout, with the voice of the archangel, and with the trump of God: and the *dead in Christ shall rise first:*
'Then we which are alive *and* remain shall be caught up together with them in the clouds, to meet the Lord in the air: and so shall we ever be with the Lord.
'Wherefore comfort one another with these words.' 1 Thess. iv. 13-18.
* R.V. precede.

Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" explains that, "We here learn what was the exact nature of the Thessalonians' anxiety concerning the dead. They were full of excited hopes of the coming of that kingdom which had formed so prominent a part of the Apostle's preaching there; and were afraid that the highest glories in that kingdom would be engrossed by those who were alive to receive them; and that the dead, not being to rise till afterwards, would have less blessed Acts xvii. 7.

privileges. This would make them not only sorry for their dead friends, but also reluctant to die themselves."

The teaching is clear that all the dead remain in the Intermediate State until the second Advent of Jesus, or the general Resurrection.

1 Tim. vi. 14-16. 'That thou keep *this* commandment without spot, unrebukeable, until the appearing of our Lord Jesus Christ:

'Which in His times He shall shew, *who is* the blessed and only Potentate, the King of kings, and Lord of lords;

'Who only hath immortality, dwelling in the light which no man can approach unto; *whom no man hath seen*, nor can see: to whom *be* honour and power everlasting. Amen.'

Compare:

Deut. iv. 12. 'And the Lord spake unto you out of the midst of the fire: ye heard the voice of the words, but saw no similitude; only ye heard a voice.'

Exod. xxxiii. 20. 'And He said, Thou canst not see My face: for there shall no man see Me, and live.'

John i. 18. 1 John iv. 12. 'No man hath seen God at any time.'

The above passages teach that all spirits remain in the Intermediate State until the second Advent of Jesus, or the Last Day.

2 Tim. i. 12, 18. 'For the which cause I also suffer these things: nevertheless I am not ashamed: for I know whom I have believed, and am persuaded that He is able to keep that which I have committed unto Him against *that day*.'

* * * * *

'The Lord grant unto him that he may find mercy of the Lord *in that day*: and in how many things he ministered unto me at Ephesus, thou knowest very well.'

"That day" means the second Advent of Jesus, or the day of the Final Judgment, and it is clear that St. Paul taught that spirits do not receive their final reward until then.

2 Tim. iv. 8, 18. 'Henceforth there is laid up for me a crown of righteousness, which the Lord, the righteous judge, shall give me at *that* day: and not to me only, but unto all them also that love His appearing.'

'And the Lord shall deliver me from every evil work, and will preserve *me* unto His heavenly kingdom: to whom *be* glory for ever and ever. Amen.'

Heb. xi. 38-xii. 2. '(Of whom the world was not worthy:) they wandered in deserts, and *in* mountains, and *in* dens and caves of the earth.

'And these all, having obtained a good report through faith, received not the promise:

'God having provided some better thing for us, that they without us *should not be made* perfect.

'Wherefore seeing we also are compassed about with so great a cloud of witnesses, let us lay aside every weight, and the sin which doth so easily beset us, and let *us* run with patience the race that is set before us,

'Looking unto Jesus the Author and finisher of *our* faith; who for the joy that was set before Him endured the cross, despising the shame, and is set down at the right hand of the throne of God.'

The teaching in verse 40 is the same as in 1 Thess. iv. 15.

'But ye are come unto Mount Sion, and unto the city of the living God, the heavenly Jerusalem, and to an innumerable company of angels, Heb. xii. 22, 23.

'To the general assembly and church of the firstborn, which are written in heaven, and to God the Judge of all, and to the *spirits of just men made perfect.*'

These words recall the last verses of the preceding chapter.

"The analogy of Scripture forbids us to consider their present state as the full consummation; for that, these 'spirits' and we who are yet 'in the body' await the day of the resurrection. These words, however, do not refer to the period of the Old Covenant only; indeed they do not in strictness belong to that period at all. The spirits of the righteous servants of Christ join the same fellowship; and only when Christ was manifested does the state to which the name 'perfection' is thus given seem to have begun. What was received by those 'spirits of the righteous' when they saw the day of Christ, we cannot tell; but the teaching of Scripture seems to be that they were raised to some higher state of blessedness."[1]

'For Christ also hath once suffered for sins, the just for the unjust, that He might bring us to God, being put to death in the flesh, but quickened by the Spirit: 1 Pet. iii. 18-20.

'By which also* He went and preached unto the spirits in prison; * R.V. in which also.

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

'Which sometime were disobedient, when once the long-suffering of God waited in the days of Noah, while the ark was a preparing, wherein few, that is, eight souls were saved by water.'

1 Pet. iv. 6. 'For this cause was the gospel preached also to them that are dead, that they might be judged according to men in the flesh, but live according to God in the spirit.'

Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" says that "by the Spirit," in verse 18, should be "in spirit," and explains the passage by teaching "that the spirit, set free from the body, immediately receives new life, as it were, thereby. To purely spiritual realities it becomes alive in a manner which was impossible while it was united to the flesh. The new powers are exemplified in what follows immediately. So long as Christ, so long as any man, is alive in the flesh, he cannot hold converse with spirits as such; but the moment death severs flesh and spirit the spirit can deal with other spirits, which Christ proceeded forthwith to do."[1]

It is, further, distinctly held that "directly Christ's human spirit was disengaged from the body, He gave proof of the new powers of purely spiritual action thus acquired by going off to the place or state in which other disembodied spirits were, and conveyed to them certain tidings: He 'preached' unto them."[2]

1 Pet. v. 4. 'And *when* the chief Shepherd shall appear, ye shall receive a crown of glory that fadeth not away.'

This clearly teaches that the reward is *not* received until the chief Shepherd shall appear, and therefore spirits *must* be waiting in the Intermediate State.

2 Pet. ii. 4. * R.V. Tartarus. See Gen. vi. 2 and Jude 6. 'For if God spared not the angels that sinned, but cast *them* down to hell,* and delivered *them* into chains of darkness, to *be reserved unto judgment.*'

The Greek word, translated "hell," means Tartarus, and it occurs nowhere else in the Bible.

2 Pet. ii. 9. 'The Lord knoweth how to deliver the godly out of temptations, and to reserve the unjust unto the *day of judgment to be punished.*'

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)
[2] *Ibid.*

The Revised Version reads, "and to keep the unrighteous under punishment unto the day of judgment."

The error is similar to that of: "such as should be saved," instead of, "those that were being saved," of the Revised Version. Acts ii. 47.

The first passage certainly teaches that there are different spheres in the Intermediate State.

'And the angels which kept not their first estate, but left their own habitation, He hath reserved in everlasting chains under darkness *unto the judgment of the great day.*' Jude 6.

Compare:

'Those who seduced them shall be bound with chains for ever.' Enoch lxviii. 39.

'For if God spared not the angels that sinned, but cast *them* down to hell,* and delivered *them* into chains of darkness, to be reserved unto judgment.' 2 Pet. ii 4.

* R.V. Tartarus.

'*I am* He that liveth, and was dead; and, behold, I am alive for evermore, Amen; and have the keys of hell† and of death.' Rev. i. 18.

† R.V. Hades.

This passage teaches the continued existence of Hades, and is against the theory that, since the Resurrection of Jesus, the spirits of the righteous are not detained in Hades, but are transported at once to heaven.

'And I will kill her children with death; and all the churches shall know that I am He which searcheth the reins and hearts: and *I will give* unto every one of you according to your works. Rev. ii. 23-26.

'But unto you I say, and unto the rest in Thyatira, as many as have not this doctrine, and which have not known the depths of Satan, as they speak; I will put upon you none other burden.

'But that which ye have *already hold fast till I come.*

'And he that overcometh, and keepeth My works unto the end, to him will I give power over the nations:'

'And no man in heaven, nor in earth, *neither under the earth*, was able to open the book, neither to look thereon.' Rev. v. 3, 13.

* * * * * *

'And every creature which is in heaven, and on the earth, *and under the earth*, and such as are in the sea, and all that are in them, heard I saying, Blessing, and honour, and glory, and power, *be* unto Him that sitteth upon the throne, and unto the Lamb for ever and ever.'

'And when He had opened the fifth seal, I saw under the altar the souls of them that were slain for the word of God, and for the testimony which they held: Rev. vi. 9-11.

'And they cried with a loud voice, saying, How long, O Lord, holy and true, dost Thou *not judge and avenge* our blood on them that dwell on the earth?'

See Isa. ix. 7-18.

* R.V. or 'should have fulfilled their course.'

'And white robes were given unto every one of them; and it was said unto them, that they *should rest yet* for a little season, until their fellowservants also and their brethren, that should be killed as they *were, should be fulfilled.*'*

Rev. xi. 18.

'And the nations were angry, and Thy wrath is come, and the time of the dead, *that they should be judged*, and that Thou *shouldest give reward* unto Thy servants the prophets, and to the saints, and them that fear Thy name, small and great; and *shouldest destroy* them which destroy the earth.'

Rev. xiv. 13.

† R.V. 'for their works follow with them.'

'And I heard a voice from heaven saying unto me, Write, Blessed *are* the dead which die in the Lord from henceforth: Yea, saith the Spirit, that they may rest from their labours; and their works do *follow them.*'†

Rev. xx. 12, 13.

'And I saw the dead, small and great, stand before God; and the books were opened: and another book was opened, which is *the book* of life: and the dead *were judged* out of those things which were written in the books, according to their works.

'And the sea gave up the dead which were in it; and death and hell‡ delivered up the dead which were in them: and *they were judged* every man according to their works.'

‡ R.V. Hades.

Rev. xxi. 5-8.

'And He that sat upon the throne said, Behold, I make all things new. And He said unto me, Write: for these words are true and faithful.

'And He said unto me, It is done. I am Alpha and Omega, the beginning and the end. I *will give* unto him that is athirst of the fountain of the water of life freely.

'He that overcometh *shall inherit* all things; and I will be his God, and he shall be My son.

'But the fearful, and unbelieving, and the abominable, and murderers, and whoremongers, and sorcerers, and idolaters, and all liars, *shall have* their part in the lake which burneth with fire and brimstone: which is the second death.'

Rev. xxii. 12.

'And, behold, I come quickly; and My reward *is* with Me, *to give* every man according as his work shall be.'

CHAPTER IV

THE TEACHING OF THE EARLY FATHERS.

CHAPTER IV

The Teaching of the Early Fathers.

There is no doubt that the early Fathers and the early Church continued the Apostolic teaching that the spirits of all the dead went to Hades, the faithful to Abraham's bosom, or Paradise, and the ungodly to a state of unhappiness.

"The unanimity, indeed, of the early Church in holding this opinion has been one of the strongest arguments alleged by the Romish Church in favour of purgatory."[1]

"It is well known that the early Christians believed in an Intermediate State of the soul between death and resurrection, and this Intermediate State they too, like the Jews, called Hades."[2]

Justin Martyr.

In Justin Martyr's Dialogue with Trypho the Jew, before A.D. 165, we read:

"However, I affirm that no soul perishes entirely, or is annihilated, for this would really be good and joyful news to the wicked. What then? Why, that the souls of the righteous are reserved in a place of happiness, and those of the wicked and unjust in a place of misery and torment, in expectation of the great day of judgment. So that those which shall be judged worthy to appear before God shall not die any more; but these shall be punished as long as it shall

[1] "The Tripartite Nature of Man," by Rev. J. B. Heard, 1866, third edition, 1870, chapter xv. (T. and T. Clark.)

[2] "Exposition of the XXXIX. Articles," by Bishop E. Harold Browne, 1882, Article III., pp. 81, 82. (Longmans.)

please God to suffer them to exist, and to punish them."[1]

Irenæus.

Irenæus, who was born between A.D. 120 and 140, and was Bishop of Lyons, in France, during the last quarter of the second century, wrote in Book II., chapter xxxiv. :

"Souls can be recognized in the separate state, and are immortal although they once had a beginning.

"The Lord has taught with very great fulness, that souls not only continue to exist, not by passing from body to body, but that they preserve the same form (in their separate state) as the body had to which they were adapted, and that they remember the deeds which they did in this state of existence, and from which they have now ceased—in that narrative which is recorded respecting the rich man and that Lazarus who found repose in the bosom of Abraham. In this account He states that Dives knew Lazarus after death, and Abraham in like manner, and that each one of these persons continued in their own proper position, and that (Dives) requested Lazarus to be sent to relieve him—(Lazarus) on whom he did not (formerly) bestow even the crumbs (which fell) from his table. (He tells us) also of the answer given by Abraham, who was acquainted not only with what respected himself, but Dives also, and who enjoined those who did not wish to come into that place of torment to believe Moses and the prophets, and to receive the preaching of Him who was to rise again from the dead. By these things, then, it is plainly declared that souls continue to exist, that they possess the form of a man, so that they may be recognized, and retain the memory of things in this world ; moreover, that the gift of prophecy was possessed by

[1] The above "Dialogue," translated by Rev. Henry Brown, Vicar of Nether Sewell, in 1745, and reprinted in the "Christian Fathers of the First and Second Centuries," by Rev. E. Bickersteth, Rector of Watton, Herts, 1838. (Seeley and Burnside.)

Abraham, and that each class (of souls) receives a habitation such as it has deserved, even before the judgment."[1]

Tertullian, before A.D. 225, wrote in a treatise, "De Anima," in chapters lv. and lviii. : Tertullian.

"You have a treatise by us, 'De Paradiso' (On Paradise), in which we have established the position that every soul is detained in safe-keeping in Hades until the day of the Lord."

And again: "All souls, therefore, are shut up within Hades. . . . In short, inasmuch as we understand 'the prison' pointed out in the Gospel to be Hades, and as we also interpret 'the uttermost farthing' to mean the very smallest offence which has to be atoned for there before the resurrection, no one will hesitate to believe that the soul undergoes in Hades some compensatory discipline, without prejudice to the full process of the resurrection, when the recompense will be administered through the flesh besides."[2]

Origen, before A.D. 254, declared his belief that "not even the Apostles have received their perfect bliss; for the saints at their departure out of this life do not attain the full reward of their labours; but are awaiting us, who still remain on earth, loitering though we be, and slack."[3] Origen.

Lactantius, about A.D. 315, in his "Divine Institutes," Book VII., chapter xxi. : Lactantius.

"Nor, however, let anyone imagine that souls are immediately judged after death. For all are detained in one and a common place of confinement, until the arrival of the time in which the great Judge shall make

[1] "Ante-Nicene Christian Library," edited by Rev. Alexander Roberts, D.D., and James Donaldson, LL.D., 1868; "Irenæus," translated by Rev. A. Roberts, D.D., and Rev. W. H. Rambant, B.A. (T. and T. Clark.)

[2] *Ibid.*, 1870; "Quintus Sept Flor Tertullianus," translated by Peter Holmes, D.D., F.R.A.S. (T. and T. Clark.)

[3] "Exposition of the XXXIX. Articles," by Bishop E. Harold Browne, 1882, Article III., p. 82. (Longmans.)

an investigation of their deserts. Then they whose piety shall have been approved of will receive the reward of immortality ; but they whose sins and crimes shall have been brought to light will not rise again, but will be hidden in the same darkness with the wicked, being destined to certain punishment." [1]

St. Hilary.

St. Hilary, who was born between A.D. 315 and 320, wrote before A.D. 368 :

"Evil is mingled in varying proportions with good in the character of men at large ; God can detect it in the very best. All, therefore, need to be purified after death, if they are to escape condemnation on the Day of Judgment. . . . All who are infected by sin, the heretic who has erred in ignorance among them, must pass through cleansing fires after death." [2]

Ambrose.

Ambrose, a contemporary of St. Hilary, still more fully says that "while the fulness of time is expected, the souls await the reward, which is in store for them. Some, pain awaits ; others, glory. But, in the meantime, the former are not without trouble, nor are the latter without enjoyment." [3]

Eusebius.

Eusebius of Gaul, about A.D. 371 :

Speaking of "those worthy of temporal punishment," and referring to Matt. v. 22, he says: "In proportion to the matter of the sin will be the lingering in the passage. In proportion to the growth of the fault will be the discipline of the discerning flame ; in proportion to the things which iniquity in its folly hath wrought will be the severity of the wise punishment." ("De Epiph.," Hom. III.)[4]

[1] "Ante-Nicene Christian Library," edited by Rev. Alexander Roberts, D.D., and James Donaldson, LL.D. ; 'Lactantius,' translated by William Fletcher, D.D. (T. and T. Clark.)

[2] "Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church," edited by Rev. W. Sanday, D.D., LL.D., vol. ix., pp. xciii and xciv. (James Parker and Co., Oxford.)

[3] "Exposition of the XXXIX. Articles," by Bishop E. Harold Browne, 1882, Article III., p. 82. (Longmans.)

[4] "Mercy and Judgment," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, p. 22. (Macmillan.)

St. Gregory of Nyssa, about A.D. 395 : St. Gregory.

"Since, however, it is necessary that the stains which have been implanted into the soul from sin should be taken away by some process of healing, therefore in the present life the medicine of virtue is applied to it for the healing of such wounds ; but if it remains unhealed, *the healing is reserved in the life beyond*" ("Orat. Catech.," Opp. II. p. 493).[1]

St. Augustine, before A.D. 430, in his "Enchiridion to Laurentius," chapter cix. : St. Augustine.

"During the time, moreover, which intervenes between a man's death and the final resurrection, the soul dwells in a hidden retreat, where it enjoys rest or suffers affliction, just in proportion to the merit it has earned by the life which it led on earth."[2]

St. Paulinus of Nola, about A.D. 431 : St. Paulinus.

"That which the flame has not burnt, but proved, will be rewarded with a perpetual reward. He who hath done things which should be burned shall suffer loss, but *shall himself escape safe out of the fires.* Yet, wretched with the marks of his scathed body, he shall keep his life, not his glory" ("Paraphr.," Ps. i.).[3]

St. Isidore, about A.D. 633 : St. Isidore.

"When the Lord says, 'Neither in this world nor in the world to come,' He shows *that, for some, sins are* there to be forgiven" ("De Off Eccl.," 18).[4]

"The learned and thoughtful Lutheran Bishop Martensen, after arguing in favour of 'a realm of progressive development in which souls are prepared and matured for the final judgment,' adds that, though the Romish doctrine 'must be repudiated Bishop Martensen.

[1] "Mercy and Judgment," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, p. 42. (Macmillan.)

[2] "The Enchiridion of Augustine to Laurentius." taken by permission from T. and T. Clark's edition of St. Augustine's works.

[3] "Mercy and Judgment," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, p. 22. (Macmillan.)

[4] *Ibid.*, 1881, p. 23. (Macmillan.)

because it is mixed up with so many crude and false positions, it nevertheless contains the truth that the Intermediate State must, in a purely spiritual sense, be a Purgatory destined for the purifying of the soul.' "[1]

[1] "Eternal Hope," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1878, Preface, p. 20. (Macmillan.)

CHAPTER V

INNOVATIONS INTRODUCED BY THE CHURCH OF ROME.

THE GREAT SCHISM IN THE TWELFTH CENTURY.

THE SECOND SCHISM IN THE SIXTEENTH CENTURY.

CHAPTER V

Innovations introduced by the Church of Rome.

Indulgences first granted.

The Church of Rome, however, gradually introduced innovations into the original simple doctrine, and in A.D. 878 Pope John VIII., for the first time, granted indulgences from the penalties in Hades due for their sins to those who fell, or were to fall, in battle with the Pagans.[1]

Indulgences first openly sold.

In the eleventh century indulgences were, for the first time, openly sold, and this and other abuses led, in the twelfth century, to what is known as the Great Schism between the East and the West, between the Church at Constantinople and the Church at Rome.[2]

The Great Schism in the Twelfth Century.

The relations between the Greek Church and the Roman had been estranged from the fifth to the eleventh century, and it is sometimes held that the final break came in 1054, when Leo IX. excommunicated Michael Cerularius and the whole of the Eastern Church.[3]

According to Ffoulkes, however, intercourse between Rome and Constantinople was renewed more than once after that date, and the permanent breach in the twelfth century was caused by the overbearing character of the Norman crusaders.[4]

[1] "Explanation of the XXXIX. Articles," by Bishop A. P. Forbes, 1867, Article XXII., p. 358. (James Parker.)
[2] *Ibid.*
[3] "Encyclopædia Britannica," vol. xi., p. 156. [4] *Ibid.*

Letter from Pope Leo XIII. in 1895.

The causes that led to this Schism were set forth in reply to a letter from Pope Leo XIII. in 1895, in which he "invited all the Eastern Churches and the people of England to acknowledge his supremacy and prerogatives, and restore the unity of Christendom by submission to him."[1]

Reply from the Eastern Church.

"The Patriarch of the Orthodox Eastern Church sent a powerful answer, signed by himself and his suffragans, declaring that there could be no union till the Church of Rome abandoned her innovations and heterodox doctrines, and returned to the faith of the ancient fathers and councils."[2]

On the subject of the Intermediate State, the Eastern Bishops said:

"The One Holy Catholic and Apostolic Church of the seven Œcumenical Councils, in accordance with the inspired teaching of Holy Scripture and with the Apostolic tradition of old, in praying, invokes the mercy of God for pardon and repose of those who are asleep in the Lord. But the Papal Church, from the twelfth century onward, invented and accumulated in the person of the Pope—as if he enjoyed exclusively some special privilege—a multitude of innovations respecting Purgatory, the superfluity of grace in saints, and its distribution among those deficient in it, and such like; and she has further propounded the belief in a complete recompense of the just before the general Resurrection and Judgment."[3]

The Second Schism in the Sixteenth Century.

Before the Reformation England was in a state of slavery to the Pope of Rome in all questions of religion, and all the higher offices of the Church were filled up

[1] "The Reformation Settlement," by Canon M. MacColl, D.D., 1899, pp. 327, 328. (Longmans.)
[2] *Ibid.* [3] *Ibid.*

from Rome, and large fees were collected from the successful candidates.[1]

Rome claimed the power to grant or withhold dispensations for marriage, and insisted on all church services being conducted in Latin, which was an unknown tongue to most of the people.[2]

Among other abuses may be mentioned the traffic in Masses for the spirits in Purgatory ; the sale of indulgences, by which persons were allowed to purchase the remission of the penalties due for their sins ; the enforced practice of private confession ; the prayers to saints ; the denial of the cup to the laity ; and the worshipping of images and saints.[3]

England's struggle with Rome.

"It is a popular error to suppose that the struggle began with Henry VIII. He inherited it from a long line of predecessors. It will suffice to give the following summary of 16 Richard II., Cap. 5 ; and Richard was by no means the first English King who resisted the Pope's encroachments. This early Statute of Præmunire declares that the Crown of England has been free at all times ; that it has been under no earthly subjection, but immediately subject to God in all things touching the regality of the same Crown, and of none other. That no submission should be made to the Pope, who aimed at the perpetual destruction of the King, his crown, his regality, and all his realm, which God defend. The Commons, and the Lords spiritual and temporal, pledged themselves to the defence of the liberties of the Church of England and of the Crown as against the pretensions, claims, and usurpations of the Pope, with respect to sentences of excommunication, and the Pope's appointment to bishoprics and benefices, or any other interference with the rights and liberties of the Church of England. And all persons getting any Bull from Rome containing any matter

[1] "Anglican Church History," by E. Webley-Parry, 1879, chapters xxi.-xxv. (Griffith and Farran.)
[2] *Ibid.* [3] *Ibid.*

whatsoever, or publishing or putting the same in use, were to be judged traitors to the King and Realm; and being thereof lawfully indicted and attainted, according to the course of the laws of the Realm, would suffer pains of death, and to lose and forfeit all their lands, hereditaments, tenements, goods, and chattels, as in cases of high treason, by the laws of this Realm."[1]

The Protestant Reformation.

The Protestant Reformation may be said to have commenced in 1517, when Luther's thesis was published at Wittenberg, and it was consummated in 1545, when the Council of Trent sanctioned the "direct and open renunciation of mediæval doctrine which he initiated."[2]

In England, however, there had been resistance to the extortions practised by Wolsey's agents previous to 1517. In 1531 a proclamation was issued, "making it penal to introduce Bulls from Rome"; and this was followed by an Act imposing "severe penalties on all who should be found going about the country for the purpose of carrying on the sale of indulgences."[3]

Act of Supremacy.

Finally, in 1534, the clergy, assembled in both houses of convocation, renounced the Pope's authority, and expressly declared "that by the word of God, he has no more jurisdiction in England than any other foreign Bishop." In the same Act King Henry VIII. was styled supreme head of the Church of England under Christ.[4]

The oath of supremacy, taken in the reign of Queen Elizabeth, "contained a declaration that the sovereign is the only supreme governor of this realm, as well in spiritual and ecclesiastical causes as temporal; and that no foreign prince, prelate, state, or potentate hath, or ought to have, any jurisdiction, superiority or authority, ecclesiastical or spiritual, within this

[1] "The Reformation Settlement," by Canon M. MacColl, 1899, pp. 93, 94. (Longmans.)
[2] "Encyclopædia Britannica," vol. xx., p. 319.
[3] *Ibid.*, p. 331.
[4] "Anglican Church History," by E. Webley-Parry, 1879, pp. 216 and 257, 258.

realm." To guard against any wrong construction of this oath, the Queen at the same time published injunctions wherein she declared that she pretended to no priestly power; and that "she challenged no authority but what was of ancient time due to the imperial crown of England . . . so as no other foreign Power shall or ought to have any superiority."[1]

[1] "Anglican Church History," by E. Webley-Parry, 1879, pp. 216 and 257, 258.

CHAPTER VI

SOME OF THE MISTAKES AND DIFFICULTIES IN THE LANGUAGE OF THE AUTHORIZED VERSION OF THE NEW TESTAMENT.

CHAPTER VI

Some of the Mistakes and Difficulties in the Language of the Authorized Version of the New Testament.

Hell and damnation.
Damned, damnation.
Damnable.
Hell.
Gehenna.
Death.
Destruction.
Unquenchable fire
Tormented, and
Tormentors.
Punishment.
Everlasting, as applied to punishment.
The unpardonable sin.

Hell, and Damnation.

The misuse of these words has been the cause of much of the antagonism to Christianity, and it has also proved a great stumbling-block to many who wished to believe.

It is true that some of the errors have been corrected in the Revised Version of the Bible, but this is not yet in general use, and until it is, and until a generation has sprung up with no knowledge of the Authorized Version, John Wycliffe's mistakes will continue to be a serious obstacle to the spread of Christianity both at home and abroad.

My objection to the use of the word "Hell" is that, while in its original meaning it was a sufficiently correct translation of the words "Sheol" and "Hades," it was in no way an equivalent of the word "Gehenna." The Hebrew word "Sheol," the Greek word "Hades," and the Anglo-Saxon word "Helle," simply meant the grave, or the Intermediate State, where spirits remain between death and the resurrection.

The Latin word *Tartarus* meant the place where "the angels that sinned" were "reserved unto judgment" in "chains of darkness."

The Hebrew word "Gehenna" is one of nearly one hundred different terms which are used in the New Testament as types of the place where unrepentant sinners will finally cease to be. Thus, this place is described as :

Matt. viii. 12. 'Outer darkness: there shall be weeping and gnashing of teeth.'

Matt. x. 28. / Luke xii. 5. 'Fear Him which is able to destroy both soul and body in Gehenna.'

Rev. xix. 20. / Rev. xiv. 10, 11. 'A lake of fire, burning with brimstone,' in which sinners will be 'tormented with fire and brimstone in the presence of the holy angels, and in presence of the Lamb: And the smoke of their torment ascendeth up for ever and ever.'

Other passages refer to "a second death," and say that the persistent sinner shall be everlastingly destroyed, shall be slain, shall be ground to powder, rooted up, cast out, cast away like bad fish, cut asunder, shall perish, and shall be a castaway.

A.D. 1380. All this imagery of the Gospels and the Apocalypse has been attached to the word "Helle" by John Wycliffe and by divines who succeeded him, down to Charles Spurgeon, and even to the present day, and it seems to me to have been a cruel mistake.

The explanation is that this teaching was necessitated by the false dogma which had been laid down that "the soul of man, passing out of the body, goeth straightways either to heaven, or else to hell, whereof

the one needeth no prayer, and the other is without redemption."[1]

I say it became necessary, because only in this way could the Reformers silence questions about the different places mentioned in the original.

I suppose that most of us who are over fifty have sat in church and heard clergymen in the pulpit describing the torments in the place they invariably called "Hell," and telling the congregation that every man, woman, and child, who was not fit to enter heaven when they died, would be at once thrown into the flames.

The effect of such preaching was to send men away from church with the idea that the Omnipotent God was a cruel, revengeful tyrant.

It was probably far from the intention of the preacher to produce such a result, and he may have concluded his sermon by quoting the following passages of Scripture, which are quite opposed to the awful denunciation with which he had commenced:

'God is love,' — 1 John iv. 8
God 'will have all men to be saved,' and — 1 Tim. ii. 4.
Jesus came 'that the world through Him might be saved.' — John iii. 17.

Sermons such as I have described are not so often heard now as they were a few years ago, but I know for certain that the same doctrine is taught in some Sunday classes.

This teaching jarred on the feelings of even the young, who saw that it was inconsistent with the idea of a merciful God to hold that He would cast into everlasting torments millions of heathen and others who had never had a chance of learning His laws.

When men grew up and thought for themselves, they simply refused to believe in the everlasting fire, and each man either evolved a creed for himself, or ceased to believe in anything.

I have been told that to do away with the teaching of

[1] "Sermon concerning Prayer, in the Second Book of Homilies," 1563.

Hell is to remove a check on the commission of sin; but this is a mistake, and the present teaching of the Anglican Church is that sinners are punished in Hades, and those who are still unrepentant on the Day of Judgment will be cast into the lake of fire, and cease to be. The great difference between the Puritan and the present doctrine is that it is now taught that the final sentence will not be passed immediately after death.

Damned, Damnation, Damnable.

These words are found in fifteen verses of the Authorized Version of the New Testament, but in the Revised Version the original words have been translated, in six verses, "condemned" or "condemnation"; in five verses, "judged" or "judgment"; in two verses, "destructive" or "destruction"; in one verse, "an eternal sin"; and one verse has been omitted.[1]

Matt. xxiii. 14.

Greek, *krima*, denotes "judgment," the sentence pronounced.

		Authorized Version.	*Revised Version.*
Matt. xxiii. 14.	1.	'The greater damnation.'	Verse omitted.
Mark xii. 40.	2.	'Greater damnation.'	'Greater condemnation.'
Luke xx. 47.	3.	'Greater damnation.'	'Greater condemnation.'
Rom. iii. 8.	4.	'Whose damnation is just.'	'Whose condemnation is just.'
Rom. xiii. 2.	5.	'Shall receive to themselves damnation.'	'Shall receive to themselves judgment.'
1 Cor. xi. 29.	6.	'Eateth and drinketh damnation.'	'Eateth and drinketh judgment.'
1 Tim. v. 12.	7.	'Having damnation.'	'Having condemnation.'

Greek, *krisis*, denotes "judgment,"—*i.e.*, the process of judging.

		Authorized Version.	*Revised Version.*
Matt. xxiii. 33. Gehenna.	8.	'The damnation of hell.'	'The judgment of hell.'
Mark iii. 29.	9.	'Eternal damnation.'	'Is guilty of an eternal sin.'
John v. 29.	10.	'The resurrection of damnation.'	'The resurrection of judgment.'

[1] "Our Life after Death," by Rev. A. Chambers, 1894, Appendix, edition 1903. (Charles Taylor.)

Greek, *krinein*, denotes "to judge," not necessarily "to condemn."

	Authorized Version.	*Revised Version.*	
11.	'That they all might be damned.'	'That they all might be judged.'	2 Thess. ii. 12.

Greek, *katakrinein*, denotes "to condemn."

	Authorized Version.	*Revised Version.*	
12.	'Shall be damned.'	'Shall be condemned.'	Mark xvi. 16.
13.	'And he that doubteth is damned if he eat.'	'But he that doubteth is condemned if he eat.'	Rom. xiv. 23.

Greek, *apōleias*, denotes "destructive."

	Authorized Version.	*Revised Version.*	
14.	'Damnable heresies.'	'Destructive heresies.'	2 Pet. ii. 1.

Greek, *apōleia*, denotes "destruction."

	Authorized Version.	*Revised Version.*	
15.	'Their damnation slumbereth not.'	'Their destruction slumbereth not.'	2 Pet. ii. 3.

These Greek words occur more than one hundred and fifty times in the New Testament, and they were correctly translated except in the fifteen passages noted.[1]

It is clear that the translators used the words "damnation" and "damned" when they thought the passages pointed to future punishment; and as their idea of future punishment was of endless suffering and misery, they thought these words were better suited to the popular idea.[2]

If these Greek words had always been translated as in these fifteen passages, we should have read :[3]

1. 'For *krima* (damnation) I am come into this world.' John ix. 39.
2. 'Woe unto you, Pharisees! for ye . . . pass over *krisis* (damnation) and the love of God.' Luke xi. 42.
3. 'As I hear I judge; and my *krisis* (damnation) is just.' John v. 30.
4. 'So opened He not His mouth: in His humiliation his *krisis* (damnation) was taken away.' Acts viii. 32, 33.
5. 'Do ye not know that the saints shall *krinein* (damn) the world?' 1 Cor. vi. 2.

[1] "Our Life after Death," by Rev. A. Chambers, 1894, Appendix, edition 1903. (Charles Taylor.)

[2] *Ibid.*

[3] *Ibid.*

Matt. xxvii. 3. 6. 'Then Judas . . . when he saw that he was *kata krinein* (damned).'

John viii. 10, 11. 7. 'Hath no man *kata krinein* (damned) thee ?'

8. 'Neither do I *kata krinein* (damn) thee.'

"The verb 'to damn' probably came from an old Teutonic verb, *deman*, 'to deem.' It is at least closely related to the words 'deem' and 'doom.' It meant to *deem* anyone guilty of any kind of offence, and to *doom* him to its appropriate punishment. Thus, for example, a man might be damned to prison—*i.e.*, *deemed* worthy of it, and *doomed* to it; or his goods might be *damnified—i.e.*, injured or condemned; or a play might be *damned—i.e.*, hissed off the stage, *deemed* too poor for farther representation, and *doomed* never to appear again."[1]

Hell.

This word occurs twenty-three times in the Authorized Version of the New Testament, but in the original Greek the words used were :

Chaps. ii. and iii.

Hades	10
Gehenna	12
Tartarus	1
	23

The meaning of the Anglo-Saxon word "Helle" was simply to cover, to hide, or conceal.[2]

1. In some counties of England, to cover in with a roof was "to helle the building," and thatchers and tilers were called "helliers."[3]

2. In the sense of to hide or conceal, "helle" is used for the name of the dark place under a tailor's shop-board, where he throws the refuse pieces of cloth cut off in the course of his work.[4]

[1] "Salvator Mundi," by Rev. Samuel Cox, 1877, pp. 40, 41. (Kegan Paul, Trench and Co.)

[2] "New English Dictionary on Historical Principles," by J. A. H. Murray, 1905. (Clarendon Press, Oxford.)

[3] "Dictionary of Phrase and Fable," by Rev. E. Cobham Brewer, LL.D., 1894. (Cassell, Petter, and Galpin.)

[4] "New English Dictionary on Historical Principles," by J. A. H. Murray, 1905. (Clarendon Press, Oxford.)

3. The same word is also used for the place where broken type is thrown by printers.[1]

4. " Helle " is also the name of the " den " to which captives are carried in the games barley-break and prisoners' base.[1]

5. A gambling-house or gambling-booth is called a " helle."[1]

6. A place of confinement for debtors was called a " helle," or sponging-house.[1]

From very early times "Helle" was used for the grave, the abode of the dead, Hades, or the Intermediate State.[1]

1. In a Saxon Psalter, about A.D. 825, this word was used in verse 15 of Psalm lv. :[1]

' Let death seize upon them, and let them go down quick into helle.' — Hebrew, Sheol.

2. About A.D. 1000 we find " Helle " used in verse 35 of Gen. xxxvii. :[1]

' For I will go down into helle unto my son mourning.' — Hebrew Sheol.

3. In another Saxon Psalter, before A.D. 1340, in verse 10 of Ps. xvi. :[1]

' For Thou wilt not leave My soul in helle.' — Hebrew, Sheol.

It appears that the word " Helle " was also used by some Saxon writers to denote Tartarus, or those parts of Hades where the wicked and certain fallen angels suffer punishment.

The following are translations of extracts from certain Saxon writings :

1. About A.D. 888, in King Ælfred Boeth, 15 : " The fire in Helle is burning like that which is in the mountain called Etna."[1]

2. About A.D. 1020, Rule St. Benet, 36 (Logeman) : " Not with fear of Helle, but with Christ's love."[1]

3. About A.D. 1175, Lamb, Hom. 61 : " From whence the angels are fallen into the darkest Helle."[1]

[1] " New English Dictionary on Historical Principles," by J. A. H. Murray, 1905. (Clarendon Press, Oxford.)

4. Before A.D. 1225, Ancr, R. 150: "It is good for nothing but the fire of Helle."[1]

5. Before A.D. 1300, Cursor, M. 478: "Satan, who first fell through his pride into Helle."[1]

In the earliest copy of the Gospels in the Anglo-Saxon language[2] the translators were careful to avoid confusion, and while "Hades" was always translated "Helle," perfectly different words were used for Gehenna:

1. Matt. v. 22: 'to tinterge fyres.'
2. Matt. v. 29: 'in tintergo in cursung.'
3. Matt. v. 30: 'in tintergo.'
4. Matt. x. 28: 'in tintergo cursung.'
5. Matt. xviii. 9: 'in tintergo fyres.'
6. Matt. xxiii. 15: 'cursunges.'
7. Matt. xxiii. 33: 'tint 'ges.'
8. Mark ix. 43: 'in tintergo fyres.'
9. Mark ix. 45: 'in tintergo fyres.'
10. Mark ix. 47: 'in tintergo fyres.'
11. Luke xii. 5: 'in tintergo.'
12. Jas. iii. 6: not included with the Gospels.

Rev. Joseph Bosworth, 1888.

In the Rev. Joseph Bosworth's "Anglo-Saxon and English Dictionary," 1888, I find: "'Tintergo' means torment, affliction, or torture; 'cursung' means a cursing, torment, a curse."

John Wycliffe, who has been called the forerunner of the English Reformation, published the first English translation of the Bible in 1380; but, instead of retaining the words "Hades," "Gehenna," and "Tartarus," or translating them into different English equivalents, as the Saxon translators had done, he made the mistake of rendering the three Greek words by the one word "Helle."

Unfortunately, the English Reformers followed the lead given by John Wycliffe, and his error was repeated in the Authorized Version, published in 1611. (In the Revised Version, while "Hades" has been retained,

[1] "New English Dictionary on Historical Principles," by J. A. H. Murray, 1905. (Clarendon Press, Oxford.)

[2] "The Lindisfarne and Rushforth Gospels," printed from the Original Manuscripts in the British Museum and Bodleian Library. Published in Latin and Saxon for the Surtees Society of Durham, 1854-1865.

the word "Hell" has been used for Gehenna and Tartarus, but marginal notes explain what the word was in the original.)

The Reformers, in the mistaken zeal of their crusade against the false teaching of Rome, were determined to throw over all idea of an Intermediate State.

They missed the grand opportunity of restoring the original pure teaching about Hades, and they upheld the awful Puritan idea that all spirits are judged immediately after death, and are then translated to heaven or cast into everlasting flames, in the place they called "Helle."

Gehenna.

This is the Greek form of the Hebrew *Ge-Hinnom*, which means "the valley of Hinnom." It was situated in the immediate vicinity of Jerusalem, and in the time of King Solomon it was full of gardens belonging to wealthy inhabitants of Jerusalem.[1]

The valley was afterwards defiled by King Josiah to put an end to the horrid rites which had been introduced, connected with the worship of Molech, and at the time of the birth of Jesus it was used as the common cesspool of Jerusalem, into which the bodies of certain criminals were flung, and fires were always kept burning to purify the air.

2 Kings xxiii. 10.

1. 'Whosoever shall say, Thou fool, shall be in danger of hell* fire.'

Matt. v. 22. * R.V. 'hell of fire,' or 'Gehenna of fire.'

2, 3. 'For it is profitable for thee that one of thy members should perish, and not that thy whole body should be cast into hell.'†

Matt. v. 29, 30. † R.V. Gehenna.

[1] "Salvator Mundi," by Rev. Samuel Cox, 1877, p. 68. (Kegan Paul, Trench and Co.)
"Eternal Hope," by Canon Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1878. (Macmillan.)
"The Spirits in Prison," by Rev. Plumptre, 1884. (William Isbister.)

Matt. xviii. 9. Mark ix. 43, 45, 47. * R.V. 'Gehenna of fire,' or 'Gehenna.'

4-7. "It is better for thee to enter into life" with one eye. or maimed, or halt, rather than having two eyes, or two hands, or two feet "to be cast into hell* fire," or "the fire that never shall be quenched."

Matt. xxiii. 15. † R.V. Gehenna.

8. 'Ye make him twofold more the child of hell† than yourselves.'

Matt. xxiii. 33. ‡ R.V. judgment of Gehenna.

9. 'How can ye escape the damnation of hell?'‡

Jas. iii. 6. § Greek, Gehenna.

10. 'And the tongue is a fire, a world of iniquity . . . and it is set on fire of hell.'§

Matt. x. 28. ‖ R.V. Gehenna.

11. 'And fear not them which kill the body, but are not able to kill the soul: but rather fear him which is able to destroy both soul and body in hell.'‖

Luke xii. 5. ¶ R.V. Gehenna.

12. 'But I will forewarn you whom ye shall fear: Fear Him, which after He hath killed hath power to cast into hell;¶ yea, I say unto you, Fear Him.'

Matt. v. 22.

1. 'Whosoever shall say, Thou fool, shall be in danger of the Gehenna of fire.'

Jesus was "simply teaching an Oriental people, in the Oriental forms with which they were familiar, that every sin, however inward, will receive its due recompense of reward; that the heart is the fountain from which all sin flows; that in God's sight the murderous wish, scheme, bent, *is* murder: and that every utterance of it, whether in word or in deed, since it deepens and confirms it, will entail a still severer punishment."[1]

Matt. v. 29, 30.

2, 3. 'For it is profitable for thee that one of thy members should perish, and not that thy whole body should be cast into Gehenna.'

"Our Lord treated the law of adultery in precisely the same method and spirit in which he had treated the law of murder."[1]

[1] "Salvator Mundi," by Rev. Samuel Cox, 1877, p. 81. (Kegan Paul, Trench and Co.)

4-7. "It is better for thee to enter into life" with one eye, or maimed, or halt, rather than having two eyes, or two hands, or two feet "to be cast into the Gehenna of fire." Matt. xviii. 9. Mark ix. 43, 45, 47.

"What our Lord is really teaching here is one of the first and most important moral lessons we all have to master—viz., that we must learn to go without a great many things we should like to have; that we must learn to rule and deny ourselves on pain of being ruined and undone."[1]

8. 'Ye make him twofold more the child of Gehenna than yourselves.' Matt. xxiii. 15.

9. 'How can ye escape the judgment of Gehenna?' Matt. xxiii. 33.

Shaitan ki butcha — a child of Satan — is a very common expression applied by Muhammadan elders generally to a younger man who has done something outraging their sense of propriety; and 'a child of Gehenna' had much the same meaning.

"The judgment of Gehenna" referred to the sentence which the Jewish High Court, called the Sanhedrin, had the power to pass—namely, that the criminal should be killed by stoning, and that his *dead* body should be thrown into the polluted valley of Hinnom, where fires were always burning to consume the refuse of the city and the carcasses of animals.

"What our Lord intended was that the Pharisees *corrupted* the proselytes they were so zealous to make . . . by teaching them to veil greed, perjury, uncleanness, and even murder itself, behind a mask of religion; and that they themselves, therefore, deserved that very sentence to the death and horrors of Ge-Hinnom to which they were so ready to doom men far less guilty than themselves."[1]

10. 'And the tongue is a fire, a world of iniquity . . . and it is set on fire of Gehenna.' Jas. iii. 6.

The fire kindled by a mischievous tongue is here

[1] "Salvator Mundi," by Rev. Samuel Cox, 1877, pp. 84 and 87. (Kegan Paul, Trench and Co.)

figuratively likened to the evil-smelling fires which were always burning in the valley of Hinnom.

Matt. x. 28. 11. 'And fear not them which kill the body, but are not able to kill the soul: but rather fear Him which is able to destroy both soul and body in Gehenna.'

Luke xii. 5. 12. 'But I will forewarn you whom ye shall fear: Fear Him, which after He hath killed hath power to cast into Gehenna; yea, I say unto you, Fear Him.'

These are the only passages in which the mention of Gehenna had any reference to the soul, which lives on in its spirit body after the first death, together with its dormant or quickened spirit. Jesus may here be understood as expressly refuting Plato's doctrine of the natural immortality of the soul, and He taught that God *has* the power to kill the soul and its spirit body in some terrible place, which He metaphorically compared with the loathsome valley of Hinnom.

Mark ix. 43-48. In the record found in Mark there is clearly an allusion to the following passage in Isaiah, and it may be noted that it was only dead carcasses of which Isaiah said: "Their worm shall not die, neither shall their fire be quenched."

Isa. lxvi. 23, 24. 'And it shall come to pass, that from one new moon to another, and from one Sabbath to another, shall all flesh come to worship before Me, saith the Lord.

'And they shall go forth, and look upon the carcasses of the men that have transgressed against Me: for their worm shall not die, neither shall their fire be quenched; and they shall be an abhorring unto all flesh.'

It is clear that "Gehenna, or the valley of Hinnom, which supplied the imagery of destruction by fire and worm, was not a place of suffering or torture. The refuse and the vile were thrown there to be destroyed."[1]

Milton wrote in "Paradise Lost":

Book I., lines 403-405.

> "And made his grove
> The pleasant valley of Hinnom; Tophet thence
> And black Gehenna call'd, the type of Hell."

[1] "The Entire Evidence of Evangelists and Apostles on Future Punishment," by Rev. W. Griffith, 1882, pp. 41, 42. (Elliot Stock.)

Milton used the word "Hell" in the sense common to his time, but he would have been correct if he had written "type of the place of final destruction." Milton, 1667.

"Gehenna continued to be the name of the abode of the lost, both among those who received our Lord's teaching—Latins, Greeks, Syrians—and those who rejected it, even in our seventh century, when the name of Gehenna, as the place of everlasting punishment, was transferred into the Koran from Mohammed's Jewish teacher."[1]

I believe, with the Rev. Samuel Cox, that, on this one occasion, Jesus used the word "Gehenna" in the same sense as He used some one hundred different terms—as a type of the place where persistent sinners will finally be blotted out of existence after the judgment on the Last Day; on all the other occasions that Jesus used this word, He referred to the earthly punishment of the dead body being cast into the polluted valley of Hinnom. {Matt. x. 28. Luke xii. 5.

The translation from the Greek of the following words is correct, but to the words themselves, as used in Scripture, both in Greek and English, divines have attached a false meaning, from the time of the early Fathers down to the present day:

Death.
Destruction.
Unquenchable fire.
Tormented and tormentors.
Punishment.
Everlasting, as applied to punishment.

The meaning attached to the above words, and to all the similar expressions in the New Testament, has been endless existence in never-ending torments, and the explanation is that many of the early Fathers had adopted the doctrine of Plato (429–348 B.C.) about the

[1] "What is of Faith as to Everlasting Punishment," by Rev. E. B. Pusey, D.D., 1880, pp. 105, 106. (Parker, Strand.)

natural immortality of the soul, before they became Christians, and they insisted on retaining their old ideas when they entered the Church.

It is certain that we should have been spared all the misery which has been caused by following the lead given by these early converts, if the words quoted above had been interpreted in a natural way, according to the wise rules for interpretation which have since been laid down.

Canon of interpretation.

The judicious Hooker laid down the canon of interpretation that "where a literal construction will stand, the farthest from the letter is commonly the worst."[1]

"Of the literal sense, Luther said that it was the substance of faith and of theology; and Dean Alford held 'that a figurative sense of words is never admissible except when required by the context.'"[1]

Mr. W. Fetherston maintained that, "if a passage of Scripture admits of two interpretations, one of which would contradict numerous other passages of Scripture, and lead to results inconsistent with our fundamental ideas of God, whereas the other would be reconcileable with both, we may unhesitatingly reject the former interpretation and adopt the latter."[2]

Language of the New Testament.

With regard to the question of the language, the Rev. C. A. Row wrote: "My general conclusion with respect to the terminology of the New Testament in relation to future retribution therefore is, that the Greek words which are used by its writers conveyed the same general meaning to a Greek-speaking Christian as the corresponding English ones do to a reader of English; that they are used in their commonly accepted signification, and not in a special or technical sense, which would have been intelligible only to the initiated; that taking them as a whole, they were calculated to

[1] "Future Punishment," by Rev. R. H. McKim, D.D., 1883, p. 23. (Thomas Whittaker, New York.)

[2] "The New Symbols; or, Suggestions as to Future Divine Punishments," by W. Fetherston, 1890, p. 12. (Hodges, Figgis and Co., Dublin.)

convey to the reader the firm persuasion that it was the intention of the writer to affirm that God will execute a righteous judgment on mankind in the world beyond the grave, when He will reward and punish men according to their deeds; and that sin wilfully persisted in will be attended with suffering, which will end in the ultimate destruction of the sinner; yet that none of the terms employed in their ordinary or natural meaning convey even a hint that the suffering will be of endless duration."[1]

Death.

"The second death is, we suppose, when the capability of receiving a spiritual life is at an end, and when there shall be no more place found for repentance. In that case, which Scripture speaks of as following the day of the general judgment, the final state of the lost will be sealed for ever."[2]

"The well-known penalty for eating of the forbidden tree is thus expressed: 'In the day that thou eatest thereof thou shalt surely die'; or, as it is in the Hebrew, and as the margin shows you: 'Dying thou shalt die'—words of the most emphatic character.

"Now, those words are interpreted to mean, *Dying thou shalt never die.* Just as destruction is taken to signify eternal preservation in woe; and, being burnt up like chaff, is taken to signify being kept unconsumed, like the bush in the flames, unlike the bush, for ever."

"If to die is to live for ever, whether in suffering or in bliss, no language can be confidently construed."[3]

'And these shall go away into everlasting punishment: but the righteous into life eternal.' Matt. xxv. 46.

[1] "Future Retribution," by Rev. C. A. Row, 1889, p. 233. (William Isbister.)

[2] "The Tripartite Nature of Man," by Rev. J. B. Heard, 1866, p. 269. (T. and T. Clark.)

[3] "Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866, pp. 19, 24, edition 1867. (Longmans.)

"The antithesis supplied in the same verse to this word 'punishment' is 'life,' and therefore we are irresistibly driven to the conclusion that the word 'punishment' means '*death*'; and on looking into the original expression, we find it is *kolasis*, which word, according to Liddell and Scott, means 'a pruning or cutting off, separation, as a branch from a tree.'

"Here there is an everlasting result, not a process, and in this sense is quite an equivalent to *death*, thus
Rom. vi. 23. making Jesus agree with Paul, who said, 'The wages of sin is death; but the gift of God is eternal life.'

"In the Epistle to the Hebrews may be found the following expressions, which are grammatically constructed precisely as the phrase 'everlasting punishment':

Eternal judgment.
" salvation.
" redemption.
" covenant.

Is it not evident that the expressions all imply an everlasting result, and not an everlasting process?"[1]

Matt. x. 28. 'Fear Him which is able to destroy both soul and body in hell.'

This is "the 'pivot' on which our Lord bases His general teaching, and is not less the grand pivot on which hang the essential doctrines of the Church of England." Mr. Tomlinson shows that the daily service in the church assumes that the soul may die; that we pray for "life everlasting" (thereby proving that it is not our lot by birth); that we may rise to "*the life immortal*," and that we may "ever hold fast *the blessed hope of everlasting life*."[2]

[1] "Where are the Dead? Will any suffer Eternal Torment?" by Antipas, Defender of Faith, 1885, pp. 19, 20. (J. Martin and Co.)

[2] "Thoughts on Everlasting Death," by Rev. W. R. Tomlinson, 1888, p. 15. (Digby Long.)

Destruction.

"If we suppose the hearers of Jesus and His Apostles to have understood, as nearly as possible in the ordinary sense, the words employed, they must naturally have conceived them to mean (if they were taught nothing to the contrary) that the condemned were really and literally to be 'destroyed,' and cease to exist; not that they were to exist for ever in a state of wretchedness.

"On the whole, therefore, I think we are not warranted in concluding, (as some have done), so positively concerning the question as to make it a point of Christian faith to interpret figuratively and not literally the 'death' and 'destruction' of the Scripture as the doom of the condemned; and to insist on the belief that they are to be kept alive for ever."[1]

"The majority of these nouns and verbs, denoting *destruction* of some sort, are used by Plato again and again in the 'Phædon,' a dialogue on immortality, expressly for the purpose of conveying the idea of the literal *destruction* or *extinction of the soul*. . . . It is said that these words in the New Testament are not used in the sense in which Plato and all his readers for four hundred years, not less than all good writers in Greek following the times of Christ, used them; but in a new and special sense, which was created for them by *inspiration of God;* so that inspiration must be regarded as having for its object to give, not only a new, but a self-contradictory sense to some of the most familiar words in the Greek language. . . .

"'Where their worm dieth not' is also one of Plato's expressions for existence coming to an end. Mark ix. 44, 48.

"Isaiah wrote: 'For the moth shall eat them up like a garment, and *the worm* shall eat them like wool.' Isa. li. 8.

"The words of Jesus are plainly a citation from the last verse in the prophecies of Isaiah, where the context Mark ix. 44-50. Isa. lxvi. 24.

[1] "The Future State," by Archbishop Whately, 1829, pp. 180, 181. (B. Fellowes.)

proves beyond question that the worm stands naturally for '*putrefaction*,' the *concomitant of death*, and in this case the death of those 'slain by Jehovah.' "[1]

Matt. vii. 13. 'For wide is the gate, and broad is the way, that leadeth to *destruction*.'

"What is meant by the *destruction* of a man? I reply, the making an end of him *as a man*. . . . Just as a tree destroyed has no longer the properties of a tree, so a man destroyed has no longer the properties of man. His life, his consciousness, his feelings, are gone. . . .

"There seems, indeed, to be an impression on many minds that a spiritual entity, being, as it is said, a simple substance, *cannot* be destroyed; but Jesus said:

Matt. x. 28. 'Fear not them which kill the body, but are not able to kill the soul: but rather fear Him which is able to destroy both soul and body in hell.'* . . .

* R.V. Gehenna.

"If the wicked will never be destroyed, never perish, never die, never come utterly to an end, we must cast aside some hundreds of sentences as not to be received in their natural meaning—their natural meaning, that is, as either directly or implicitly expressed. . . .

"Let others say that *destruction* means endless preservation in misery: I accept what God declares; and I am sure that His truth will better promote virtue than man's error. . . ."[2]

"*Destruction* can be called everlasting when the effect, not the act of destroying, lasts eternally. Thus, a tree burnt to ashes is destroyed for ever. So a man is destroyed for ever if he be reduced to non-existence as a man, and is no longer a sentient creature."[3]

During the last quarter of a century, many writers have declared that the word "destruction," when applied to sinners, cannot be understood to mean

"L...ife in Christ," by Rev. Edward White, 1846, pp. 387-390. (Elliot Stock.)

[2] "Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866, pp. 6-8, edition 1867. (Longmans.)

[3] *Ibid.*

" conscious life in never-ending torments," but that it must mean that they will be killed irrevocably, never to be resuscitated, and become extinct.

Unquenchable Fire.

The translation of the Greek word *asbestos* as " that *never shall be quenched* " in the Authorized Version of the New Testament was quite unwarranted, and it has been altered in the Revised Version to " *unquenchable fire.*" Mark ix. 43, 45.

This word *asbestos* occurs only three times in the New Testament. " Unquenchable fire " is the metaphor used by John the Baptist for the fire used to burn up the chaff, and in Mark it is used for the fire of Gehenna, or the valley of Hinnom.[1] Matt. iii. 12. Luke iii. 17. Mark ix. 43.

To understand the meaning in Jewish speech of the term ' unquenchable fire,' we must look at its meaning in the Old Testament, and in secular writings of the day.

Thus, in the Old Testament we read :

' Moreover, the word of the Lord came unto me, saying.
' Son of man, set thy face toward the south, and drop thy word toward the south, and prophesy against the forest of the south field ;
' And say to the forest of the south, Hear the word of the Lord ; Thus saith the Lord God ; Behold, I will kindle a fire in thee, and it shall devour every green tree in thee, and every Ezek. xx. 45 48.

" Mercy and Judgment," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, pp. 405, 406. (Macmillan.)
" Future Punishment," by Rev. R. H. McKim, D.D., 1883, p. 23. (Thomas Whittaker, New York.)
" Thoughts on Everlasting Death," by Rev. W. R. Tomlinson, 1888, p. 11. (Digby Long.)
" Future Retribution," by Rev. C. A. Row, 1889, pp. 240-245, 418. (William Isbister.)
" The Fate of the Dead," by Dr. Thomas Clarke, M.D., 1889, p. 68. (F. Norgate.)
" The Unspeakable Gift," by Rev. J. H. Pettingell, 1898, pp. 22, 23. (Digby Long.)
" Immortality in Christ," by Rev. S. Hemphill, D.D., Litt.D., M.R.I.A., 1904, pp. 15, 43. (Simpkin, Marshall.)

[1] " Mercy and Judgment," by Canon Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, pp. 406, 407. (Macmillan.)

dry tree : the flaming flame shall *not be quenched*, and all faces from the south to the north shall be burned therein.

' And all flesh shall see that I the Lord have kindled it : it shall *not be quenched.*'

" The people should be as forest-trees devoured by fire that could not be quenched—that is, as the words mean, could not be extinguished till its work was done."[1]

Jer. xvii. 27. ' But if ye will not hearken unto Me to hallow the Sabbath day, and not to bear a burden, even entering in at the gates of Jerusalem on the Sabbath day ; then will I kindle a fire in the gates thereof, and it shall devour the palaces of Jerusalem, and it *shall not be quenched.*'

" The meaning is that nothing should stay the destructive flame until it had consumed utterly."[1]

The following passage[2] proves that Jerusalem was burnt, but it is certain that the " *unquenchable fire* " went out after doing its work :

Jer. lii. 13. ' And burned the house of the Lord, and the king's house ; and all the houses of Jerusalem, and all the houses of the great men, burned he with fire.'

I note,[3] with reference to the metaphor used by John the Baptist of the chaff being burnt up with " *unquenchable fire,*" that Isaiah wrote :

Isa. v. 24. ' Therefore as the fire devoureth the stubble, and the flame consumeth the chaff, so their root shall be as rottenness, and their blossom shall go up as dust.'

Matt. xxv. 41. The article being prefixed in the expression ' the eternal fire ' proves the fire in question to have been one well known to our Lord's hearers—viz., the Ge-

[1] " Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866, pp. 42-45, edition 1867. (Longmans.)

[2] " Where are the Dead ? Will any suffer Eternal Torment ?" by Antipas, Defender of Faith, 1885, p. 19. (J. Martin and Co.)

" Thoughts on Everlasting Death," by Rev. W. R. Tomlinson, 1888, p. 25. (Digby Long.)

" The Fate of the Dead," by Dr. Thomas Clarke, M.D., 1889, p. 68. (F. Norgate.)

[3] " Mercy and Judgment," by Canon Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, pp. 406, 407. (Macmillan.)

henna referred to in His previous teaching. The fire being described as prepared for the devil and his angels shows that the word denotes an instrument of destruction.[1]

Turning to secular writings, we find the same word applied in Homer* to the fire which for a few hours raged in the Grecian fleet; to the gleam of Hector's helmet; to glory; to laughter; and, most frequently, to shouting.†[2]

* 'Iliad,' XVI. 123; I. 599; XI. 50; XVI. 267, etc.

† See Wetstein, 'Nov. Test.' I. 267.

"The well-known historian, Eusebius, who wrote in the latter part of the third century and the beginning of the fourth, in recording the martyrdom of four Christians, writes: 'Cronion and Julian were scourged, and afterwards consumed with *unquenchable fire*.' And, in another passage: 'Epimachus and Alexander, who had continued for a time in prison enduring innumerable sufferings from the scrapers and scourges, were also destroyed with '*unquenchable fire*.'"[3]

"The everlasting fire, the unquenchable fire, and the fire that shall not be quenched, were coextensive in meaning, and were used interchangeably and indifferently."[4]

It appears clear that, at the time when they were spoken by Jesus, the words "unquenchable fire" meant so intense and fierce a fire that, before it died out, it would utterly consume anything submitted to its flames.

Tormented.

'And he shall be tormented with fire and brimstone in the presence of the holy angels, and in the presence of the Lamb: 'And the smoke of their torment ascendeth up for ever and ever.' Rev. xiv. 10, 11.

[1] "Future Retribution," by Rev. C. A. Row, 1889, pp. 265-267. (William Isbister.)

[2] "Mercy and Judgment," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, pp. 406, 407. (Macmillan.)

[3] "Ecclesiastical History," b. 6, c. 41, quoted by Rev. T. Davis.

[4] "Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866, pp. 42-45, edition 1867. (Longmans.)

"No man worthy to be listened to believes that it will be part of the happiness of heaven to witness the sufferings thus awfully represented as inflicted on the worshippers of the Beast and his image. The language is evidently in the highest degree figurative."[1]

Isa. xxxiv. 8-10.

'For it is the day of the Lord's vengeance, and the year of recompenses for the controversy of Zion.

'And the streams thereof shall be turned into pitch, and the dust thereof into brimstone, and the land thereof shall become burning pitch.

'It shall not be quenched night nor day; and the smoke thereof shall go up for ever: from generation to generation it shall lie waste; none shall pass through it for ever and ever.'

"Now, here again no one construes literally; no one supposes that the streams of Idumæa have been turned into pitch, or the dust thereof into brimstone, or the land thereof into burning pitch. No one supposes that flames have been kindled in it that have not been quenched night nor day; nor that the smoke thereof is going up at this time.

"Its real meaning evidently is utter desolation and ruin, or, in a sense, destruction."[1]

Tormentors.

Matt. xviii. 34.

'And his lord was wroth, and delivered him to the tormentors, till he should pay all that was due unto him.'

"This word in the Greek language does not necessarily mean one who actually inflicts tortures, but the keeper of a prison, the term being applied to him because he not infrequently acted in the capacity of torturer."[2]

The words "torment," "torments," "tormentors," and "tormented," in relation to the state after death, only occur in the New Testament, outside of the Revelation of St. John, in the Parable of the Rich Man and Lazarus, and in the First Epistle of St. John.

[1] "Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866, pp. 47-49, edition 1867.

[2] "Future Retribution," by Rev. C. A. Row, 1889, p. 248.

There is no reason to suppose that the words "torment," "torments," or "tormented"* in the parable meant any degree of torture; and torment of the mind may be understood as the meaning. Luke xvi. 23, 24, 25, 28. * R.V. in anguish.

In the Epistle of St. John, "fear hath *torment*" has been changed in the Revised Version to "fear hath *punishment*." 1 John iv. 18

In the following passages from the Revelation the words cannot be understood literally, as the book is acknowledged to be full of symbols to which no key has as yet been found:

'And to them it was given that they should not kill them, but that they should be tormented five months: and their torment *was* as the torment of a scorpion, when he striketh a man.' Rev. ix. 5.

'And they that dwell upon the earth shall rejoice over them, and make merry, and shall send gifts one to another; because these two prophets tormented them that dwelt on the earth.' Rev. xi. 10.

'And the third angel followed them, saying with a loud voice, If any man worship the beast and his image, and receive *his* mark in his forehead, or in his hand, Rev. xiv. 9-11.

'The same shall drink of the wine of the wrath of God, which is poured out without mixture into the cup of his indignation; and he shall be tormented with fire and brimstone in the presence of the holy angels, and in the presence of the Lamb:

'And the smoke of their torment ascendeth up for ever and ever: and they have no rest day nor night, who worship the beast and his image, and whosoever receiveth the mark of his name.'

'And he cried mightily with a strong voice, saying, Babylon the great is fallen, is fallen, and is become the habitation of devils, and the hold of every foul spirit, and a cage of every unclean and hateful bird. Rev. xviii. 2, 7, 15.

* * * * * *

'How much she hath glorified herself, and lived deliciously, so much torment and sorrow give her: for she saith in her heart, I sit a queen, and am no widow, and shall see no sorrow.

* * * * * *

'The merchants of these things, which were made rich by her, shall stand afar off for the fear of her torment, weeping and wailing.'

'And the devil that deceived them was cast into the lake of fire and brimstone, where the beast and the false prophet *are*, and shall be tormented day and night for ever and ever.' Rev. xx. 10.

Mr. Row has pointed out that "*tormentors*" does not necessarily mean more than "gaolers."

Punishment.

Matt. xxv. 46. 1 John iv. 18.

The Greek word *kolasis* occurs only twice in the New Testament.

In Matthew it is joined with *aionios*, and translated "everlasting punishment"; but in St. John's Epistle the translation "torment" in the Authorized Version is altered in the Revised Version to "punishment."

Canon Farrar and the Rev. F. N. Oxenham, both in 1881, argued that the word *kolasis* means, according to Grotius, "that kind of punishment which tends to the improvement of the criminal."[1]

"The word literally means 'pruning.' We 'prune' trees to make them better and more fruitful, not in order permanently to destroy them. When, therefore, our Lord used these words, so far from asserting the doctrine of everlasting punishment, He was implicitly denying it, and by His very words reminding us that the punishment of those 'on His left hand' will not be a hopeless and endless misery, but 'a correction,' inflicted for the express purpose of amending and restoring them."[2]

Matt. xxv. 46. * R.V. eternal.

I do not agree with the two authorities I have quoted that the punishment called here "everlasting* punishment" means "a correction inflicted for the express purpose of amending and restoring."

I believe that that kind of punishment will be inflicted on sinners in the Intermediate State, but that at the Judgment on the Last Day persistent sinners will be completely cut off, like a branch from a tree, and will no longer exist; and this is the meaning given to the word *kolasis* by Liddell and Scott.

[1] "Mercy and Judgment," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, pp. 407-409. (Macmillan.)

[2] "What is the Truth as to Everlasting Punishment?" by Rev. F. N. Oxenham, 1881, pp. 108, 109. (Longmans.)

Everlasting,* Greek "Aionios," as applied to Punishment.

* R.V. eternal.

It appears that from very early times attempts have been made to argue that the Greek word *aionios* only meant "age-long."

"St. Augustine sums up the argument as to the meaning of the word drawn from the parallelism in a way the weight of which has of late not been felt: 'What a thing it is to account eternal punishment to be a fire of long duration, and eternal life to be without end, since Christ comprised both in that very same place, in one and the same sentence, saying, "These shall go into eternal punishment, but the righteous into life eternal." If both are eternal, either both must be understood to be lasting with an end, or both perpetual without end. Matt. xxv. 46.

"For like is related to like; on the one side, eternal punishment, on the other, eternal life. But to say in one and the same sentence, life eternal shall be without end, punishment eternal shall have an end, were too absurd: whence, since the eternal life of the saints shall be without end, punishment eternal shall doubtless have no end to those whose it shall be."[1]

The Archbishop of Canterbury issued an authoritative ruling on the point in a pastoral letter dated March 14, 1864:

"I am sure you will beware of giving any other interpretation to the word 'everlasting' in the passages of our formularies which relate to the punishment of the lost, than that of 'eternal' in the sense of 'never-ending.' For, whatever be the meaning of the word in these passages in the case of the lost, the same must be its meaning in the case of the saved; and

[1] "What is of Faith, as to Everlasting Punishment," by Rev. E. B. Pusey, D.D., 1880, p. 44.

our certainty of never-ending bliss for penitent believers is gone if the word bears not the same signification in the case of the impenitent and unbelieving."[1]

The Rev. J. W. Haley,[2] in 1881, and Bishop J. C. Ryle, D.D.,[3] in 1883, wrote to the same effect.

What I have already written seems to place the old argument that *aionios*, when applied to punishment, should be translated "age-long," quite out of court.

Some authorities,[4] however, while admitting that sinners will be eternally lost, deny that they will be kept eternally in woe; and they say "that whilst the believer's living joy is endless, the unbeliever's *death* and extinction is endless."[5]

* R.V. eternal.

The words "everlasting* punishment" are not found anywhere in the Bible except in the following passage:

Matt. xxv. 46. † R.V. eternal.

'And these shall go away into everlasting† punishment; but the righteous into life eternal.'

As is so often the case in quoting passages of Scripture, the mistake has always been made of quoting the above passage apart from the context.

In this case it is clear that the actual sentence was recorded in verse 41:

Matt. xxv. 41.

'Then shall He say also unto them on the left hand, Depart from Me, ye cursed, into everlasting fire, prepared for the devil and his angels.'

[1] "Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866, p. 50. Edition 1867. (Longmans.)

[2] "Supplicium Æternum," by Rev. J. W. Haley, 1881, pp. 5, 6.

[3] "Thoughts on Immortality," by Bishop J. C. Ryle, D.D., 1883, pp. 75, 76. (C. J. Thynne.)

[4] "Lectures on Future Punishment," by Rev. H. H. Dobney, 1844, pp. 76-79. (T. Ward and Co.)

"Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866. (Longmans.)

"Mercy and Judgment," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, p. 14. (Macmillan.)

"Future Retribution," by Rev. C. A. Row, 1889, p. 416. (William Isbister.)

The *Bible Standard* of September, 1887.

"Punishment for Sin: is it Eternal?" by H. S. Solly, 1893, p. 156.

[5] "Thoughts on Everlasting Death," by Rev. W. R. Tomlinson, 1888, p. 29. (Digby, Long.)

I have already explained that "everlasting" or "unquenchable" fire did not mean endless life in never-ending torments, and I am satisfied that St. Paul gave the true explanation of this much-debated passage when he told the Thessalonians that sinners "shall be punished with everlasting* destruction from the presence of the Lord, and from the glory of His power." 2 Thess. i. 9. * R.V. eternal.

I believe that at the Judgment on the Last Day persistent sinners will be sentenced to some overwhelming destruction, and that they will be blotted out entirely, and cease to exist.

The Unpardonable Sin.

There is no question here of the translation, but the passage is certainly a "difficulty," and I was told once that *suicide* was the sin referred to.

St. Matthew having been himself present at the time and heard what Jesus said, his record is more probably correct than that of St. Mark, who wrote what he remembered of a sermon preached by St. Peter. Matt. xii. 31, 32. Mark iii. 28, 29. Luke xii. 10.

The authorities I have consulted are generally agreed that the sin in question consists in imputing to devilish magic the miracles which Jesus wrought by the power of the Holy Ghost.[1]

The Rev. C. F. Aked, however, says, "the sin itself consists in a persistent, deliberate rejection of the truth, which is known to be truth; a persistent, deliberate choice of the falsity which is known to be a falsity."[2]

[1] "Life in Christ," by Rev. Edward White, 1846, p. 434. (Elliot Stock.)
"Notes on the New Testament," by John Wesley, 1703-1791.
"Commentary on the New Testament," by Dr. Morison.
"Purgatory," by Rev. M. Canty, P.P., 1886, pp. 16, 17.
"Future Retribution," by Rev. C. A. Row, 1889, p. 255. (William Isbister.)
"New Testament Commentary," edited by Bishop C. J. Ellicott. D.D., 1905. (Cassell and Co.)

[2] "Eternal Punishment," by Rev. C. F. Aked, 1892, p. 29. (James Clarke and Co.)

The Rev. A. Jukes has been followed by some writers in his argument that "the text says nothing of those 'ages to come,' elsewhere revealed to us; much less does it assert that the punishment of sin not here forgiven is never ending. . . . When therefore we remember how our Lord has taught us to forgive, 'not until seven times, but until seventy times seven'; and when we see the length and breadth of this commandment, that it is bidding us to forgive as God forgives . . . we may be pardoned for believing that the threatening, 'It shall not be forgiven, neither in this age, nor in the coming age,' does not measure or exhaust the possibilities of God's forgiveness."[1]

Eph. ii. 7.

Matt. xii. 31, 32.
Mark iii. 28, 29.
Luke xii. 10.

'Wherefore I say unto you, All manner of sin and blasphemy shall be forgiven unto men: but the blasphemy *against* the *Holy* Ghost shall not be forgiven unto men.

'And whosoever speaketh a word against the Son of man, it shall be forgiven him: but whosoever speaketh against the Holy Ghost, it shall not be forgiven him, neither in this world, neither in the *world* to come.'

"The meaning of this mysterious text is not that there is an absolutely unpardonable sin, involving everlasting torments, which is a common misinterpretation of it; but that the radical spiritual perversion involved in, not only resisting, but blaspheming the Holy Spirit, has no forgiveness provided for it, either in the present or the future æon, either under the Law or under the Gospel."[2]

[1] "The Second Death, and the Restitution of all Things," by Rev. A. Jukes, 1869, pp. 113, 114. (Longmans.)

[2] "Texts Explained," by Dean F. W. Farrar, D.D, F.R.S., 1899, p. 22. (Longmans.)

CHAPTER VII

THE PRESENT DOCTRINE OF THE CHURCH OF ROME.

CHAPTER VII

The Present Doctrine of the Church of Rome.

The doctrine of the Church of Rome, at the present day, regarding Purgatory is said to be founded "on the authority of the Church and her Apostolic Traditions, recorded in ancient Liturgies," and by many of the ancient Fathers.[1]

The Church has given no definition as to the locality of Purgatory, or the nature of the sufferings undergone therein.[2]

The Church has confirmed the belief in Purgatory from the following passages in Holy Scripture :[3]

'Agree with thine adversary quickly, whiles thou art in the way with him; lest at any time the adversary deliver thee to the judge, and the judge deliver thee to the officer, and thou be cast into prison. Matt. v. 25 26.

'Verily I say unto thee, Thou shalt by no means come out thence, till thou hast paid the uttermost farthing.'

'Wherefore I say unto you, All manner of sin and blasphemy shall be forgiven unto men: but the blasphemy *against* the *Holy* Ghost shall not be forgiven unto men. Matt. xii. 31, 32.

'And whosoever speaketh a word against the Son of man, it shall be forgiven him: but whosoever speaketh against the Holy Ghost, it shall not be forgiven him, neither in this world, neither in the *world* to come.'

'And I say also unto thee, That thou art Peter, and upon this rock I will build My Church; and the gates of hell* shall not prevail against it. Matt. xvi. 18, 19. * R.V. Hades.

'And I will give unto thee the keys of the kingdom of heaven: and whatsoever thou shalt bind on earth shall be bound in heaven: and whatsoever thou shalt loose on earth shall be loosed in heaven.'

---

[1] "Catholic Belief," by the very Rev. J. Faà di Bruno, D.D., 1884, p. 186. (Burns and Oates, Limited.)

[2] *Ibid.*, p. 185. [3] *Ibid.*, p. 187.

Matt. xvi. 27. 'For the Son of man shall come in the glory of His Father with His angels; and then He shall reward every man according to his works.'

1 Cor. iii. 11-15. 'For other foundation can no man lay than that is laid, which is Jesus Christ.

'Now if any man build upon this foundation gold, silver, precious stones, wood, hay, stubble;

'Every man's work shall be made manifest: for the day shall declare it, because it shall be revealed by fire; and the fire shall try every man's work of what sort it is.

'If any man's work abide which he hath built thereupon, he shall receive a reward.

'If any man's work shall be burned, he shall suffer loss: but he himself shall be saved; yet so as by fire.'

1 Cor. xiii. 8. * R.V. love. 'Charity* never faileth: but whether *there be* prophecies, they shall fail; whether *there be* tongues, they shall cease; whether *there be* knowledge, it shall vanish away.'

Jas. v. 16. 'Confess *your* faults one to another, and pray one for another, that ye may be healed. The effectual fervent prayer of a righteous man availeth much.'

1 Pet. iii. 19. 'By which also he went and preached unto the spirits in prison.'

The Church teaches that sin may be divided into Original, and Actual or Personal sin; and the latter is again divided into Mortal, and Venial sin.[1]

Original sin. Rom. v. 12. "Original sin is that sin which our human nature has committed with the will of Adam, in whom all our human nature was included."[2]

"Of the original sin in which we are born we are not personally guilty with our own personal will, but our nature is guilty of it by the will of Adam, our head, with whom we form one moral body through the human nature which we derive from him."[3]

Personal sin. 1 John v. 16. Mortal sin is the "sin unto death," and Venial sin is the "sin which is not unto death."[4]

Final judgment at death. "When death comes the final doom of every one is fixed, and there is no more possibility of changing it."[5]

Eccles. xi. 3. 'And if the tree fall toward the south, or toward the north, in the place where the tree falleth, there it shall be.'

The south and the north are explained as meaning Heaven and Hell, and it is taught that "*at death*

[1] "Catholic Belief," by the very Rev. J. Faà di Bruno, D.D., 1884, p. 59. (Burns and Oates, Limited.)
[2] *Ibid.*, p. 4. [3] *Ibid.*, pp. 4, 5.
[4] *Ibid.*, p. 60. [5] *Ibid.*, p. 189.

either heaven or hell is allotted to every man, Purgatory being only a passage to heaven. So, too, the just ones of the Old Law, though sure of heaven, yet had to wait in some middle state, until after the Ascension of Jesus Christ."[1]

Mortal sin.

If a man dies with the guilt of Mortal sin unremitted, his soul is at once thrown into the "everlasting fire, which was prepared for the devil and his angels."[2] Matt. xxv. 41.

If a man "dies after the guilt and everlasting punishment of mortal sin have been forgiven him, but who, either from want of opportunity or through his negligence, has not discharged the debt of temporal punishment due to his sin," his soul "will have to discharge that debt to the justice of God in Purgatory."[3]

Venial sin.

"If he dies guilty of only Venial sin, his soul does not 'immediately enter Heaven, where *nothing defiled*' can enter, but goes first to Purgatory for an allotted time, and after being purified there from the stain of these venial or lesser faults, is then admitted into Heaven."[4]

Spirits free from all sin.

"Souls who die perfectly in the Lord; that is, entirely free from every kind of sin, even venial, and from the stain, the guilt, and the debt of temporal punishment of every sin, . . . have no pain to suffer in Purgatory, as is the case also with the Martyrs and Saints who die in a perfect state of grace."[5]

I feel sure that the Romish doctrine concerning Purgatory is not generally understood, and therefore I call special attention to the teaching that, first, "when death comes the final doom of everyone is fixed, and there is no more possibility of changing it";[6] and, second, "at death either heaven or hell is allotted to every man, Purgatory being only a passage to heaven."[7]

[1] "Catholic Belief," by the Very Rev. J. Faà di Bruno, D.D., 1884, p. 189. (Burns and Oates, Limited.)
[2] *Ibid.*, p. 65. [3] *Ibid.*, p. 185. [4] *Ibid.*
[5] *Ibid.*, pp. 188, 189. [6] *Ibid.*, p. 189. [7] *Ibid.*

CHAPTER VIII

I.—THE TEACHING OF THE ANGLICAN CHURCH.

II.—SHEOL, HADES, TARTARUS, PARADISE.

III.—HADES IS DIVIDED INTO MANY SPHERES, BOTH FOR THE RIGHTEOUS AND THE WICKED.

IV.—IN THE INTERMEDIATE STATE SPIRITS REMAIN CONSCIOUS, RETAIN THE MEMORY OF THE LIFE ON EARTH, AND ARE SENSIBLE TO PAIN AND PLEASURE.

V.—IN THE INTERMEDIATE STATE THE SINNER, WHO IS WILLING TO BE SAVED, IS GIVEN EVERY OPPORTUNITY OF BECOMING PURIFIED, AND GRADUALLY MADE PERFECT.

VI.—THERE IS PREACHING AFTER DEATH IN HADES.

VII.—EVERY SPIRIT HAS TO REMAIN IN THE INTERMEDIATE STATE UNTIL THE SECOND ADVENT OF JESUS, OR THE RESURRECTION ON THE LAST DAY, BUT THE CONDITION OF THE FAITHFUL, AND OF ALL THE SAINTS, IS ONE OF PEACE AND HAPPINESS.

CHAPTER VIII

I.—The Teaching of the Anglican Church.

The Anglican Church teaches :[1]

1. That man consists of spirit, soul, and body, and that, on the death of the body, the spirit and soul occupy a spirit-body.[2] 1 Thess. v. 23.

2. That Hades or, as it is now more generally called, the Intermediate State is divided into many spheres, both of happiness and of misery, and the sphere in which each Spirit finds its own place by spiritual attraction depends on the life the man has lived on earth ; and it has been held that retribution commences immediately. Many spheres in Hades. 1 Cor. iii. 13.

3. That every Spirit will remain conscious, will retain the memory of the life on earth, and will be sensible to pain and pleasure. Spirits remain conscious.

4. That the sinner who is willing to be s[illegible] s given every opportunity of becoming purified [illegible]ually made perfect. Purification possible.

5. That there is preaching and m[illegible] in the Intermediate State.

The Rev. A. Chambers[3] urges that [illegible]must be this preaching of the Gospel in the Inter[illegible]ate State,

[1] "An Explanation of the XXXIX. Articles," by Bishop A. P. Forbes, 1867. (James Parker.)

[2] "The Tripartite Nature of Man," by Rev. J. B. Heard, 1866. (T. and T. Clark, Edinburgh.)
"After Death," by Canon H. M. Luckock, D.D., 1879. (Longmans.)

[3] "Our Life After Death," by Rev. A. Cha[illegible]bers, 1894. (Charles Taylor.)

because many millions have left this earth-life without ever having heard the Gospel, and there is an express promise that no member of the human race is excluded from God's offer of salvation.

Remain in Hades till Last Day.

Finally, the Church teaches that every Spirit has to remain in the Intermediate State until the second Advent of Jesus, or the Resurrection on the Last Day, but the condition of the Faithful, and of all the Saints, is one of peace and happiness.

Difference between the Anglican and Roman Church teaching.

The following is, I believe, a fair statement of the difference between the teaching of the Anglican Church regarding the Intermediate State, and the doctrine of the Church of Rome about Purgatory :

The Anglican Church teaches that there is no final judgment immediately after death, but that the Spirits of the Faithful and of the Wicked all go to Hades, which is divided into many Spheres, and they are all given every opportunity of becoming purified, and gradually made perfect.

1 Tim. vi. 16. Acts ii. 34.

No Spirit, although perfect, is translated to Heaven before the Judgment Day, and even "David is not ascended into the heavens."

The Church of Rome teaches that Christians *are* judged immediately after death, and those who have their mortal sins unremitted are cast at once into the

Matt. xxv. 41.

"ever[illegible]g fire prepared for the devil and his angel

Ch[illegible]ho have had the guilt and everlasting puni[illegible]ortal sin forgiven, and Christians, with the g[illegible]al sins only, are cast into Purgatory, and, a[illegible] purified, they are admitted into Heaver[illegible] waiting till the Day of Judgment. [1]

The Church of Rome farther, under the authority of the following passage, claims the power of regulating the period of purification in Purgatory :

[1] "Catholic Belief," by the Very Rev. J. Faà di Bruno, D.D., 1884. (Burns and Oates, Limited.)

'And I say also unto thee, That thou art Peter, and upon this rock I will build My Church; and the gates of hell* shall not prevail against it. Matt. xvi. 18, 19. * R.V. Hades.

'And I will give unto thee the keys of the kingdom of heaven: and whatsoever thou shalt bind on earth shall be bound in heaven: and whatsoever thou shalt loose on earth shall be loosed in heaven.'

II.—Sheol, Hades, Tartarus, Paradise.

"The Intermediate State is one of those lost truths of the Bible which it is to the credit of our age to have rediscovered and restored to its right importance."[1]

Hades.

Under the teaching of Jesus and His Apostles I have given (Chapters II. and III.) the four passages from the Gospels in which Hades was mentioned by Jesus, and the two passages from the Acts, and the four from the Revelation of St. John, in which it was referred to by the Apostles; and I have explained (Chapter VI.) how the word was abandoned for the word "Helle," to which a strange and terrible meaning was attached.

Sheol.

This has already been fully explained (Chapter I.).

Tartarus.

This word is only used once in the Bible, and it clearly refers to an intermediate state:

'For if God spared not the angels that sinned, but cast them down to hell,† and delivered them into chains of darkness, to be reserved unto judgment.' 2 Pet. ii. 4. † R.V. Tartarus. Compare Jude vi.

It may, perhaps, be here noted that, while the word "Sheol" is Hebrew; and "Hades" and "Paradise" are Greek; "Tartarus" is Latin.

[1] "The Tripartite Nature of Man," by Rev. J. B. Heard, 1866. (T. and T. Clark.)

Paradise.

"Paradise, Greek *Paradeisos*, is a word of Persian origin, and signifies a park or pleasure-grounds. The Greek translators quite naturally gave *paradise* as the equivalent of *garden* in: 'The Lord God planted a paradise in Eden'; in which they were followed by Josephus."[1]

Gen. ii. 8.

"Ant." I. i., sec. 3.

"The orthodox Jews were accustomed to speak of the abode in Hades, where the souls of the righteous awaited the resurrection, as Abraham's bosom, Gan Eden, and Paradise."[2]

St. John, in his Revelation, wrote of the same place or state as "under the altar," and this has become a Christian expression, which means much the same as the "Throne of God" did to a Jew.

"David foretold that Christ's human spirit should go to Hades at His death; and, seeing that Jesus told the thief on the cross, 'To-day shalt thou be with Me in paradise,' it follows that 'paradise' is a sphere of 'hades.'"[3]

Ps. xvi. 10.

Luke xxiii. 43.

The word "Paradise" is only found in two other passages in the New Testament: In one, St. Paul says he was caught up into Paradise, which was evidently a sphere of the Intermediate State, and he heard unspeakable words, and this proves that the Spirits were conscious.

2 Cor. xii. 4.

The other passage is in the Apocalypse, which is a book of symbols to which no key has been found, and I offer no comment on it.

Rev. ii. 7. R.V. or "garden," as in Gen. ii. 8.

Meaning of Hades.

The word "Hades" means "not seen," and it is the exact equivalent of the Hebrew word, "Sheol."

[1] "Salvation Beyond Death," by Rev. G. W. Hunt, 1900, p. 104. (A. R. Mowbray.)

[2] "The Soul in the Unseen World," by Rev. G. W. Hunt, 1901, p. 155. (A. R. Mowbray.)

[3] "The Souls of the Righteous," by Rev. W. R. Savage, 1881, p. 58. (Chapman and Hall.)

Before the Advent of Jesus, it meant "that vast subterranean kingdom, that dim shadow-world, into which the spirits of all men, good and bad alike, were held to pass at death."[1]

"Both the Eastern and Western nations of antiquity"—including the Jews—"assumed the earth to be a vast plain, floating through space as a broad leaf floats through air, the upper side of which, illumined by the sun, was reserved for the living, while the spirits of the dead were condemned to the dark undersurface. . . ."[1]

"All the best ancient writers, Greek and Roman, Jewish and Christian, speak of their noblest men as dwelling in Hades, and looking with solemn expectation and sustaining hope for the dawn of some great day of deliverance."[1]

Locality of Hades.

It is, I think, generally held that we are not told the locality of the Intermediate State. It is true that Jesus appeared to uphold the idea of the Jews when He said:

Matt. xii. 40.

'As Jonas was three days and three nights in the whale's belly; so shall the Son of man be three days and three nights *in the heart of the earth.*'

It is clear, however, that the reference to Jonah was made to foretell the resurrection of Jesus, and not to teach the locality of Hades, and it has been thought that the spirits of the departed may be in the air, some close to the earth, and others in the enormous expanse of ether, beyond.

Summing up of the teaching of Jesus about Hades.

In the second chapter I have collected all the passages in the Gospels which contain the teaching of Jesus about Hades, and I will now only refer to some of the most important; at the same time I call attention to the numerous passages which teach that the love of God for fallen man is unlimited, and particularly to the Parables of the Lost Sheep, and the Piece of Money; and complete forgiveness is promised to every

[1] "Salvator Mundi," by Rev. Samuel Cox, 1877, pp. 61, 62. (Kegan Paul, Trench and Co.)

sinner who repents, even after he has suffered the first death.

1. During the first visit of Jesus to Jerusalem after His baptism, in the course of the wonderful conversation with Nicodemus, He said "no man hath ascended up to heaven," and therefore it follows that there must be an Intermediate State.

John iii. 13.

2. On the same occasion, He promised that "whosoever believeth" in the Son of man should "have eternal life."

John iii. 14, 15.

Now it is certain that many millions have never had a chance on this earth of believing in, or even hearing of, Him, and therefore there must be teaching in the Intermediate State, and a second probation.

3. In the Sermon on the Mount, preached during the second tour in Galilee, Jesus said:

Matt. v. 26. Luke xii. 59. 'Verily I say unto thee, Thou shalt by no means come out thence, till thou hast paid the uttermost farthing.'

This passage is generally held to be a reference to Hades, and the teaching clearly is that recovery from the unhappy sphere of Hades is most difficult, but *not* impossible.

4. It was in the same sermon that Jesus spoke the passage commencing, "Enter ye in at the strait gate," and Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" says: "The short span of this life is not necessarily the whole of the discipline of a soul made for eternity."

Matt. vii, 13-20.

5. During His second visit to Jerusalem, Jesus said to the Jews:

John v. 25. 'The dead shall hear the voice of the Son of God: and they that hear shall live.'

And again:

John v. 28. 'All that are in the graves shall hear His voice.'

This clearly teaches that spirits in the Intermediate State are conscious, and may still obtain pardon there.

6. During the third tour in Galilee, Jesus taught

that the sin of speaking against the Holy Ghost was unpardonable either in this world or in the world to come, that is to say, in the Intermediate State, and the natural inference is that all other sins can be forgiven there, after sincere repentance.

Matt. xii. 31, 32. Mark iii. 28, 29. Luke xii. 10. 1 John v. 16.

7. Shortly after this, Jesus spoke the Parable of the Wise Steward, in which He used the well-known words:

'And that servant, which knew his lord's will and prepared not *himself*, neither did according to his will, shall be beaten with many *stripes*.

'But he that knew not, and did commit things worthy of stripes, shall be beaten with few *stripes*. For unto whomsoever much is given, of him shall be much required: and to whom men have committed much, of him they will ask the more.'

Luke xii. 47, 48.

This clearly points to different spheres in the unhappy part of Hades.

8. The Transfiguration took place after Jesus had visited "the coasts of Cæsarea Philippi," between the third and fourth tours in Galilee, and it clearly showed that Moses and Elias* were alive and conscious, and, according to Luke, aware of the "decease which He (Jesus) should accomplish at Jerusalem."

Matt. xvii. 1-3. Mark ix. 2-4. Luke ix. 30-31.

* R.V. Elijah.

9. During the fourth tour in Galilee, Jesus spoke the parable of the talents which He concluded with the words:

'And his lord was wroth, and delivered him to the tormentors, till he should pay all that was due unto him.'

Matt. xviii. 34.

It has been held that the teaching here is the same as in the Sermon on the Mount, namely, that recovery from the unhappy sphere of Hades is most difficult but *not* impossible.

Matt. v. 26.

10. Afterwards, in Capernaum, Jesus, knowing that the disciples had been disputing among themselves who should be the greatest, spoke the words which have been so much misunderstood about cutting off a hand or a foot, or plucking out an eye, that offended (see Chapter VI., Gehenna), and He added:

Matt. xviii. 1-14. Mark ix. 33-50. Luke ix. 46, 48.

'For every one shall be salted with fire.'

Mark ix. 49.

It is generally held that this fire represents purification and cleansing in the Intermediate State.

11. During the third visit to Jerusalem, Jesus was teaching the people in the Temple, and He said :

John viii. 56. 'Your father Abraham rejoiced to see my day : and he saw it, and was glad.'

This can only mean that Abraham was alive and conscious in Hades, and aware of what was happening on earth.

Luke xvi. 19-31. 12. During the fourth, and last, journey to Jerusalem, Jesus told His disciples the well-known Parable of the Rich Man and Lazarus, and I refuse to accept the teaching that the parable "may be taken to represent the cutting off of the Jews."

The parable could not have been told in simpler language, and, considering that all the disciples already believed in Sheol or Hades, no unprejudiced person can doubt that Jesus intended to sanction the current belief.

If we bear in mind that the parable was spoken while Jesus was travelling to His death in Jerusalem, I think it must be understood that He deliberately summed up in it all His previous teaching on the subject of Hades.

The teaching clearly is that Hades is divided into a Paradise for the righteous, and a place of anguish for the wicked, and that all spirits remain conscious, retain the memory of the life on earth, and are sensible to pain and pleasure.

13. Among the events recorded as having taken place in Jerusalem and its neighbourhood, while waiting for the last Passover, is the visit to the house of Zacchæus, in Jericho.

Luke xix. 12-27. It was here that Jesus spoke the Parable of the Pounds, and it is held that the teaching in the words, "Have thou authority over ten cities," is the same as in the words, "He shall make him ruler," in the

Matt. xxiv. 47.

Parable of the Faithful and Wise Servant, and as in the Parable of the talents. Matt. xxv. 14-30.

I note that the two last-mentioned parables were spoken by Jesus to His disciples, on the Mount of Olives, after they had come to Him, saying :

'Tell us, when shall these things be ? and what shall be the sign of Thy coming, and of the end of the world ?' Matt. xxiv. 3

It is very important to lay stress on the teaching of these three parables, which is that those who have been doing God's work on earth will find a new sphere of usefulness in Hades in bringing sinners to repentance.

14. After the visit to Zacchæus, Jesus "put to silence" "the Sadducees, which say that there is no resurrection," and He taught them that Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob are still alive, and God is still their God. Matt. xxii. 29-34. Mark xii. 24-27. Luke xx. 27-38.

15. In Mark, we find the teaching that there are different spheres in the unhappy part of Hades in the words, Mark xii. 40.

'These shall receive *greater* damnation.'* * R.V. condemnation.

16. In the terrible description of the Final Judgment on the Last Day, which was also spoken on the Mount of Olives, we find the Spirits who are to be judged depicted as conscious, and retaining the memory of their life on earth. Matt. xxv. 31-46. See Matt. vii. 21-23.

17. In the metaphor of the vine and the branches, which was spoken by Jesus during the last Passover supper, it is clearly taught that the purging, *i.e.*, the pruning and training of the human beings who are represented as the branches, as Jesus Himself is the vine, is carried on from this life on earth, through the life in Hades, until the day of final judgment. John xv. 1-6.

18. Among the last words He spoke with His human earthly body, Jesus said, "Verily I say unto thee, To-day shalt thou be with me in Paradise," and so taught that spirits do *not* ascend straight to heaven, Luke xxiii. 43.

but that the righteous go to the happy sphere of Hades called Paradise.

19. The first words Jesus spoke with His resurrection body were :

John xx. 17. 'Touch Me not ; for I am *not yet* ascended to My Father.'

20. We have also the teaching of Jesus that all Spirits remain in Hades until His second Advent or the Last Day :

John iii. 13. 'And no man hath ascended up to heaven.'
Matt. xi. 27. Luke x. 22. 'Neither knoweth any man the Father.'
John vi. 46. 'Not that any man hath seen the Father.'

21. And John the Baptist said :

John i. 18. 'No man hath seen God at any time.'

The Apostles continued the teaching of Jesus.

The Apostles continued the teaching of Jesus about Hades, but, as I have explained in the third chapter, they undoubtedly expected the speedy return of Jesus, and therefore the state after death had not the same importance to them as it has to us.

Acts i. 25. 1. We read that Judas went "to his own place," which shows that there are different spheres in the unhappy part of Hades.

Acts ii. 39. Acts iii. 25, 26. Gal. iii. 8. 2. We are told that "the promise" included "all that are afar off," and therefore there must be teaching and a possibility of purification in Hades, as many millions have died without ever hearing the name of Jesus.

3. Another passage suggests a hope as to the possibilities of repentance and conversion in Hades :

Acts iii. 19-21. 'Repent ye therefore, and be converted, that your sins may be blotted out, when the times of refreshing shall come from the presence of the Lord ;

'And He shall send Jesus Christ, which before was preached unto you :

'Whom the heaven must receive until the times of restitution* of all things, which God hath spoken by the mouth of all His holy prophets since the world began.'

* R.V. restoration.

Rom. xiv. 9. 4. St. Paul told the Romans that Christ was "Lord both of the dead and living," and this teaches that there is consciousness in Hades.

5. In the wonderful passage about the resurrection body, St. Paul clearly intimated to the Corinthians that all Spirits remain waiting somewhere till the second Advent of Jesus, or the Last Day; and he proceeded to say that "the dead shall be *raised*." 1 Cor. xv. 35-50. 1 Cor. xv. 52.

6. In his Second Epistle, St. Paul certainly implies that Spirits remain conscious after death, because he says he is "willing rather to be absent from the body, and to be present with the Lord." 2 Cor. v. 6-8.

7. Again, St. Paul taught that there are different spheres in Hades, in the words:

'He which soweth sparingly shall reap also sparingly; and he which soweth bountifully shall reap also bountifully.' 2 Cor. ix. 6.

8. In the account of his vision of Paradise, St. Paul certainly taught that Spirits are conscious, and are able to converse. 2 Cor. xii. 1-5.

9. St. Paul also told the Galatians and the Ephesians that there are different spheres in Hades. Gal. vi. 7, 8. Eph. vi. 6-8.

10. To the Philippians, St. Paul repeated what he had written to the Corinthians, and expressed his longing to be with Christ, which forces upon us the conclusion that there is conscious fellowship in Paradise. Phil. i. 21-24.

11. He again taught that there was this consciousness of all spirits by writing that "things under the earth" should bow "at the name of Jesus." Phil. ii. 10.

12. St. Paul explained that life continues in Hades by the words, "whether we wake or sleep, we should *live* together with him." 1 Thess. v. 10.

13. The Hebrews were assured that those who died were not made perfect until the second Coming of Jesus, or the Last Day; and that "chastening" continues in Hades. Heb. xi. 40. Heb. xii. 5-11.

14. There are also numerous passages in the Epistles and in Revelation which teach that all Spirits—even since the resurrection of Jesus—remain in Hades until the second Coming of Jesus, or the Last Day, and even "David is not ascended into the heavens." Acts ii. 34.

Apostolic teaching in Rome.

Considering that there has been an unbroken succession of Popes in Rome since the first Bishop was appointed in the middle of the first century after Christ, it is most probable that the original Apostolic teaching is to be found in the doctrine of that Church, however covered over and concealed it may be by subsequent innovations.

I accept the teaching of Rome that there *is* an Intermediate State, and that Spirits are there purged of their sins by some form of suffering.

Acts xxiv. 15. Rev. xx. 11, 12. 2 Cor. v. 10.

We are, however, distinctly taught that there will be a resurrection both of the just and unjust, and that all the dead must appear before the "great white throne" of God, and I therefore find it impossible to believe, that those who die with the guilt of mortal sin unremitted are at once thrown into the everlasting fire prepared for the devil and his angels, or that some Spirits, after being purified, are translated to heaven, before the Resurrection on the Last Day.

Teaching of the ancient Church.

"The ancient Church, East and West, divided the unseen realm into three states. (1) The highest heaven, where God is seen in unclouded majesty. Into this disembodied spirits do not enter; they must wait to be 'clothed upon' with the spiritual body. (2) Hades, which was divided into a place of torment, as in the case of Dives, and into Paradise, as in the case of Lazarus. (3) Gehenna.

Regarding those who died in grace.

"Into Paradise passed all souls who died in grace, but in every degree of ethical and spiritual development, from the brand snatched from the burning to the mature saint; each going to his own place—to the mansion prepared for his special need. In this intermediate state there was progress for all, and visitation of angels, and such measure of the Divine glory as was suited to the capacity of each."[1]

"So strongly did the Church of the first ages recog-

[1] "Life Here and Hereafter," by Canon M. MacColl, 1894, second edition, 1896, Preface, xxv, xxvi and p. 92. (Longmans.)

nize the need of preparation in th intermediate state for admission into heaven, that i regarded martyrs, and even the Blessed Virgin, as stil in Hades with the rest of the faithful departed, and, with them, fit subjects for the prayers of the Church on earth."[1]

Reformers rejected Roman doctrine.

Canon Farrar wrote that the Refo mers rejected the Roman doctrine of Purgatory "be ause it was connected in their minds with the de lorable but parasitic abuses of indulgences, pardons works of supererogation, purchasable Masses for he dead, and all the sixteenth-century devices of Tetzel and Leo X.

"It was a deep misfortune to the Church that, while rejecting Purgatory, the Reformers did not distinguish it from the widespread ancient, reasonable, and, I had almost said, necessary, belief in some condition in which—by what means we know not, whether by the *pœna sensûs* or only the *pœna damni*—imperfect souls who die in a state unfit for heaven may yet have perfected in them until the day of Christ, that good work of God which has been in this world begun. There are few great theologians, whether of pre-Reformation or of modern times, who have not used language which, consciously or unconsciously, favours such a view as this."[2]

Arguments in support of the belief.

It is argued that there must be an Intermediate State between death and the Last Judgment because, as Dr. Julius Ulrich Maywahlen observes, "the strongest mind of man *would not be able* to bear the sudden transition from this vale of tears to the presence of the throne of God."[3]

Again, as Johann August Dorner pointed out, "not merely would nothing of essential importance remain for the judgment if everyone entered the place of his

[1] "Life Here and Hereafter," by Canon M. MacColl, D.D., 1894, second edition, 1896, p. 92. (Longmans.)

[2] "Eternal Hope," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1878, p. 26. (Macmillan.)

[3] "Life in the Invisible," Anonymous, 1875, p. 44. (Elliot Stock.)

eternal destiny a death, but in that case also no space would be l or a progress of believers, who are not sinless at th ment of death."[1]

Again, it can be supposed that if the spirit of Lazarus, whom e loved, had been translated to heaven, Jesus w d have recalled him from thence to take up his life in on earth.

Bishop Bull on the Intermediate State.

Bishop Bull, St. David's (A.D. 1634-1710), in a sermon concerni the middle state of Happiness or Misery, between th and the Resurrection, said: "Now I do affirm t consentient and constant Doctrine of the Primitive hurch to be this, That the Souls of all the Faithfu immediately after death, enter into a Place or State Bliss, far exceeding all the Felicities of this World, o' short of that most consummate perfect Beatitu of the Kingdom of Heaven, with which they are be crowned and rewarded in the Resurrection: Al so, on the contrary, that the Souls of all the Wic d are, presently after Death, in a State of very great isery, and yet dreading a far greater Misery at the ay of Judgment."[2]

Only taught openly during last forty years.

It is, however, only during the last for years that any appreciable number of the Anglican cle gy have openly taught this doctrine.

The authorities I have consulted teach hat all spirits—good and bad—go at death to Hades, or the Intermediate State, where each finds the Sphere which is suited to its development, and goes to "its p c place," as the present Bishop of London teaches i paper to working men, entitled "Five Minutes a Death."

Jesus the Lord of all the dead.

Dr. Pope, in 1875, wrote: "It is, however, m certain that the Intermediate State is under

[1] "Man's Immortality and Destiny," by Rev. R. P. Dow LL.D., 1903. (Smith's Publishing Company.)

[2] "An Inquiry into the Scripture Doctrine concerning t Duration of Future Punishment," by Rev. M. Horbery, D.D 1744. (Wesleyan Conference Office, reprinted.)

special control of the Redeemer as the Lord of all the dead who have ever passed from the world ; that those who have departed in unbelief are in a condition of imprisonment waiting for the final judgment, while those who have died in the faith are in Paradise, or rather with Christ, waiting for their consummation ; and that the universal resurrection will put an end both to death, and to the state of the disembodied dead."[1]

In America, belief is not confined to the older Churches.

It may be unknown to some that in America, the belief in an Intermediate State is not confined to members of the Anglican, Roman, and Greek Churches.

Rev. C. H. Fowler, 1889.

The Rev. C. H. Fowler, D.D., Bishop of the Methodist Episcopal Church, said :

"The teaching of the Bible on this subject, as we understand it, is substantially this, namely, at death the soul is separated from the body and enters into Hades, the receptacle of disembodied spirits, whether good or bad. Hades contains both classes. The good are in the Paradise of Hades, or in Abraham's bosom, and the bad are in Hades, or the Tartarus of Hades. After the experiments of probation are finished with the human race, and time is ended, comes the resurrection of the dead, when all spirits shall be called out of Hades, and all bodies out of the grave (the sea and the earth give up their dead), and these spirits and bodies, being reunited, shall be judged at the general judgment, according to the deeds done in the body.

"After this judgment, the righteous, with their resurrection bodies, are received into heaven, the final and eternal home of the blessed, and the wicked are cast into Gehenna or Hell, into everlasting punishment.

"Hades ceases at the judgment. Heaven and Gehenna begin after the judgment."[2]

[1] "A Compendium of Christian Theology," by Rev. W. B. Pope, D.D., 1875, p. 376. (C. H. Kelly.)

[2] Quoted in "That Unknown Country ; or, What Living Men believe concerning Punishment after Death," 1889, Anonymous, p. 304. (C. A. Nichols, Mass., U.S.A.)

Rev. Augustus Schultze.

The Rev. Augustus Schultze, President of the Moravian Theological Seminary, Bethlehem, Pa., U.S.A., taught :

"We conclude, therefore, that there is an intermediate state between the death of the body and the resurrection day. To the believer the intermediate state cannot be a state of unconsciousness, although it is sometimes termed a sleep. . . . To him who has lived a life of sin, the entrance into the spirit world must bring a painful sense of want, a feeling of misery and anguish, as illustrated by the outcry of the rich man in the parable, 'I am tormented in this flame.'"[1]

Luke xvi. 24.

The judgment after death is not the final judgment.

This "is a passage which seems at first sight to support the view of those who deny the Intermediate State.

Heb. ix. 27. * R.V. cometh judgment.

"'And as it is appointed unto men once to die, but after this the* judgment.'

Canon H. M. Luckock.

In the original Greek the definite article is wanting and the absence of it is very significant, for it is invariably prefixed to the noun in all the passages where that judgment is clearly spoken of, which is to decide finally the eternal destiny. What the author of the Epistle teaches is, that death is immediately followed by a judgment or crisis; but it can only be that by which the place of the soul is determined in Hades or the Intermediate State."[2]

Jesus sanctioned the current belief.

The Rev. R. E. Hutton, in 1898, farther pointed out that, "Our Lord must have been familiar with the teaching of an Intermediate State of punishment, since it was the common belief of Israel, and was officially sanctioned by the use of prayers and sacrifices

[1] Quoted in "That Unknown Country; or, What Living Men believe concerning Punishment after Death," 1889, Anonymous, p. 793. (C. A. Nichols, Mass., U.S.A.)

[2] "The Intermediate State," by Canon H. M. Luckock, 1890, p. 22. (Longmans.)

for the dead in the Temple services, and by prayers used in the Synagogues, and at other times.

"Our Lord by no means passed over corrupt traditions of His people. His language on fasting, prayer, and almsgiving, severely censured popular abuses. His reference to other corruptions, such as the 'corban,' the buying and selling in the temple, and the 'washing' of vessels, leaves us in no doubt whatever that our Lord condemned what He did not approve in the traditions of Israel. It is, then, remarkable that we have not a word of censure for the tradition that some sins are only temporarily punished in the world to come. But this is not all. To the Jewish people our Lord's words, on more than one occasion, must have been a strong confirmation of their belief. When He spoke of a prison whence none should go out until the uttermost farthing had been paid, it is not at all certain that He intended to imply the sum could never be forthcoming. When He spoke of all sins, except blasphemy against the Holy Spirit, as pardonable either here or hereafter, He certainly confirmed those who heard Him in their belief that some sins were forgiven after death.

"Again, He told them of the servant who knew not his Lord's will, and how he should be 'beaten with but few stripes.' All this teaching pointed out our Lord's acceptance, rather than His rejection, of the Jewish and Gentile belief, that some souls might . . ., after a 'few stripes,' pass upward. Luke xii. 48.

"This probability becomes almost a certainty when we find that not only were the dead prayed for by the Jews, but that there has never been a doubt in the Catholic Church, from the Apostolic days downwards, as to the duty of prayer for the dead."[1]

Lastly, Jesus taught in His description of the Day of Judgment that all mankind will be arranged in "two classes, finally and determinately, good or evil. Matt. xxv. 31-46.

[1] "The Soul Here and Hereafter," by Rev. R. E. Hutton, 1898, pp. 208-210. (Longmans.)

A change must therefore have taken place in the condition of many after their departure from the world, since the great mass of Christians do not belong to one class or the other. They are partly good and partly evil, even the lives of those mainly on God's side are imperfect and stained with sin, so that in their present state they are manifestly unfit for His presence and kingdom ; and in case of others who we may hope will finally be saved, there is a far greater amount of imperfection and sinfulness."[1]

Supposed taint of Romanism in this belief.

Any reference to an Intermediate State is supposed by people who have not studied the subject to savour of Romanism, and it is commonly said that the Doctrine of a Purgatory was condemned in the twenty-second Article of the Church of England. This is a mistake, because the Article in question only condemns "the *Romish Doctrine concerning Purgatory*, meaning the popular teaching on the subject of Purgatory among Roman Catholics at the time when the Article was drawn up."[2]

In other words, the Church of England condemned the innovations which had been superadded to the original teaching that, there is *some* Intermediate State where spirits which, at the time of death, are still imperfect and unworthy, may be reached by God's mercy.

These innovations include the Indulgences which were openly bought and sold before the Reformation ; also, the teaching that, although "the sinner may receive by Absolution, through God's Priest, full forgiveness of the guilt of his sins, and full remission of the eternal punishment due for those sins," still "the debt of temporal punishment due for those sins, if not paid in this life, must be paid in the next."[3]

Also, the doctrine of "a Treasury of Merit which[4] means, not only the merits of Christ, but all the credit

[1] "Theological Dictionary : Purgatory," by Rev. J. H. Blunt, 1870, p. 602. (Longmans.)
[2] "Things beyond the Tomb," by Rev. T. H. Passmore, 1900, pp. 20-24. (Longmans.) [3] *Ibid.* [4] *Ibid.*

of such good works done by the Saints of the Church, as are not necessary to salvation. These works are called Works of Supererogation, that is, works over and above what God *expects* us to do if we want to be saved."

The key, so to speak, of this Treasury is in the hands of the Pope of Rome, who makes grants from it to whomsoever he likes.

"These grants are called Indulgences, because they are believed to convey to the persons who receive them an Indulgence from the whole or part of the punishment due for sin, in the next world."

These are the innovations condemned by the twenty-second Article.

III.—Hades is divided into Many Spheres, both for the Righteous and the Wicked.

Many spheres in Hades.

"Death does not break the continuity of character. Human beings appear on the other side of death in precisely the same moral condition in which they left this world. But that means innumerable degrees of moral development." . . .[1] "At death, therefore, every soul will be drawn by spiritual attraction towards the particular abode for which it is suited. The predominating bias, the ruling passion, will be the determining cause of man's future destiny." . . .[2] "If you have followed me so far," Canon MacColl says, "you will see that Paradise, or the intermediate state, is the abode of all who die in the grace of God; but that their condition must necessarily vary indefinitely, from the brand plucked out of the burning to the purity and stability of mature sancity; from the penitent prodigal to 'the disciple whom Jesus loved.' It follows that those diverse characters need diverse treatment; but they have all this note in common,

[1] "Life Here and Hereafter," by Canon M. MacColl, D.D., 1894, pp. 122. Edition 1896. (Longmans.) [2] *Ibid.*, p. 129.

that they are imperfect, more or less incomplete, and will remain so, in spite of general progress, till they are summoned to 'inherit the kingdom prepared for them.' "[1]

"That there are degrees of misery, as well as degrees of glory in the future state, that the condition of some who are lost will be far worse than that of others, all this is undeniable."[2]

Jesus sanctioned the current belief.

To understand the teaching of Jesus we must remember that "Jew, Heathen, Christian were all addressed in words to which they attached a distinct meaning. 'Hades' spoke to the Jew, who knew it to be the equivalent of the Sheol of his older Scriptures, of a state or region in which dwelt the souls of the dead. In that region there were consciousness, memory, sympathy. . . . To the Greek the word would come with all the associations that had gathered round it from the days of Homer, ripened, developed, purified, as they had been by the teaching of Plato in the myths of the *Republic*, the *Phædo*, and the *Gorgias*. He, too, thought of the dwelling-place of the spirits of the dead, of Tartarus, and the Elysian fields, of punishments, partly penal, partly purgatorial, some temporary, and some without end.

"It might be the work of the preachers of the new doctrine to confirm, correct, discard some of these thoughts, but when the word was chosen which was identified with them, and used, so to speak, without any previous *caveat*, we may be quite sure that they were as a whole, recognized and adopted, that the word, as the current symbol of ideas, was not, and could not be, stamped with an entirely new connotation. We may be quite sure that no Jew or Greek in the apostolic age would ever have thought that the words

[1] "Life Here and Hereafter," by Canon M. MacColl, 1894, p. 132. Edition, 1896. (Longmans.)
[2] "Thoughts on Immortality," by Bishop J. C. Ryle, D.D., 1883, p. 62. (C. J. Thynne.)

'He descended into Hades' meant only that the body of Christ had been laid in the grave, or that His soul had suffered with an exceeding sorrow in Gethsemane and on the cross."[1]

IV.—In the Intermediate State, Spirits remain Conscious, retain the Memory of the Life on Earth, and are Sensible to Pain and Pleasure.

Death does not stop consciousness.

"We are living, conscious beings, capable of willing, thinking, loving, acting, up to the hour of death. What is there in the fact of bodily death that should lead us to think that it stops that conscious and energetic life of the soul? And if the soul's existence continues, must not we think of it as passing into its new phase of being with the same capacities, with the character, plastic and capable of re-formation, in the same measure as at the hour of death?"[2]

Spirits remain conscious.

All the authorities I have consulted are agreed that the spirits of the "departed, in the intermediate state, are possessed of consciousness, memory, and sensibility to pain and pleasure; and that the life of all men, whether good or bad, is continued without interruption after the separation of soul and body."[3]

Old Testament teaching about recognition.

Gen. xv. 15.
Deut. xxxi. 16.
Gen. xxv. 8.

The frequent use in the Old Testament of analogous phrases, "And thou shalt go to thy fathers in peace"; "Thou shalt sleep with thy fathers"; "was gathered to his people"; certainly seem to point to a recognition by spirits of the relationship which subsisted between them on earth.[4]

[1] "The Spirits in Prison," by Dean E. H. Plumptre, D.D., 1884, pp. 101, 102. (William Isbister.)
[2] *Ibid.*, p. 22.
[3] "After Death," by Canon H. M. Luckock, D.D., 1879, pp. 29, 33. (Longmans.)
[4] "Souls of the Righteous," by Rev. W. R. Savage, 1881, p. 114. (Chapman and Hall.)

"Again, David, whilst mourning the loss of his beloved child, can yet take comfort from the thought,

2 Sam. xii. 23. 'I shall go to him.' He evidently believes, not only that it was 'well with the child,' but that there will be mutual recognition between parents and their offspring in that unseen world to which all are hastening.[1]

"Furthermore, it is surely incredible that Moses

Matt. xvii. 3. and Elijah, who both knew our Lord, and conversed with Him at His transfiguration, should yet have been ignorant of one another.

"Once again, in the parable, Dives recognizes Abraham, and Abraham Dives."[2]

Job, Isaiah, and Ezekiel certainly thought that the spirits of the departed remain conscious:

Job iii. 17-19. 'There the wicked cease from troubling; and there the weary be at rest.

'There the prisoners rest together; they hear not the voice of the oppressor.

'The small and great are there; and the servant is free from his master.'

Isa. xiv. 10, 11. * R.V. to Hell, Sheol. 'All they shall speak and say unto thee, Art thou also become weak as we? art thou become like unto us? Thy pomp is brought down to the grave.'*

Isa. lvii. 2. 'He shall enter into peace: they shall rest in their beds, each one walking in his uprightness.'

Ezek. xxxii. 21. † R.V. Sheol. 'The strong among the mighty shall speak to him out of the midst of hell† with them that help him.'

Appearances in spirit body.

We find in Scripture fifteen instances of the human spirit appearing after death, clothed in a recognisable spirit body, and possessed of full consciousness.

1 Sam. xxviii. 14, 15.

The first is the apparition of the prophet Samuel, four years after his death, to Saul, in the witch's cave at Endor, and Canon MacColl said that this, "however we explain it, implies belief in the consciousness of the soul after death, and of its knowledge of what is happening and is about to happen on earth."[3]

[1] "Souls of the Righteous," by Rev. W. R. Savage, 1881, p. 114. (Chapman and Hall.) [2] *Ibid.*, pp. 113-115.

[3] "Life Here and Hereafter," by Canon M. MacColl, D.D., 1894, p. 103. Edition 1896. (Longmans.)

The second is the appearance of Moses, with Elijah—who did not undergo death—on Mount Tabor, when Jesus was transfigured before His three disciples, Peter, James, and John. 2 Kings ii. 11. Matt. xvii. 3.

The remaining thirteen are the appearances of Jesus Himself after His resurrection (see Conclusion).

In the New Testament we have the direct teaching of Jesus on this subject in the Parable of the Rich Man and Lazarus, which was spoken while He was travelling to His death in Jerusalem, and it may be understood to be a summing up of all the previous teaching about Hades (see Chapter II., and Chapter VIII., II.). The direct teaching of Jesus. Luke xvi. 19-31.

Irenæus, in the second century of our era, understood this parable according to its simple language. Irenæus.

Canon Luckock wrote: "While, then, admitting that the literal interpretation of details must be rejected, we hold that its whole teaching is based on substantial truth."[1] Canon Luckock.

Canon MacColl declared that "The story of Dives and Lazarus leaves us in no doubt as to what our Lord wished us to believe. The rich man, and Lazarus, and Abraham are all represented as in the full enjoyment of consciousness and mental activity. Canon MacColl.

"In the Transfiguration scene, again, we find Moses and Elijah talking to Jesus about His approaching Passion. . . . Our Lord's promise to the penitent robber is another sidelight on the subject plainly implying consciousness on the part of disembodied souls."[2]

The Rev. A. Chambers has pointed out that "when disputing with the Sadducees, who denied an Afterlife,"[3] Jesus sought to convince them that Abraham, Isaac and Jacob were still living, because God had Rev. A. Chambers.

[1] "After Death," by Canon H. M. Luckock, D.D., 1879, p. 29. (Longmans.)
[2] "Life Here and Hereafter," by Canon M. MacColl, 1894, p. 104. Edition 1896. (Longmans.)
[3] "Our Life after Death," by Rev. A. Chambers, 1894, p. 38. (Charles Taylor.)

Matt. xxii. 32. Luke xx. 38. said, "I *am* (not I *was*) the God of Abraham," etc. This argument He followed up by saying, "For He is not a God of the dead, but of the *living :* for all *live* unto Him."

Matt. x. 28. Again, in His words, "Fear not them which kill the body, but are not able to kill the soul," the inference is unmistakable.

Teaching of the Apostles. "And St. Peter's declaration that Jesus went and 'preached unto the spirits in prison'—that is, the generation who disregarded the preaching of Noah—is a still more emphatic assertion of the continued consciousness of the soul after death. St. Paul echoes the same belief when he desires 'to depart and to be with Christ, which is far better,' as well as in his account of his temporary translation to Paradise, though he could not tell 'whether in the body or out of the body.' The souls under the altar, too, in the Apocalyptic vision, are conscious, for they cry for retribution on the persecutors of the Church on earth, and are soothed with white robes and a message of peace."[1]

There are many passages in the Gospels and Epistles, besides those quoted in this chapter, which teach the continued consciousness of departed spirits (see Chapters II. and III.).

V.—In the Intermediate State, the Sinner, who is willing to be Saved, is given every Opportunity of becoming Purified, and gradually made Perfect.

Teaching in Old Testament. No teaching on this subject can be looked for in the earlier books of the Old Testament, because Sheol or Hades was thought, at the time when they were written, to be a place of dreamy inactivity, where

[1] "Life Here and Hereafter," by Canon M. MacColl, D.D., 1894, p. 105. (Longmans.)

"there is no work, nor device, nor knowledge, nor wisdom." Eccles. ix. 10.

When, however, Revelation had become fuller, we read:

'When the Lord shall have washed away the filth of the daughters of Zion, and shall have purged the blood of Jerusalem from the midst thereof by the spirit of judgment, and by the spirit of burning.' Isa. iv. 4.

And again:

'And He shall sit as a refiner and purifier of silver: and He shall purify the sons of Levi and purge them as gold and silver, that they may offer unto the Lord an offering in righteousness.' Mal. iii. 3.

For the teaching of Jesus and His apostles under this head of the subject, I refer readers to Chapters II. and III.; and I will only quote here one passage: Teaching of Jesus and His Apostles.

'Being confident of this very thing, that He which hath begun a good work in you will perform* *it* until the day of Jesus Christ.' Phil. i. 6. * R.V. perfect it.

Dr. Davidson, of the University of Halle, declared that: "Whatever be its (the fire of Hades) nature it is *reformatory*. This idea was entertained of old. It is in the writings of Origen, who thought that the fire of torment is cleansing in conformity with the doctrine of universal restoration realized after long periods of purification. He even ventured to say that the last enemy, the devil, should cease at some indefinite time; not cease to exist, but to be a devil and the enemy of God. Early Fathers.

"In like manner, Scotus Erigena looked to a period when vice and evil should cease, grounding the hope on the negative nature of evil.

"The idea is reflected in *the purgatory* of Gregory the Great, where the souls of those who have committed venial sins go after death that they may be prepared for heaven."[1]

Writing of the belief of the early Church, Dean Plumptre, in 1884, said:

[1] "Doctrine of Last Things," by Rev. S. Davidson, D.D., LL.D., 1882, pp. 81, 143. (Kegan Paul.)

Belief of the first fifteen centuries.

"We may be quite sure, that if the Descent into Hell had brought to men's minds no other thoughts than those which we commonly attach to it, it would never have gained a place in the Creed of Christendom, or seized, as it did for centuries, on men's thoughts and feelings. To those who so received it it spoke of a victory over death, which was the completion of the sacrifice of the cross. It told them that He who came to seek and save the souls He loved on earth had continued that divine work while the body was lying in the rock-hewn grave. He had passed into that unseen world as a mighty King, the herald of His own conquests. . . . There had He gathered round Him the souls of those righteous ones, from Abel onwards . . . and these He had delivered from the passionate yearning of expectancy, and the pain of unsatisfied desire, and had taken them to rest till the Resurrection in that paradise of God where He had promised to be with one whose lawless life had melted at the last hour into some touch of tenderness, and awe, and pity. Others, worthy of but a lower place, had yet found mercy. . . . In His Father's house there were many mansions, and there was a place found there for them.

"Such at one time was the Creed of Christendom. It retained its hold on the minds of the great masses of mankind for fifteen centuries. . . . In part, at least, it retained its hold on our own Church even at the Reformation."[1]

Martin Luther's belief.

"God forbid," Martin Luther once wrote to Hansen von Rechenberg, in 1522, "that I should limit the time of acquiring faith to the present life. In the depths of the Divine mercy, there may be opportunity to win it in *the future state*."[2]

Martin Luther, 1483-1546.

Again, Luther, in A.D. 1545, (as quoted by Bengel)

[1] "The Spirits in Prison," by Dean E. H. Plumptre, D.D., 1884, pp. 3-6. (William Isbister.)

[2] Quoted in "Salvation Beyond Death," by Rev. G. W. Hunt, 1900, p. 124. (A. R. Mowbray.)

in his exposition of Hosea, accepted "the idea that Christ appeared to the souls of some who in the time of Noah had been unbelieving, that they might recognize 'that their sins were forgiven through His sacrifice.'"[1]

Dr. Johnson, 1709-84.

"Dr. Johnson would, I presume," wrote the Rev. G. W. Hunt,[2] in 1900, "be generally recognized as a very typical Englishman, with very English habits of mind, yet Boswell records the following conversation between himself and that famous worthy. Boswell inquires, 'What do you think, sir, of Purgatory, as believed by the Roman Catholics?' Johnson replies, 'Why, sir, it is a very harmless doctrine. They are of opinion that the generality of mankind are neither so obstinately wicked as to deserve everlasting punishment, nor so good as to merit being admitted into the society of blessed spirits, and, therefore, that God is graciously pleased to allow of a middle state, where they may be purified by certain degrees of suffering. You see, sir, there is nothing unreasonable in this.' Boswell thereupon persists, 'But, then, sir, their Masses for the dead?' To this Johnson makes answer, 'Why, sir, if it be once established that there are souls in Purgatory, it is as proper to pray for *them* as for our brethren of mankind, who are yet in this life.'"

Dr. Van Ulrich Maywahlen, 1854.

Dr. Van Ulrich Maywahlen considers, "The Intermediate State an agreeable and peaceful abode (which) affords the believer an opportunity for undisturbed recollection and self-examination; for a deeper insight into the most secret dispositions and desires of his soul; and for a gradual completion of his own sanctification. Every inclination and disposition still remaining and drawing him away from God, as also everything which hindered man heretofore to give himself

[1] "Immortality in Christ," by Rev. S. Hemphill, Litt.D., D.D., M.R.I.A., 1904, p. 53. (Simpkin, Marshall.)

[2] "Salvation Beyond Death," by Rev. G. W. Hunt, 1900, pp. 12, 13. (A. R. Mowbray.)

entirely and unreservedly up, with all he is and has, to his Saviour, will thus be overcome."[1]

Julius Müller, 1801-78.

Julius Müller, in "The Christian Doctrine of Sin," was positive that: "The way of return to God is closed against no one who does not close it against himself; therefore, those who have not yet closed it against themselves, in that the means of salvation, the redemption of Christ, has not yet been offered to them, will indisputably hereafter, when beyond the limits of this earthly life, be placed in a condition to enter upon this way of return to God if they choose."[2]

Opinions of our own time.

Coming down to our own time, I find the general opinion to be that very few human spirits, if any, are fit to enter heaven at the time of death, and, as "nothing reaches perfection except by slow stages of growth and advancement,"[3] the perfecting of the spirit cannot be accomplished in the act of dying.

It follows therefore that "the work of bringing a human spirit to a state of full development and perfection"[4] must go on in the Intermediate life.

The Rev. J. B. Heard, in 1866:

The teaching of some well-known writers.

Rev. J. B. Heard, in 1866.

"Thus we look forward to the Intermediate State as the time when God will perfect that which is lacking. Not in purgatorial fires—quite the contrary—but under the sunshine of God's love, His spirit shall then grow in increased likeness to the Father of spirits. Thus, as the spirit grows in likeness to God, so it will grow in strength and mastery over the rational soul. . . . Then relieved altogether from the conflict with the lower or animal nature, the spirit can give its whole undivided strength to subdue the soul. . . . The blissful and unbroken communion with Christ which the spirit will enjoy during the interval between death

[1] Quoted in "Life in the Invisible," by an anonymous author, 1875, pp. 44, 45. (Elliot Stock.)

[2] Quoted in "Man's Immortality and Destiny," by Rev. R. P. Downes, LL.D., 1903, p. 93. (Smith's Publishing Company.)

[3] "Our Life after Death," by Rev. A. Chambers, 1894. (Charles Taylor.)

[4] *Ibid.*

and the resurrection may be intended to procure us advances in holiness which are impossible in our present low condition of being."[1]

The Rev. W. B. Pope, D.D., in 1875 .

"The Apocalypse shows that the disembodied spirits of the saints 'follow the Lamb whithersoever He goeth.'" . . . and other passages indicate "a progress in blessedness and in the development of moral energy in the disembodied state. They have the discipline of hope, and of hope as not yet eternal in the heavens, though no longer probationary. They wait for the consummation, their Lord's and their own. And then progress in the spiritual life is not simply that which after the judgment will go on for ever, but an advance from stage to stage peculiar to the Intermediate State. Time is behind them ; time is also before them ; the day of eternity is not yet fully come."[2]

Rev. xiv. 4.

Rev. W. B. Pope, in 1875.

The Rev. Samuel Cox,[3] in 1877, wrote to exactly the same effect as the Rev. J. B. Heard had written eleven years before, and he quoted : "Whatsoever good thing any man doeth, the same shall he receive of the Lord."

Rev. Samuel Cox, in 1877.

Eph. vi. 8.

Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., in 1878 :

"My hope is that the vast majority, at any rate, of the lost, may at length be *found*. If any hardened sinner, shamefully loving his sin, and despising the longsuffering of his Saviour, *trifle* with that doctrine, it is at his own just and awful peril. But if, on the other hand, there be some among you—as are there not? —souls sinful indeed, yet not hard in sin ;—souls that fail indeed, yet even, amid their failing, long, and pray, and love, and agonise, and strive to creep ever nearer to the light ;—then, I say, Have faith in God. There is hope for you ;—hope for you, even if death overtake

Canon F. W. Farrar, in 1878.

[1] "The Tripartite Nature of Man," by Rev. J. B. Heard, 1866, pp. 286, 287. (T. and T. Clark.)

[2] "A Compendium of Christian Theology," by Rev. W. B. Pope, D.D., 1875, vol. iii., p. 384, second edition, 1881. (Wesleyan Conference Office.)

[3] "Salvator Mundi," by Rev. Samuel Cox, 1877, pp. 157, 158 (Kegan Paul, Trench and Co.)

you before the final victory is won ; hope for the poor in spirit, for theirs is the kingdom of heaven ;—hope for the mourners, for they shall be comforted. . . .

Isa. iii. 10, 11. Yes, my brethren, 'Say ye to the righteous, that it shall be well with him ; for they shall eat the fruit of their doings. Woe unto the wicked ! it shall be ill with him ; for the reward of his hands shall be given him :'—but say also, as Christ's own Apostles said,

Acts iii. 21. that there shall be 'a restitution of all things,'—that

2 Pet. iii. 9. 1 Tim. ii. 4. Rom. ii. 4. God willeth not 'that *any* should perish ;'—that 'Christ

Rom. xiv. 9. both died, and rose, and revived that He might be

1 Cor. xv. 22. Lord both of the dead and living ;'—that 'as in Adam all die, even so in Christ shall all be made alive ';—and

1 Cor. xv. 28. that the day shall come 'when *all* things shall be subdued unto Him,' 'that God may be *all in all*'—*πάντα ἐνπᾶσιν*—omnia in omnibus—*all things in all men*. . . .

"Ay, my brethren, fear not ; have faith in God ; think noble things of God ; be sure that trust in the righteous God means the ultimate triumph of good over evil ;—be sure that the cross of Christ, Christ's infinite atonement, Christ's plenteous redemption, means,—for all who do not utterly extinguish within their own souls the glimmering wick of love to God,—the conversion of earth's sinners, far off it may be,—but *at last*, far off, at last,—into God's saints."[1]

Rev. Newman Smyth, in 1881. "There are those passages which speak of Jesus' descent into Hades, and of His preaching to the dead, to a class of souls represented as being in prison. . . . These texts, and certain glowing passages in which St. Paul speaks of the final completion of Christ's kingdom, do not teach explicitly a second probation, or mean without doubt that there shall be a final reconciliation of evil to God ; . . . yet so long as such expressions have been left in the Bible, our theology

[1] "Eternal Hope," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1878, pp. 88, 89, 116. (Macmillan.)

ought, at least, not to be over-confident that it has learned the whole mind of the Spirit concerning God's work and purpose in the interval—we know not how long it may be—between death and the final judgment. . . . All the analogies of experience would seem to compel us to believe that disciplinary processes of life must be continued after death ; and in this intermediate period, suggested by some Scriptures, room would be found for the play of those forces of moral development whose working we observe in the present life. Not, then, until the day of revelation shall disclose to our eyes the secrets of Hades, are we warranted in raising one question of our troubled understandings, or one doubt of our beating hearts, concerning the just judgments of God in eternity.

"The reformers found in their day that this half-revealed truth of the intermediate life had developed into the overgrown and corrupt doctrine of Purgatory —a doctrine saturated through and through with the poison of meritorious works and penance ; and rightly, therefore, the reformers laid the axe at the root of the tree, and cut down the whole deadly doctrine. But back in the minds of the Christian fathers had been simpler ideas of moral purification which had grown into that corrupt Papal teaching ; and back still in Scriptural ground may lie, perhaps, the germs of a better doctrine of an intermediate life, and its processes of purification and perfecting, which it may remain for our Protestant theology more carefully to discriminate, and to cultivate, for the healing of many souls now bruised and wounded by too bare and crushing dogmatism."[1]

Dean E. H. Plumptre, D.D., in 1884 :

"The words, then, of the Apostles lead us to the belief of a capacity for repentance, faith, love—for growth, discipline, education, in those who have passed

1 Pet. iv. 6.
Eph. iv. 9, 10.
Phil. ii. 10.

[1] The works of the Rev. Newman Smyth—"The Orthodox Theology of To-day," 1881, pp. 80-83. (Ward, Lock and Co.)

Dean E. H. Plumptre, in 1884.

away. We have no sufficient grounds for limiting the work on which they dwell to the representative instance or the time-boundaries of which they speak.

"Our Lord's personal teaching, as might be expected, is less explicit. He had many things to say

John xvi. 12.

to His disciples which they could not bear while He was yet with them, and this might well be one. It was not till the work had been accomplished that in this, as in other things, they could enter fully into the mystery of the Cross. Yet hints, suggestions, glimpses of the truth there are, which receive a new significance when we look at them in the light of the later teaching. Now we see more clearly than we did before what He meant when He taught His disciples that there is one sin only which has never forgiveness

Matt. xii. 31, 32. Mark iii. 28, 29.

'neither in this world, neither in the world to come';

Luke xii. 48.

how it is that the servant which knew not his Lord's will, and did it not, 'shall be beaten with few stripes';

Matt. x. 15. Matt. xi. 22-24.

or the condemnation of those who never listened to a preacher of repentance be 'more tolerable' than

John xiv. 2.

that of those who have sinned against light and knowledge: how in the 'many mansions' of His Father's house there may be room for souls in all stages of grace, strength, illumination."

We "believe that the state into which the soul passes at death is one which admits of discipline, change, progress—that there also the love which does not will that any should perish, but that all should come to repentance, proclaims evermore to the 'spirits in prison,' as during those hours of the descent into Hades, the glad tidings of reconciliation."[1]

Three American Doctors of Divinity.

The Rev. L. Abbott, D.D., Congregational Pastor, Brooklyn, New York:

Rev. L. Abbott, 1889.

"If any man avers that Christ's work of redeeming mercy ends for any soul at death, the burden of proof

[1] "The Spirits in Prison," by Dean E. H. Plumptre, D.D. 1884, pp. 20, 21, 23. (William Isbister.)

rests upon him to make good the assertion. Presumptively Christ's work of redeeming love will continue so long as love can see any hope of achieving redemption, and no longer. I see no ground in Scripture whatever for the assertion, on the one side, that this work of redemption continues for every man till death, or ends for any man at death. Christ uniformly represents the end of His redemption as coming not at death, but at the last judgment, and he who asserts that it ends at death, and he who undertakes to assert that it will certainly be carried on beyond death are wise above what is written. . . . He who looks on life and sees how little apparently is done for the redemption of some souls, cannot but hope that more will be done hereafter than has been done here. There is nothing in Scripture to forbid this hope, though nothing to convert it into an assurance of conviction."[1]

Rev. George Harris, 1889.

The Rev. George Harris, D.D., of Andover, Mass. :

'It is probable that those who have no knowledge of the gospel in this life will, after death, come under its enlightening and saving influences. How, when, where, I do not profess to know. But it seems to me reasonable to suppose that, before Christ confronts men as Judge, He will have been made known to them as Redeemer. . . . I do not discover any passage of Scripture which necessarily forbids the belief that some may have the gospel after death."[2]

Rev. E. De Pressensé, 1889.

The Rev. E. De Pressensé, D.D. :

"It is enough for me to know that God is love, to be convinced that He never ceases to love His poor creatures, even though fallen to the lowest depth. Only His love never ceases to be a holy love and saves only when it has been responded to by repentance, which is the renunciation of rebellion.

[1] Quoted in "That Unknown Country," essays by numerous writers, 1889, pp. 73, 74. (C. A. Nichols, Mass., U.S.A.)

[2] Quoted in "That Unknown Country," Anonymous, 1889, p. 437. (C. A. Nichols, Mass., U.S.A.)

Now this response can only be made by accepting the work of Christ which makes us, through faith, one with Him in His life and in His death. Therefore, it is He alone, as Paul says, who can reconcile all things. To state it briefly, no obstacle to the conversion or salvation of a sinner can ever, either in this world or *the other*, proceed from God. It is the sinner who condemns himself by his impenitence."[1]

Canon H. M. Luckock, in 1890.

Canon H. M. Luckock, D.D., in 1890 :

"It seems almost impossible to form any other conclusion than that the souls of the departed pass through some purifying process between death and judgment,"[2] and he quoted the following passages :

Mark ix. 49. 'For every one shall be salted with fire.'

1 Cor. iii. 13. 'And the fire shall try every man's work of what sort it is.'

Isa. iv. 4. 'When the Lord shall have washed away the filth of the daughters of Zion, and shall have purged the blood of Jerusalem from the midst thereof by the spirit of judgment, and by the spirit of burning.'

Mal. iii. 3. 'And He shall sit as a refiner and purifier of silver : and He shall purify the sons of Levi, and purge them as gold and silver.'

Bishop Webb, 1893.

Bishop Webb said : "We must remember, when we speak of the Holy Spirit's 'perfecting' work, that there will be much to be done as to the perfecting of the spirit—and, probably, much to be revealed—in the Intermediate State ; though not, of course, involving the necessity of pain. We often grow and expand, and the love of God takes hold upon us, quite as much in happiness as in sorrow. There is a discipline of happiness, as well as a discipline of suffering, in our Father's household."[3]

Rev. G. W. Hunt, in 1900.

The Rev. G. W. Hunt, in 1900 :

"They are guarded words, these of the present

[1] Quoted in "That Unknown Country," by Anonymous, 1889, p. 257. (C. A. Nichols, Mass., U.S.A.)

[2] "The Intermediate State," by Canon H. M. Luckock, D.D., 1890, pp. 63-72. (Longmans.)

[3] Quoted in "Glimpses of the Far-off Land," by A. J. Seymour, with introduction by Rev. W. H. Hutchings, 1893, p. 65. (Skeffington.)

Archbishop of Canterbury, guarded, as you would expect them to be, when spoken by a man in his responsible position in dealing with a highly controversial subject; but they sufficiently convey to us just that hope, to which we cling, on behalf of some, aye, the vast majority, of those who have passed or are passing out of our sight, but never out of our hearts. 'We do not know,' said Archbishop Temple, in his now historical first Visitation Charge, 'we cannot know, for God has not told us, what is happening to them in that other world, and we have no right to set up inventions of our own, and adapt our worship to such inventions. What they may need, in order to be fitted for the final entrance into perfect happiness, we cannot tell. We are told that there will be at the last day some whose work will be burned, but who nevertheless will themselves be saved, and we see men die who seem to be forgiven, but nevertheless are so full of imperfections that we can hardly believe them as yet fit for heaven. They are not sanctified. They have not that holiness without which no man can see the Lord. We have no right to invent accounts of the way by which they may be purified. We know that they will be changed when the Lord comes; but the nature, the manner, and the process of that change is not made known."[1]

Archbishop Temple.

The Rev. R. P. Downes, LL.D., in 1903:

Rev. R. P. Downes, in 1903.

"How can we escape the conviction that there is a condition of the sinner in the next world which is not final, but which makes improvement and restoration to virtue and God yet possible? It is very probable that this will be brought about through penalty and suffering proportioned to the offence—that those in the mystic under-world will be exposed to what Dean Farrar called 'the aching glow of God's revealing light, the willing agony of God's remedial fire.' But we

[1] "Salvation Beyond Death," by Rev. G. W. Hunt, 1900. pp. 72, 73. (A. R. Mowbray.)

cherish the hope that this agency will not be without avail—a hope strengthened by those words of the Master :

Luke xii. 48. 'The servant that knew not his master's will, and did it not, shall be beaten with few stripes.'

And again :

Matt. v. 26. 'Verily I say unto thee, Thou shalt by no means come out thence, till thou hast paid the uttermost farthing.'[1]

It seems to me that, when Spirits find themselves after death in the Intermediate State, there will be an end to all the doubt which exists in this world about the whole subject of religion ; and the vast majority of Spirits, while wondering at their own refusal to believe when they were on earth, will recognize the justice of God's treatment of them, and I think this will be the case even with those who, like the rich man, are in a penal sphere of Hades.

Spirits in Paradise, who fail to find there the dear ones they knew on earth, will know that they will certainly meet at some future time, when the erring ones have been purified and refined.

VI.—There is Preaching after Death, in Hades.

1 Pet. iii. 14-20. 'But and if ye suffer for righteousness' sake, happy *are ye :* and be not afraid of their terror, neither be troubled ;

'But sanctify the Lord God in your hearts : and *be* ready always to *give* an answer to every man that asketh you a reason of the hope that is in you with meekness and fear :

'Having a good conscience ; that, whereas they speak evil of you, as of evildoers, they may be ashamed that falsely accuse your good conversation in Christ.

'For *it is* better, if the will of God be so, that ye suffer for well doing, than for evil doing.

'For Christ also hath once suffered for sins, the just for

[1] "Man's Immortality and Destiny," by Rev. R. P. Downes, LL.D., 1903, p. 125. (Smith's Publishing Company.)

the unjust, that he might bring us to God, being put to death in the flesh, but quickened by the Spirit:

'By which also he went and preached unto the spirits in prison;

'Which sometime were disobedient, when once the long-suffering of God waited in the days of Noah, while the ark was a preparing, wherein few, that is, eight souls were saved by water.'

The two main ways of interpretation of the passage.

This passage has been the subject of much controversy from very early times.

One of the two main ways of interpretation is to dissociate the passage entirely from the doctrine of the descent into Hades, and to hold that it was "'in spirit,' *i.e.*, mystically speaking, that our Lord Himself" "through the person of Noah, preached repentance to the old world."[1]

This idea appears to be untenable, as it bears no reference to the context.

The second interpretation is based on the undoubted fact that "St. Peter's object through the whole of this section is to encourage the Hebrew Christians to be ready, through a good conscience, for a brave martyrdom, if need be. They are to think how their deaths, like Christ's, may bring their persecutors to God. Nay—he seems to imply—their very spirits going forth into the world of spirits may conceivably carry a gospel of some kind even to Hebrew relatives who have passed away, like those Antediluvians, in the 'disobedience' which was characteristic of the Jews."[2]

This second interpretation is that, "directly Christ's human spirit was disengaged from the body, He gave proof of the new powers of purely spiritual action thus acquired by going off to the place, or state, in which other disembodied spirits were (who would have been incapable of receiving direct impressions from Him had He not Himself been in the purely spiritual condition), and conveyed to them certain tidings"—the gospel of good tidings.

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)
[2] *Ibid.*

"Some have thought that Christ went to proclaim to them the certainty of their damnation," but "it would be too grim to call that a gospel which (in Calvin's words) "made it more clear and patent to them that they were shut out from all salvation."

Opinion of St.

"St. Clement of Alexandria, who derives the notion from the *Shepherd* of Hermas, gives his belief that the Apostles also, when they died, preached to those who had died before them; and though there is little that throws light on our occupation in the Intermediate State, it can hardly be pronounced impossible for some spirits to be allowed to follow Christ's example there by preaching to spirits in prison"[1] ("Stromata," ii. 9 and vi. 6).

Opinions of well-known writers.

The Rev. Andrew Jukes, in 1869:

1 Pet. iii. 19. 'By which also He went and preached unto the spirits in prison.'

Rev. Andrew Jukes, in 1869.

"This passage, I know, is called 'difficult,' that is, it is one which it is hard and even impossible fairly to reconcile with the views called Orthodox. The words, however, are not difficult. They distinctly assert that our Lord went and preached to the spirits in prison, who once had been disobedient in the days of Noah. The 'difficulty' is that Protestant orthodoxy has decided that there can be no message of mercy to any after death. Protestant commentators therefore have attempted to evade the plain statements of this Scripture, and their forced and unnatural interpretations show how very strong the passage is against them. Anyone who wishes to see a summary of these interpretations may find them collected in Alford's Greek Testament, *in loco*. His own comment is as follows:

[1] "An Inquiry into the Scripture Doctrine Concerning the Duration of Future Punishment," by Rev. M. Horbery, D.D., 1744. (Wesleyan Conference Office, *reprinted*.)

"'I understand these words to say, that our Lord, in His disembodied state, did go to the place of detention of departed spirits, and did there announce His work of redemption, preach salvation, in fact, to the disembodied spirits of those who refused to obey the voice of God, when the judgment of the flood was hanging over them.'

"The fact, that in the Prayer-Book these verses are appointed to be read as the Epistle for Easter Even, that is for the day after the crucifixion, and before the resurrection of our Lord, shews plainly enough the judgment of the English Church as to the true sense and interpretation of this passage. The Early Fathers, almost without exception, understood it to speak of Christ's descent to Hades."[1]

Mr. Jukes thought that, to "those who are Christ's," death "shall only introduce them to fuller and wider service to lost ones, over whom the Lord shall set them as His priests and kings, until all things are restored and reconciled unto Him. . . . To whom, I ask, shall the Church after death be priests? Shall it be to that great mass of our fellow-men, who have departed hence in ignorance? Shall it be to 'spirits in prison,' such as those to whom after His death Christ Himself once preached? Shall not His saints, made like Him, do the same works, still following Him, and with Him being priests to God? Will not their glory be to rule and feed and enlighten and clothe those who are committed to them, even as Christ has fed and clothed them? For He is 'King of kings and Lord of lords,' words which indicate the many kings and rulers under Him, of whom He is Head, and whom He makes heads to others."[2]

1 Tim. vi. 15.

Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., in 1881:

Canon F. W. Farrar, in 1881.

"As early as the first century it had been inferred that, since His saints and apostles continue His work

[1] "The Second Death and the Restitution of All Things," by Rev. Andrew Jukes, 1869, pp. 39, 40. (Longmans.)

[2] *Ibid.*

on earth, so they too preached, and by their preaching helped to deliver, or to ameliorate the lot of those who pass hence into a state of punishment."[1]

Dean E. H. Plumptre, in 1884.

Dean E. H. Plumptre, D.D., in 1884 :

May we not "believe, as some did in the earliest ages of the Church, and as others have thought of late, that those whose joy it has been in life to be fellow-workers with Christ in leading many to righteousness, may continue to be fellow-workers there, and so share the life of angels in their work of service as in their ministries of praise ? The manifestation of God's righteous judgment and of His changeless love may thus, using men and angels as His instruments, help to renew throughout His universe all who are capable of renewal."[2]

Canon H. M. Luckock, in 1890.

Canon H. M. Luckock, in 1890 :

"As in this life, experience shows that ministering to those who are ignorant or imperfectly instructed in the knowledge of God, is a great means of strengthening a man's religious character ; as the very desire to hold up for imitation the highest example of a Christ-like life is a powerful factor in developing the faculties that create it, so, it may be, hereafter the act of ministering spiritual service to other souls within the fold of the Invisible Church will prove to be an important means for one's own advancement.

"The possibility of such opportunities of usefulness after death helps us to understand the deep mystery of Divine Providence, when God cuts short the earthly career of one whose life, as man judges, is of priceless value to the Church. The influence, the preaching, the ministrations are not stopped, they are only transferred to another sphere, to be continued with intensified energy under spiritual conditions, though

[1] "Mercy and Judgment," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, p. 80. (Macmillan.)

[2] "The Spirits in Prison," by Dean E. H. Plumptre, D.D., 1884, pp. 24, 25. (William Isbister.)

no material ear may hear the voice, no mortal hand shall feel the touch; they are lost to the Church on earth, they are gained by the Church in the Intermediate State."[1]

Rev. A. Williamson, in 1890.

The Rev. A. Williamson, B.D., in 1890:

"We conclude that consciousness, hereafter, will centre round a mentally active life. Memory, aspiration, solicitude, intercession, and all the different exercises and occupations of the human mind will have an enlarged scope given them. Passionate prayer will ascend incessantly to God, for each human tie left on earth. Contrition may be experienced in a way which would now be impossible. The soul is set free to give expression to its deepest longing, and the remembrance of the past will be reflected with a vivid reality that can make it almost possible, in thought, to live over again the earthly life of past experience."[2]

"In the Intermediate State, progress and development, under due limitation, may possibly and reasonably be conceived."[3]

"We can imagine, for instance, the Church in the Intermediate State, continuing a course of ministry similar to that by which the sanctification of souls is carried on in present time. The Divine Word may be proclaimed by a company of preachers unembarrassed by the difficulties which now hinder its free course and acceptance. A ministry of intercession may be employed, which by its faith and intense reality may lead to miracles of grace quite impossible to the Church in her militant state. There may be even some further operation of the Holy Ghost, by which, without the aid of visible means, the blessings of incorporation into Christ's Church and of the soul's

[1] "The Intermediate State," by Canon H. M. Luckock, D.D., 1890, p. 99. (Longmans.)
[2] "The Intermediate State," by Rev. A. Williamson, B.D., 1890, p. 34. (Wells Gardner, Darton and Co., Limited.)
[3] *Ibid.*, p. 37.

feeding upon His Body and Blood may be vouchsafed."[1]

Rev. A. Chambers, in 1894.

The Rev. A. Chambers, in 1894:

"God's attitude toward the human race, as portrayed by the writers of Scripture, makes it a *necessity* that there should be a preaching of the Gospel in the Intermediate-life.

"When God devised the scheme of Redemption, He contemplated humanity as a whole.

"It was no expedient whereby only a limited number of the human race should be brought within the pale of salvation, and the remainder left outside. . . .

"Of no person is it true that God does not wish him to be saved. . . .

"But the above representation of God is untrue in the face of the millions who leave the Earth-life without so much as hearing the Gospel, if there be no preaching of that Gospel in the Intermediate-life."[2]

Rev. G. W. Hunt, in 1900.

The Rev. G. W. Hunt, in 1900:

"I take it absolutely and literally, that each and every soul, into which God has ever, or shall ever breathe the breath of life, shall have his or her opportunity of accepting or rejecting the offer of salvation, that offer being made to him or her so fully and so intelligibly, as to render its rejection a *crime against his or her own soul*. . . . The conviction that every man, *quâ* man, and every woman, *quâ* woman, by virtue of wearing the same humanity that Christ wears, must somewhere, at some time or other, have the chance of salvation in Him, is to me the Magna Charta of Christendom, without which Christianity tends to become the shibboleth of a petty sect, instead of the creed of a Catholic religion."[3]

[1] "The Intermediate State," by Rev. A. Williamson, B.D., 1890, pp. 53, 54. (Wells Gardner, Darton and Co., Limited.)

[2] "Our Life after Death," by Rev. A. Chambers, 1894, pp. 140-168. (Charles Taylor.)

[3] "Salvation Beyond Death," by Rev. G. W. Hunt, 1900, pp. 18, 19. (Mowbray and Co.)

Dean Alford, of Canterbury (A.D. 1810-1871):

'For this cause was the gospel preached also to them that are dead, that they might be judged according to men in the flesh, but live according to God in the spirit.' 1 Pet. iv. 6.

Dean Alford.

"It will be gathered from all which has been said that, with the great majority of commentators, ancient and modern, I understand these words to say that our Lord, in His disembodied state, did go to the place of departed spirits, and did then commence His work of redemption—preach salvation, in fact, to the disembodied spirits of those who refused to obey the voice of God when the judgment of the Flood was hanging over them."[1]

Rev. R. P. Downes, in 1903.

The Rev. R. P. Downes, LL.D., in 1903:

"The Church of Christ is in the Intermediate State as well as here, and in that unseen world there are agencies and activities not less needed and not less blessed than those which exist in our present world. Children will need training and instruction, perplexed souls will need guidance, and multitudes who never knew Him here will need leading into the knowledge and the love of Christ.

"It is a violation of the lesson of analogy and of all the laws of mind to suppose that children, and the ignorant, and depraved will become wise and holy at a flash, or as the result of mere change of place. . . .

"This largely explains the mystery of arrested service in the present life."[2]

The Heathen.

It is marvellous to consider how cruel has been the teaching of some divines regarding the lot of the heathen, and of those who have never been granted

[1] Quoted in "Man's Immortality and Destiny," by Rev. R. P. Downes, LL.D., 1903, p. 97. (Smith's Publishing Co.)

[2] "Man's Immortality and Destiny," by Rev. R. P. Downes, LL.D., 1903, pp. 118, 119. (Smith's Publishing Co.)

any opportunity of finding the light. Some have taught that we know nothing about the lot of the heathen, and others have declared that the heathen are doomed to perdition.

The American Board of Commissioners of Foreign Missions, in 1889, in a tract entitled, "The Grand Motive of Missionary Effort," said: "The heathen are involved in the ruins of the apostasy, and are expressly doomed to perdition."[1]

A minister of the Gospel, in England, when pleading the cause of Foreign Missions, said, that the Heathen "must be for ever exposed to the torments of hell."[2]

If this is the Gospel which missionaries carry to the Heathen, it is surprising that they get anyone to listen to them, as they are trying to introduce a God who, according to them, is more cruel than any heathen god.

It must be remembered that, before the advent of Jesus, the term Heathen included all the nations of the world except the Israelites, and it is monstrous to hold that all the millions who died natural deaths, or were slaughtered by the Israelites in their conquest of Palestine, have been condemned to torments in everlasting fire.

The first opinion, that we know nothing about the lot of the heathen, is a cowardly plea, and it would be a poor answer for a missionary to give to a convert questioning him about the state of his dead mother, who had never heard of the Christian God.

The belief that the Gospel will be explained and offered to the heathen in Hades, while not expressly taught in the Bible, is in accordance with what we know, or imagine, of the justice of God, and it is, I

[1] "That Unknown Country, or What Living Men believe Concerning Punishment After Death," published in America, 1889, p. 229. (C. A. Nichols and Co., Mass., U.S.A.)

[2] "Man's Immortality and Destiny," by Rev. R. P. Downes, LL.D., 1903, pp. 134, 135. (Smith's Publishing Company.)

think, more generally accepted now than the cruel doctrine of old.

I know no reason why it should be thought that the Heathen are excluded from the very full offer of salvation made in the Gospels—of which I give a few passages—and this necessitates preaching in Hades to those who never heard the Gospel on earth.

'Even as the Son of man came not to be ministered unto, but to minister, and to give His life a ransom for many.' Matt. xx. 28. Mark x. 45.

'Go ye therefore, and teach all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Ghost.' Matt. xxviii. 19. Mark xvi. 15.

'And all flesh shall see the salvation of God.' Luke iii. 6.

'And I, if I be lifted up from the earth, will draw all *men* unto Me. John xii. 32, 47.

* * * * * *

'And if any man hear My words, and believe not, I judge him not: for I came not to judge the world, but to save the world.'

St. Paul, in writing to the Romans about "the judgment of God," distinctly referred to the Gentiles: Rom. ii. 2.

'For there is no respect of persons with God. Rom. ii. 11-16.

'For as many as have sinned without law shall also perish without law: and as many as have sinned in the law shall be judged by the law;

'(For not the hearers of the law *are* just before God, but the doers of the law shall be justified.

'For when the Gentiles, which have not the law, do by nature the things contained in the law, these, having not the law, are a law unto themselves:

'Which shew the work of the law written in their hearts, their conscience also bearing witness, and *their* thoughts the mean while accusing or else excusing one another;)

'In the day when God shall judge the secrets of men by Jesus Christ according to my gospel.'

Besides those who are nominally Christians, there are now, as in the past, millions upon millions to whom the Most Holy Name of Jesus is utterly unknown; there are also "masses of the population of even a professedly Christian country like England" to whom The Heathen.

that Name is, "through no fault of their own," practically unknown.[1]

Unless, therefore, we are prepared to hold that all these Heathen will be doomed to the sentence passed on those on the left hand of Jesus, we must believe that there is an Intermediate State between death and the Judgment Day, in which all these classes of spirits can receive the training which they never had on earth.

In considering the case of those—other than the Heathen—"who have never been granted any opportunity of finding the light," I seem to notice an indisposition on the part of most of the authors I have consulted to entertain the idea of a second Probation for any who have been educated and taught the rudiments of the Christian religion. My objection to this reserve is founded on the argument that many men have never been taught what may be called the reformed doctrine of the Anglican Church, either in their youth, at school, or in after-life, from the pulpit.

A man brought up in the old Puritan doctrine of immediate judgment after death, never heard of an Intermediate State, in his youth, and the subject is very seldom mentioned in the pulpit.

I hold, therefore, that it is reasonable to expect that such men will be given an opportunity to hear the true Gospel preached in the Intermediate State, and I go further, and say that I believe the Gospel will be freely preached in the Intermediate State, and every Spirit will have opportunities of hearing it.

[1] "Salvation Beyond Death," by Rev. G. W. Hunt, 1900, pp. 137, 138. (A. R. Mowbray and Co.)

VII.—Every Spirit has to remain in the Intermediate State until the Second Advent of Jesus, or the Resurrection on the Last Day, but the Condition of the Faithful, and of all the Saints, is one of Peace and Happiness.

The direct teaching of Jesus and His Apostles on this point appears to me to be clearer and more explicit than it is under any of the other heads into which I have divided the subject of the Life after Death (Chapters II. and III.).

Intermediate state denied by Reformers.

Nevertheless, since the publication of John Wycliffe's translation of the Bible in A.D. 1380, when the Reformers determined to throw over the idea of an Intermediate State, the general teaching in England, until quite recently, has been that Spirits are judged immediately after death, and, while the righteous are admitted at once into Heaven, the sinners are sentenced to everlasting punishment, and are cast into flames of material fire, in what is always called "Hell."

Reformers agreed with Rome about immediate judgment.

It is a curious fact that the teaching of the Reformers was similar to the present doctrine of the Church of Rome as regards the judgment immediately after death, with the omission of Purgatory.

I have already pointed out (Chapter VII.) that the Church of Rome teaches that all Spirits are judged immediately after death, and "the final doom of every one is then fixed, and there is no more possibility of changing it."

If the sentence is to everlasting punishment, the sinner is at once thrown into the everlasting fire; if Heaven is his lot, the spirit has first to be purified in Purgatory.

Teaching of Jesus. John vi. 46. John iii. 13.

Jesus clearly taught that "Not that any man hath seen the Father," and "no man hath ascended up to heaven, but He that came down from heaven."

Enoch and Elijah.

These passages are accepted as explicit on the point that no spirits were admitted into Heaven previous to the Crucifixion, but it is argued that St. Paul taught, in the following passage, that the result of the descent into Hades was that Jesus led out the spirits of the faithful, who had been in captivity :

St. Paul's teaching misunderstood.

Eph. iv. 8.

'Wherefore he saith, When He ascended up on high, He led captivity captive, and gave gifts unto men.'

St. Paul is again quoted as teaching that, since that time, all spirits are judged immediately after death :

Heb. ix. 27.

'And as it is appointed unto men once to die, but after this the judgment.'

Unfortunately for those who hold this belief, the revisers of the text have altered the passage to :

Heb. ix. 27 (R.V.).

'And inasmuch as it is appointed unto men once to die, and after this *cometh judgement.*'

Canon Luckock has pointed out that the definite article is always prefixed to the noun when the final Judgment is spoken of. The absence of it in the above passage shows St. Paul's teaching to be that "death is immediately followed by *a* judgment or crisis ; but it can only be that by which the place of the soul is determined in Hades."[1]

Eph. iv. 8.

Col. ii. 15.

The explanation of the first passage which commends itself to me is that it is probably best interpreted by the passage, "And having spoiled principalities and powers"—the powers of sin and death—"He made a shew of them openly, triumphing over them in it"[2]—the cross (see the passage quoted in Chapter III.).

Teaching of St. Peter, St. John, and St. Paul.

I confess I cannot understand how the Reformers brought themselves to oppose the direct teaching of St. Peter, St. John, and St. Paul, that the Resurrection of Jesus made no change as regards the detention of all Spirits in Hades until the Second Coming of Jesus.

[1] "The Intermediate State," by Canon H. M. Luckock, D.D., 1890, p. 22. (Longmans.)

[2] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

As Canon Luckock points out, the Fathers and Doctors of the Early Church did not make this mistake, but followed the teaching in the Epistles.

Shortly after the Crucifixion, St. Peter told the Jews in Jerusalem that, "David is *not* ascended into the heavens." Acts ii. 34.

In his first Epistle, he told the elders, "*when* the chief Shepherd shall appear, ye shall receive a crown of glory that fadeth not away," but not before; and, in his second Epistle, he referred to the angels who sinned, and who were "*reserved unto judgment*," not already sentenced; and, in the same Epistle, he wrote of the unjust being *reserved* "unto the day of judgment to be punished," but not before. 1 Pet. v. 4. 2 Pet. ii. 4. 2 Pet. ii. 9.

St. John, in his first Epistle, wrote, "*when* He shall appear, we shall be like Him," but not before; and, "*No man hath seen God* at any time." 1 John iii. 2. 1 John iv. 12.

In nearly all his Epistles St. Paul taught this doctrine:

1. 'Waiting for the coming of our Lord Jesus Christ.' 1 Cor. i. 7.
2. 'Afterward they that are Christ's *at His coming*.' 1 Cor. xv. 23.
3. 'Will perform it* *until the day* of Jesus Christ.' Phil. i. 6. * R.V. perfect it.
4. '*When* Christ, who is our life, shall appear, *then* shall ye also appear with Him in glory.' Col. iii. 4.
5. 'The dead in Christ *shall rise* first.' 1 Thess. iv. 16.
6. '*Whom no man hath seen* nor can see.' 1 Tim. vi. 16.
7. 'That they without us *should not be made* perfect.' Heb. xi. 40.

The Rev. H. Constable, in 1873, wrote:

"Paul's teaching is reiterated by our Lord Himself in the Book of Revelation. He is comforting His Apostle John, overcome by His divine presence. His words of comfort are: 1 Cor. xv. Rev. H. Constable, in 1873.

"'Fear not; I am the first and the last: I *am* He that liveth, and was dead; and, behold, I am alive for evermore, Amen; and have the keys of hell† and of death.' Rev. i. 17, 18. † R.V. Hades.

"The teaching of Christ here is very plain. He refers to His own death, when His body was in the grave and His soul in Hades. He refers to His own

resurrection, when His body left the grave and His soul was delivered from Hades. He does this to comfort the mind of his Apostle John, and so of all believers, that what He had done for Himself He would do for them. He conveys the comfort in the words, 'I have the keys of Hades and of death.' What is this but saying, 'I will open Hades and the grave for my people, even as I opened them for Myself?' And hence we are taught that for believers in Christ, since His resurrection, Hades still has the very same existence and power that it ever had, that it as truly reigns over them as death reigns. The words of Christ are but the reiteration of the sentiment of
1 Cor. xv. 55. Paul: 'O death, where is thy sting? O Hades, where is thy victory?' The sting of death would be removed, and the victory of Hades changed into defeat, when, in the morning of resurrection, Christ uses the keys of death and Hades, and lets the prisoners of hope free for ever."[1]

Canon H. M. Luckock, in 1879.

Canon H. M. Luckock, D.D., in 1879, also said:

"It is clear that the Fathers and Doctors of the Early Church were right in their conclusion, that the souls of the saints, whether martyrs or others, will not see God and be admitted to the Beatific Vision till after the Day of Judgment. It follows also that the perfect knowledge of which St. Paul spoke must be still in the future, and dependent on the same manifestation."[2]

Rev. J. Bush, in 1896.

The Rev. J. Bush, in 1896, agreed, and wrote:

Matt. xxv. 46. 'And these shall go away into everlasting punishment: but the righteous into life eternal.'

"If the wicked and the righteous, who are thus judicially disposed of, had been, on the average, thousands of years in a state of absolute retribution;

[1] "Hades," by Rev. H. Constable, 1873, pp. 69, 70. (Elliot Stock.)

[2] "After Death," by Canon H. M. Luckock, D.D., 1879, p. 227. (Longmans.)

if they had left, these their chains and those their harps, to come to the judgment seat, then this verse would have read, 'And these shall go back into everlasting punishment, and the righteous into life eternal. . . .

"We conclude that, until the general judgment, rewards are not bestowed and punishment is not inflicted."[1]

[1] "The Intermediate State," by Rev. J. Bush, 1896, p. 15. (Methodist Publishing House.)

CHAPTER IX

THE JUDGMENT ON THE LAST DAY.

CHAPTER IX

The Judgment on the Last Day.

"What the First Coming of the Messiah was to the ancient saints His Second Coming is to us: we have the same certain but indefinite future; very much more clearly outlined as to its great events, but equally undefined as to times and seasons, and vanishing into equal, if not deeper, mystery."[1] Rev. W. B. Pope, in 1875.

"It is solemnly and distinctly asserted that all who have ever lived shall be awakened from the sleep of death, and shall come forth from their graves, and undergo a scrutiny. The judgment will take place according to fixed principles, universally applied: there will be, we are assured, 'no respect of persons.' The statements of Scripture are explicit: 'We must all appear before the judgment seat of Christ; that every one may receive the things done in his body, according to that he hath done, whether it be good or bad.' Rev. H. H. Dobney, in 1844. Rom. ii. 11. 2 Cor. v. 10.

"And the Judge Himself represents Himself as saying to one class, 'Come, ye blessed of My Father, inherit the kingdom prepared for you from the foundation of the world'; and to another class, 'Depart from Me, ye cursed, into everlasting fire, prepared for the devil and his angels,' and he asserts, that as a consequence, the one class will rise to highest bliss, the other Matt. xxv. 34. Matt. xxv. 41, 46.

[1] "A Compendium of Christian Theology," by Rev. W. B. Pope, D.D., 1875, vol. iii., p. 368; second edition, 1881. (Wesleyan Conference Office.)

sink into awful woe—'These shall go away into ever-
2 Thess. i. 9. lasting punishment';—they 'shall be punished with everlasting destruction from the presence of the Lord, and from the glory of His power.'"[1]

Rev. Edward White, in 1846. "Although in one noted description of the 'torment' in Hades of the spirit of the selfish sensualist, Christ seems, according to St. Luke, to indicate suffering as awaiting the separate souls of wicked men who have
Luke xvi. 29. had 'Moses and the prophets,' He and His Apostles more usually point to 'a day of judgment' in the future as the 'appointed' time of the execution of these awful threatenings.

Matt. x. 15. "'It shall be more tolerable for Sodom and Gomorrha *in the day of judgment* than for that city.'

"And by Christ Himself it is distinctly said that men
Rom. viii. 11. who are thus judged will appear before God *in their bodies*, to undergo the infliction.

John v. 28, 29. "'*All that are in the graves* shall hear His voice,
"'And shall come forth; they that have done good, unto
*R.V. judgement. the resurrection of life; and they that have done evil, unto the *resurrection of damnation*.'*

"St. Paul speaks of himself as having hope toward
Acts xxiv. 15. God 'that there shall be a resurrection of the dead, both of the just and unjust.'

"St. John also, in the vision in the Apocalypse, appears to confirm this tremendous expectation, when he says:

Rev. xx. 12, 15. 'I saw the dead, (the dead who lived again at the end of the millennium), small and great, (high and low), stand before God; . . . and the dead were judged out of those things which were written in the books, according to their works. . . .
'And whosoever was not found written in the book of life was cast into the lake of fire.'"[2]

Rev. S. Hemphill, in 1904. "Then, when the Great Assize takes place, shall be the resurrection of the unjust, as also of the just. Then the judgment, the sentence, the going into the eternal

[1] "Lectures on Future Punishment," by Rev. H. H. Dobney, 1844, pp. 26, 27. (T. Ward and Co.)
[2] "Life in Christ," by Rev. Edward White, 1846, pp. 374, 375. (Elliot Stock.)

fire, and the destruction of both soul and body in Gehenna, like chaff, or tares, or withered branches: 'this is the second death.' "[1]

Rev. xx. 14.

"Our Lord makes a distinction as to the Kingdom. Up to the end of this world, it is 'His own Kingdom'; after that crisis, it is 'the Kingdom of the Father.' So long as probation lasts, and until the day of reckoning and retribution, it is His Kingdom and He governs; and the last act of His government will be the judging of all those whom He had redeemed and governed. After that, the Son of God retires from the mediatorial office and work, and thenceforth it is the Kingdom of the Father."[2]

Rev. J. Bush, in 1896.

Matt. xvi. 27.

I think I have made it clear that I do not believe the body, which is laid in the grave and gradually becomes dust, will be raised again exactly as it was. St. Paul gave no uncertain answer to the question:

'How are the dead raised up? and with what body do they come?

'Thou fool,' he said, 'that which thou sowest is not quickened, except it die:

'And that which thou sowest, thou sowest not that body that shall be, but bare grain, it may chance of wheat, or of some other *grain*:

'But God giveth it a body as it hath pleased Him, and to every seed His own body.'

1 Cor. xv. 35-38.

I believe that, immediately after death, the soul and the Spirit—whether dormant or quickened—enter a spirit-body suited to the conditions of the Intermediate State, and, at the Resurrection, it is the spirit-body which will rise, and which, in the case of the righteous, will be changed for a celestial body.

A certain resemblance is preserved through all these changes, so that recognition will be possible in Hades, and also in Heaven.

The first recorded reference by Jesus to the Last

[1] "Immortality in Christ," by Rev. S. Hemphill, D.D., Litt.D., M.R.I.A., 1904, p. 94. (Simpkin, Marshall.)

[2] "The Intermediate State," by Rev. J. Bush, 1896, p. 28. (Methodist Publishing House.)

Great Day is found in the Sermon on the Mount, which was preached during the second tour in Galilee :

Matt. vii. 21-23. Luke xiii. 25-27.

1. 'Not every one that saith unto Me, Lord, Lord, shall enter into the kingdom of heaven ; but he that doeth the will of My Father which is in heaven.

'Many will say to Me in that day, Lord, Lord, have we not prophesied in Thy name ? and in Thy name have cast out devils ? and in Thy name done many wonderful works ?

'And then will I profess unto them, I never knew you; depart from Me, ye that work iniquity.'

"No part of the Sermon on the Mount is more marvellous in its claims than this. . . . At the commencement of His ministry, in a discourse which, though it is spoken in the tone of authority, gives no prominence to His mission as the Messiah, He yet claims, with the calmness of assured conviction, to be the Judge before whom the faithful and the hypocrites will alike have to give an account. In 'that day' (the words, though they would not suggest, as afterwards, the thought of His own advent, would yet carry the minds of men to the 'great and dreadful day') the words 'Lord, Lord,' would mean more than the expression of human courtesy."[1]

Mal. iv. 5.

Matt. xiii. 24-30.

2. During the same tour, He spoke the Parable of the good seed and the tares, which He afterwards explained to His disciples by saying :

Matt. xiii. 37-43.

'He that soweth the good seed is the Son of man ;

'The field is the world ; the good seed are the children of the kingdom ; but the tares are the children of the wicked *one* ;

'The enemy that sowed them is the devil ; the harvest is the end of the world ; and the reapers are the angels.

'As therefore the tares are gathered and burned in the fire ; so shall it be in the end of this world.

'The Son of man shall send forth His angels, and they shall gather out of His kingdom all things that offend,* and them which do iniquity ;

* R.V. cause stumbling.

'And shall cast them into a furnace of fire : there shall be wailing and gnashing of teeth.

'Then shall the righteous shine forth as the sun in the kingdom of their Father. Who hath ears to hear, let him hear.'

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

3. On the same occasion, Jesus spoke the Parable of the

'Net that was cast into the sea, and gathered of every kind: Matt. xiii. 47-50.
'Which, when it was full, they drew to shore, and sat down, and gathered the good into vessels, but cast the bad away.
'So shall it be at the end of the world: the angels shall come forth, and sever the wicked from among the just,
'And shall cast them into the furnace of fire: there shall be wailing and gnashing of teeth.'

4. During the second visit to Jerusalem after His baptism, Jesus said to the Jews, who "sought to kill Him" because He had broken the sabbath by healing an infirm man at Bethesda: John v. 2-18.

'Verily, verily, I say unto you, He that heareth My word, and believeth on Him that sent Me, hath everlasting life,* and shall not come into condemnation;† but is passed from death unto life. John v. 24-29.
'Verily, verily, I say unto you, The hour is coming, and now is, when the dead shall hear the voice of the Son of God: and they that hear shall live.
'For as the Father hath life in Himself; so hath He given to the Son to have life in Himself;
'And hath given Him authority to execute judgment also, because He is the Son of man.
'Marvel not at this: for the hour is coming, in the which all that are in the graves shall hear His voice,
'And shall come forth; they that have done good, unto the resurrection of life; and they that have done evil, unto the resurrection of damnation.'‡

* R.V. eternal life.
† R.V. into judgement.
‡ R.V. judgement.

5. During the third tour in Galilee, in the wonderful sermon preached in the synagogue at Capernaum, Jesus said: John vi. 26-58.

'And this is the Father's will which hath sent Me, that of all which He hath given Me I should lose nothing, but should raise it up again at the last day. John vi. 39, 40.
'And this is the will of Him that sent Me, that every one which seeth the Son, and believeth on Him, may have everlasting life: and I will raise him up at the last day.'

It was the calling Himself "the bread which came down from heaven," and the making belief in Himself as "the Son of man" indispensable for obtaining eternal life, that made many leave and walk no more with Him. This was because their most cherished

belief, which they had learnt from Plato, was that the soul of man is *by nature* immortal.

Luke xii. 31-59.

6. During the same tour, Jesus foretold His own Second Coming by the Parables of the servants watching, and the faithful and wise steward.

In the first Parable, He said :

> 'Blessed are those servants, whom the Lord when He cometh shall find watching';

and, in the second :

> 'The Lord of that servant will come in a day when he looketh not for Him, and at an hour when he is not aware.'

7. After the return from "the coasts of Cæsarea Philippi," Jesus said to His disciples :

Matt. xvi. 27. Mark viii. 38. Luke ix. 26.

> 'For the Son of man shall come in the glory of His Father with His angels ; and then He shall reward every man according to his works.'

8. During the last visit to Jerusalem, Peter said unto Jesus :

Matt. xix. 27-30. Mark x. 28-31. Luke xviii. 28-30. Luke xxii. 28-30.

> 'Behold, we have forsaken all, and followed Thee ; what shall we have therefore ?
>
> 'And Jesus said unto them, Verily I say unto you, That ye which have followed Me, in the regeneration when the Son of man shall sit in the throne of His glory, ye also shall sit upon twelve thrones, judging the twelve tribes of Israel.
>
> 'And every one that hath forsaken houses, or brethren, or sisters, or father, or mother, or wife, or children, or lands, for My name's sake, shall receive an hundredfold, and shall inherit everlasting life.*
>
> 'But many *that are* first shall be last; and the last *shall be* first.'

* R.V. eternal life.

The words "the Son of man shall sit in the throne of His glory" recall the vision of Daniel.

Dan. vii. 14.

Luke xxii. 30.

"The repetition of the promise at the moment when apparent failure was close at hand (and sit on thrones judging the twelve tribes of Israel), is significant as carrying the words into a higher region of symbolic meaning. Not on any thrones of earth were those disciples to sit, any more than the Master was to sit on the throne of His father David in an earthly Jerusalem."[1]

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

9. When He was abiding in the house of Zacchæus, in Jericho, Jesus spoke the Parable of the pounds, which He concluded with the warning : Luke xix. 5-27.

'But those Mine enemies, which would not that I should reign over them, bring hither, and slay them before Me.' Luke xix. 27.

10. One day—

'Jesus cried and said, He that believeth on Me, believeth not on Me, but on Him that sent Me. John xii. 44-50.
'And he that seeth Me seeth Him that sent Me.
'I am come a light into the world, that whosoever believeth on Me should not abide in darkness.
'And if any man hear My words, and believe not,* I judge him not : for I came not to judge the world, but to save the world. * R.V. and keep them not.
'He that rejecteth Me, and receiveth not My words, hath one that judgeth him : the word that I have spoken, the same shall judge him in the last day.
'For I have not spoken of Myself ; but the Father which sent Me, He gave Me a commandment, what I should say, and what I should speak.
'And I know that His commandment is life everlasting :† whatsoever I speak therefore, even as the Father said unto Me, so I speak.' † R.V. life eternal.

11 and 12. When the chief priests and elders of the people asked Jesus, "By what authority doest Thou these things ? and who gave Thee this authority ?" He answered them, and spoke the Parables of the wicked husbandmen, and the marriage of the King's son. Matt. xxi. 23-41. Mark xii. 1-9. Luke xx. 9-16. Matt. xxii. 1-13.

The first Parable concluded as follows :

'When the lord therefore of the vineyard cometh, what will he do unto those husbandmen ?
'They say unto him, He will miserably destroy those wicked men, and will let out *his* vineyard unto other husbandmen, which shall render him the fruits in their seasons.'

The order given regarding the man who came to the marriage without a wedding-garment was :

'Bind him hand and foot, and take him away, and cast *him* into outer darkness ; there shall be weeping and gnashing of teeth.
'For many are called, but few *are* chosen.'

13. After Jesus had paid His last visit to the Temple, He prophesied its destruction, and when "the disciples

came unto Him privately," "as He sat upon the mount of Olives," "saying, Tell us when shall these things be? and what shall be the sign of Thy coming, and of the end of the world?" Jesus answered and spoke the following prophecies, which were fulfilled even before the destruction of Jerusalem.

Matt. xxiv. 3-28. Mark xiii. 1-23. Luke xvii. 23, xxi. 8-24, xxiii. 29, 30.

'Take heed that no man deceive you.

'For many shall come in My name, saying, I am Christ; and shall deceive many.

'And ye shall hear of wars and rumours of wars: see that ye be not troubled: for all *these things* must come to pass, but the end is not yet.

'For nation shall rise against nation, and kingdom against kingdom: and there shall be famines, and pestilences, and earthquakes, in divers places.

'All these *are* the beginning of sorrows.

'Then shall they deliver you up to be afflicted, and shall kill you: and ye shall be hated of all nations for My name's sake.

* R.V. stumble.

'And then shall many be offended,* and shall betray one another, and shall hate one another.

'And many false prophets shall rise, and shall deceive many.

'And because iniquity shall abound, the love of many shall wax cold.

'But he that shall endure unto the end, the same shall be saved.

'And this gospel of the kingdom shall be preached in all the world for a witness unto all nations; and then shall the end come.

Dan. ix. 27. Dan. xii. 11.

'When ye therefore shall see the abomination of desolation, spoken of by Daniel the prophet, stand in the holy place, (whoso readeth, let him understand:)

'Then let them which be in Judæa flee into the mountains:

'Let him which is on the housetop not come down to take any thing out of his house:

'Neither let him which is in the field return back to take his clothes.

'And woe unto them that are with child, and to them that give suck in those days!

'But pray ye that your flight be not in the winter, neither on the Sabbath day:

'For then shall be great tribulation, such as was not since the beginning of the world to this time, no, nor ever shall be.

'And except those days should be shortened, there should no flesh be saved: but for the elect's sake those days shall be shortened.

'Then if any man shall say unto you, Lo, here *is* Christ, or there; believe *it* not.

'For there shall arise false Christs, and false prophets, and shall shew great signs and wonders; insomuch that, if it *were* possible, they shall deceive the very elect.

'Behold, I have told you before.

'Wherefore if they shall say unto you, Behold, He is in the desert; go not forth: behold, *He is* in the secret chamber; believe *it* not.

'For as the lightning cometh out of the east, and shineth even unto the west; so shall also the coming of the Son of man be.

'For wheresoever the carcase is, there will the eagles* be gathered together.' (Luke xvii. 37. * R.V. vultures.)

These prophecies referred to events which should take place before the destruction of Jerusalem, and they were most completely fulfilled.

We read of wars, actual or threatened, that affected the Jews, under Caligula, Claudius, and Nero (Jos., "Ant.," xx. 1, 6).[1]

At Seleucia, 50,000 Jews are said to have perished ("Ant.," xviii. 9, §§ 8, 9); others at Cæsarea, Scythopolis, Joppa, Ascalon, and Tyre ("Wars," ii. 18); and there was the memorable conflict between Jews and Greeks, at Alexandria, under Caligula, A.D. 38, of which we learn from Philo.[1]

The reign of the Emperor Claudius was marked by "continual scarcity" (Suetonius, Claud., c. 18); and in the ninth year of his reign there was a severe famine in Syria.[1]

A pestilence is recorded as sweeping off 30,000 persons at Rome (Sueton., Nero, 39; Tacitus, Ann., xvi. 13).[1]

Many earthquakes were recorded during this period.[1]

Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary" points out that from verse 29 "onwards the prophecy takes a wider range, and passes beyond the narrow limits of the destruction of Jerusalem to the final coming of the Son of man, and the one is represented as following 'immediately' on the other."[1]

Up to this point in His ministry, Jesus had only referred to the rewards and punishments which would be allotted on the Last Day, but now, continuing to

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

prophesy, He depicted to His disciples the awful suddenness of the Second Coming of the Son of man, and the necessity for being always expectant and prepared.

It may be noticed that it is only in Matthew that we find the events in the following prophecy recorded as following "*immediately*" after the destruction of Jerusalem.

Matt. xxiv. 29.

"The truest and most reverential explanation" of the use of the word "immediately," although already so many centuries have passed, is that "of that day and that hour knoweth no man," not even the Son, but the Father only, "and therefore He, as truly man, and as having, therefore, vouchsafed to accept the limitations of knowledge incident to man's nature, speaks of the two events as poets and prophets speak of the far-off future."[1]

Mark xiii. 32.

Matt. xxiv. 36.

Phil. ii. 7.

Matt. xxiv. 29-51. Mark xiii. 24-37. Luke xxi. 25-36. See Mark xiv. 62. See Luke xvii. 26-36.

14. 'Immediately after the tribulation of those days shall the sun be darkened, and the moon shall not give her light, and the stars shall fall from heaven, and the powers of the heavens shall be shaken:

'And then shall appear the sign of the Son of man in heaven: and then shall all the tribes of the earth mourn, and they shall see the Son of man coming in the clouds of heaven with power and great glory.

'And He shall send His angels with a great sound of a trumpet, and they shall gather together His elect from the four winds, from one end of heaven to the other.

'Now learn a parable of the fig-tree; When his branch is yet tender, and putteth forth leaves, ye know that summer *is* nigh:

'So likewise ye, when ye shall see all these things, know that it is near, *even* at the doors.

'Verily I say unto you, This generation shall not pass, till all these things be fulfilled.

'Heaven and earth shall pass away, but My words shall not pass away.

'But of that day and hour knoweth no *man*, no, not the angels of heaven, but My Father only.

'But as the days of Noe *were*, so shall also the coming of the Son of man be.

'For as in the days that were before the flood they were eating and drinking, marrying and giving in marriage, until the day that Noe entered into the ark,

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

'And knew not until the flood came, and took them all away; so shall also the coming of the Son of man be.

'Then shall two be in the field; the one shall be taken, and the other left.

'Two *women shall be* grinding at the mill; the one shall be taken, and the other left.

'Watch therefore: for ye know not what hour your Lord doth come.

'But know this, that if the goodman of the house had known in what watch the thief would come, he would have watched, and would not have suffered his house to be broken up.

'Therefore be ye also ready: for in such an hour as ye think not the Son of man cometh.

'Who then is a faithful and wise servant, whom his lord hath made ruler over his household, to give them meat in due season?

'Blessed *is* that servant, whom his lord when he cometh shall find so doing.

'Verily I say unto you, That he shall make him ruler over all his goods.

'But and if that evil servant shall say in his heart, My lord delayeth his coming;

'And shall begin to smite *his* fellowservants, and to eat and drink with the drunken;

'The lord of that servant shall come in a day when he looketh not for *him*, and in an hour that he is not aware of,

'And shall cut him asunder, and appoint *him* his portion with the hypocrites: there shall be weeping and gnashing of teeth.'

15. Jesus then spoke His last three Parables. The Parable of the ten virgins taught the necessity of being always prepared and watching for the Coming of the Son of man; and the Parable of the ten talents insisted on the importance of each man making the best use of the talents entrusted to him. Matt. xxv. 1-46. See Mark viii. 38, ix. 41.

In the last Parable of the sheep and the goats, Jesus summed up all His previous teaching about the final destiny of the righteous, and the persistently wicked, and unrepentant.

He said that "Then shall the King say unto them on His right hand (the sheep), Come ye blessed of My Father, inherit the kingdom prepared for you from the foundation of the world," and "the righteous" "shall go away" "into life eternal"; but "then shall He say also unto them on the left hand (the goats), Depart from Me, ye cursed, into everlasting* fire, prepared for Matt. xxv. 34. Matt. xxv. 46. Matt. xxv. 41. * R.V. eternal.

Matt. xxv. 46. * R.V. eternal

the devil and his angels," "and these shall go away into everlasting* punishment."

Throughout His ministry, Jesus had taught that *destruction* was the final doom of persistent sinners, and here, again, He taught, in the metaphor of being cast into the everlasting, or eternal, or unquenchable fire, prepared for the devil and his angels, that, as they were worthless, and unfit for the new kingdom of God, they would be utterly consumed like chaff, or tares, or withered branches, and the punishment will be eternal because recovery will no longer be possible.

16. On the night before the Crucifixion, when the high priest said, "I adjure Thee by the living God, that Thou tell us whether Thou be the Christ, the Son of God," Jesus answered:

Matt. xxvi. 64.

'Thou hast said: nevertheless I say unto you, Hereafter shall ye see the Son of man sitting on the right hand of power, and coming in the clouds of heaven.'

"He was indeed what the words they had uttered implied. More than this, He was also the Son of man of Daniel's vision, the Head of an everlasting kingdom. No words in the whole Gospel records are more decisive against the views of those who would fain see in our Lord only a great moral teacher like Socrates or Cakya Mouni. At the very crisis of His history, when denial would have saved His life, He asserts His claim to be much more than this, to be all that the most devout Christians have ever believed Him to be."[1]

Dan. vii. 13.

17. After His resurrection, Jesus said to the eleven disciples in Galilee:

Matt. xxviii. 19, 20.

'Go ye therefore, and teach all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Ghost:

'Teaching them to observe all things whatsoever I have commanded you: and, lo, I am with you alway, *even* unto the end of the world. Amen.'

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

1. In the Acts of the Apostles we read that, after the Ascension, two men stood by the Apostles "in *white apparel*," and said, "This same Jesus, which is taken up from you into heaven, shall so come in like manner as ye have seen Him go into heaven." Acts i. 10, 11. Dan. vii. 13.

2. In the temple, St. Peter spoke to the Jews of "the times of refreshing" which "shall come from the presence of the Lord" . . . "whom the heaven must receive until the times of restitution* of all things." Acts iii. 19-21. See Matt. xvii. 11. 2 Pet. iii. 13. * R.V. restoration.

3. St. Paul, on Mars' Hill, told the Athenians that God "hath appointed a day, in the which He will judge the world in righteousness." Acts xvii. 31.

4. Afterwards, St. Paul told Felix, the Roman Procurator of Judæa, that he had hope toward God, "that there shall be a resurrection of the dead, both of the just and unjust." Acts xxiv. 15.

5. St. James wrote of the coming of the Lord, and told the brethren to be patient. James v. 7-9.

6. St. Peter wrote of the resurrection and the Day of Judgment, and he said: 1 Pet. i. 3. 1 Pet. iv. 5. 1 Pet. v. 4. 2 Pet. ii. 9.

'But the day of the Lord will come as a thief in the night; in the which the heavens shall pass away with a great noise, and the elements shall melt with fervent heat, the earth also and the works that are therein shall be burned up.' 2 Pet. iii. 10.

7. St. John, in his Epistles, wrote of the Second Coming of Jesus and the Day of Judgment, and he explained that— 1 John ii. 28. 1 John iv. 17.

'Now are we the sons of God, and it doth not yet appear what we shall be: but we know that, when He shall appear, we shall be like Him; for we shall see Him as He is.' 1 John iii. 2.

8. In Jude we find:

'And Enoch also, the seventh from Adam, prophesied of these, saying, Behold, the Lord cometh with ten thousands of His saints,

'To execute judgment upon all, and to convince all that are ungodly among them of all their ungodly deeds which they have ungodly committed, and of all their hard *speeches* which ungodly sinners have spoken against Him.' Jude 14, 15.

In most of his Epistles, St. Paul made some reference to the Day of Judgment.

Rom. ii. 5, 16. **9.** He warned the Romans against treasuring up wrath unto themselves "against the day of wrath and revelation of the righteous judgment of God"; and he wrote of "the day when God shall judge the secrets of men by Jesus Christ."

10. Again, he said:

Rom. viii. 19. * R.V. creation. 'The earnest expectation of the creature* waiteth for the manifestation of the sons of God.'

1 Cor. xv. 1-58. 2 Cor. iv. 14. **11.** He wrote very fully to the Corinthians about the resurrection, and he explained that it was not the earthly body which is put into the grave which will be quickened.

12. He also assured them that—

2 Cor. v. 10. 'We must all appear before the judgment seat of Christ; that every one may receive the things *done* in *his* body, according to that he hath done, whether *it be* good or bad.'

13. He explained to the Philippians that the Lord Jesus Christ—

Phil. iii. 20, 21. 'Shall change our vile body, that it may be fashioned like unto His glorious body, according to the working whereby He is able even to subdue all things unto Himself.'

14. He repeated this, in other words, to the Colossians:

Col. iii. 4. 'When Christ, *who is* our life, shall appear, then shall ye also appear with Him in glory.'

15. He told the Thessalonians—

1 Thess. v. 2, 3. 'That the day of the Lord so cometh as a thief in the night.

'For when they shall say, Peace and safety; then sudden destruction cometh upon them, as travail upon a woman with child; and they shall not escape.'

16. And he depicted to them the terrors and, at the same time, the glory of that day—

2 Thess. i. 7-10. 'When the Lord Jesus shall be revealed from heaven with His mighty angels,

'In flaming fire taking vengeance on them that know not God, and that obey not the gospel of our Lord Jesus Christ:
'Who shall be punished with everlasting destruction from the presence of the Lord, and from the glory of His power;
'When He shall come to be glorified in His saints, and to be admired in all them that believe (because our testimony among you was believed) in that day.'

17. In writing to Timothy, he twice referred to "that day." 2 Tim. i. 12. 2 Tim. iv. 8.

18. And he announced to the Hebrews that "unto them that look for Him" Christ shall "appear the second time without sin unto salvation." Heb. ix. 28.

The following passages in the Revelation of St. John the Divine, which depict in terrible language the woes of the Last Great Day, are not quoted at length because it is admitted that the book is figurative and symbolical, and no key has yet been found to enable us to interpret it in a satisfactory way:

Revelation	i. 3.
,,	iii. 10, 11.
,,	vi. 12-17.
,,	xi. 18, 19.
,,	xiv. 8-11.
,,	xiv. 14-20.
,,	xvi. 1-21.
,,	xvii. 1-18.
,,	xviii. 1-24.
,,	xix. 17-21.
,,	xx. 1-15.
,,	xxi. 8.

The Gospels do not contain any such distinct teaching about a first resurrection as is contained in the Revelation, but, as I have already pointed out,[1] Dean Plumptre wrote that the terms of the two Parables of the Marriage of the King's Son, and the Ten Virgins, would be satisfied by exclusion from the joy and triumph symbolized by the first resurrection. Rev. xx. 5.

St. Paul, however, taught the Thessalonians that

[1] See pp. 41 and 43.

1 Thess. iv. 13-18.

the faithful, who had died, would not lose any of the glories of the coming kingdom of God on earth by precedence being given to those who were still alive.

St. Paul's words were :

1 Thess. iv. 16, 17.

'For the Lord Himself shall descend from heaven with a shout, with the voice of the archangel, and with the trump of God : and the dead in Christ shall rise first :

'Then we which are alive *and* remain shall be caught up together with them in the clouds, to meet the Lord in the air : and so shall we ever be with the Lord.'

If the Apocalypse is read with the above, it would seem to point to a millennial reign, which is to last for a "thousand years."

Rev. xx. 4-6.

'And I saw thrones, and they sat upon them, and judgment was given unto them : and *I saw* the souls of them that were beheaded for the witness of Jesus, and for the word of God, and which had not worshipped the beast, neither his image, neither had received *his* mark upon their foreheads, or in their hands ; and they lived and reigned with Christ a thousand years.

'But the rest of the dead lived not again until the thousand years were finished. This *is* the first resurrection.

'Blessed and holy *is* he that hath part in the first resurrection : on such the second death hath no power, but they shall be priests of God and of Christ, and shall reign with Him a thousand years.'

See Luke xiv. 14, xx. 35; John v. 29; Phil. iii. 11; 1 Cor. xv. 23.

It appears probable that the rest of mankind on earth, who are not fit to be caught up to meet the Lord, will, at this time, die the "first death" ; and they will be kept in Hades during this "thousand years," and will be given the opportunity of becoming purified, which they would not have had, if the Final Judgment had been held immediately after the Second Coming of Jesus.

At the end of the "thousand years," the Final Judgment will take place, and the faithful will then be admitted into Heaven, and those sinners who are still unrepentant will die the "second death," which

2 Thess. i. 9.

St. Paul explains as meaning "everlasting destruction from the presence of the Lord, and from the glory of His power."

The lake of fire, Gehenna, and all the other numerous terms, by which the final punishment of sinners is expressed, refer to this "everlasting destruction" written of by St. Paul; and, as we are taught nothing to the contrary, we may rightly understand "destruction" to mean what it means in ordinary use.

I therefore hold positively that the word "destruction" does *not* mean, as many divines have taught, being kept alive for ever in never-ceasing torments in material flames, but it is synonymous with extinction, annihilation, and extermination.

CHAPTER X

I.—HEAVEN.
II.—GOD THE FATHER.

CHAPTER X

I.—Heaven.

A general view of heaven. Rev. S. D. F. Salmond, D.D., 1899.

"The Scriptures give us a large general view of heaven as the final home of God's servants; of its rewards as having degrees corresponding to the character and the service; of its blessedness as found in freedom from all sin, pain, sorrow; in the manifestation of the eternal love and glory; in the realization of hope; the possession of all good; the presence of Christ; the immediate vision and fellowship of God. It leaves much to the sanctified imagination, and makes its final teaching this: 'Eye hath not seen, nor ear heard, neither have entered into the heart of man, the things which God hath prepared for them that love Him.'"[1]

1 Cor. ii. 9.

A symbolical view. Rev. H. H. Dobney, 1844.

"Heaven is set forth as a paradise, a pleasure garden, where are found trees of delicious fruitage, and springs and streams of water as clear as crystal (an idea peculiarly grateful to the Easterns among whom the word originated). It is a city with splendid walls and gates and streets, where gold and pearls and precious stones abound, giving to all on which the eye can rest a most magnificent aspect. It is a banquet, the most costly that can be conceived, at which we are to sit down on terms of happy friendship with the noblest guests. A palace, and the inhabitants are princes, arrayed in sumptuous robes, and wearing crowns of glory.

"It is in this way heaven is presented to us; but none

[1] "A Dictionary of the Bible," by Rev. James Hastings, D.D., vol. ii., 1899, p. 324. An article by the late Principal Rev. S. D. F. Salmond, D.D. (T. and T. Clark, Edinburgh.)

of us expect that all this will be literally fulfilled: yet thus is the imagination stimulated to conceive of whatever may be glorious, and heaven will immeasurably exceed all we have ever imagined. 'Then shall we be satisfied.' There is no danger of our colouring too highly the glories of the heavenly world."[1]

Summary of the Bible teaching.

I do not propose to attempt to write an imaginary description of heaven, about which very little is told us, but I shall adhere to the exact words of Scripture.

1 Cor. xv. 50.

St. Paul wrote that "flesh and blood cannot inherit the kingdom of God," and we read, "there shall in no

Rev. xxi. 27.

wise enter into it anything that defileth, neither whatsoever worketh abomination, or maketh a lie."

As regards the Appearance of the Faithful.

1 John iii. 2.

1. "We shall be like Him; for we shall see Him as He is."

1 Cor. xv. 40, 44.

2. They will have "a spiritual body," or "a celestial body."

2 Cor. iii. 18.

3. They "are changed into the same image—the glory of the Lord—from glory to glory."

Phil. iii. 21.

4. Their vile bodies shall be changed that they "may be fashioned like unto His glorious body."

5. If any raiment is worn, it would seem from the many passages of Scripture which I have quoted that

Rev. iii. 5.

it will consist of "white robes," but perhaps the words are symbolical.

Life in Heaven.

Zech. viii. 5. Matt. xviii. 10, xix. 14. Mark x. 14. Luke xviii. 16.

1. I think it is certain that one feature of the life will be the number of children.

Matt. xxii. 30. Mark xii. 25. Luke xx. 35.

2. The Spirits in Heaven "neither marry, nor are given in marriage, but are as the angels of God."

[1] "Lectures on Future Punishment," by Rev. H. H. Dobney, 1844, p. 82. (T. Ward and Co.)

3. I shall lay no stress on the passages in the Apocalypse which speak of singing and harping, as the words are probably symbolical, and we have no key to enable us to translate them.

The Glory of Heaven.

1. Jesus Himself said :

'In My Father's house are many mansions.' — John xiv. 2.

2. St. Paul wrote :

'I reckon that the sufferings of this present time are not worthy to be compared with the glory which shall be revealed in us.' — Rom. viii. 18

3. And St. Paul, again, said :

'Eye hath not seen, nor ear heard, neither have entered into the heart of man, the things which God hath prepared for them that love Him.' — 1 Cor. ii. 9. Isa. lxiv. 4.

Peace of Heaven.

1. 'They may rest from their labours. — Rev. xiv. 13.
2. 'They shall hunger no more, neither thirst any more; neither shall the sun light on them, nor any heat.' — Rev. vii. 16.
3. 'And God shall wipe away all tears from their eyes; and there shall be no more death, neither sorrow, nor crying, neither shall there be any more pain: for the former things are passed away.' — Rev. xxi. 4.
4. 'And there shall be no more curse.' — Rev. xxii. 3.

Other references to Heaven are found both in the Old and New Testaments. — Gal. 2.

1. 'Thou wilt show me the path of life: in Thy presence is fulness of joy; at Thy right hand there are pleasures for evermore.' — Ps. xvi. 11.
2. 'For as the heaven is high above the earth, so great is His mercy toward them that fear Him.' — Ps. ciii. 11.
3. 'Thine eyes shall see the King in His beauty: they shall behold the land that is very far off.' — Isa. xxxiii. 17.

New Testament.

1. 'Blessed *are* the pure in heart: for they shall see God. — Matt. v. 8-12.
'Blessed *are* the peacemakers: for they shall be called the children of God.
'Blessed *are* they which are persecuted for righteousness' sake: for theirs is the kingdom of heaven.
'Blessed are ye, when *men* shall revile you, and persecute *you*, and shall say all manner of evil against you falsely, for My sake.

'Rejoice, and be exceeding glad: for great *is* your reward in heaven: for so persecuted they the prophets which were before you.'

Matt. xiii. 43. 2. 'Then shall the righteous shine forth as the sun in the kingdom of their Father. Who hath ears to hear, let him hear.'

Matt. xvii. 2. Mark ix. 3. Luke ix. 29. 3. 'And was transfigured before them: and His face did shine as the sun, and His raiment was *white as the light*.'

Matt. xxviii. 2, 3. Mark xvi. 5. Luke xxiv. 4. John xx. 12. 4. 'And, behold, there was a great earthquake: for the angel of the Lord descended from heaven, and came and rolled back the stone from the door, and sat upon it.

'His countenance was like lightning, and his raiment *white as snow*.'

Luke xv. 3-10. See Matt. xviii. 12-14. 5. 'And He spake this parable unto them, saying,

'What man of you, having an hundred sheep, if he lose one of them, doth not leave the ninety and nine in the wilderness, and go after that which is lost, until he find it?

'And when he hath found *it*, he layeth *it* on his shoulders, rejoicing.

'And when he cometh home, he calleth together *his* friends and neighbours, saying unto them, Rejoice with me; for I have found my sheep which was lost.

'I say unto you, that likewise *joy shall be in heaven over one sinner that repenteth*, more than over ninety and nine just persons, which need no repentance.

'Either what woman having ten pieces of silver, if she lose one piece, doth not light a candle, and sweep the house and seek diligently till she find *it*?

'And when she hath found *it*, she calleth *her* friends and *her* neighbours together, saying, Rejoice with me; for I have found the piece which I had lost.

'Likewise, I say unto you, *there is joy in the presence of the angels of God over one sinner that repenteth*.'

Luke xxiv. 36-40. 6. 'And as they thus spake, Jesus Himself stood in the midst of them, and saith unto them, Peace *be* unto you.

'But they were terrified and affrighted, and supposed that they had seen a spirit.

'And He said unto them, Why are ye troubled? and why do thoughts arise in your hearts?

'Behold My hands and My feet, that it is I Myself: handle Me, and see; *for a spirit hath not flesh and bones, as ye see Me have*.

'And when He had thus spoken, He shewed them *His* hands and *His* feet.'

John iii. 13. 7. 'And *no man hath ascended up to heaven*, but He that came down from heaven, *even* the Son of man which is in heaven.'

Acts i. 9, 10. 8. 'And when He had spoken these things, while they beheld, He was taken up; and a cloud received Him out of their sight.

'And while they looked stedfastly toward heaven as He went up, behold, two men stood by them in *white apparel*.'

St. Peter wrote:

1 Pet. i. 3, 4. 9. 'Blessed *be* the God and Father of our Lord Jesus Christ, which according to His abundant mercy hath begotten us again unto a lively hope by the resurrection of Jesus Christ from the dead,

'To an inheritance incorruptible, and undefiled, and that fadeth not away, reserved in heaven for you.'

10. 'Nevertheless we, according to His promise, look for new heavens and a new earth, wherein dwelleth righteousness. 2 Pet. iii. 13, 14.

'Wherefore, beloved, seeing that ye look for such things, be diligent that ye may be found of Him in peace, without spot, and blameless.'

St. Paul wrote much more fully:

11. 'For now we see through a glass, darkly; but then face to face: now I know in part; but then shall I know even as also I am known.' 1 Cor. xiii. 12.

12. 'For we know that if our earthly house of *this* tabernacle were dissolved, we have a building of God, an house not made with hands, eternal in the heavens.' 2 Cor. v. 1.

13. 'Wherefore God also hath highly exalted Him, and given Him a name which is above every name: Phil. ii. 9, 10.

'That at the name of Jesus every knee should bow, of *things* in heaven, and *things* in earth, and *things* under the earth.'

14. 'Giving thanks unto the Father, which hath made us meet to be partakers of the inheritance of the saints in light.' Col. i. 12.

15. 'That thou keep *this* commandment without spot, unrebukeable, until the appearing of our Lord Jesus Christ: 1 Tim. vi. 14-16.

'Which in His times He shall shew, *Who is* the blessed and only Potentate, the King of kings, and Lord of lords;

'Who only hath immortality, dwelling in the light which no man can approach unto; whom no man hath seen, nor can see: to whom *be* honour and power everlasting. Amen.'

16. St. Paul also clearly taught that it was not the body which is placed in the grave which would rise. 1 Cor. xv. 35-58.

The following passages in the Revelation of St. John which refer to Heaven are not quoted at length because no key has yet been found to the symbolical language in which it is written:

Revelation iii. 5.
,, iii. 12.
,, v. 8-14.
,, vii. 9-17.
,, x. 6, 7.
,, xiv. 1-7, 12, 13.
,, xv. 1-8.
,, xix. 1-16.
,, xx. 11-13.
,, xxi. 1-7, and
,, xxi. 9-27.
,, xxii. 1-21.

II.—God the Father.

Matt. v. 45. John xx. 17. — 1. He is the true Father of His people.
Matt. v. 48. — 2. He is perfect.
Matt. vi. 4, 6, 18. — 3. He seeth in secret, but rewards openly.
Matt. vi. 8, 32. Luke xii. 30. — 4. He knoweth what things we have need of before we ask Him.
Matt. vi. 14, 15, xviii. 35. Mark xi. 26. — 5. He forgiveth men their trespasses.
Matt. vi. 26. — 6. He feedeth even the fowls of the air,
Matt. vi. 28-30. — 7. and clothes the grass of the field.
Matt. vii. 11. — 8. He gives good things to them that ask Him.
Matt. x. 29. — 9. He watches over even the sparrows.
Matt. xviii. 10, 14. — 10. It is not His will that one little one should *perish*.
Matt. xviii. 19. — 11. If two shall agree on earth touching anything that they shall ask, He will do it.
Matt. xxiv. 36. Mark xiii. 32. — 12. He, only, knows of the day and hour of the Final Judgment.
Luke vi. 35, 36. — 13. He is kind unto the unthankful and to the evil, and He is merciful.
Luke xi. 13. — 14. He will give the Holy Spirit to them that ask Him.
John iv. 23. — 15. He seeketh the true worshippers to worship Him.
John v. 21. — 16. He raiseth up the dead, and quickeneth them.
John v. 26. — 17. He hath life in Himself.
John v. 30, 36, 37, vi. 27, 38, 39, 44, 57, vii. 28, 29, viii. 16, 18, 29, 42, x. 36-38, xii. 49, 50, xvi. 28, xvii. 3, 23, xx. 21. — 18. He hath borne witness of Jesus, whom He sent.
John vi. 32. — 19. He giveth the true bread from heaven.
John vi. 44, 65. — 20. He draws men to Jesus.
John viii. 54, x. 15, 17, xv. 9. — 21. He honoureth and loveth Jesus, whom He knows.
John xii. 26. — 22. He will honour any man who serves Jesus.
John xv. 16, xvi. 23, 24. — 23. He will give whatsoever is asked in the name of Jesus.
John xiv. 21, 23, xvi. 27. — 24. He loveth those who love Jesus.

CHAPTER XI

A REFUTATION OF THE DOCTRINE THAT SINNERS WILL LIVE FOR EVER AND EVER, AND SUFFER NEVER-ENDING TORMENTS IN WHAT IS CALLED "HELL."

CHAPTER XI

A Refutation of the Doctrine that Sinners will live for ever and ever, and suffer Never-ending Torments in what is called "Hell."

THE DOCTRINE.

I.—Teaching of Some Early Fathers.

"We know not who it was whose dark mind first conceived the doctrine that the great and good God will torment for ever any creature of His hands. . . . The writings of what are styled the Apostolical Fathers, with the narratives of the martyrdoms of Ignatius and Polycarp, were all produced, we have reason to believe, within about the first century and a half of the Christian era. In not one of them is there a passage more undeniably containing the doctrine in question than any to be found in the sacred volume. I do not, you will observe, assert that it was not held or taught by any Christian before the close of the period mentioned. I simply affirm that we have no proof to the contrary, no clear, unambiguous proof. We find the words 'eternal punishment' used thrice in these writings: once in the second (questionable) Epistle of Clement to the Corinthians, and twice in the Epistle to the Church at Smyrna, which gives an account of the martyrdom of Polycarp. In addition to this we read in two places of the 'unquenchable fire'; and in one of them the 'undying worm' is mentioned in immediate con-

Rev. T. Davis, in 1866.

nexion with the fire. In each, however, of these passages we have, it is evident, but the language of the Bible. Altogether there are five passages which some would regard as countenancing the doctrine of eternal suffering.

"The common language of the primitive Fathers teaches plainly that 'death' awaits the wicked. I do not say *eternal* death, because there is no such phrase in Scripture. We can no more speak with propriety of eternal death than of eternal birth."[1]

During the first two centuries the early Christians were exposed to terrific persecutions, and "it is not to be wondered at, if, after a while, some feelings of wrath and vindictiveness, combined with a strong sense of the wickedness they witnessed, deepened their picture of that hell, which, not much weighing *the meaning of eternity*, they honestly believed such atrocities deserved."[1]

"Passing over Justin Martyr, whose mind seems to have wavered on the subject, the first Christian author of note, whose writings are extant, that denounced unambiguously eternal torments, is the well-known African, Tertullian of Carthage."[1]

In the early part of the third century, Tertullian, the African Bishop, who had been educated as a lawyer, and was one of the most eminent of the Latin Fathers of his day, wrote as follows:

Tertullian of Carthage.

"You are fond of your spectacles. But there are other spectacles. That day which is disbelieved, derided by the nations, the last and eternal day of judgment, when all ages shall be swallowed up in one conflagration, what a variety of spectacles shall then appear! how shall I admire, how laugh, how rejoice, how exult, when I behold so many Kings and fallen Gods in heaven, together with Jove himself, groaning

[1] "Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866, pp. 71, 72. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

in the lowest abyss of darkness! So many magistrates, who persecuted the name of the Lord, liquefying in fiercer flames than they ever kindled against Christians; so many sage philosophers blushing in raging fire, with their scholars, whom they persuaded to despise God, and disbelieve the resurrection; and so many poets, shuddering before the tribunal—not of Rhadamanthos, not of Minos, but—of the disbelieved Christ. Then shall we hear the tragedians more tuneful in the expression of their own sufferings; then shall we see the dancers more sprightly amidst the flames; the charioteer all red-hot in his burning car; and the wrestlers hurled, not upon the accustomed list, but upon a plain of fire!"[1]

Cyprian.

"Cyprian, also an African, who was an ardent admirer of Tertullian, wrote: 'Gehenna, ever burning, will prey upon the damned, a devouring punishment of burning flames; torments that can have no respite or end. Their souls will be preserved with their bodies for the pain of endless tortures. Then shall he who made a brief spectacle of us be himself a spectacle for men, *and the transitory joy of cruel eyes in our persecutions shall be repaid with a perpetual vision*, according to the Holy Scripture which saith, "their worm shall not die, and their fire shall not be quenched, and they shall be a spectacle to all flesh."'"[2]

"Ep. ad Demetrianum," c. 24.

Augustine.

"Augustine said: 'Though infants departing from the world without baptism will be in the mildest damnation of all, yet he greatly deceives and is deceived who preaches that they will not be in damnation,' meaning thereby unending punishment."[3]

Rev. F. N. Oxenham, in 1881.

That "the punishment of the lost involves physical torments or corporeal sufferings was taught not only by St. Augustine, but also by St. Chrysostom, St.

[1] "De Spectaculis," c. 30.

[2] "Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866, p. 76. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

[3] "Restitution of All Things," by Rev. A. Jukes, 1869, p. 138. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

Hilary, St. Ephrem, St. Basil, Eusebius Gallicanus, and a host of others."[1]

Rev. R. H. McKim, in 1883.

"The doctrine of endless pain in hell—that every soul that leaves this world impenitent shall be cast into hell, and there, body and soul, be tormented through endless ages; on, still on, through an eternity of conscious woe—became the ruling doctrine in the Church through the influence of the great Augustine, in the fifth century. That I believe to be an unquestionable historical fact. . . . There seems to be much reason to believe that it rests upon the scriptures of Plato, and not upon the Scriptures of God. Augustine was a Platonist; Augustine was steeped in the philosophy of the great Athenian, and, accordingly, he was familiar with the teachings which Plato gave in Athens concerning this subject. . . .

"Plato supposed that, after this life, those who were incurably wicked were sent into Tartarus, with its stream of fire, where they remained for ever and ever, immortal, indestructible, and without hope of restoration.

"Then he supposed that there was an Acherusian Lake, a place of purgation for the less heinously guilty, whence they emerged after a longer or shorter period of suffering, and were received into Elysium.

"He supposed, also, that there was a third place—the Lake of Acheron, as it was termed—a less terrible place of purgation for the class of offenders next less guilty.

"Now, here was just the theory of Augustine. On the one hand, the *purgatory* which he taught, and which, from his time, became the doctrine of the Church of Rome; and, on the other hand, the territory of hell, of endless pain, of eternal life in torment.

"Now, Calvin adopted Augustine's theology as upon other points, so on this also; only he cut off

[1] "What is the Truth as to Everlasting Punishment?" by Rev. F. N. Oxenham, 1881, p. 16. (Longmans.)

Augustine's purgatory and retained Augustine's hell. Following this, the majority of Protestant theologians, from that day to the present, have walked in the same path."[1]

Joseph Milner.

" Milner testifies to the injurious effects produced by Platonism upon Christianity in the second and third centuries. The Christian fathers, as a general rule, adopted the Platonic dogma, 'every soul is immortal.' This became the motto upon the patristic banner, not among prophets and apostles, but above all prophets and apostles. A doctrine which neither the Old Testament nor New taught, directly or indirectly—nay, which was contrary to a great part of the teaching of both—these fathers brought in with them into the Church. . . . It was, in effect, Plato teaching in the Church, under the supposed authority of Christ and His Apostles.

" *This dogma of Plato was made the rigid unbending rule for the interpretation of Scripture.* In this lay its deadly effect on truth : No Scripture, no matter what its language, no matter what the natural sense of its language, could be interpreted in a sense inconsistent with Plato's theory. Under its influence words assume new, unnatural, distorted, far-fetched meanings."[2]

II.—Teaching of Some Later Preachers.

Thomas Aquinas.

In the thirteenth century Thomas Aquinas, whose authority has always been very high in the Roman Church, said : " That the bliss of the saved may please them more, and they may render more abundant

[1] " Future Punishment," by Rev. R. H. McKim, D.D., 1883, pp. 83, 84. (Thomas Whittaker, New York.)

[2] " History of the Church of Christ," Century II., chapter ix., by Joseph Milner, 1794-1809, quoted in " Is Eternal Torment Scriptural ?" by H. P. and R., 1896, p. 14. (Oakley House, Spring Grove, Isleworth.)

thanks to God for it, they are permitted to gaze on the punishment of the wicked."[1]

Peter Lombard.

Peter Lombard, to the same effect: "The elect, while they see the unspeakable sufferings of the ungodly, shall not be affected with grief, but rather satiated with joy at the sight, and give thanks to God for their own salvation."[1]

Jeremy Taylor, seventeenth century.

In the seventeenth century Jeremy Taylor, in his "Pains of Hell," wrote: "We are amazed at the inhumanity of Philaris, who roasted men in his brazen bull: this was joy in respect of that fire of hell, which penetrates the very entrails without consuming them. . . . Husbands shall see their wives, parents shall see their children, tormented before their eyes. . . . The bodies of the damned shall be crowded together in hell like grapes in a wine-press, which press one another till they burst. . . . Every distinct sense and organ shall be assailed with its own appropriate and exquisite sufferings."[2]

President Jonathan Edwards, eighteenth century, 1703-1758.

President Jonathan Edwards, in the eighteenth century, wrote: "They will not be sorry for the damned; it will cause no uneasiness or dissatisfaction to them; but, on the contrary, when they have this sight, it will excite them to joyful praises. However the saints in heaven may have loved the damned while here, especially those who were near and dear to them in this world, they will have no love to them hereafter. It will occasion rejoicing in them, as they will have the greater sense of their own happiness by seeing the contrary misery. . . . When they shall see how miserable others of their fellow-creatures are, who were naturally in the same circumstances with themselves; when they shall see the smoke of their torment, and the raging of the flames of their burning, and hear their

[1] Quoted in "Restitution of All Things," by Rev. A. Jukes, 1869, pp. 138, 139. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

[2] "Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866, p. 76. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

dolorous shrieks and cries, and consider that they, in the meantime, are in the most blissful state and they shall be in it to all eternity, how will they rejoice!"[1]

The same preacher, in a sermon on sinners in the hands of an angry God: "The God that holds you over the pit of hell, much as one holds a spider, or some loathsome insect, over the fire, abhors you, and is dreadfully provoked . . . you are a hundred thousand times more abominable in His eyes than the most hateful serpent is in ours . . . and yet it is nothing but His hand that holds you from falling into the fire every moment. . . . There is no other reason why you have not gone to hell, since you have sat here in the house of God, provoking His pure eyes by your wicked manner of attending His solemn worship. If we knew that there was one person, and but one, in the whole congregation, that was to be the subject of this misery, what an awful thing it would be to think of! If we knew what it was, what an awful sight it would be to see such a person! How might all the rest of the congregation lift up a lamentable and bitter cry over him. But alas! instead of one, how many is it likely will remember this discourse in hell."[2]

Rev. Samuel Hopkins, in 1852.

"It has been already observed and shown how well suited and necessary endless punishment is, to make a full and most glorious display of the Divine character in the view of the blessed. In this will be seen, as could not be seen so clearly and to such advantage by any other medium, or without this, the infinite greatness, power, and terrible majesty of Jehovah; and also His infinite excellence and worthiness, and His hatred and displeasure, His indignation and wrath against sin, and His infinite benevolence and goodness, to which sin

[1] "President Edwards' Sermons," vol. iv., quoted by Rev. J. H. Pettingell in "The Life Everlasting," 1882, p. 46. (J. D. Brown, Philadelphia.)

[2] "That Unknown Country; or, What Living Men Believe concerning Punishment after Death," 1889, pp. 55, 56. (Nichols and Co., Springfield, Mass., U.S.A.)

is opposed. The smoke of their torment shall ascend up in the sight of the blessed for ever and ever, and serve, as a most clear glass, always before their eyes, to give them a constant, bright, and most affecting view of all these. And all this display of the Divine character and glory will be in favour of the redeemed, and most entertaining, and give the highest pleasure to all who love God, and raise their happiness to ineffable heights, whose felicity consists summarily in the knowledge and enjoyment of God. This eternal punishment must therefore be unspeakably to their advantage, and will add such immense degrees of glory and happiness to the kingdom of God, as inconceivably to overbalance all they will suffer, who shall fall under this righteous punishment, and render it all, in this view and connexion, an infinite good."[1]

The idea that a part of the happiness of heaven will consist in witnessing the sufferings of the lost in never-ending torture is probably founded on the following passage in the Apocalypse :

Rev. xiv. 10, 11.

'The same shall drink of the wine of the wrath of God, which is poured out without mixture into the cup of his indignation ; and he shall be tormented with fire and brimstone in the presence of the holy angels, and in the preesnce of the Lamb :

'And the smoke of their torment ascendeth up for ever and ever : and they have no rest day nor night, who worship the beast and his image, and whosoever receiveth the mark of his name.'

There is certainly nothing in the Gospels or Epistles to warrant such teaching, and the Apocalypse " being beyond question a book of symbols, it is difficult to determine what are the realities to which they point ; the key by which its symbolism can be interpreted remains undiscovered to this hour."[2]

[1] " The Works of Samuel Hopkins, D.D., First Pastor of the Church in Great Barrington, Mass., U.S.A., 1852," vol. ii., p. 459. (Doctrinal Tract and Book Society, Boston.)

[2] " Future Retribution," by Rev. C. A. Row, 1889, pp. 331, 332. (William Isbister.)

Bishop Pearson, of Chester, in 1659.

"I conceive these certain and infallible doctrines in Christianity: That the wicked after this life shall be punished for their sins, so that in their punishment there shall be a demonstration of the justice of God revealed against all unrighteousness of men. That to this end they shall be raised again to life, and shall be judged and condemned by Christ, and delivered up under the curse to be tormented with the Devil and his angels. That the punishment which shall be inflicted on them shall be proportionate to their sins, as a recompense of their demerits, so that no man shall suffer more than he hath deserved. That they shall be tormented with a pain of loss, the loss from God, from whose presence they are cast out; the pain from themselves, in a despair of enjoying Him, and regret for losing Him. That they farther shall be tormented with the pain of sense inflicted on them by the wrath of God which abideth upon them, represented unto us by a lake of fire. That their persons shall continue *for ever* in this remediless condition, under an everlasting pain of loss, because there is no hope of heaven; under an *eternal* pain of sense, because there is no means to appease the wrath of God which abideth on them. Thus the Athanasian Creed: 'They that have done good shall go into life everlasting, and they that have done evil into everlasting fire.'"[1]

Mr. Benson.

"God is therefore present in hell to see the punishment of these rebels. His fiery indignation kindles, and His incensed fury feeds the flame of their torment, while His powerful presence and operation *maintain their being*, and render their powers most acutely sensible, thus setting the keenest edge upon their pain, and making it cut most intolerably deep."[2]

[1] "Bishop Pearson on the Creed," ed. 1867, p. 595, quoted in "That Unknown Country; or, What Living Men Believe concerning Punishment after Death," 1889, pp. 478, 479. (Nichols and Co., Springfield, Mass., U.S.A.)

[2] Quoted in "Here and Hereafter; or, Man in Life and Death," by Rev. U. Smith, 1897, p. 269. (*Review and Herald* Publishing Association, Washington, U.S.A.)

Matt. xxv. 46.

Rev. E. B. Pusey, D.D., in 1864.

In a sermon, preached in 1864, on the text, "And these shall go away into everlasting punishment," the Rev. E. B. Pusey said: "Apart from the central misery, the endless loss of the end of our being, of Him who is still our God; apart from all those terrific physical miseries, of which our Lord speaks, the inextinguishable fire, the never-dying worm of each,—the society of the damned were misery unutterable. Conceive this alone, to which St. Paul says human nature of itself went, hatred of God, intrinsic hatefulness, hatred of one another. Gather in one in your mind an assembly of all those men or women, from whom, whether in history or in fiction, your memory most shrinks (no fiction can reach the reality of human sin); gather in mind all which is most loathsome, most revolting, the most treacherous, malicious, coarse, brutal, inventive, fiendish cruelty, unsoftened by any remains of human feeling; such as thou couldst not endure for a single hour; conceive the fierce fiery eyes of hate, spite, frensied rage, ever fixed on thee, glaring on thee, looking thee through and through with hate; sleepless in their horrible gaze; felt, if not seen; never turning from thee, never to be turned from, except to quail under the like piercing sight of hate; hear those yells of blaspheming, concentrated hate, as they echo along the lurid vault of hell; every one hating every one, and venting that hate unceasingly with every inconceivable expression of malignity; conceive all this, multiplied, intensified, reflected all around, on every side; and, amid it, the especial hatred of anyone, whose sins thou sharedst, whom thou didst thoughtlessly encourage in sin, or teach some sin before unknown—a deathlessness of hate were in itself everlasting misery. Yet a fixedness in that state, in which the hardened, malignant, sinner dies, involves, without any further retribution of God, this endless misery."[1]

[1] Pp. 15, 16. (J. H. and James Parker, Oxford.)

I might quote many other preachers to the same effect, but, in proof that these theories are widespread as the genuine teachings of the Christian revelation, I will only refer to two sermons by Mr. Spurgeon,[1] who was in the habit of addressing the largest congregation in London, which give a description of what he calls "Hell," and which are as awful as anything written by the African Bishop Tertullian. Mr. Spurgeon.

"Only conceive that poor wretch in the flames who is saying, 'O for one drop of water to cool my parched tongue!' See how his tongue hangs from his blistering lips, how it excoriates and burns the lips of his mouth as it were a firebrand! Behold him crying for a drop of water! I will not picture the scene. Suffice it for me to close up by saying that the hell of hells will be to thee, poor sinner, the thought that it is to be to thee for ever. Thou wilt look up there on the throne of God, and on it shall be written, 'For ever.' When the damned jingle the burning irons of their torments they shall say, 'For ever.' When they howl, echo cries, 'For ever,'" etc.[2]

In a later sermon Mr. Spurgeon said:

"We are sometimes accused, my brethren, of using language too harsh, too ghastly, too alarming, with respect to the world to come; but we will not soon change our note; for we solemnly believe that if we could speak thunderbolts, and in every look were a lightning flash; if our eyes dripped blood instead of tears, no tones, words, gestures, or similitudes of dread, could exaggerate the awful condition of a soul which has refused the Gospel, and is delivered over to justice."[3]

"On the whole, I cannot conceive anything more conclusive in support of my position that eternal sufferings for the wicked is the doctrine of Scripture, Rev. F. J. B. Hooper, in 1877.

[1] "Future Retribution," by the Rev. C. A. Row, 1889, pp. 16, 17. (William Isbister.)
[2] *Ibid.*, p. 16. [3] *Ibid.*, p. 17.

than the absence of any contradiction by our Lord, or by that Pharisee of the Pharisees, Paul; but, on the contrary, an implied assumption of its truth in all their statements that bear upon it."[1]

Bishop J. C. Ryle, in 1883.

Dan. xii. 2. Matt. xxv. 46.

"These two texts alone seem to me conclusive and unanswerable. In each case the Hebrew and Greek words describing the two states are precisely the same. . . . If one is to come to an end, so also is the other; if the 'life' is endless, so also is the shame and the punishment. To my eyes both appear equally interminable, everlasting, and eternal. . . ."[2]

"I say, then, unhesitatingly that the alleged distinction between the duration of the future blessedness of the godly and the future misery of the ungodly is a distinction which cannot be proved from the Bible. You cannot teach the distinction without striking a deadly blow at the prospects of the believer beyond the grave."[3]

Bishop Pearson.

Bishop Pearson wrote that "the condition of the lost is unalterable, their condemnation is irreversible, their torments inevitable, their miseries eternal. As they shall not be taken from their punishment by annihilation of themselves, so the punishment shall not be taken off them by any compassion."[4]

Bishop of Toronto.

The Bishop of Toronto has recently published the authoritative declaration that "every child of humanity, except the Virgin Mary, is from the first moment of conception a child of wrath, hated by the blessed Trinity, belonging to Satan, and doomed to hell."[5]

Rev. J. Furniss.

The Rev. J. Furniss, C.S.S.R., in a tract for children and young persons, called "The Sight of Hell,"

[1] "Endless Sufferings the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. F. J. B. Hooper, 1877, p. 31. (Elliot Stock.)

[2] "Thoughts on Immortality," by Bishop J. C. Ryle, D.D., 1883, pp. 75, 76. (C. J. Thynne.)

[3] *Ibid.*, p. 74.

[4] *Ibid.*, p. 78.

[5] Quoted in "That Unknown Country; or, What Living Men Believe concerning Punishment after Death," 1889, p. 228. (Nichols and Co., Springfield, Mass.)

published, *permissu superiorum*, by Duffy (Dublin and London), gives "a detailed description of the dungeons of hell," and a few sentences may serve as a sample: "See! on the middle of that red-hot floor stands a girl; she looks about sixteen years old. Her feet are bare. She has neither shoes nor stockings. . . . Listen! she speaks. She says, 'I have been standing on this red-hot floor for years. Day and night my only standing-place has been this red-hot floor. . . . Look at my burnt and bleeding feet. Let me get off this burning floor for one moment only—only for one single short moment.' . . . The fourth dungeon is the boiling kettle. . . . In the middle of it there is a boy. . . . His eyes are burning like two burning coals. Two long flames come out of his ears. Sometimes he opens his mouth, and blazing fire rolls out. But listen! there is a sound like a kettle boiling. . . . The blood is boiling in the scalded veins of that boy. The brain is boiling and bubbling in his head. The marrow is boiling in his bones. . . . The fifth dungeon is the red-hot oven. The little child is in this red-hot oven. Hear how it screams to come out. See how it turns and twists itself about in the fire. It beats its head against the roof of the oven. It stamps its little feet on the floor. . . . God was very good to this child. Very likely God saw it would get worse and worse, and would never repent, and so it would have to be punished much more in hell. So God in His mercy called it out of the world in its early childhood."[1]

III.—Teaching of the Church in Rome.

Even in the first century of our era "the perverse Jewish custom of obscuring the plain language of

[1] Lecky's "History of European Morals," 1869, vol. ii., p. 237, quoted in "That Unknown Country, or What Living Men Believe concerning Punishment after Death," 1889, pp. 228, 229. (Nichols and Co., Springfield, Mass.)

Scripture by forced and frigid allegories, and of diverting words from their natural and proper meaning, in order to extort from them some recondite sense, found some admirers and imitators among Christians. Besides others, Barnabas, whose epistle is still extant, is proof of this."[1]

In the second century, the expositors of Scripture—and especially "Clement—attempted to make the Divine oracles teach and support the precepts of philosophy."[2]

In other words, many of the early Christians were followers of Plato, and believed in the natural immortality of the soul, before they were converted, and they insisted on retaining this doctrine when they joined the Church.

Before A.D. 225. Tertullian is believed to be the author of the teaching that sinners will be kept alive for ever and ever, and will suffer never-ending torments in flames of material fire, and his treatise "De Spectaculis" has already been referred to.

Tertullian had accepted the Platonic dogma that the soul of man is absolutely immortal and indestructible, and the idea that the punishment of sinners will be never-ending follows naturally on this, as his savage mind could not entertain the possibility of any forgiveness.

After A.D. 246. Cyprian, who was also an African, continued the teaching of his master Tertullian that sinners would live after death for ever and ever, and would suffer never-ending punishment. He, like his master, refused to believe in the possibility of forgiveness.

Before A.D. 254. It may be noticed that Origen quoted the philosophy of Plato as proving that the soul was immortal, and therefore the worst sinners would at last be saved.

A.D. 553. In the sixth century was held the fifth Ecumenical

[1] "Mosheim's Institutes of Ecclesiastical History," by James Murdock, D.D., revised by James Seaton Reid, D.D.. twelfth edition, 1848, p. 39. (Ward, Lock and Co,)

[2] *Ibid.*, p. 67.

Council, when Origen was anathematized, and the Emperor Justinian's definite ruling in support of the doctrine of never-ending punishment, "being sanctioned by the requisite authority, had the effect of shaping the creed of the Catholic Church from that day to this "[1] (see Walch, "Hist. der Ketzer.," vol. viii. pp. 3-468, but especially p. 437).

The Anathematisms of the Emperor Justinian against Origen.

A.D. 553.

"IX. If anyone says or thinks that the punishment of demons and of impious men is only temporary, and will one day have an end, and that a restoration (ἀποκατάστασις) will take place of demons and of impious men, let him be anathema."

"X. Anathema to Origen and to that Adamantius who set forth these opinions together with his nefarious and execrable and wicked doctrine, and to whomsoever there is who thinks thus, or defends these opinions, or in any way hereafter at any time shall presume to protect them."[2]

"THE FIFTH ECUMENICAL COUNCIL.

THE SECOND COUNCIL OF CONSTANTINOPLE.

EMPEROR—JUSTINIAN I. POPE—VIGILIUS.

"Capitula XI. If anyone does not anathematize Arius . . . and *Origen*, as well as their impious writings, as also all other heretics . . . let him be anathema."[3]

In the next six centuries the principal teaching was that "God could easily be appeased and become reconciled to sinners by the intercessions and prayers of the

A.D. 601 to 1201.

[1] "Mosheim's Institutes of Ecclesiastical History," by James Murdock, D.D., revised by James Seaton Reid, D.D., twelfth edition, 1848, p. 233. (Ward, Lock and Co.)

[2] "Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church," vol. xiv.: "The Seven Ecumenical Councils of the Undivided Church," by Rev. H. R. Percival, D.D., M.A., 1900, p. 320. (John Parker, Oxford.)

[3] *Ibid.*, 314.

saints, and by the friendly offices of the priests, the ministers of God" ;[1] "that the gates of heaven would be closed against none who should enrich the clergy or the Church with their donations" ;[2] and that "Pope, Cardinal, Priest, has the power of irrevocably predeclaring the doom of his fellow-men."[3]

A.D. 847. In the ninth century, Godeschalcus, a Saxon of noble birth, "entered into discussion respecting predestination, maintaining that God had from eternity predestinated some to everlasting life, and others to the punishment of hell."[4]

A.D. 1513-1521. The doctrine of Rome is set forth in the Decree of the Lateran Council under Pope Leo X.

"Whereas some have dared to assert concerning the reasonable soul that it is *mortal ;* we, with the approbation of the Sacred Council, do condemn and reprobate all who assert that the intellectual soul is mortal, seeing that the soul is not only truly, and of itself and essentially, the form of the human body, as it is expressed in the canon of Pope Clement V., but likewise immortal ; and we strictly prohibit all from dogmatizing otherwise ; and we declare that all who adhere to the like erroneous assertion *shall be shunned and punished as heretics.*"[5]

This Decree clearly teaches that, as the soul is immortal, the punishment of persistent sinners will continue for ever and ever.

It was declared that when death comes the final doom of every one is fixed, and there is no more possibility of changing it.

[1] "Mosheim's Institutes of Ecclesiastical History," by James Murdock, D.D., revised by James Seaton Reid, D.D., twelfth edition, 1848, p. 278. (Ward, Lock and Co.)

[2] *Ibid.*, p. 250.

[3] "History of Latin Christianity," by Dean Henry Hart Milman, D.D., 1855, vol. vi., p. 631. (John Murray.)

[4] "Mosheim's Institutes of Ecclesiastical History," by James Murdock, D.D., revised by James Seaton Reid, D.D., twelfth edition, 1848, p. 313. (Ward, Lock and Co.)

[5] Quoted in "The Unspeakable Gift," by Rev. J. H. Pettingell, 1898, pp. 46, 47. (Digby Long and Co.)

If a man dies with the guilt of mortal sin unremitted, his soul is *at once* thrown into the "everlasting fire prepared for the devil and his angels."[1]

In England.

1. Until the second Schism, in the sixteenth century, when the English and other Western Churches shook off the yoke of Rome, England had been under the domination of Rome in all matters of religion, and all the Church services were conducted in Latin.

2. In the ten Articles of Religion, published by the Royal Authority of King Henry VIII., the Romish teaching about everlasting punishment was continued. A.D. 1536.

The second Item to the First Article was:

"That they ought and must believe, repute, and take all the articles of our faith contained in the said creeds (the creeds of the Apostles, of Nice, and of Athanasius) to be so necessary to be believed for man's salvation, that whosoever being taught will not believe them as is aforesaid, or will obstinately affirm the contrary of them, he or they cannot be the very members of Christ and His espouse the Church, but be very infidels or heretics, and members of the Devil, with whom they shall *perpetually be damned*."[2]

"One sees here the dawn of the Reformation; the Scriptures and the ancient creeds are made the standards of faith, without the tradition of the church or decrees of the Pope; the doctrine of justification by faith is well stated; four of the seven sacraments are passed over, and *purgatory is left doubtful*. But transubstantiation, auricular confession, the worshipping of images and saints are still retained."[3]

3. In this same year, however, the first step was

[1] "Catholic Belief," by the Very Rev. J. Faà di Bruno, D.D., 1884, pp. 60 and 65. (Burns and Oates, Limited.)

[2] "A History of the Articles of Religion," by Archdeacon Charles Hardwick, B.D., 1884, p. 242. (George Bell and Sons.)

[3] "History of the Puritans," by Neal, 1811, p. 17.

taken towards breaking down the tyranny of the Latin language, and a Royal Licence was issued permitting persons of every class to read the Bible in English, and every minister of a parish was directed to place an English Bible in his church, and to exhort the people to read it.[1]

A.D. 1380. 4. This Bible, now only brought into general use, was published by John Wycliffe, and he has been rightly called the forerunner of the Protestant Reformers, because he struck the first severe blow not only to the Romish doctrine of Purgatory, but also to the original teaching of Jesus about Hades.

In the New Testament the word "Hades" occurs ten times and "Gehenna" twelve times, but John Wycliffe translated both words, and also the word "Tartarus," which only occurs once, by the one word "Helle," and so made it possible to teach that Scripture acknowledges the existence of only the two places, Heaven and Helle.

I think there can be no doubt that John Wycliffe's misuse of the word "Helle" has been the cause of all the misconceptions about the Life after Death from the sixteenth century, when the word came into general use, down to the present day.

If the original words had been retained in the English translation, it would have been impossible to confuse "Hades," where Jesus preached to the spirits in prison, with "Gehenna," where He told the twelve disciples, before sending them on their mission, that God is able to *destroy* both soul and body.

Jesus here metaphorically likened the *destruction* of unrepentant sinners on the Last Day to being cast into the loathsome Valley of Hinnom, and everyone who heard Him must have understood that He was expressly condemning the Platonic dogma that the soul is indestructible.

[1] "The Reformation," by Rev. H. Stebbing, vol. ii., p. 246, 1836.

On the eleven other occasions on which Jesus mentioned "Gehenna," He was not referring to the punishment at the time of death, but to the sentence passed by the Jewish High Court—the Sanhedrin—that the criminal should be stoned to death, and his body afterwards cast into the Valley of Hinnom.

Notwithstanding the clearness of the above teaching, the word "Hell" has been understood as including the lake of fire burning with brimstone of the Apocalypse, to which no key has yet been found, and also the unquenchable fire and the undying worm of the ninth chapter of Mark, which did not in any way refer to the Life after Death.

It was not until the last revision of the text of the Bible, in 1880, that this mistake was partly rectified, and in the ten passages in which the word occurs in the original, "Hades" has been retained in the English translation; the revisers, however, refused to accept the proposal of the American delegates to retain the word "Gehenna" in the twelve passages in which it occurs in the original, and it is still translated "Hell," as in the Authorized Version.

John Wycliffe's translation from the Greek of the numerous words which denote the entire destruction of the soul, or life, of unrepentant sinners, is quite correct; but, to the words themselves, as used in Scripture, both in Greek and English, divines have attached a false meaning almost from the beginning of our era.

The argument, put crudely, is that, because the philosophy of Plato laid down that the soul of man is by nature immortal, the terms used in Scripture which, in ordinary writing or conversation, denote entire destruction, must mean being kept alive for ever and ever.

No one of the present day will admit that he is bound by the philosophy of Plato, but, as it is certain that the belief in the natural immortality of the soul

is held to this day, it is clear that, whether founded on his philosophy or not, Plato's dictum is still victorious.

A.D. 1537. The Institution of a Christian Man.

5. In the following year, a second Formulary of Faith appeared, entitled the "Institution of a Christian Man"; this was known as the *Bishop's Book*, because it was destitute of the royal authority.

The first part contained "the Exposition of the Creed, called the Apostles' Creed," and extracts are given from it.[1]

Article II. of the Apostles' Creed.—"After this transitory life I shall ascend into heaven, there to reign with my Saviour Christ perpetually in glory and felicity."[2]

Article V.—"I believe . . . that this our Saviour Jesu Christ, after he was thus dead upon the cross, he descended immediately in his soul down into hell. . . . First he conquered and oppressed both the Devil and hell, and also death itself . . . and afterward he spoiled hell, and delivered and brought with him from thence all the souls of those righteous and good men, which from the fall of Adam died in the favour of God, and in the faith and belief of this our Saviour Jesu Christ, which was then to come."[3]

Article VII.—"I believe . . . at the last end of the world . . . our Saviour Jesu Christ . . . shall set all the other, which shall be judged to *everlasting pain and death*, upon his left hand, and so shall send them down into *hell, there to be punished in body and soul eternally with fire that never shall have end, which was prepared from the beginning of the world for the Devil and his angels, and the cursed members of his body.*"[4]

Articles XI. and XII.—"I believe . . . Almighty God shall by the operation of his Holy Spirit, stir and raise up again the very flesh and bodies of all men, women, and children, both good and bad, christened and

[1] "A History of the Articles of Religion," by Archdeacon Charles Hardwick, B.D., 1884, p. 50. (George Bell and Sons.)
[2] "Formularies of Faith put forth by Authority during the Reign of Henry VIII.," 1825, p. 35. (Clarendon Press, Oxford.) [3] *Ibid.*, p. 41. [4] *Ibid.*, pp. 46-48.

heathen, that ever lived in this world, from the beginning of the same, and died before that day.[1]

A.D. 1543. The Necessary Doctrine and Erudition for any Christian man.

6. The "Necessary Doctrine and Erudition for any Christian Man," or the *King's Book*, supplanted the Ten Articles of 1536. This Book was divided into ten parts, and the second part was the Articles of our Belief, called the Creed.[2]

The fifth, seventh, eleventh, and twelfth Articles of the *Bishop's Book* were practically copied for the *King's Book*.[3]

(Henry VIII. died.) A.D. 1547.

A.D. 1549.

7. The publication of the first Book of Common Prayer in English was a deadly blow to the teaching of Purgatory, and the Act of Uniformity prescribed its use, while that of all other forms of devotion was forbidden under heavy penalties.[4]

From this time it was impossible to continue to teach that there is an Intermediate State between Death and the Last Day, because the English Bible and the Book of Common Prayer contained only the two words—Heaven and Hell—which referred to the state after death.

A.D. 1549. Edward VI.

8. The Forty-two Articles which had been drafted by Archbishop Cranmer were "prepared by the authority of the King and Council, agreed to in Convocation, and there subscribed by both houses; and so presently promulgated by the King's authority, according to law."[5]

A.D. 1553.

Article XXV. was a further step towards the abolition

[1] "Formularies of Faith put forth by Authority during the Reign of Henry VIII.," 1825, p. 59. (Clarendon Press, Oxford.)

[2] "History of the Articles of Religion," by Archdeacon Charles Hardwick, B.D., 1884. (George Bell and Sons.)

[3] "Formularies of Faith put forth by Authority during the Reign of Henry VIII., 1825," pp. 46-48. (Clarendon Press, Oxford.)

[4] "Encyclopædia Britannica," vol. xx., p. 337.

[5] "A History of the Articles of Religion," by Archdeacon Charles Hardwick, B.D., 1884, pp. 111, 112. (George Bell and Sons.)

of the Latin language, but the wording was not so peremptory as it became in the Thirty-nine Articles :

Article XXV.—" It is most seemly and agreeable to the Word of God that in the congregation nothing be openly read, or spoken in a tongue unknown to the people, the which thing St. Paul did forbid, except some were present that should declare the same."

Article XL.—" The souls of them that depart this life do neither die with their bodies nor sleep idly. They which say that the souls of such as depart hence do sleep, being without all sense, feeling, or perceiving, until the day of judgment, or affirm that the souls die with the bodies, and at the last day shall be raised up with the same, do utterly dissent from the right belief declared to us in holy Scripture."

Article XLII.—" All men shall not be saved at the length. They also are worthy of condemnation, who endeavour at this time to restore the dangerous opinion, that all men, be they never so ungodly, shall at length be saved, when they have suffered pains for their sins a certain time appointed by God's justice."[1]

If these two Articles are considered together, they seem to imply the *doctrine of endless suffering*.[2]

A.D. 1553. Queen Mary. A.D. 1553-1558.

King Edward VI. died two months after the Articles of Religion were promulgated. During the reign of Queen Mary the Articles were suppressed.

A.D. 1558. Queen Elizabeth.

(Queen Elizabeth ascended the throne.)

A.D. 1559 or 1560. The eleven Articles of Religion.

9. A test of doctrine, entitled the " Eleven Articles of Religion," was compiled under the eye of Matthew Parker, Archbishop of Canterbury, with the sanction of the northern metropolitan and other English prelates.

I find no reference to endless suffering in these

[1] " A History of the Articles of Religion," by Archdeacon Charles Hardwick, B.D., 1884. p. 348. (George Bell and Sons.)

[2] " The Promise of Life, and the Doctrine of Everlasting Punishment," by Rev. J. T. B. Tinling, B.A., 1881, p. 7. (Elliot Stock.)

Articles, but the Book of Common Prayer, including the three Creeds, was declared to be agreeable to the Scriptures.[1]

10. Archbishop Parker laid before the Houses of Convocation a revised copy of the Forty-two Articles of 1553, and the result of the deliberations was that Thirty-nine Articles were subscribed to.[2] A.D. 1563.

11. I have found the first authoritative denial of the existence of a Purgatory, both for the just and the wicked, in the second Book of Homilies.

Sermon concerning Prayer. Second Book of Homilies, 1563. Queen Elizabeth

"Therefore let us not deceive ourselves, thinking that either we may help other or other may help us by their good and charitable prayers in time to come; for, as the preacher saith:

'Where the tree falleth, whether it be toward the south, or toward the north, in what place soever the tree falleth, there it lieth:' Eccl. xi. 3.

meaning thereby, that every mortal man dieth either in the state of salvation or damnation, according as the words of the Evangelist John do also plainly import, saying:

'He that believeth on the Son hath eternal life: and he that believeth not the Son shall not see life, but the wrath of God abideth on him.' John iii. 36.

"Where is then the third place, which they call purgatory? Or where shall our prayers help and profit the dead? St. Augustine doth only acknowledge two places after this life, heaven and hell. As for the third place, he doth plainly deny that there is any such to be found in all Scripture. Chrysostom likewise is of this mind, that unless we wash away our sins in this present world, we shall find no comfort afterward.

"And St. Cyprian saith that, after death, repentance

[1] "A History of the Articles of Religion," by Archdeacon Charles Hardwick, B.D., 1884. (George Bell and Sons.)
[2] *Ibid.*

and sorrow of pain shall be without fruit ; weeping also shall be in vain, and prayer shall be to no purpose. Therefore he counselleth all men to make provision for themselves while they may, because, when they are once departed out of this life, there is no place for repentance nor yet for satisfaction.

" Let these and such other places be sufficient to take away the gross error of purgatory out of our heads ; neither let us dream any more that the souls of the dead are anything at all holpen by our prayers : but, as the Scripture teacheth us, let us think that the soul of man, passing out of the body, goeth straightways either to heaven or *else to hell*, whereof the one needeth no prayer, and the other is without redemption."[1]

A.D. 1571. 13 Elizabeth, c. 12. The Thirty-nine Articles.

12. The Thirty-nine Articles were passed into law, as they now exist.

Article VIII.—" The three Creeds, Nicene Creed, Athanasius's Creed, and that which is commonly called the Apostles' Creed, ought thoroughly to be received and believed : for they may be proved by most certain warrants of holy Scripture."

This includes, of course, the damnatory clause of Athanasius's Creed, namely, " and they that have done evil into *everlasting* fire.*"

* R.V. eternal.

Article XXII.—" The Romish doctrine concerning Purgatory . . . is a fond thing vainly invented, and grounded upon no warranty of Scripture, but rather repugnant to the Word of God."

It has well been pointed out that it is the *Romish doctrine of Purgatory* which is here condemned, and not the original pure idea of an Intermediate State between death and the resurrection.

It would appear, however, that this Article was misunderstood, and it would seem to have been generally

[1] " The Two Books of Homilies appointed to be read in Churches : Third Part of the Sermon concerning Prayer," 1859, pp. 336, 337, first published in 1563. (Oxford University Press.)

accepted as the final blow to the doctrine of an Intermediate State after death.

Article XXIV.—"It is a thing plainly repugnant to the Word of God, and the custom of the Primitive Church to have public prayer in the Church, or to minister the Sacraments in a tongue not understanded of the people."

This Article is much more compulsory than the corresponding Article of 1553.

"King Edward's Article affirms the use of a known tongue to be most seemly and agreeable to the Word of God; but this twenty-fourth Article denies the worship in an unknown tongue to be *lawful*, and affirms it to be *repugnant* to the Word of God; to which it adds, and the custom of the primitive Church."[1]

Thus, in the short space of thirty-five years—1536 to 1571—there was a complete revolution in the doctrine taught by the Church in England and in the way the Church's services were conducted.

The Latin language was entirely discarded, and it was taught that the righteous are admitted into heaven immediately after death.

As regards never-ending suffering, the principal alteration made in 1571 was the omission of the fortieth and forty-second Articles of 1553.

13. The Irish Articles of Religion say: "The souls of the wicked are cast into hell, there to *endure endless torments*."[2] A.D. 1615.

It is supposed that these Articles were chiefly composed by Archbishop Ussher.

14. "The Westminster document was the outcome of the great Puritan agitation of the seventeenth century, and as it is the last, so it is one of the most elaborate and finished of the long series of Protestant Westminster Confession of Faith. King Charles I.

[1] "An Exposition of the Thirty-nine Articles," by Bishop Gilbert Burnet, 1845, p. 290.

[2] "Doctrine of Last Things," by Rev. S. Davidson, D.D., LL.D., 1882, p. 83. (Kegan Paul.)

confessions. The Westminster Assembly met in the
A.D. 1643. autumn, and sat for upwards of five years. The Con-
A.D. 1646. fession of Faith was completed in the third year of its existence, and laid before the English Parliament in the same year. It never attained to any position of legal authority in England; but in Scotland it was accepted in the year following its composition by the General Assembly of the Kirk as 'agreeable to the Word of God, and in nothing contrary to the received doctrine, worship, discipline, and government of this
February 7, 1649. Kirk,' and two years afterwards it was ratified and approved by the Estates of the Scottish Parliament. The Westminster Confession thus took the place in Scotland of the old *Scoticana Confessio Fidei* of John Knox. It retained this position of authority, when
A.D. 1690. Presbyterianism was finally established in Scotland, and possesses, as we have said, symbolical authority, not only for Scottish Presbyterianism, but for the large Presbyterian churches in America and Australia which have sprung from it or own connexion with it. The *Confession of Faith* extends to thirty-three chapters, ranging over the most abtruse topics of theology; and along with it are generally printed the Larger and Shorter Catechisms, which have also been approved by the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland, but which do not possess the legal or statutory authority of the *Confession*."[1]

The first article of chapter xxxii. is as follows:

" The bodies of men, after death, return to dust and
Gen. iii. 19. Acts xiii. 36. see corruption; but their souls (which neither die nor
Luke xxiii. 43. Eccl. xii. 7. sleep), having an immortal subsistence, immediately return to God Who gave them; the souls of the righteous, being then made perfect in holiness, are re-
Heb. xii. 23. 2 Cor. v. 1, 6, 8. Phil. i. 23. ceived into the highest heavens, where they behold the face of God in light and glory; waiting for the full redemption of their bodies.

" And the souls of the wicked are *cast into hell, where*
Acts iii. 21. Eph. iv. 10.

[1] " Encyclopædia Britannica," vol. vi., p. 565.

they remain in torments and utter darkness, reserved to the judgment of the great day. (Luke xvi. 23, 24. Acts i. 25. 1 Pet. iii. 19. Jude 6, 7.)

"Beside these two places for souls separated from their bodies, the Scripture acknowledgeth none."

It may be noticed that this Confession denies the existence of any Intermediate State for the righteous, who are said to be finally judged immediately after death.

It is true that the wicked are said to be reserved for judgment, but the "hell" in which they are detained, is the place of final punishment.

15. The Wesleyan Catechism teaches that Hell is "a dark and bottomless pit, full of fire and brimstone, in which *the wicked will be punished for ever and ever, by having their bodies tormented by the fire* and their souls by a sense of the wrath of God."[1] The Wesleyan Catechism. Wesley, 1703-1791.

16. The United Presbyterian Church teaches in her Confession of Faith, chapter vi., article 6: "Every sin, both original and actual, being the transgression of the righteous law of God, and contrary thereunto, doth, in its own nature, bring guilt upon the sinner, whereby he is bound over unto the wrath of God and curse of the law, and so made subject to death, with all miseries, spiritual, temporal, and eternal." It teaches, also, that the nature of sin is such that every transgression of the law deserves death, and that there "is no sin so small but it deserves damnation." The United Presbyterian Church. Rev. W. H. French, D.D., of Ohio.

With respect to the last judgment and the appointing of the day of judgment, it teaches, chapter xxxiii., article 2: "The end of God's appointing this day is for the manifestation of the glory of his mercy in the eternal salvation of the elect, and of his justice in the damnation of the reprobate who are wicked and disobedient. . . . But the wicked who know not God and obey not the Gospel of Jesus Christ *shall be cast into*

[1] "The Keys of Hell: Who Holds Them, and Why; and When they will be Used," by J. Bland, 1884, p. 9. (Robert Roberts, Birmingham.)

eternal torments, to be "punished with everlasting destruction from the presence of the Lord and from the glory of His power." In this is set forth the doctrine of the Church as to the fact of the punishment in the future state, and of its duration. It further teaches what shall be the nature of this punishment, as in the Larger Catechism, question 29, the answer is given: 'The punishments of sin in the world to come are everlasting separation from the comfortable presence of God, and *most grievous torments in soul and body, without intermission, in hell-fire for ever;* or, as in the Shorter Catechism, 'All mankind are, by the Fall, made liable to . . . *the pains of hell for ever.*' "[1]

A.D. 1646. I have found no Confession of Faith, or important ruling of the Church after the Westminster Confession until the pastoral letter of the Archbishop of Canter-

A.D. 1864. bury.

The doctrine laid down in the different Articles of Religion and Confessions which I have quoted, is as follows:

(1) That there is no Intermediate State between Death and the Last Day.

(2) That, immediately after death—(1) the righteous are translated to heaven, and (2) the wicked are cast into hell, where they will live for ever and ever, and, after the judgment of the great day, they will be punished in body and soul eternally with fire that never shall have end.

February, 1864. Queen Victoria. 17. The Lord Chancellor (Lord Westbury) delivered judgment, with the approval of the two Archbishops, in the appeal by the Rev. H. Bristow Wilson, Vicar of Great Staughton, Huntingdonshire, who had been convicted by the Dean of Arches (Dr. Lushington). The conviction was with reference to an Essay entitled "Séances Historiques de Genève; the National

[1] "That Unknown Country; or, What Living Men Believe Concerning Punishment After Death," 1889, p. 326. (Nichols and Co., Springfield, Mass.)

Church," in the well-known collection of essays called "Essays and Reviews."

The judgment was as follows: "The charge (now under consideration) is, that in the portion of his Essay which is set out in this article, Mr. Wilson has advisedly declared and affirmed, in effect, that after this life, and at the end of the existing order of things on this earth, there will be no judgment of God awarding to those men whom He shall then approve everlasting life or eternal happiness, and to those men whom He shall then condemn everlasting death or eternal misery. . . ." The Lord Chancellor held that there was "nothing in the passages extracted which in any respect questions or denies that at the end of the world there will be a judgment of God, awarding to those men whom He shall approve everlasting life or eternal happiness; but with respect to a judgment of eternal misery, a hope is encouraged by Mr. Wilson that this may not be the purpose of God. . . .

"The hope that the punishment of the wicked may not endure to all eternity is certainly not at variance with anything that is found in the Apostles' Creed, or the Nicene Creed, or in the Absolution which forms part of the Morning and Evening Prayer, or in the Burial Service. In the Catechism the child is taught that in repeating the Lord's Prayer he prays unto God 'that He will keep us from all sin and wickedness, and from our ghostly enemy, and from everlasting death; but this exposition of the Lord's Prayer cannot be taken as necessarily declaring anything touching the eternity of punishment after the resurrection.

"There remain the Commination Service and the Athanasian Creed. The material passage in the Commination Service is in these words:

"'O terrible voice of most just judgement, which shall be pronounced upon them, when it shall be said unto them, Go, ye cursed, into the fire everlasting, which is prepared for the devil and his angels.'

"In like manner the Athanasian Creed declares that they that have done evil shall go into everlasting fire. Of the meaning of these words 'everlasting fire' no interpretation is given in the formularies which are referred to in the charge.

"Mr. Wilson has urged in his defence that the word 'everlasting' in the English translation of the New Testament and of the Creed of St. Athanasius must be subject to the same limited interpretation which some learned men have given to the original words which are translated by the English word 'everlasting,' and he has also appealed to the liberty of opinion which has always existed without restraint among very eminent English divines upon this subject. . . .

"We are not required, or at liberty, to express any opinion upon the mysterious question of the eternity of final punishment, further than to say that we do not find in the formularies to which this article refers any such distinct declaration of our Church upon the subject as to require us to condemn as penal the expression of hope by a clergyman that even the ultimate pardon of the wicked who are condemned in the day of judgment may be consistent with the will of Almighty God."

It was further observed that the forty-second Article of King Edward VI., framed in 1552 (see p. 246), "was omitted from the Thirty-nine Articles of Religion of the year 1562, and it might be said that the effect of sustaining the judgment of the court below on this charge would be to restore the Article so withdrawn."[1]

March, 1864. 18. The Archbishop of Canterbury issued the following pastoral letter:

"I am sure you will beware of giving any other interpretation to the word 'everlasting' in the passages of our formularies which relate to the punish-

[1] "The Annual Register: a Review of Public Events at Home and Abroad for the Year 1864," pp. 241-246. (Rivingtons, 1865.)

ment of the lost, than that of 'eternal' in the sense of 'never-ending.' For, whatever be the meaning of the word in these passages in the case of the lost, the same must be its meaning in the case of the saved; and our certainty of never-ending bliss for penitent believers is gone if the word bears not the same signification in the case of the impenitent and unbelieving."[1]

This is how the question stands at present, except that in the Revised Version of the New Testament— which, however, is not yet used in the Church services— the word "Hell" has been replaced by "Hades" in the ten passages in which that word occurs in the original, and it would appear in consequence that the revisers were in favour of the belief in an Intermediate State. A.D. 1880.

The approved teaching of Christendom regarding the passage, "There shall be no more death," is that, "since the wrath of God is for ever, there must be eternal death (words, by the way, not to be found in all Scripture), and that this death consists in never-ending torments, so endless that after the lapse of ages on ages the punishment of the wicked shall be no nearer its end than when it first commenced; that, therefore, the words, 'In Christ shall all be made alive,' only mean that all who are here in Christ shall be made alive; that the Lamb of God, though willing to be, is not really the Saviour of the world, but only of those who are not of the world, but chosen out of it; that instead of taking away the sin of the world, He only takes away the sin of those who here believe in Him; that all things therefore shall not be reconciled to God, and that 'the restitution of all things,' whatever it may mean, does not mean the reconciliation of God to all men."[2] Rev. Andrew Jukes, in 1869. Rev. xxi. 4. 1 Cor. xv. 22. Acts iii. 21.

"If there be any doctrine ever taught in the name of Christianity which can claim to be really Catholic, Rev. John Hunt, D.D., in 1878.

[1] "Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866, p. 50. (Longmans.)

[2] "The Second Death, and the Restitution of All Things." by Rev. Andrew Jukes, 1869, p. 26. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

it is the doctrine of never-ending punishment. This has been believed by the majority of Christians in all ages, in all Churches, and, with very insignificant exceptions, in all sects. Fathers, Schoolmen, and Reformers, zealous Roman Catholics, and ardent Protestants, have agreed that this is an undeniable portion of the Catholic faith."[1]

Rev. H. N. Oxenham, in 1878.

"What is called orthodox Protestantism has clung with a singular tenacity to the doctrine of eternal punishment, which forms, if I am not mistaken, one of nine articles of faith, constituting the bond of union of the Evangelical Alliance."[2]

Rev. F. N. Oxenham, in 1881.

"The dominant teaching of all sorts of theologians since the Reformation, both Catholic and Protestant (with, no doubt, a remarkable exception here and there) until the last few years, has declared unhesitatingly that the doctrine that endless punishment is incurred by the vast mass of mankind is a certain and terrible truth revealed to us by God."[3]

Rev. Alfred Gurney, M.A., in 1888.

"It [everlasting punishment] is the doctrine of Lutherans, of Calvinists, and of Presbyterians, as shown by their authoritative documents, the seventeenth Article of the Confession of Augsburg, the fifteenth Canon of the Synod of Dort, and the Westminster Confession of Faith. The latter declares that 'by the decree of God, for His honour and glory, some men and angels are predestined unto everlasting life, and others foreordained to everlasting death'"[4] (chapter iii., article vi.).

[1] Rev. John Hunt, D.D., in the *Contemporary Review*, 1878, quoted in "Doom Eternal: the Bible and Church Doctrine of Everlasting Punishment," by Rev. J. B. Reimensnyder, 1887, p. 63. (Funk and Wagnalls, Chicago.)

[2] "Catholic Eschatology and Universalism," by Rev. H. N. Oxenham, M.A., 1878, second edition, p. xxv. (W. H. Allen and Co.)

[3] "What is the Truth as to Everlasting Punishment?" by Rev. F. N. Oxenham, 1881, p. 31. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

[4] "Our Catholic Inheritance in the Larger Hope," by Rev. Alfred Gurney, M.A., 1888, p. 13. (Kegan Paul, Trench and Co.)

On the Continent.

The Protestant Reformation commenced when Luther published his thesis at Wittenberg.

The Protestant Reformation, A.D. 1517.

"The theology which is now taught in the Lutheran schools did not at once attain its present form, but was improved and perfected progressively. Of this fact those are aware who understand the history of the doctrines concerning the Holy Scriptures, free will, predestination, and other subjects, and who have compared the early systems of theology written by Lutherans with those of more recent date. For the vindicators of religious liberty did not discover all truth in an instant; but, like persons emerging from long darkness, their vision improved gradually. The theologians were also greatly assisted in correcting and explaining their sentiments by the controversies in which they were involved, by their external conflicts with the Papists, with the disciples of Zwingli, Calvin, and others, and by their internal contests. . . . Those who, like James Benigne Bossuet and others, make this a reproach against the Lutherans, do not consider that the founders of the Evangelical Church never wished to be regarded as inspired men, and that the first virtue of a wise man is to discover the errors of others, and the second is to find out the truth."[1]

Lutheran theology progressive.

Five years after the commencement of the Reformation, Luther wrote to Hansen Von Rechenberg: "God forbid that I should limit the time of acquiring faith to the present life. In the depths of the Divine mercy there may be opportunity to win it *in the future state*."[2]

A.D. 1522. Luther.

Luther died in A.D. 1546, and in the previous year he wrote, in his exposition of Hosea, that he accepted

A.D. 1546.

[1] "Mosheim's Institutes of Ecclesiastical History," by James Murdock, D.D., revised by James Seaton Reid, D.D., twelfth edition, 1848, pp. 642, 643. (Ward, Lock and Co.)

[2] Quoted in "Salvation Beyond Death," by Rev. G. W. Hunt, 1900, p. 124. (A. R. Mowbray.)

" the idea that Christ appeared to the souls of some who in the time of Noah had been unbelieving, that they might recognize ' that their sins were forgiven through His sacrifice.' "[1]

A.D. 1522. Unfortunately, in his translation of the New Testament, instead of following the lead of the Anglo-Saxon translators,[2] Luther made the same mistake as John

A.D. 1380. Wycliffe, and he rendered Hades, Gehenna, and Tartarus by the one word " Helle."

I have already shown that Luther believed in a future state, where there may be opportunity of acquiring faith, and he must have realized that the Hades, where Jesus preached to the spirits in prison, and the Gehenna, where Jesus said the soul and body could be *destroyed* by God, were two distinct places or states.

Why, then, he made this mistake is a question I find it impossible to answer.

Lutheran Bishop Martensen.

" The learned and thoughtful Lutheran Bishop Martensen, after arguing in favour of ' a realm of progressive development in which souls are prepared and matured for the final judgment,' adds that, though the Romish doctrine ' must be repudiated because it is mixed up with so many crude and false positions, it nevertheless contains the truth that the Intermediate State must, in a purely spiritual sense, be a Purgatory destined for the purifying of the soul.' "[3]

A.D. 1530. Confession of Faith at Augsburg.

A Confession of Protestant Faith was made at the Diet of Augsburg :

Article XVII.—" There will be a judgment, in which all men will appear before the tribunal of Christ, and when the wicked *will be doomed to everlasting punishment.*"[4]

[1] " Immortality in Christ," by Rev. S. Hemphill, Litt.D., D.D., M.R.I.A., 1904, p. 53. (Simpkin Marshall.)
[2] See p. 114.
[3] " Eternal Hope," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1878. Preface, p. 20. (Macmillan.)
[4] " The Reformation," by Rev. Henry Stebbing, M.A., vol. i., 1836, p. 247. (Longmans.)

"The Protestant Reformation was consummated when the Council of Trent sanctioned the direct and open renunciation of mediæval doctrine which Luther had initiated."[1] A.D. 1545.

Calvin clearly taught that "the great mass of mankind were irrevocably *foreordained to eternal damnation*," and by "eternal" he meant "for ever and ever."[2] Calvin. A.D. 1509-1564.

"To those just coming upon the stage of religious thought and endeavor (*sic*), no words can adequately describe the reign of terror with which, but little more than a generation earlier, Calvinistic creeds bore sway in sensitive souls, and in an authoritative public sentiment. In America—certainly in the Northern States of the Federal Union—the old theology had shown few signs of serious weakening at the period of the outbreak of rebellion in the South."[3] Dr. Emerson in 1883.

"In a Confession of Fayth made by common consent by divers Reformed Churches beyonde the Seas, in 1568, it was stated: 'We believe also that Infidelles are, without delaye, *caste downe hedlonge into helle*, from whence no service of the living is able to deliver them."[4] The Confession of Helvetia, in 1568.

IV.—Popular Idea of Hell.

"Throughout the Middle Ages the world after death continued to reveal more and more fully its awful secrets. Hell,* Purgatory, Heaven became more distinct, if it may be so said, more visible. Their site, their topography, their torments, their trials, their enjoyments, became more conceivable, almost more palpable to sense: till Dante summed up the whole of A.D. 1265-1321.

* Dante, "Inferno."

[1] "Encyclopædia Britannica," vol. xx., p. 319.

[2] "The Reformation Settlement," by Canon M. MacColl, p. 303, 1899. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

[3] "The Doctrine of Probation Examined," by Rev. G. H. Emerson, D.D., 1883, p. 9. (Universalist Publishing House, Boston, Mass.)

[4] "Switzerland Reformed Church: a Confession of Fayth," edited by I. O., 1568. (H. Wykes, London.)

this traditional lore, or at least, with a poet's intuitive sagacity, seized on all which was most imposing, effective, real, and condensed it in his three co-ordinate poems.

* Hell, "Inferno."

"That Hell* had a local existence, that immaterial spirits suffered bodily and material torments; none, or scarcely one, hardy speculative mind presumed to

† "Inferno."

doubt. Hell† had admitted, according to legend, more than one visitant from this upper world, who returned to relate his fearful journey to wondering man—St. Fiercy, St. Vettin, a layman, Bernilo. But all these early descents interest us only as they may be supposed, or appear to have been faint types of the great Italian poet. Dante is the one authorized

‡ "Inferno."

topographer of the mediæval Hell.‡ His originality is no more called in question by these mere signs and manifestations of the popular belief than by the existence and reality of those objects or scenes in external nature which he describes with such unrivalled truth. In Dante meet unreconciled (who thought of or cared for their reconciliation?) those strange contradictions, immaterial souls subject to material torments; spirits which had put off the mortal body, cognizable by the corporeal sense. The

§ "Inferno."

mediæval Hell§ had gathered from all ages, all lands, all races, its imagery, its denizens, its site, its access, its commingling horrors; from the old Jewish traditions, perhaps some from regions beyond the sphere of the Old Testament; from the Pagan poets, with their black rivers, their Cerberus, their boatman and his crazy vessel; perhaps from the Teutonic Hela, through some of the earlier visions. Then came the great Poet, and reduced all this wild chaos to a kind of order, moulded it up with the cosmical notions of the times, and made it, as it were, one with the prevalent mundane system. Above all, he brought it to the very borders of our world; he made the life beyond the grave one with our present life; he mingled in close and intimate relation

the present and the future. Hell,* Purgatory, Heaven were but an immediate expansion and extension of the present world. And this is among the wonderful causes of Dante's power, the realizing the unreal by the admixture of the real: even as in his imagery the actual homely, everyday language or similitude mingles with and heightens the fantastic, the vague, the transmundane. What effect had Hell† produced if peopled by ancient, almost immemorial, objects of human detestation—Nimrod or Iscariot, or Julian, or Mohammed? It was when Popes all but living, Kings but now on their thrones, Guelfs who had hardly ceased to walk the streets of Florence, Ghibellines almost yet in exile, revealed their awful doom—this it was which, as it expressed the passions and the fears of mankind of an instant, immediate, actual, bodily, comprehensible place of torment: so, wherever it was read, it deepened that notion, and made it more distinct and natural. This was the Hell‡ conterminous to the earth, but separate, as it were, by a gulf passed by almost instantaneous transition, of which the Priesthood held the keys. These keys the audacious Poet had wrenched from their hands, and dared to turn on many of themselves, speaking even against Popes the sentence of condemnation.

* "Inferno."

† "Inferno."

‡ "Inferno."

"Of that which Hell,§ Purgatory, Heaven were in popular opinion during the Middle Ages, Dante was but the full, deep, concentred ‖ expression; what he embodied in verse all men believed, feared, hoped."[1]

§ "Inferno."

‖ *Sic.*

> "There is a dreadful hell,
> And never-ending pains;
> Where sinners must with devils dwell,
> 'Midst darkness, fire, and chains."

Dr. Watts, 1674-1758.

"It cannot be denied that from century to century, after the second, up to the one in which we live, the doctrine of eternal torments has been generally taught,

Rev. T. Davis, in 1866.

[1] "History of Latin Christianity," by Dean Henry Hart Milman, D.D., 1855, vol. vi., pp. 426-428. (John Murray.)

and in word accepted. Here and there dissentients might be found, and some, like Origen, had many followers ; but the avowed rejectors of the doctrine have been, doubtless, a small minority."[1]

Canon Farrar, in 1878.

There are four elements in the current opinion regarding Hell, " which make the popular view far darker than that held in the Roman Church, and far darker even than that of St. Augustine :

" 1. The physical torments, the material agonies, the ' sapiens ignis ' of eternal punishment.

" 2. The supposition of its necessarily endless duration for all who incur it.

" 3. The opinion that it is thus incurred by the vast mass of mankind ; and

" 4. That it is a doom irreversible, at the moment of death, on all who die in a state of sin."[2]

Rev. E. B. Pusey, in 1880.

" No one has yet been found to doubt that the mass of Christians have from the first believed the future punishment of the lost to be everlasting. We see it, even apart from Holy Scripture, in those close upon the times of Jesus ; it was the faith of the martyrs ; it was recognized as the faith of Christians by the heathen. . . . No one doubts that the millions upon millions of Christians, century after century, have believed it. It is owned to have been from the first the faith of the Creeds."[3]

And, again, by the same author : " Various as the authorities are, and varied as are the precise terms which they use, writing also in part in different languages, the belief which they concurrently express is uniform and unmistakable. One only exception there was of persons among the wealthy who did not

[1] " Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866, p. 76. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

[2] " Eternal Hope," by Canon Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1878, Preface, pp. 23, 24. (Macmillan.)

[3] " What is of Faith as to Everlasting Punishment," by Rev. E. B. Pusey, D.D., 1880, pp. 46, 47. (James Parker and Co.)

believe in the life to come, the Sadducees ; but whoever did believe it, believed in the eternity of weal and woe, which God would allot to the righteous or the wicked."[1]

J. Bland, in 1884.

" There is, perhaps, no word in the English language that has exercised so great an influence of terror over the human mind as the word ' Hell.' The most hideous conceptions, the most terrible horrors, the most frightful torments, the most inconceivable agony, both of mind and body, has been associated—through the teaching of so-called divines, and through the imaginations of poets—with this word, and with the place supposed to be represented thereby. The character of the Great, and Just, and Holy, and Merciful God has been entirely obscured by the smoke that is supposed to proceed from the pit of Hell, and instead of beholding Him in the light that He is presented to us in the Scriptures of Eternal Truth, as a Being of stern and unswerving justice, and also as a Being of tender compassion and love—characteristics which are in no way opposed to each other—divines and theologians have pictured Him as a monster of injustice—unrelenting, merciless, tyrannical—delighting in the cruelties they have ascribed to Him, and as having actually brought into this world millions upon millions of human beings, under an absolute and irreversible decree, formed in His own mind in the ages that are past—that, do what they would, they must dwell in the utterly inconceivable fire of His wrath, and suffer the agony of inextinguishable burnings kindled by Him as long as He Himself existed."[2]

Rev. C. A. Row, in 1889.

The general conclusion is " that Christianity affirms that the overwhelming majority of that innumerable multitude of men who have existed in the past, and who

[1] " What is of Faith as to Everlasting Punishment," by Rev. E. B. Pusey, D.D., 1880, pp. 46, 47. (James Parker and Co.)

[2] " The Keys of Hell : Who Holds Them and Why ; and When will They be Used ?" by J. Bland, 1884, p. 1. (Robert Roberts, Birmingham.)

exist in the present, will after this life is ended pass into a state of endless existence in never-ending misery; for this is the meaning which is popularly attached to the word damnation."[1]

The idea that a single individual will continue to exist in a state of torment, which will never terminate nor be relieved by a single ray of hope, is sufficiently awful; but when this fate is assigned to that innumerable multitude which, according to these theories, will constitute the lost, words fail to express its awfulness. If it is true that Christianity affirms this, we may almost say, in the words in which our Lord denounced the sin of Judas: "Good were it for mankind if they had never been born."[2]

V.—Result of these Views.

John Foster, A.D. 1787-1846.

"It amazes me to imagine how thoughtful and benevolent men believing this doctrine (of everlasting punishment) can endure the sight of the present world, and the history of the past. I am, without pretending to any extraordinary depth of feeling, amazed to conceive what they do with their sensibility, and in what manner they maintain a firm assurance of the Divine goodness and justice."[3]

Rev. Edward White, in 1846.

"It cannot be denied that the frightful doctrines on the future of humanity . . . though supported by the general authority of nearly all Christendom for at least fourteen centuries, are regarded with contemptuous scepticism by the bulk of the existing male population of Europe, who assign these articles of the 'faith' as the chief reason for their ever-extending and fierce revolt against Christianity. . . . Faith in the supposed Divine revelation has almost faded away from the

[1] "Future Retribution," by Rev. C. A. Row, 1889, p. 2. (William Isbister.)

[2] *Ibid.*

[3] "John Foster's Life," vol. ii., pp. 289, 290, quoted by Rev. T. Davis in "Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," 1866, p. 5. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

classes who are alienated from traditionary religion. . . . Men hold that such conceptions of moral government cannot possibly be in accord with the thoughts of God, 'whose tender mercies are over all His works.' . . . If death signifies endless misery, there seems no escape from the established dogma; but this dogma shakes the Christian faith even of its most devoted adherents."[1]

Isaac Taylor, in 1852.

"The same Gospel," says Isaac Taylor, "which penetrates our souls with warm emotions, dispersive of selfishness, brings in upon the heart a sympathy that tempts us often to wish that itself was not true, or that it had not taught us to feel."[2]

Albert Barnes, in 1854.

Even more affecting are the words of Albert Barnes, as a witness to the darkness of the ordinary orthodox theology: "These and a hundred difficulties meet the mind when we think on this great subject; and they meet us when we endeavour to urge our fellow-sinners to be reconciled to God, and to put confidence in Him. I confess for one that I feel these, and feel them more sensibly and powerfully the more I look at them, and the longer I live. I do not know that I have a ray of light on this subject which I had not when the subject first flashed across my soul. I have read to some extent what wise and good men have written. I have looked at their theories and explanations. I have endeavoured to weigh their arguments, for my whole soul pants for light and relief on these questions. But I get neither; and in the distress and anguish of my own spirit, I confess that I see no light whatever. I see not one ray to disclose to me the reason why sin came into the world, why the earth is strewed with the dying and the dead, and why man must suffer to all eternity."[3]

[1] "Life in Christ," by Rev. Edward White, 1846, pp. 72, 73. (Elliot Stock.)

[2] Isaac Taylor's "Restoration of Belief," 1852, p. 367. (Macmillan, Cambridge.)

[3] Albert Barnes's (of Philadelphia) "Practical Sermons," 1854, p. 123. (T. and T. Clark, Edinburgh.)

"Such confessions are surely sad enough; but they do not and cannot express one-thousandth part of the horror which the idea of never-ending misery should produce in every loving heart." As Archer Butler says: "Were it possible for man's imagination to conceive the horrors of such a doom as this, all reasoning about it would be at an end; it would scorch and wither all the powers of human thought." "Indeed, human life would be at a stand could this doctrine of endless torment be realized. Can such a doctrine then be true? If it be, let men declare it always and in every place. But if it be simply the result of a misconception of God's Word, it is high time that the Church awake to truer readings of it."[1]

Henry Rogers, in 1857.

"For my part, I fancy I should not grieve if the whole race of mankind died in its fourth year. As far as we can see, I do not know that it would be a thing much to be lamented."[2]

Bishop Newton.

Bishop Newton, in his "Dissertations" (No. 60), says: "Imagine a creature—nay, imagine numberless creatures—delivered over to torments of endless ages, without the least hope or possibility of relaxation or redemption. Imagine it you may, but you can never seriously believe it, nor reconcile it to God and goodness."[3]

Rev. T. Davis, in 1866.

"The doctrine of eternal torments has driven some persons mad; causes many to reject the Bible, because they are taught that the Bible contains it; tends to render men harsh and severe; and, in former ages of the world, contributed in no small degree to occasion atrocious and unutterable cruelties. . . . I believe that in countless cases flesh and blood could not sustain the clear, firm, undoubting conviction that the

[1] "Sermons," Second Series, p. 383.

[2] Professor Henry Rogers, in "Greyson's Letters": Letter VII. to C. Mason, Esq., 1857, vol. i., p. 34. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

[3] Quoted in "Bible Terminology Relative to the Future Life," by Rev. J. H. Pettingell, 1881, p. 244. (Bible Banner Association, Philadelphia.)

alternative before us is everlasting happiness in heaven, or everlasting misery in hell. . . . Once give to the word 'destruction' a meaning which it does not bear, according to the custom of any language, and then to believe that God is love, and to trust Him, delight in Him, and praise Him unfeignedly, is too hard a task for the human spirit."[1]

Rev. A. Jukes, in 1869.

"I cannot but think, too, that this doctrine of final restitution would meet much of the hopeless scepticism which is abroad, and which is certainly increased by this dogma of never-ending punishment. Men turn from the Gospel and from the Scriptures, not knowing what they contain, offended at the announcement, which shocks them, that God, Who is love, consigns all but a 'little flock,' the 'few who find the narrow way,' to endless misery. Even true believers groan under the burden which this doctrine, as it is commonly received, must lay on all thoughtful and unselfish minds."[2]

Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., in 1881.

These descriptions of hell-torments "have filled the hearts of thousands, perhaps of millions, with defiant and ignoble thoughts of God. Here, for instance, are the words of a true and noble-hearted woman—one of the most devout and self-sacrificing women whom this age, or any age, has seen. 'Is it not a simple impertinence,' says Miss Florence Nightingale, 'for preachers and schoolmasters, literally *ex cathedra*, to be always inculcating . . . what they call the commands of God, . . . and often representing Him as worse than a devil? Alas! for mankind might easily answer: "I cannot love because I am ordered. Least of all can I love One Who seems only to make me miserable here to torture me hereafter. Show me that He is lovable, and I shall love Him without being told."

[1] "Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866, pp. 8, 15. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

[2] "The Second Death and the Restitution of all Things." by the Rev. A. Jukes, 1869, p. 151. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

But does any preacher show this? He may say that God is Love, but he shows Him to be hate, worse than any hate of man. As the Persian poet says: "If God punishes me for doing evil by doing me evil, how is He better than I?" And it is hard to answer; for certainly the worst man would hardly torture his enemy, if he could, for ever. All good men would save others if they could.' "[1]

Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., in 1881.

"There is overwhelming proof that the degrading falsehoods embodied in these unwarrantable accretions to the faith are the most fruitful source of infidelity. If it involve an 'awful responsibility' to try to restore the true faith on this subject, it involves a far more awful responsibility to preach the popular error. 'All who teach it,' says one, 'are morally responsible for the atheism, suicide, madness, and gloom thereby produced.' They are preaching inferences, and indulging in descriptions which tend to array against them and against religion much that is noblest and most Christ-like in the heart of man. There is nothing in which Secularists so much delight as in attempts to buttress up the current views of endless vengeance in such forms as those I have denounced. They know that a religion which identifies itself with evil and fallible inferences dishonouring to the nature of God, and false to the drift of His revelation, can never retain its hold on the heart of man. The Church is no longer guilty of the unwisdom which once enlisted so many of her teachers against the advance of science, but she will suffer reverses yet more deadly if she continues to represent her doctrines of the future life in forms which are the mere inventions of scholasticizing theology, and which outrage the noblest instincts of mankind."[2]

Rev. J. H. Pettingell, in 1881.

"It is difficult to see how it can be possible for any man of human instincts, to say nothing of Christian sensibilities, to accept honestly and cordially the doc-

[1] "Mercy and Judgment," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, pp. 115, 116. (Macmillan.)

[2] *Ibid.*, p. 117.

trine of eternal punishment, in the sense of pain and misery ceaselessly and endlessly inflicted upon immortal creatures by the Almighty Creator. It may be, and certainly is, accepted by multitudes as a theory, as an abstract article of a traditionary creed, that has come down to us from the earlier ages ; but in these last days, when the Gospel of Christ has done so much to enlighten the minds and soften the hearts and refine the sensibilities of men throughout the Christian world, it may be questioned whether there are any who do considerately, truly, sincerely, accept of it, in its actual, living application to any portion of their fellow-men.

" That enlightened public sentiment which has reformed our penal code, and now insists upon the humane treatment of the very worst of criminals, and even of animals—refusing to tolerate cruelty to either man or beast—cannot be indifferent to a question that so intimately concerns every man. It inquires whether He, in whom ' we live and move and have our being '; who requires and expects us to love and to trust, as well as to obey Him ; who sets before us His own character as infinitely good for our imitation, will execute upon any of the creatures of His forming, even upon the most ill-deserving, such merciless cruelties, endlessly perpetuated, as their creeds attribute to Him —such penal inflictions of endless misery and woe as shock and outrage every humane sentiment in man which the Deity Himself has planted there, the faintest imitation of which by any human government, civilized or uncivilized, would not be tolerated for one hour."[1]

Rev. J. H. Pettingell, in 1898.

" Holding to the doctrine of the endless conscious existence of all men, beyond this life, as a doctrine of the Bible—for so they have been taught to believe—they begin, in their hearts, to charge God foolishly with all the injustice and cruelty their false creed attributes to Him, or to doubt the testimony of His

[1] " Bible Terminology Relative to the Future Life," by Rev. J. H. Pettingell, 1881, pp. 46, 47. (Bible Banner Association, Philadelphia.)

Word as to the actual danger of coming short of salvation, and the necessity of striving to lay hold of the Eternal Life that is set before them in the Gospel, or to deny the God of the Bible, or to take refuge in some other form of belief or unbelief. . . .

" They cannot be induced to love or worship a deity, who is represented to them as a monster of cruelty—more savage and vengeful than the blood-thirsty gods of the heathen world—nor to accept of a theodicy that is at war with the spirit and precepts of the Gospel. . . . Men everywhere, in increasing numbers, are turning away their ears from the truth, mixed, as it is, with human conceits, and turned into a fable, under the influence of this great falsehood. They are forsaking the altars at which their fathers worshipped, and betaking themselves to other forms of belief or unbelief that have, at least, the merit of not being incredible, however far they may be from ' the faith once delivered to the saints.' "[1]

VI.—The Refutation.

I have devoted so much space to show what has been the teaching of the Church on the subject of the endless life of the soul of the wicked in never-ending torments because I was once told by an Anglican minister that the Church had never actually taught such a dogma, and he insisted that the laity, independently of the Church, had come to the conclusion that this was the doctrine laid down in the Scriptures.

I think, however, I have proved that the clergy have been untrue to the teaching of our Master.

In the first place, they have put in the background all His loving promises to seek and, if possible, to save every wandering sinner, not only during this life on earth, but also afterwards in Hades.

[1] " The Unspeakable Gift," by Rev. J. H. Pettingell, 1898, pp. 30-34. (Digby Long and Co.)

In the second place, commencing in the very first century of our era, they have given a false meaning to all the numerous words and metaphors in the Gospels and Epistles, which distinctly warn us that, at the Last Day, the souls of all the persistently wicked and unrepentant will die, lose life, and be destroyed.

Other terms employed are :

be slain ;
be devoured ;
fall in pieces like a house ;
be ground to powder ;
perish ;
be burnt in a furnace of fire, or with flaming, or eternal, or unquenchable fire, like chaff, tares, or a tree, or withered branches ;
be consumed ;
be cut asunder ;
be cut down like a tree ;
be cut off like a branch ;
be rooted up like a plant ;
be cast out, or cast away.

Without the slightest authority, and merely on the ground that philosophy has proved that the soul of man is by nature immortal and indestructible, our teachers have insisted that all the above terms must mean that sinners will be kept alive for ever and ever, and will suffer never-ending torments.

The fifth Ecumenical Council made a definite ruling that never-ending punishment was the creed of the Catholic Church. A.D. 553.

John Wycliffe's translation of the Bible certainly supported this doctrine, which was distinctly laid down in the first Articles of Religion published by the authority of King Henry VIII. A.D. 1380. A.D. 1536.

Both the Bishop's Book and the King's Book acknowledged this doctrine, as did also the forty-two Articles. A.D. 1537. A.D. 1543. A.D. 1553.

The sermon concerning Prayer, in the second Book of Homilies, insisted on this belief, and so do the Irish Articles of Religion. A.D. 1563. A.D. 1615.

No authority for this dogma can be found in the ancient belief of the Jews.

It is true that the name of the loathsome valley of Hinnom was used by the Jews as the type of the place where sinners are punished after death, but it was never believed that the punishment was unending.

Canon Farrar, in 1881.

1. "According to the opinion of the Mishna and the Gemara, and all the most eminent Rabbis, Gehenna meant for the majority of Jews—if not for all Jews—brief temporary punishment, followed by forgiveness.

2. "For worse offenders, long, but still terminable, punishment.

3. "For the worst offenders of all—especially Gentile offenders—punishment followed by annihilation."[1]

Rev. Alfred Dewes, in 1866.

The Rev. Alfred Dewes, in 1866, wrote that he had carefully examined every passage "which is quoted in the works of Lightfoot, Schoettgen, Buxtorf, Castell, Schindler, Glass, Bartoloccius, Ugalino, and Nork; and the result of the whole examination is this: there are but two passages which even a superficial reader could consider to be corroborative of the assertion that the Jews understood Gehenna to be a place of everlasting punishment. There is no trace of such a notion in any of the Apocryphal Books; Judith xvi. 17 is the nearest approach to it, and how far that comes short of it let the reader judge. . . .[2]

Judith xvi. 17.

'Woe to the nations that rise up against my kindred! the Lord Almighty will take vengeance of them in the day of judgment, in putting fire and worms in their flesh; and they shall feel them and weep for ever.'

"There is no trace of it in Philo or Josephus. Of the Targums, or Chaldee Paraphrases, the most valuable, and probably the oldest, is that of Onkelos on the Pentateuch; that contains no trace of it."

[1] "Mercy and Judgment," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, pp. 207, 208. (Macmillan.)

[2] "A Plea for a New Translation of the Scriptures," by Rev. Alfred Dewes, M.A., 1866, p. 21. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

" The prophet Moses was a grand master in all Egyptian wisdom* ; and he knew nothing about it (eternity of woe). Dr. Thomas Clarke, M.D. in 1889. *Acts vii. 22.

" Maimonides, the most celebrated Jew next to Moses who ever lived, said :

" ' This is the penalty which awaits the unjust—that they shall not attain that [eternal] life, but shall be *utterly destroyed*. He who is unworthy of Eternal Life is called the " Dead," because he shall not live for ever ; but, on account of his iniquities, shall be cut off in his wickedness, and, like a beast, shall perish.'

" The present Rabbi, Hermann Adler, says : ' The Hebrew seers did *not* teach a belief in endless torture and everlasting torment." '[1]

VII.—The Old Testament.

There is one passage which is always quoted from the Old Testament in support of the dogma of never-ending torments :

' And many of them that sleep in the dust of the earth shall awake, some to everlasting life, and some to shame and everlasting contempt.' Dan. xii. 2.

The words " shame and everlasting contempt " do not necessarily imply that sinners will live for ever, and I agree with the Rev. J. H. Pettingell, who wrote :

" This contempt the righteous, who will live for ever, may well entertain for ever towards all the wicked who perish, as we now entertain a contempt for the treachery of Judas, eighteen centuries after he has passed away."[2]

" This passage was explained by the most eminent Rabbis to mean ' death and immobility.' Rabbi Saadjah, says, ' The meaning is, that for Israelites the resurrection constitutes eternal life, and that for non- Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S.

[1] " The Fate of the Dead," by Dr. Thomas Clarke, M.D., 1889, pp. 12-14. (F. Norgate.)

[2] " The Unspeakable Gift," by Rev. J. H. Pettingell, 1898, p. 200. (Digby, Long.)

Israelites the eternal shame consists in the non-resurrection which is their lot.' "[1]

Two passages from Isaiah are also quoted by some writers, but they do not seem to be relevant :

Isa. xxxiii. 14. 'The sinners in Zion are afraid; fearfulness hath surprised the hypocrites. Who among us shall dwell with the devouring fire? Who among us shall dwell with everlasting burnings?'

Dr. Wordsworth. "The inhabitants of Jerusalem, when they arose early in the morning, and saw the ground beneath their city strewn with the dead bodies of the Assyrians, were awe-struck at the sight, and the sinners in Zion trembled for dread of God's Majesty and Power; and 'fearfulness surprised the hypocrites.' . . .

"The ungodly sinners and hypocrites in Jerusalem saw a terrible warning to themselves in the sudden destruction of Sennacherib's army, when one hundred and eighty-five thousand were swept away in one night by the wrath of God. . .

Jer. iv. 11, and li. 1. "This Divine Judgment was executed (we have reason to believe) by means of a hot, fiery, pestilential, scorching wind, and they perished, as it were, in a furnace kindled by the breath of the Lord."[2]

Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S. "These words refer exclusively to temporal judgments, and to the Assyrian invader."[3]

Isa. lxvi. 23, 24. 'And it shall come to pass, that from one new moon to another, and from one sabbath to another, shall all flesh come to worship before Me, saith the Lord. And they shall go forth, and look upon the carcases of the men that have transgressed against Me: for their worm shall not die, neither shall their fire be quenched; and they shall be an abhorring unto all flesh.'

Dr. Wordsworth. "Isaiah in this place seems to compare the sight of the wicked condemned at the Great Day to the awful spectacle seen by Hezekiah, and by those who were

[1] "Mercy and Judgment," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, pp. 436-443. (Macmillan.)

[2] "The Old Testament," with Notes and Introduction by Charles Wordsworth, D.D., Bishop of Lincoln, 1878, vol. v., "The Book of the Prophet Isaiah." (Rivingtons.)

[3] "Mercy and Judgment," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, pp. 436-443. (Macmillan.)

saved by God's mercy in Jerusalem (among whom was Isaiah himself), when they went forth from the city in the morning and looked upon the dead corpses of the Assyrians of Sennacherib's army, one hundred and eighty-five thousand in number, strewing the ground near the city, and lying scorched with fire in the valley of Hinnom at the south of Jerusalem."[1]

I may point out that this passage is decidedly against the theory that sinners will live for ever and ever, and, seeing that the inhabitants of Jerusalem went out and looked upon *dead corpses*, it points rather to the wicked who are condemned at the Great Day being suddenly slain in some similar awful way, and so dying the "second death."

I quote verses 3 and 4 from the eleventh chapter of Ecclesiastes because the Church of Rome depends upon verse 3 to prove its dogma that "when death comes the final doom of every one is fixed," although the Anglican Church gives a very simple interpretation to the passage :

'If the clouds be full of rain, they empty themselves upon the earth: and if the tree fall toward the south, or toward the north, in the place where the tree falleth, there it shall be. 'He that observeth the wind shall not sow; and he that regardeth the clouds shall not reap.' Eccles. xi. 3, 4.

"This text (verse 3) confirms and illustrates the truth that when death comes the final doom of every one is fixed, and there is no more possibility of changing it; so that one dying in a state of mortal sin will always remain in a state of mortal sin, and consequently be rejected for ever; and one dying in a state of grace and friendship with God can never again fall away."[2] Very Rev. J. Faá di Bruno, D.D.

"*Verse* 3.—The thought is linked to that which precedes it by the mention of the 'evil coming upon the earth.' In regard to that evil, the sweeping calamities Dean E. H. Plumptre, D.D.

[1] "The Old Testament," with Notes and Introduction by Charles Wordsworth, D.D., Bishop of Lincoln, 1878, vol. v., "The Book of the Prophet Isaiah." (Rivingtons.)

[2] "Catholic Belief," by the Very Rev. J. Faá di Bruno, D.D., 1884, p. 189. (Burns and Oates.)

that lie beyond man's control, he is as powerless as he is when the black clouds gather and the winds rush wildly. He knows only that the clouds will pour down their rain, that the tree will lie as the tempest has blown it down. Is he therefore to pause, and hesitate, and stand still, indulging the temper

> " 'Over exquisite
> To cast the fashion of uncertain evils'?

That question is answered in the next verse. It may be noted, as an illustration of the way in which the after-thoughts of theology have worked their way into the interpretation of Scripture, that the latter clause has been expounded as meaning that the state in which men chance to be when death comes on them is unalterable, that there is 'no repentance in the grave.' So far as it expresses the general truth that our efforts to alter the character of others for the better must cease when the man dies, that when the tree falls to south or north, towards the region of light or that of darkness, we, who are still on earth, cannot prune, or dig about, or dung it, the inference may be legitimate enough, but it is clear that it is not that thought which was prominent in the mind of the writer.

Luke xiii. 8.

"*Verse* 4.—This is, as has been said above, the answer to the question suggested in verse 3. Our ignorance of the future is not to put a stop to action. If we allowed that 'taking thought for the morrow' to hinder us from doing good, we should be as the husbandman who is always observing the clouds, and lets the time of sowing pass by; who, when harvest comes, watches the wind as it blows round him, till 'the harvest is past, and the summer ended,' and he can no longer reap. The very watching for opportunities may end in missing them. There are times when it is our wisdom to 'be instant *out* of season.'"[1]

Matt. vi. 25.

Jer. viii. 20.

2 Tim. iv. 2.

[1] "Ecclesiastes, or the Preacher," by Dean E. H. Plumptre, D.D., 1881. (University Press, Cambridge.)

" *Verse* 3.—The world is ruled by fixed laws, the operation of which man has no power to suspend. Bishop Ellicott.

" *Verse* 4.—But it is idle to guard against all possibilities of failure. To demand a certainty of success before acting would mean not to act at all."[1]

" This is nothing but a wise warning against over-anxiety. Do your work, and leave the issues with God."[2] Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., in 1881.

" In all these books of the Old Testament there are but four texts (those already quoted) which, even by stretching them on the rack of an impossible exegesis, can be made even to *seem* to bear witness to the Augustinian, mediæval, and modern views of hell."[3]

VIII.—The Teaching of Jesus.

There is only one passage in the Gospels which can be quoted to uphold the belief that never-ending punishment was the doctrine taught by Jesus, and I have proved, at least to my own satisfaction, that the passage has been misunderstood by being regarded apart from its context.[4]

The passage in question is :

'And these shall go away into everlasting* punishment: but the righteous into life eternal.' Matt. xxv. 46. * R.V. eternal.

The actual sentence which will be passed on those " on the left hand " will be :

'Depart from Me, ye cursed, into everlasting† fire, prepared for the devil and his angels.' Matt. xxv. 41. † R.V. eternal.

If these two passages are read together, the teaching of Jesus on the Mount of Olives, shortly before His crucifixion, is seen to be exactly the same as it had been throughout His three years' ministry. It seems

[1] " A Bible Commentary for English Readers," edited by Bishop C. J. Ellicott, D.D., 1895. (Cassell and Co.)
[2] " Mercy and Judgment," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, p. 436. (Macmillan.)
[3] *Ibid.*, pp. 436-443.
[4] See p. 131.

perfectly clear that Jesus taught the utter destruction of persistent sinners on the Last Day by using the metaphor of being cast into so intense a fire[1] that, in the Greek language of the day, it was called everlasting or unquenchable.

If we can imagine the historian Eusebius writing an account of the death of Thomas Cranmer, Archbishop of Canterbury, at Oxford, in 1555, we may be sure that he would have used the word "asbestos" to denote the "unquenchable" fire in which he was burnt.

Ezek. xx. 45, 48. Jer. xvii. 27.

Throughout the Scriptures "the everlasting fire," "the unquenchable fire," and "the fire that shall not be quenched," were co-extensive in meaning, and were used interchangeably,[2] and I have proved that in secular writings the Greek word "asbestos," which is translated "unquenchable," only meant intense or fierce.[3]

The Greek word "aionios," which is translated "everlasting" or "eternal," occurs altogether seven times in the New Testament in connexion with the lot of the wicked, but the words "everlasting punishment" are only found once in the whole Bible:

Matt. xviii. 8; xxv. 41. * R.V. eternal. — 1 and 2. Everlasting* fire.

Jude vii. — 3. Eternal fire.

Mark iii. 29. † R.V. an eternal sin. — 4. Eternal damnation.†

Heb. vi. 2. — 5. Eternal judgment.

2 Thess. i. 9. ‡ R.V. eternal. — 6. Everlasting‡ destruction.

Matt. xxv. 46. § R.V. eternal. — 7. Everlasting§ punishment.

[1] "The After Life," by Henry Buckle, 1907, pp. 123-133. (Elliot Stock.)

[2] "Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866, pp. 42-45. (Longmans.)

[3] See p. 127.

It cannot be supposed that when the word "aionios" is attached to damnation, judgment, and destruction, the meaning was that the process of damning, judging, or destroying continued for ever and ever. Why, therefore, should it not be held that, the sentence of everlasting punishment having been passed, the *effect* will last for ever and ever?

St. Paul clearly taught us the meaning of this passage when he wrote to the Thessalonians:

'When the Lord Jesus shall be revealed from heaven with His mighty angels, in flaming fire taking vengeance on them that know not God, and that obey not the gospel of our Lord Jesus Christ: Who shall be punished with everlasting* destruction from the presence of the Lord, and from the glory of His power.'

Matt. xxv. 46.
2 Thess. i. 7-9.
* R.V. eternal.

Whenever a thing is destroyed it ceases to be, and "there is not one image either in the Old or New Testaments descriptive of retribution which encourages the expectation of a bad man's everlasting life."[1]

Reading these two verses together, therefore, they should be understood as follows:

'Then shall He say also unto them on the left hand, Depart from Me, ye cursed, into everlasting† fire, prepared for the devil and his angels.
'And these shall go away into everlasting‡ punishment.'

Matt. xxv. 41, 46.
† R.V. eternal.
‡ R.V. eternal.

"Everlasting"§ in "everlasting punishment," having the same meaning as in "everlasting judgment or destruction," must mean that no recovery will be possible from the annihilation portrayed in the symbol of the fire, burning so intensely as to be called everlasting or eternal.

§ Eternal.

IX.—The Teaching of the Apostles.

I have found only three passages quoted from the Epistles in support of the teaching of never-ending punishment in flames of material fire, but I fail to see how they support it:

[1] "Life in Christ," by Rev. Edward White, 1846, ed. 1875, p. 406. (Elliot Stock.)

2 Cor. v. 11. 1 'Knowing therefore the terror of the Lord, we persuade men.'

2 Thess. i. 9. 2. 'Who shall be punished with everlasting destruction from the presence of the Lord, and from the glory of His power.'

Heb. xii. 29. 3. 'For our God is a consuming fire.'

Rev. J. F. B. Tinling, in 1881.

"Unless we seek a foundation for so tremendous a doctrine as that of endless woe in the very last book of the Bible, and among the scenes of the Apocalyptic vision, which none will dare to interpret with confidence. . . . we shall find no word in the writings of any of the Apostles to disturb our conviction that the doom of sinful and unregenerate men is the destruction of a literal death. . . . Paul, with all his insight into the deepest mysteries and uncompromising maintenance of the sovereignty of God, has no word to say about a state of torment, though he speaks clearly

2 Thess. i. 9. and solemnly of 'everlasting destruction from the presence of the Lord.'

Ps. xlix. "Peter is content with the idea of the Psalmist, who compared men of the world to 'beasts that perish'; but he clothes the old idea in language more forcible than it had ever worn before, as he writes:

2 Pet. ii. 12. 'These, as natural brute beasts made to be taken and destroyed . . . shall utterly perish in their own corruption.'"[1]

Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., in 1881.

"There are four chief Apostles, St. Paul, St. Peter, St. James, St. John, and in the writings of all four—excluding for the moment the disputed symbols of the Apocalypse—there is not one word which teaches us the *endless misery* of any, much less of the majority, of mankind. Yet how worse than cruel would such reticence have been in men who professed to teach 'the whole counsel of God,' if indeed the common view formed any part of that counsel."[2]

Rev. F. N. Oxenham, in 1881.

"*If* our Lord's teaching on this awful subject was so clear, and *if* His disciples so distinctly understood

[1] "The Promise of Life and the Doctrine of Everlasting Punishment," by Rev. J. F. B. Tinling, 1881, pp. 76, 77. (Elliot Stock.)

[2] "Mercy and Judgment," by Canon F. W. Farrar, D.D., F.R.S., 1881, p. 429. (Macmillan.)

His meaning, how did it happen that of all those most near Him, His chosen 'witnesses'; of all those most authoritative teachers, whose Epistles make up one half of the New Testament—St. Peter, St. Paul, St. John, St. James—*not one, in any of his Epistles, ever teaches this doctrine*, except (if it be an exception) St. Paul in one place, where he applies to the destruction of the wicked the disputed word 'aionios'? If this doctrine had been the doctrine of Jesus Christ, and if these His great Apostles had known it to be His doctrine—a doctrine of such awful terror, of such incomparable importance—is it credible that they should all have passed it over in silence?"[1] 2 Thess. i. 9.

"The gospel of the Apostolic preachers was a gospel of salvation, and only on very rare occasions did it contain denunciations of judgment; and even these contain no hint that the judgment threatened was a never-ending existence in never-ending misery.... The terms used to describe the future punishment of men irrecoverably wicked, unless some signification is assigned to them which they do not naturally bear, affirm that it will be some awful form of destruction. Rev. C. A. Row, in 1889.

"The terms used by St. Paul must have conveyed to ordinary speakers of Greek the idea of destruction, and not a few of destruction attended with painful suffering. Not one of the terms which he uses would, to an ordinary speaker of Greek, convey the meaning of everlasting existence in torments."[2]

"The language of Moses and of Paul shows that an eternal existence of moral corruption and fiery torture is not the doom of the wicked. When Moses besought the Lord to forgive the sin of Israel, he said: Rev. U. Smith, in 1897.

'Yet now, if Thou wilt forgive their sin—; and if not, blot me, I pray Thee, out of Thy book which Thou hast written.' Exod. xxxii. 32.

[1] "What is the Truth as to Everlasting Punishment?" by Rev. F. N. Oxenham, 1881, pp. 117, 118. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

[2] "Future Retribution," by Rev. C. A. Row, 1889, pp. 270 and 321. (William Isbister.)

"This book must be the book of life, in which the names of the righteous are written. By being blotted out of this book, Moses evidently meant being devoted to the doom of sinners. If Israel could not be forgiven, he would himself perish with that unfaithful people.

"But no one can for a moment suppose that he wished throughout eternity for a life of sin, pain, and blasphemy in hell. He only wished for an utter cessation of that life which, if his prayer could not be granted, would be an intolerable burden.

"And if this is what he meant by being blotted out of God's book, it follows that this will be the doom of the ungodly, for the Lord answered:

Exod. xxxii. 33. '*Whosoever hath sinned against Me*, him will I *blot out* of My book.'"[1]

St. Paul wrote to the Romans:

Rom. ix. 3. 'For I could wish that myself were accursed from Christ for my brethren, my kinsmen according to the flesh.'

Rev. J. Bland, in 1884. "There can be no doubt that the ordinary meaning attached to the idea of being 'accursed from Christ' for ever includes or involves the endurance of eternal punishment in hell. It is impossible that St. Paul can have believed this, or that he could have been willing to dwell in fire and brimstone for ever, even for his brethren's sake. What he really meant was that he was willing to suffer everlasting or eternal

2 Thess. i. 9. 'destruction from the presence of the Lord.'"[2]

X.—Eternal Damnation is not now Constantly Preached.

Rev. Edward White, in 1846. "It has become almost an established doctrine of our time in Protestant countries that the 'Biblical threatenings of material fire in hell,' as they are termed,

[1] "Here and Hereafter, or Man in Life and Death," by Rev. U. Smith, 1897, p. 272. (*Review and Herald* Publishing Association, Washington, U.S.A.)

[2] "The Keys of Hell: Who holds them, and why?" by Rev. J. Bland, 1884, p. 8. (Robert Roberts, Birmingham.)

are all to be understood of mental anguish only, inflicted by the fire of 'men's own passions,' or of 'God's wrath.'

"This reaction has been caused doubtless by the recoil of thoughtful minds from the extravagantly horrible prospect of *endless* torment by fire."[1]

"I can hardly imagine two propositions more discordant one with the other than that Almighty God is love, and that He will torment sinners for ever. . . . Rev. T. Davis, in 1866.

"A better translation would be:

"'These shall go away into everlasting punishment, but the righteous into everlasting life.' Matt. xxv. 46.

"The difference may seem slight, but the meaning of the text gains clearness by the change.

"We see at once that, whatever the punishment, it is not *life* of any kind. Yet life it must be, and life everlasting, if it be everlasting suffering; for to suffer for ever there must be feeling for ever; and to feel for ever there must be life for ever. . . .

"We should infer from the text that the punishment, not being life, must be death, especially when so many other passages teach us that death *is* the punishment of the wicked, and life the very blessing that is peculiar to the good.

"'For the wages of sin is death; but the gift of God is eternal life through Jesus Christ our Lord.' Rom. vi. 23.

"Now death, as I understand it here, is equivalent to destruction."[2]

"It has now—blessed be God!—become simply incredible to all who care to exercise their minds and their hearts—which are equally needed—about Divine things that the God who has given to us the measure of His love to the world on Calvary can bring into existence, generation after generation, countless Rev. J. Baldwin Brown, in 1875.

[1] "Life in Christ," by Rev. Edward White, 1846, p. 375. (Elliot Stock.)

[2] "Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866, pp. 56, 58, 59. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

myriads of free, intelligent beings, capable of enduring the intensest suffering, with the clear certainty that the vast mass of them must spend an undying existence in fearful anguish, for want of saving faith in a Gospel which few of them were permitted to listen to, and which still fewer of them had a chance of hearing, as Christ would have proclaimed it, in the full power of its love and of its truth. . . .

"And it now seems clear—at least, to the thoughtful in the Christian community, whom the thoughtless follow in time—that the Church may no longer dare to present in the forefront of its Gospel the vision of the great mass of mankind, the men and women for whom Christ died, and whom on Calvary He gathered to His heart, passing out after a sad, struggling, sobbing life into a great waste of eternal darkness, where 'weeping and wailing and gnashing of teeth' burden the shuddering air for ever and for ever."[1]

Rev. F. N. Oxenham, in 1881.

"I have tried to show that there are no sufficient grounds on which the popular doctrine—of everlasting, never-ending punishment—can rightly claim any place as a necessary article of Christian faith. I have ventured to assert that the popular doctrine, if not certainly false, is certainly unwarrantable, and that it is not *de fide*."[2]

Rev. J. F. B. Tinling, in 1881.

"One must see that, whereas in the past preachers called evangelical were wont to extract from it—the doctrine of endless suffering—the utmost horrors which the imagination of their hearers could compass, the labours of the same class, and even of the same individuals, have of late been directed chiefly to the opposite end of modifying the severity of the doctrine, wherever that appeared to be compatible with the

[1] "Doctrine of Annihilation in the Light of the Gospel of Love," by the Rev. J. Baldwin Brown, Minister of Brixton Independent Church, 1875, pp. 2, 3. (Henry S. King and Co.)

[2] "What is the Truth as to Everlasting Punishment?" by Rev. F. N. Oxenham, 1881, p. 202. (Longmans, Green and Co.)

essentials of their theory. Thus, it is now held to be reasonable, or at any rate harmless, to believe in the safety of all who die in infancy, and even in the salvability of the heathen who have never heard the Gospel. . . .

"Similar modifications are offered in representing the *character* of everlasting punishment. The *comparatively* little suffering of some is inferred from the principle of degrees of guilt, and made as much of as possible, while the idea of physical pain is discredited as uncertain and unnecessary.

"But the silence of the pulpit with reference to this momentous theme is the most remarkable evidence of a general change of mind. . . .

"Against this doctrine of eternal torment a great part, and not the least thoughtful part, of Christendom is in revolt. . . .

"Protests against it by the most distinguished Christian scholars reach back to the earliest age in which it was asserted, and that (to leave aside for the present the words of Scripture) was not the age of the Apostles. And yet there is a sense in which the revolt is distinctively modern. . . .

"A large proportion of the most learned and practical leaders of the Church have abandoned the belief in eternal misery."[1]

Rev. E. R. Hendrix, D.D., Bishop of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South America.

"The Church with which the writer stands connected accepts as a matter of revelation, and believes on rational grounds as well, the doctrine of the future and endless punishment of sin. . . . Formerly there was a more general belief in a literal fire, and consequently more stress was laid upon the physical tortures of the lost. . . . Using, as our Lord had done, the terms best suited to impress the masses, they did not pause to determine how much was literal and how much was figurative. . . . The preachers of a hundred

[1] "Doctrine of Everlasting Punishment," by Rev. J. F. B. Tinling, 1881, pp. 2-4, and 7. (Elliot Stock.)

years ago deemed these terms more literal than figurative, while those of to-day deem them more figurative than literal. Those who deem the terms to be mostly figurative, so far from relaxing their views as to the poignancy and endlessness of the suffering, see in this use of language an imperfect endeavour to indicate the appalling agony of the lost, who, in calling upon the rocks and mountains to fall upon them and hide them from the face of the Lamb, would fain welcome any physical pain that should make them unmindful of mental agony."[1]

Rev. H. W. Thomas, D.D., Pastor of the People's Church, Chicago.

"Even the orthodox churches are beginning to feel, and, if no more, by silence to say, that such conceptions [of President Edwards and Spurgeon] of after-death punishment in a hell of material fire were creations of the imagination; that they never were true in the world of fact. They are beginning to say that the expressions 'fire' and 'brimstone' are figurative, and some are even saying that the sufferings of the lost are hardly so severe as the full strength of the figure might justify; a few are venturing still further, and saying that, whatever may be the sufferings of the lost, they will not be so terrible as non-existence; that existence in hell will not be an unmitigated curse, but rather a poor kind of blessing—an endurable misery."[2]

Rev. Washington Gladden, D.D., of Ohio.

"I remember hearing Elder Knapp describe the writhings of the lost in that pit of flame, and it is impossible to forget the extremely realistic rhetoric in which he pointed out the damned crawling up the sides of the crater, and the devils standing with pitchforks on the edges to fling them in again. These picturesque delineations were delivered with perfect assurance to a crowded audience of Christians.

"A few evangelists are now traveling (*sic*) who

[1] "That Unknown Country, or What Living Men Believe Concerning Punishment After Death," 1889, p. 448. (Nichols and Co., Springfield, Mass., U.S.A.)

[2] *Ibid.*, pp. 900, 901.

adhere, though rather shamefacedly, to this method of presentation—insisting that 'the Bible always means just what it says'; but from no intelligent teacher, even of the most conservative school, is any such doctrine heard. The *costume* of the theory of retribution has greatly changed within the last century."[1]

Dr. Angus.

"Dr. Angus himself admits that the controversy—denial of natural immortality and the consequent denial of eternal torments—dates as far back as the second century. . . ."

Acts xxiv. 15. Ps. i. 5. Matt. xxv. 41. Phil. iii. 19. 2 Pet. ii. 12.

"The opponents of eternal torments believe the testimony that 'there shall be a resurrection of the just and unjust'; that the unjust shall be condemned in the judgment; that their condemnation will end in their destruction.

"Those in favour of it quote passages to prove the popular view—that punishment consists of torment, torture, misery, suffering, pain, agony, 'hell-fire' feeding upon, but never consuming, its wretched victims."[2]

Rev. C. A. Row, in 1889.

"While the doctrine in question—Eternal Damnation—still continues to be popularly believed to be the teaching of the New Testament, and even still continues embodied with more or less definiteness in the creeds and confessions of faith of a large majority of the communities into which the Christian Church is divided, yet by far the greater proportion of Christian teachers, without dropping a hint that in their opinion this doctrine has no foundation in revelation, have ceased to proclaim it from the pulpit; whereas, if it is really the teaching of Christ and His Apostles, it is impossible to proclaim it too loudly."[3]

[1] "That Unknown Country, or What Living Men Believe Concerning Punishment After Death," 1889, pp. 381, 382. (Nichols and Co., Springfield, Mass., U.S.A.)

[2] "Everlasting Punishment not Eternal Torments," by Rev. R. Roberts, 1883, pp. 1 and 2. (R. Roberts, Birmingham.)

[3] "Future Retribution," by Rev. C. A. Row, 1889, p. xii. (William Isbister.)

Rev. C. A. Row, in 1889.

Not a few of the declarations of the New Testament " imply, and at least three of them affirm, that a time is coming in the future when evil will be made to cease in the Universe of God ; and this can only be effected in two ways—either by the ultimate reconciliation of all evil beings to God, or by evil beings being made to cease to exist.

" As the language of the New Testament, taking it as a whole, seems to me to be inconsistent with the ultimate reconciliation of every evil being to God, I have felt myself obliged to accept the latter alternative ; but if it had not been for this, I should have gladly accepted the former."[1]

Rev. H. T. Cheever, D.D., of Boston, in 1893.

" The dogma of the eternal existence and torment of the wicked in hell has been already virtually undermined. There is a general revolt against it in the reason and consciousness of enlightened Bible Christians. This is proved, not so much by what they say—for the sentiment of tradition and the restraints of institutionalism are still very strong—but in the fact that there is scarcely a minister who preaches, or a private Christian who acts, as if he really believed that the mass of his fellow-men around him were standing on the edge of such an eternal perdition.

" The doctrine is inconsistent not only with a true knowledge of God, but with the specific promises of universal blessing which underlie the Divine economy as revealed in the Bible. We are there met by the record of man's lapse into sin, whose wages are death, and by a Divine provision to redeem the race from sin and death—a provision so ample that ' all the kindreds of the earth ' and ' all generations ' were to be reached and blessed by it."[2]

Acts iii. 25.

Luke i. 48.

Rev. Stewart, D. F. Salmond, D.D., in 1895.

" The doctrine of the finality of life's spiritual decisions has no necessary connection with ideas of

[1] " Future Retribution," by Rev. C. A. Row, 1889, p. xxv. (William Isbister.)

[2] " Biblical Eschatology," by Rev. H. T. Cheever, D.D., 1893, pp. 84, 85. (Lee and Shepard, Boston.)

punishment which were once current, or with those realistic pictures of hell and crude conceptions of the retributive awards of Divine justice with which it has been burdened. The harrowing, materialistic ideas of the pains of the lost which were natural to times in which life was rougher and more cruel are a witness to the deep sense of the perils and terrors of sin. But they form no part of the doctrine itself. It has to be relieved of all such accessories. It has to get the benefit of that finer moral sense, those higher and purer ideas of judgment and punishment, those humaner feelings, that deeper insight into the intrinsic nature of things, which are the results of the gradual informing of men's minds with the spirit of Christianity."[1]

Rev. F. H. Carlisle, in 1896.

" As might be expected from my previous discourses in this course, the old-fashioned and injurious ideas of hell as a place of material flames and endless punishment will be here either totally ignored or treated with deserving contempt.

" These two ideas of Hell have done more than anything else to foster a spirit of indifference and unbelief, to keep cultured men and women out of Christian Churches, to bring ridicule on Holy Writ through an erroneous interpretation.

" By a cultured and general study of the Holy Bible it is found that ' flames of fire ' merely indicates spiritual purification and punishment, and that ' everlasting punishment ' or its equivalent merely indicates ages of punishment until remedial correction has been completed. Material flames of fire and endless punishment in hell would only disgrace God, blight human culture and progress, and make the very idea of life itself ridiculous and degrading.

" The Bible does not sanction this horrible idea,

[1] " The Christian Doctrine of Immortality," by Rev. Stewart D. F. Salmond, D.D., 1895, p. 662. (T. and T. Clark, Edinburgh.)

antiquity does not confirm it, reason revolts from it, and conscience ignores it."[1]

Rev. J. A. Beet, D.D., in 1898.

"It is worthy of note that, whereas until recent years preachers and writers did not hesitate to speak of and describe the actual torment of the lost, few do so now. Indeed, the excesses of past days is producing an excessive recoil. For I observe with regret that the future punishment of sin, so conspicuous in the New Testament, is losing its due place in the modern pulpit. To reinstate it is one purpose of this volume."[2]

Rev. Levi Gilbert, in 1903.

"Formerly the subject of hell and its damnation constituted the chief burden of discourse, as men were earnestly warned to flee from 'the wrath to come.' Now the theme is rarely presented, even in evangelical pulpits, and has practically dropped out of preaching."[3]

Rev. R. P. Downes, LL.D., in 1903.

"John Foster says in one of his letters: 'As to religious teachers, if this tremendous doctrine be true, surely it ought to be almost continually proclaimed as with the blast of a trumpet, inculcated and reiterated with ardent passion in every possible form of terrible illustration; no remission of the alarm to thoughtless spirits.' The fact is, that ministers do not believe this doctrine, or they would be compelled to preach it as with tongues of fire. It is, indeed, rapidly passing through the stages of instinctive repulsion, subtle disintegration, and final abandonment."[4]

Rev. S. Hemphill, D.D., Litt.D., M.R.I.A., in 1904.

"But now we are suffering from a reaction. For many years Hell has been more or less of a stranger to our pulpits. Preachers have kept a discreet silence about the nature of future retribution. They have given the go-by to an inconvenient and intricate sub-

[1] "The Four Last Things," by Rev. F. H. Carlisle, 1896, p. 62. (Elliot Stock.)

[2] "The Last Things," by Rev. J. A. Beet, D.D., 1898, p. xviii. (Hodder and Stoughton.)

[3] "Side-Lights on Immortality," by Rev. Levi Gilbert, D.D., 1903, p. 214. (Fleming H. Revell Co., Chicago.)

[4] "Man's Immortality and Destiny," by Rev. R. P. Downes, LL.D., 1903, p. 137. (Smith's Publishing Company.)

ject, and have presented only or chiefly the pleasing parts of God's revelation; and what is the result? Sunday desecration, neglect of family prayer, or of any prayer at all, and practical heathenism."[1]

Conclusion.

This, then, is the whole of the evidence on which has been founded the frightful doctrine of an eternity of existence for sinners in never-ending punishment, suffering torments in flames of material fire.

And what does the evidence amount to?

1. One passage in Daniel, which speaks of "shame and everlasting contempt"; but this is what *we* feel for the treachery of Judas, and the *righteous*, who finally win the life eternal, may well feel the same for the unrepentant, who are at last destroyed. Dan. xii. 2.

2. Two passages in Isaiah, which, instead of teaching that the wicked are kept alive, clearly point to their ceasing to exist. Isa. xxxiii. 14, and lxvi. 23, 24.

3. One passage in Ecclesiastes, which has been wrongly interpreted by the Church of Rome. Eccl. xi. 3, 4.

4. One passage in Matthew, which I have shown has been misunderstood by being read apart from its context. Matt. xxv. 46.

5. Three passages in the Epistles of St. Paul, which certainly do not prove the argument. 2 Cor. v. 11. 2 Thess. i. 9. Heb. xii. 29.

There is, in truth, only the one passage in Matthew which really mentions "everlasting* punishment," and even if there were no such satisfactory explanation of it as I have given, there would be no warrant for insisting on the authority of this one passage as against the very numerous words and metaphors which teach that the fate of unrepentant sinners *on the Last Day* will be absolute destruction, or "the second Death." Matt. xxv. 46. * R.V. eternal.

Undoubtedly, the real argument in support of this

[1] "Immortality in Christ," by Rev. S. Hemphill, D.D., Litt.D., M.R.I.A., 1904, p. 41. (Simpkin, Marshall.)

belief is that it has been always held since the beginning of the Church.

I have, however, pointed out that the early converts to Christianity insisted on retaining Plato's theory of the natural immortality of the soul, which was already their cherished belief.

In order to support Plato's dogma, it was necessary to hold that the words in the New Testament, which refer to actual destruction, and which always had that meaning when used in ordinary writing or conversation (both in Greek and English), have in Scripture the totally different meaning of being kept alive for ever in never-ending torments.

Many of the intelligent laity realize that the clergy no longer sully their sermons with imaginary descriptions, such as they heard in their youth, of an impossible "hell," where ravenous worms live in a furnace of fire.

They also notice, however, that the preachers have introduced no other theory in its place, and the subject of what happens after death is simply ignored.

Very large numbers of the clergy agree with what I have written about the After Life, but they do not preach it, and I say they are untrue to our Master, as they ought to take every opportunity of preaching what they believe on such an all-important subject.

CHAPTER XII

CONCLUSION.

CHAPTER XII

Conclusion.

I HOLD that the whole of the teaching of Jesus is against the doctrine of Everlasting Punishment.

He taught that God willeth to have all men to be saved, and that, after the first death, all Spirits are detained in Hades, where sinners suffer terrible torments of remorse, but, while they have to bear discipline, they are given opportunities of becoming purified. Recovery—although likened to the payment of a very large debt—is *not* impossible.

Finally, I would point to the wonderful order of the creation, which, according to the science of evolution, commenced with the lowest form possessing life, and culminated in the pre-Adamite human beings.

No revelation from God was apparently given to these evolved beings, and I have explained the prevalence of Serpent worship all over the world by the supposition that Satan had attempted to set up a kingdom on earth in opposition to God, and had ordered the worship of himself in the form which he afterwards assumed in the garden of Eden.

Adam and Eve were created, I imagine, to be the parents of a godly race who would act as missionaries to the previous inhabitants of the earth, and the Advent of Jesus was rendered necessary by the failure of the chosen race to be true to God.

I am convinced that the final judgment will not take

place immediately after death, and no one will be translated to Heaven until after the Last Day.

At death, each soul—with its dormant, or quickened, Spirit—will enter its spirit-body, and will go to its own place, or sphere, in Hades, or the Intermediate State, to which it is suited by its life on earth.

I believe that most sinners will recognise the mercy of God when they find themselves in Hades, instead of being in awful torments in material fire, and I think many will then accept the teaching which they will receive from angels and spirits, who will visit them from the higher spheres of Hades.

Many souls will thus resign themselves to the discipline they will receive, and they will gradually become purified, and promotion may be possible until the happy state of Paradise is attained.

I believe that, at the second Coming of Christ, the dead in Christ will rise first, and will be joined by the righteous who are on earth, and they will live and reign on earth with Him, for what is called a thousand years.

The unrighteous on earth will then die the first death, and will go through the discipline of Hades with those who were still unfit to rise and meet Christ at His Coming.

On the Last Day all will appear before the great white throne, and will be judged, and those who are still unrepentant—but of whom I hope there will be few—will be pronounced to be unfit for a place in the new kingdom of God, and they will be finally blotted out of existence.

Tripartite nature of man.

In conclusion I will now deal with the two questions of the Tripartite nature of Man, and the Natural or Conditional Immortality of the Soul.

Body, soul, spirit.

1. "The body (Greek, *sōma*), or sense-consciousness, is that which feels, eats, drinks, and rests."[1]

[1] "Immortality and Destiny," by Rev. R. P. Downes, LL.D., 1903, p. 19. (Smith's Publishing Company, Limited.)

2. "The soul" (Greek, *Psyche*), or self-consciousness, "is the life of man in its widest and most inclusive sense, embracing not only the animal, but also the intellectual and moral faculties, in so far as their exercise has not been depraved by the Fall."[1]

The body and the soul together are called the flesh (Greek, *sarx*).

3. "The spirit (Greek, *Pneuma*), or God-consciousness, is that which receives impressions of heavenly things, and communes with the unseen Deity."[2]

It may also be described as "that part of man which is made in the image of God. It is the conscience, or faculty of God-consciousness, which has been depraved by the Fall, and which is dormant, though not quite dead. The *pneuma* in the physical or natural man has some little sense of the law of God, but no real love for Himself, and therefore it drives man from God, instead of drawing him to God."[3]

"As God is spirit, so the spirit in man is that which, in an eminent and peculiar sense, comes from God. . . . The spirit in man is Divine, consubstantial with God, who is the Father of spirits, as our bodies of flesh are consubstantial with those of the parents of our flesh."[4]

"It is important to see where to draw the line when we say that man is fallen, and that the spirit is dead in trespasses and sins. The spirit is dead as to all higher exercises of faith, hope, and charity; but not so dead as to have lost all fear of God, all sense of dependence on Him, or all sense that His law is the supreme standard of right. Were man to lose this

[1] "The Tripartite Nature of Man," by Rev. J. B. Heard, 1866, p. 90. (T. and T. Clark.) Edition 1870.
[2] "Immortality and Destiny," by Rev. R. P. Downes, LL.D., 1903, p. 19. (Smith's Publishing Company, Limited.)
[3] "The Tripartite Nature of Man," by Rev. J. B. Heard, 1866, p. ix. (T. and T. Clark.)
[4] *Ibid.*, p. 103.

remains of the spirit which we call conscience, then he would have no sin. . . . So our Lord says to the Pharisees: 'If ye were blind, ye should have no sin: but now ye say, We see; therefore your sin remaineth.' Thus we identify conscience with the remains of the *pneuma* in fallen man."[1]

John ix. 41.

The *Pneuma*.

When God breathed into Adam's nostrils the breath of life, "he was given that which we call the *pneuma*, or spirit, the *conscientia*, or consciousness, common between him and God."[2] Adam was not created holy and immortal as well as innocent. "He was innocent because he had a well-balanced nature, in which the passions had not got the mastery over reason, as they now have."[3] He was "capable of becoming holy by not eating of the one tree in the garden, and so of attaining immortality by having the right to eat of the other tree."[4]

In Adam the "conscience was the knowledge of good as godly, and of evil as ungodly";[5] and the discipline "man was put under in Eden was not merely to choose the good, and refuse the evil, to make reason the sovereign and appetite the servant; it was also to *know* good and evil, to know that the essence of goodness consisted in obedience to God's rule as such; and that the root of sin is disobedience or self-will."[6]

1 John iii. 4.

'Sin is the transgression of the law.'

"This was the root of the tree of the knowledge of good and evil, the reason why God planted it in Paradise, and tried man by it, before he could have right to the tree of life."[7]

"The temptation of Satan lay in this, that he urged Adam not only to know the distinction of good and

[1] "The Tripartite Nature of Man," by Rev. J. B. Heard, 1866, pp. 158, 159. (T. and T. Clark.)
[2] *Ibid.*, p. 169.
[3] *Ibid.*, p. 173.
[4] *Ibid.*, p. 173.
[5] *Ibid.*, p. 170.
[6] *Ibid.*, pp. 171, 172.
[7] *Ibid.*, p. 172

evil. but to know it *as gods—i.e.*, in a god-like, not in a creaturely way."[1]

And Eve 'took of the fruit thereof, and did eat, and gave also unto her husband with her; and he did eat.' Gen. iii. 6.

'And the Lord God said, Behold, the man is become as one of us, to know good and evil: and now, lest he put forth his hand, and take also of the tree of life, and eat, and live for ever: Therefore the Lord God sent him forth from the garden of Eden.' Gen. iii. 22, 23.

At the same time, "God withdrew from Adam the presence of His Holy Spirit, and thus the *pneuma* fell back into a dim and depraved state of conscience toward God."[2]

Distinction between *psyche* and *pneuma*.

"The distinction between *psyche* and *pneuma* was caught by the Greek, but lost or neglected by the Latin fathers. The Latin language wanted the precision of the Greek, and *spiritus* and *anima* never acquired the same precision of meaning as *pneuma* and *psyche*. Irenæus, Justin Martyr, Clement of Alexandria, Origen, Didymus of Alexandria, Gregory of Nyssa, and Basil of Cæsarea all note the distinction of soul and spirit, and designate the spirit as that which bears the truest image of God. With the error of Apollinaris, who denied to Christ a human *pneuma*, the reaction came, and the trichotomy fell into disfavour, and was neglected even in the East. In the West it cannot be said to have ever received the attention it deserved. Tertullian opposed it from the first, and Augustine thought it safest to neglect it" (see Bishop Ellicott's "Destiny of the Creature," p. 117).[3]

Luther.

"Scripture, Luther says, divides man into three parts, and he quotes, 'and I pray God your whole spirit and soul and body be preserved blameless.'" 1 Thess. v. 23.

"*Each of these three parts*, together with the whole

[1] "The Tripartite Nature of Man," by Rev. J. B. Heard, 1866, p. 171. (T. and T. Clark.)
[2] *Ibid.*, p. 185.
[3] *Ibid.*, p. 4.

man, is also divided into two spheres, which we call spirit and flesh. Which division is one not of *nature, but of quality only—i.e.*, human nature has three parts (spirit, soul, and body), and these must each and all be good or bad "[1] (see the passage quoted at length in Delitzsch's " Psychologie," Appendix, p. 372, second Auflage).

Dr. T. Arnold, in 1829, said : " When this threefold division of our nature is mentioned, the term ' body ' expresses those appetites which we have in common with the brutes ; the term ' soul ' denotes our moral and intellectual faculties, directed only towards objects of the world, and not exalted by the hope of immortality ; and the term ' spirit ' takes these same faculties when directed towards God and heavenly things, and from the purity, the greatness, and the perfect goodness of Him who is their object, ' transformed into the same image from glory to glory, even as by the Spirit of the Lord.' "[2]

I have consulted several other authors, who agree about the tripartite nature of man, and Canon Luckock quoted : ' The Spirit itself beareth witness with our spirit, that we are the children of God.'

Rom. viii. 16

" As in the case of the doctrine of the Trinity, it was not fully understood until the Spirit was given, so the distinction between *psyche* (soul) and *pneuma* (spirit) is implied rather than taught (in the Old Testament) when the race was still in its spiritual infancy."[3]

Tripartite nature of man.

Jesus commenced, however, to teach this truth very early in His ministry.

During the first visit to Jerusalem, after His baptism, occurred the wonderful discourse with Nicodemus, during which Jesus said :

[1] " The Tripartite Nature of Man," by Rev. J. B. Heard, 1866, p. 75. (T. and T. Clark.)

[2] Sermons by Thomas Arnold, D.D., headmaster of Rugby School, 1829, vol. i., Sermon 26, on 1 Thess. v. 23. (Rivington.)

[3] " The Tripartite Nature of Man," by Rev. J. B. Heard, 1866, p. 39. (T. and T. Clark.)

'Verily, verily, I say unto thee, Except a man be born of water and *of* the Spirit, he cannot enter into the kingdom of God. John iii. 5, 6.

'That which is born of the flesh is flesh; and that which is born of the Spirit is spirit.'

Again, at the close of the sermon which He preached in the synagogue at Capernaum, He said to His disciples:

'It is the spirit that quickeneth; the flesh profiteth nothing: the words that I speak unto you, *they* are spirit, and *they* are life.' John vi. 63.

When He was sending forth the Twelve on their mission "to the lost sheep of the house of Israel," He said: Matt. x. 6.

'And fear not them which kill the body, but are not able to kill the soul: but rather fear Him which is able to destroy both soul and body in hell.'* Matt. x. 28. * R.V. Gehenna.

We see here the whole teaching of the Tripartite nature of man — Spirit, Soul, and Body, and we may conclude that Soul and Body constitute the Flesh.

Jesus referred again to the loss of the "Soul," or the "Life," after Simon Peter's declaration of his belief: See R.V. Matt. xvi. 16.

'Then said Jesus unto His disciples, If any *man* will come after Me, let him deny himself, and take up his cross, and follow Me. Matt. xvi. 24-26. Mark viii. 34-37.

'For whosoever will save his life shall lose it: and whosoever will lose his life for My sake shall find it.

'For what is a man profited, if he shall gain the whole world, and lose his own soul?† or what shall a man give in exchange for his soul?'† † R.V. life.

The last occasion on which Jesus mentioned the Spirit was when, as He was hanging on the cross, He said:

'Father, into Thy hands I commend *My spirit*.' Luke xxiii. 46.

I may note here that, when Stephen was stoned to death, not long afterwards, he cried out:

Acts vii. 59. 'Lord Jesus, receive *my spirit*.'

Mr. Heard, however, said that "those deeper views of the Spirit as the soul of the soul were not disclosed under a carnal dispensation, and while as yet the personal indwelling of the Holy Ghost had not been taught."[1]

It is clear that the Apostles afterwards fully comprehended the doctrine, and, although most of the following references are to the writings of St. Paul, we must understand that all the Apostles were of the same mind on this point.

Writing to the Romans, St. Paul said:

Rom. i. 9. 'For God is my witness, whom I serve with my *spirit* in the gospel of His Son, that without ceasing I make mention of you always in my prayers;'

And, then, he explained the doctrine clearly:

Rom. viii. 1-16. '*There is* therefore now no condemnation to them which are in Christ Jesus, who walk not after the flesh, but after the Spirit.

'For the law of the Spirit of life in Christ Jesus hath made me free from the law of sin and death.

'For what the law could not do, in that it was weak through the flesh, God sending His own Son in the likeness of sinful flesh, and for sin, condemned sin in the flesh:

'That the righteousness of the law might be fulfilled in us, who walk not after the flesh, but after the Spirit.

'For they that are after the flesh do mind the things of the flesh; but they that are after the Spirit the things of the Spirit.

'For to be carnally minded *is* death; but to be spiritually minded *is* life and peace.

'Because the carnal mind *is* enmity against God: for it is not subject to the law of God, neither indeed can be.

'So then they that are in the flesh cannot please God.

'But ye are not in the flesh, but in the Spirit, if so be that

---

[1] "The Tripartite Nature of Man," by Rev. J. B. Heard, 1866, p. 39. (T. and T. Clark.)

the Spirit of God dwell in you. Now if any man have not the Spirit of Christ, he is none of His.

'And if Christ *be* in you, the body *is* dead because of sin; but the Spirit *is* life because of righteousness.

'But if the Spirit of Him that raised up Jesus from the dead dwell in you, He that raised up Christ from the dead shall also quicken your mortal bodies by His Spirit that dwelleth in you.

'Therefore, brethren, we are debtors, not to the flesh, to live after the flesh.

'For if ye live after the flesh, ye shall die: but if ye through the Spirit do mortify the deeds of the body, ye shall live.

'For as many as are led by the Spirit of God, they are the sons of God.

'For ye have not received the spirit of bondage again to fear; but ye have received the Spirit of adoption, whereby we cry, Abba, Father.

'The Spirit itself beareth witness with our spirit, that we are the children of God.'

To the Corinthians, St. Paul explained the new doctrine very fully, and he intimated that in the Natural man the Spirit was unquickened, and he was therefore unable to discern spiritually:

'But as it is written, Eye hath not seen, nor ear heard, neither have entered into the heart of man, the things which God hath prepared for them that love Him. 1 Cor. ii. 9 16.

'But God hath revealed *them* unto us by His Spirit: for the Spirit searcheth all things, yea, the deep things of God.

'For what man knoweth the things of a man, save the spirit of man which is in him? even so the things of God knoweth no man, but the Spirit of God.

'Now we have received, not the spirit of the world, but the spirit which is of God; that we might know the things that are freely given to us of God.

'Which things also we speak, not in the words which man's wisdom teacheth, but which the Holy Ghost teacheth; comparing spiritual things with spiritual.

'But the natural man receiveth not the things of the Spirit of God: for they are foolishness unto him: neither can he know *them*, because they are spiritually discerned.

'But he that is spiritual judgeth all things, yet he himself is judged of no man.

'For who hath known the mind of the Lord, that he may instruct him? But we have the mind of Christ.'

He then explained that "the union betwixt Christ and each member of His Church is a spiritual one"[1]:

[1] Bishop Ellicott's "Commentary." (Cassell and Co.)

1 Cor. vi. 17-20.

'But he that is joined unto the Lord is one spirit.

'Flee fornication. Every sin that a man doeth is without the body; but he that committeth fornication sinneth against his own body.

'What? know ye not that your body is the temple of the Holy Ghost *which is* in you, which ye have of God, and ye are not your own?

'For ye are bought with a price: therefore glorify God in your body, and in your spirit, which are God's.'

And, lastly, after recapitulating the proofs of the resurrection of Jesus, he answered his own question of, "How are the dead raised up?" with the illustration of a grain "of wheat or of some other grain":

1 Cor. xv. 35-50.

'But some *man* will say, How are the dead raised up? and with what body do they come?

'*Thou* fool, that which thou sowest is not quickened, except it die:

'And that which thou sowest, thou sowest not that body that shall be, but bare grain, it may chance of wheat, or of some other *grain:*

'But God giveth it a body as it hath pleased Him, and to every seed his own body.

'All flesh *is* not the same flesh: but *there is* one *kind of* flesh of men, another flesh of beasts, another of fishes, *and* another of birds.

'*There are* also celestial bodies, and bodies terrestrial: but the glory of the celestial *is* one, and the *glory* of the terrestrial *is* another.

'*There is* one glory of the sun, and another glory of the moon, and another glory of the stars: for *one* star differeth from *another* star in glory.

'So also *is* the resurrection of the dead. It is sown in corruption; it is raised in incorruption:

'It is sown in dishonour; it is raised in glory: it is sown in weakness; it is raised in power:

'It is sown a natural body; it is raised a spiritual body. There is a natural body, and there is a spiritual body.

'And so it is written, The first man Adam was made a living soul; the last Adam *was made* a quickening spirit.

'Howbeit that *was* not first which is spiritual, but that which is natural; and afterward that which is spiritual.

'The first man *is* of the earth, earthy: the second man *is* the Lord from heaven.

'As *is* the earthy, such *are* they also that are earthy: and as *is* the heavenly, such *are* they also that are heavenly.

'And as we have borne the image of the earthy, we shall also bear the image of the heavenly.

'Now this I say, brethren, that flesh and blood cannot inherit the kingdom of God; neither doth corruption inherit incorruption.'

At the end of his first epistle to the Thessalonians, St. Paul prayed for their "whole spirit, and soul, and body":

'And the very God of peace sanctify you wholly; and *I pray God* your whole spirit and soul and body be preserved blameless unto the coming of our Lord Jesus Christ.' 1 Thess. v. 23.

The absolute distinction between "Spirit" and "Soul" was brought home to the Hebrews by St. Paul, in the following words of his Epistle to them:

'For the word of God *is* quick, and powerful, and sharper than any two-edged sword, piercing even to the dividing asunder of soul and spirit, and of the joints and marrow, and *is* a discerner of the thoughts and intents of the heart.' Heb. iv. 12.

And he afterwards referred to "the spirits of just men made perfect." Heb. xii. 23.

In the last verse of the epistle of James, we learn that the "soul" can die, as in Matthew we learnt that it can be destroyed: Jas. v. 20. Matt. x. 28.

'Let him know, that he which converteth the sinner from the error of his way shall save a soul from death, and shall hide a multitude of sins.' Jas. v. 20.

St. Peter wrote of Jesus preaching "unto the spirits in prison." 1 Pet. iii. 19.

In the epistle of Jude, we find a reference to the Natural man:

'These be they who separate* themselves, sensual, having not the Spirit.' Jude 19. * R.V. make separations.

It seems clear from the above that the Natural man consists of "Soul," and "Body," and an embryo, or dormant, "Spirit," and that this "Spirit" is quickened in the Spiritual man.

The "Soul" means all that part of man other than the "Spirit" and the "Body," and includes the Life, the Will, the Mind, and the Conscience, or, in Bishop Welldon's words, "the life, the sense, the affection, or appetite, and the reason."

The word "everlasting," or "eternal," is never attached to the "Soul," and we are clearly told that the "Soul" can be destroyed and can die.

Natural immortality of the soul.

I have not hitherto considered the question of the Natural Immortality of the Soul of man, because it is only those who deny that there will be a General Resurrection who also deny that Life continues, after the first Death, until the Resurrection Day.

The Orthodox doctrine, however, goes farther than this, and the teaching is that the Soul of man is by nature Immortal, and is therefore destined to live for ever and ever in weal or woe; and it is on this that the dogma of everlasting Punishment is founded.

It is impossible to show that the Old Testament anywhere assumes the natural immortality of the soul.

The word does not occur at all in the Old Testament,[1] but an expression, which is perhaps equivalent, was spoken by the Devil to Eve:

Gen. iii. 4. 'Ye shall not surely die.'

No one, however, would like to quote this saying of the Devil as the authority for his belief on this point.

The word "Immortal" occurs only once in the New Testament, and then it is used as an attribute of God!—

1 Tim. i. 17. * R.V. incorruptible. 'Now unto the King eternal, immortal,* invisible, the only wise God, be honour and glory for ever and ever. Amen.'

[1] "Here and Hereafter, or Man in Life and Death," by Rev. U. Smith, 1897, pp. 56, 57. (Review and Herald Publishing Company, Mich., U.S.A.)

"Search the Bible from beginning to end, and nowhere will you find sinners addressed as immortal beings who are endowed with eternal life."[1]

Nowhere is man "declared to be immortal apart from the quickening power of Him who only hath immortality to give."[2]

So far from the words "Immortal" and "Immortality" being applied in the Bible to man, "the terms are used to point out the contrast between God and man:

"'And changed the glory of the uncorruptible* God into an image made like to corruptible man.' — Rom. i. 23. * R.V. incorruptible.

God is uncorruptible, or immortal; man is corruptible or mortal. The word is used to distinguish between heavenly and eternal objects, and those that are earthly and decaying."[3]

Immortality is placed before us as an object of hope for which we are to seek.

The doctrine of the Natural Immortality of the Soul was first propagated among the Egyptians; in later years it was adopted by a school of Grecian Philosophers, Socrates, Plato, etc.[4] Origin of the doctrine.

After the Advent of Jesus, the idea that mankind was dependent for eternal life on a Jewish peasant, who claimed to be "God manifest in the flesh," was most repugnant to all thinking men, as was seen when Jesus proclaimed the doctrine in the synagogue at Capernaum, with the effect that "many of His disciples went back, and walked no more with Him," John vi. 26-56.

[1] "Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. T. Davis, 1866. (Longmans.)

[2] "Conditional Immortality," by Rev. W. R. Huntington, 1878. (E. P. Dutton and Co., New York.)

[3] "Here and Hereafter, or Man in Life and Death," by Rev. U. Smith, 1897, pp. 56, 57. (Review and Herald Publishing Company, U.S.A.)

[4] "The Faith or Heresy, Which is it? An Examination of Conditional Immortality," by W. Tupman, 1899, p. 4. (Digby, Long.)

saying, "This is an hard saying; who can hear it?"[1]

When Christianity began to spread, the Jewish and Grecian converts insisted on retaining their old ideas on this subject when they entered the Christian Church.[2]

"Men like Luther, Tyndale, and others fought hard against it, but the tide was too strong for them, until at last this 'tradition of men' has become part of the established faith of Christendom, undermining the great and grand truths of the Gospel."[3]

Even up to the present day, the majority of Christian scholars and thinkers refuse to believe the clear teaching of Jesus that Immortality is the *Gift* of God, to men in Christ, and that it is *not* the common possession of all men.

Argument from Scripture.

It is universally admitted, however, that the Natural Immortality of the Soul cannot be proved independently of Revelation, and the supporters of this, the Orthodox doctrine, used to point to the account of the Creation, as proof of their claim:

Gen. i. 27. 'So God created man in His own image.'

Gen. ii. 7. 'And the Lord God formed man of the dust of the ground, and breathed into his nostrils the *breath of life;* and man became a *living soul.*'

The Rev. H. H. Dobney,[4] in 1844, and other writers since, have pointed out that there is no good reason for asserting that man bears the image of God in respect of *Immortality*. There are other attributes of God, such as Omnipotence, Omniscience, and Infallibility, and these might with equal justice be claimed for man, but no one has ever ventured to do so.

[1] "Life in Christ," by Rev. Edward White, 1846, pp. 78, 79. (Elliot Stock.)

[2] *Ibid.*

[3] "The Faith or Heresy, Which is it? An Examination of Conditional Immortality," by W. Tupman, 1899, p. 4. (Digby, Long.)

[4] "Lectures on Future Punishment," by Rev. H. H. Dobney, 1844. (T. Ward and Co.)

With regard to the *Soul*, Cruden says in his "Concordance" that "The Scripture ascribes to beasts a soul," and it is certain that the "*breath of life*" was in all animals; and the word "*soul*" is applied to all the lower order of animals.

Gen. vii. 15, 21, 22.
Gen. i. 20, 21, 24, 30.

The above arguments would seem to have proved conclusive, because later writers have generally abandoned the attempt to prove the Natural Immortality of the Soul of man from the account of the creation, and they have argued only from reason.

I believe the following summary contains all the arguments from reason brought forward in the books I have studied. Before, however, commencing the enumeration, I must point out that many of the arguments are based on the false assumption that immortality is denied to the righteous as well as to the persistently wicked; and that a resurrection of the just and unjust is disputed.

Arguments from reason.

The truth is that the doctrine of Conditional Immortality teaches that all men are raised for the purpose of retribution and reward, and the "spiritual" man *then* enters upon life immortal, but sentence of death—the second death—is passed upon "natural" men—"not temporal and bodily death only, but eternal death, that is, death from which there will be no recovery, and of the whole man," soul and body.[1]

Arguments from Reason.

1. "Upon the Principles of all true Philosophy, the Souls of Men are (under God) naturally immortal."[2] Rev. M. Horbery, in 1744.

2. "The intellectual endowments of man, together with his inherent capacity for almost boundless Rev. R. P. Downes, in 1875.

[1] "Harmony of Scripture on Future Punishment," by Rev. S. Minton, 1872, pp. 9, 10. (Elliot Stock.)

[2] "An Inquiry into the Scripture Doctrine Concerning the Duration of Future Punishment," by Rev. M. Horbery, D.D., 1744, pp. 9, 10. (Wesleyan Conference Office.)

progress, afford strong probability of his immortality."[1]

3. "Reason asserts the immateriality of the thinking principle, and the possibility of its existence when released from its earthly environment."[1]

4. "Reason demonstrates that as far as our knowledge goes, nothing in the universe is annihilated, not even an atom of unconscious matter—why then should we suppose that the self-conscious, immaterial, and indivisible soul of man is annihilated?"[1]

5. "Reason recognizes in the moral consciousness of man a prediction of immortality."[1]

6. "Reason affirms the more than probable immortality of a creature capable of God."[1]

7. "It seems to be demanded by the bewildering inequalities of human life."[1]

8. "The unfinished justice apparent in our world asserts the necessity for man's immortality."[1]

9. "God the Creator has endowed man with an instinct for immortality which He will not mock."[1]

10. "God has constituted our earthly life an education, and as He is wise and just, this education must involve a destiny."[1]

11. "God cherishes in man aspirations, finding their end in immortality."[1]

12. "God has accepted from the noblest men a trust based on immortality, which He will not betray."[1]

Dr. W. B. Pope, in 1875.

13. "First, because nothing is said to the contrary when the separation of soul and body is spoken of; and, secondly, because death is said to be in its widest meaning done away in Christ."[2]

Rev. F. J. B. Hooper, in 1877.

14. "The doctrine was so generally and so confidently held by those among whom Christ and His

[1] "Man's Immortality Argued from Reason," by Rev. R. P. Downes, LL.D., 1875, pp. 2-15. (Smith's Publishing Company.)

[2] "A Compendium of Christian Theology," by Rev. W. B. Pope, D.D., 1875, p. 372 (second edition 1881). (Wesleyan Conference Office.)

Apostles moved, and taught, that no occasion arose, and no opportunity was given, for a direct and explicit affirmation of it."[1]

15. "The belief of mankind that a soul or ghost survives the body has been so nearly universal as to appear like the spontaneous result of an instinct."[2] — W. R. Alger, in 1878.

16. "The faith of the Old Testament is a faith in a living God, and therefore a faith in everlasting life."[3] — Dr. Stewart D. F. Salmond, in 1895.

17. "An argument for immortality is based on the affections."[4] — Rev. Isaac Hartill, in 1896.

18. "Jesus believed it, and taught it, and lived it."[5] — Bishop Welldon, in 1898.

19. "The utility of the doctrine."[6] — Rev. J. H. Pettingell, in 1898.

20. "The sons of God must be immortal, for His own sons God cannot slay."[7] — Rev. R. P. Downes, in 1903.

The above arguments are all quoted from the writings of Divines, and I have read numerous other books in which the same arguments are used.

21. John Stuart Mill (1806-1873) wrote :—

"The common arguments are :

"1. The goodness of God.

"2. The improbability that He would ordain the annihilation of His noblest and richest work, after the greatest part of its few years of life had been spent in the acquisition of faculties which time is not allowed him to turn to fruit.

[1] "Endless Sufferings the Doctrine of Scripture," by Rev. F. J. B. Hooper, 1877, p. 52. (Elliot Stock.)

[2] "Critical History of the Doctrine of a Future Life," by W. R. Alger, 1878, p. 583. (George W. Childs, U.S.A.)

[3] "Christian Doctrine of Immortality," by Rev. S. D. F. Salmond, D.D., 1895, p. 293. (T. and T. Clark, Edinburgh.)

[4] "Immortality," by Rev. Isaac Hartill, 1896, p. 75. (Alexander and Shepheard, London.)

[5] "The Hope of Immortality," by Bishop J. E. C. Welldon, 1898, p. 283. (Seeley and Co., London.)

[6] "The Unspeakable Gift," by Rev. J. H. Pettingell, 1898, p. 90. (Digby, Long and Co.)

[7] "Man's Immortality and Destiny," by Rev. R. P. Downes, LL.D., 1903, p. 21. (Wesleyan Conference Office.)

"3. And the special improbability that He would have implanted in us an instinctive desire for eternal life and doomed that desire to complete disappointment."[1]

My reply to many of the eleven arguments put forward by the Rev. R. P. Downes, in 1875, is that, while it is admitted believers will attain Immortality, it is claimed that the utterly depraved and persistently wicked probably have no moral consciousness, and no instinct, or aspiration, for Immortality; neither can they be called "creatures capable of God," or noble men from whom God has accepted a trust based on Immortality.

The Rev. H. H. Dobney, in 1844, wrote: "The desire for Immortality (even if the fact be admitted) can no more prove that it is the necessary portion of every individual than the desire for happiness proves that it also is the inalienable portion of everyone."[2]

To the Rev. F. J. B. Hooper I would point out that Jesus *made the opportunity* to speak the parable of the Rich Man and Lazarus, in which He affirmed the doctrine of the life in Hades, which was already as generally and confidently held as Plato's belief in the Immortality of the Soul.

It is a sufficient answer to the argument of the Rev. Stewart D. F. Salmond to quote the celebrated Jew Maimonides:

"This is the penalty which awaits the unjust;—that they shall not attain that (eternal) life, but shall be utterly destroyed."[3]

The common argument, quoted ironically by the Rev. J. H. Pettingell, seems to be that the Soul must

[1] Quoted in "The Problem of Immortality," by Rev. E. Pétavel, D.D., translated by F. A. Freer, 1892, p. 58. (Elliot Stock.)

[2] "Lectures on Future Punishment," by Rev. H. H. Dobney, 1844. (T. Ward and Co.)

[3] "The Fate of the Dead," by Thomas Clarke, M.D., 1889. (F. Norgate.)

be Immortal because it is useful to be able to tell sinners that, as the Soul cannot die, the punishment in store for them must last for ever.

As regards John Stuart Mill, I think it is a question whether persistent sinners can be called the "noblest and richest work of God."

After careful consideration of all the arguments in support of the Orthodox view, I have come to the conclusion that Immortality is Conditional, and is not common to all men.

Immortality *not* natural, but conditional.

The Rev. W. R. Tomlinson wrote, in 1888: "That the Soul is *mortal* by nature is practically laid down early in the Book of Genesis."[1]

'And the Lord God said, Behold, the man is become as one of us, to know good and evil: and now, lest he put forth his hand, and take also of the tree of life, and eat, and live for ever: Therefore the Lord God sent him forth from the garden of Eden.' Gen. iii. 22.

The following passages also support this opinion:

'Nevertheless man being in honour abideth not:* he is like the beasts that perish.' Ps. xlix. 12. * R.V. abideth not in honour.

'The soul that sinneth, it shall die.' Ezek. xviii. 20.

'And fear not them which kill the body, but are not able to kill the soul: but rather fear Him which is able to destroy both soul and body in hell.'† Matt. x. 28. Luke xii. 4. † R.V. Gehenna.

'There is one lawgiver, who is able to save and to destroy: who art thou that judgest another?' Jas. iv 12.

'For what is a man profited if he shall gain the whole world and lose his own soul?‡ or what shall a man give in exchange for his soul?'‡ Matt. xvi. 26. Mark viii. 37. ‡ R.V. life.

'For if ye live after the flesh, ye shall die: but if ye through the Spirit do mortify the deeds of the body, ye shall live.' Rom. viii. 13.

'Let him know, that he which converteth the sinner from the error of his way shall save a soul from death, and shall hide a multitude of sins.' Jas. v. 20.

I have already pointed out, more than once, that there are about one hundred different terms used in the New Testament as types of the final punishment

The "second" death.

[1] "Thoughts on Everlasting Death," by Rev. W. R. Tomlinson, 1888, p. 36. (Digby, Long.)

of persistent sinners, and the clear meaning of these terms is that the "Soul" or "Life," and the Body, which appear before the "great white throne," will, in some terrible way, cease to exist.

I know that it has been held that many of these terms bear a different meaning in Scripture to what they bore in the ordinary literature of the day, but I have found nothing to support this dictum.

The following are a few of the terms referred to:

1. Hewn down like a tree and cast into the fire.
2. Burnt up as chaff, as tares, as withered branches, in unquenchable fire.
3. Cast into a furnace of fire, or into everlasting or eternal fire, or into the fire prepared for the devil and his angels.
4. Cast into the lake of fire.
5. Cast out into outer darkness.
6. Cast into sea like bad fish.
7. Be destroyed.
8. Be destroyed body and soul.
9. Be miserably destroyed.
10. Be consumed.
11. Be lost.
12. Be drowned in destruction and perdition.
13. Be ground to powder.
14. Be rooted up like a plant.
15. Be cut off.
16. Be cut down like a fig-tree.
17. Be cut asunder.
18. Be a castaway.
19. Perish.
20. Die the second Death.

I foresee one difficulty in connection with the doctrine of Conditional Immortality, and the extinction of the unrepentant sinner at the Judgment on the Last Day which I have not seen mentioned by its critics, or explained by its supporters.

I have shown that the Natural man on earth

consists of a dormant or embryo Spirit, a Soul, and Body; and, at the Resurrection, he will consist of a still dormant or embryo Spirit, in its Spirit body, and a Soul.

It cannot be supposed that the Spirit, which emanates from God, can be annihilated, and I think the explanation must be that this dormant or embryo Spirit in unrepentant sinners—of whom I imagine there will not be many—will be reabsorbed into the Deity, to utilize the expression which is often wrongly employed when trying to explain what Nirvana means to a Buddhist.

This appears to be the actual teaching of Scripture, because we read :

' Then shall the dust return to the earth as it was : and the spirit shall return unto God who gave it.' Eccles. xii. 7.

Everlasting punishment.

The doctrines of Everlasting Punishment and the Natural Immortality of the Soul are closely connected, because the former would never have come into existence but for the fact, which I have just dealt with, that the terms which, in ordinary language, clearly imply total destruction, have been held to have in Scripture a meaning which is just the reverse.

The Spirit-Body.

The Duke of Argyll[1] said : " The Christian doctrine of the resurrection of the body sanctions and involves the notion that there is some deep connexion between spirit and form which is essential, and which cannot be finally sundered even in the divorce of death."

The Rev. R. H. Brenan,[2] in 1887, referred to ' the risen Lord, in whose image His people hope to spring from death.' Luke xxiv. 39.

[1] " The Reign of Law," by the Duke of Argyll, 1866, p. 286. (Straham and Company.) Edition 1871.

[2] " Surpassing Fables ; or, Glimpses of our Future Home," by Rev. R. H. Brenan, 1877, pp. 4, 5. (James Nisbet.)

Canon Luckock,[1] in 1890, held that "there are spirit-forms, and that the soul, when it has left the body, still retains some incorporeal shape or figure."

The Rev. E. H. Palmer,[2] in 1900, thought that at death the spirit finds itself "clothed in an intermediate body adjusted to the conditions of Paradise," and that this body in all essential features is like the body which it had upon earth, and is therefore capable of recognition.

The Rev. A. Chambers,[3] in 1900, taught that man, in his essence, even while on earth, is a spirit, and "this spirit is enclosed in its own spirit-body, from which it is never dissevered. The spirit-body possesses shape as well as faculties of sight, hearing, and speech, and probably other faculties."

1 Cor. xv. 40, 44. He referred also to St. Paul's mention of "celestial bodies" as well as "bodies terrestrial," and a "spiritual body" as distinct from a "natural body."

It is very interesting to notice that Irenæus, whose teaching on the point is given at length in the fourth chapter, taught, in the second century of our era, that spirits after death preserve the same form as the bodies they have quitted, "so that they may be recognized."

Angels and men also—after death—possess spirit-bodies, with bodily shape and organization. In most of the following passages the spiritual beings *spoke* to the human beings who saw them.[4]

Old Testament.

Gen. xvi. 7-12. 1. 'And the angel of the Lord found her (Hagar) by a fountain of water,' and spoke to her.

Gen. xvii. 1-22. 2. 'The Lord appeared to Abram,' and spoke to him.

[1] "The Intermediate State," by Canon H. M. Luckock, 1890, p. 119. (Longmans.)

[2] In "White Robes," by Rev. E. H. Palmer, 1900, pp. 58, 59. (Skeffington.)

[3] "Man and the Spiritual World," by Rev. A. Chambers, 1900, pp. 92-95 and 114, 272. (Charles Taylor.)

[4] *Ibid.*, pp. 135-147.

3. 'And the Lord appeared unto him (Abraham) in the plains of Mamre,' and spoke to him. Gen. xviii. 1-33.

4. 'Angels of God met' Jacob, and he *saw* them. Gen. xxxii. 1, 2.

5. Jacob wrestled with One, of whom he said, 'I have *seen* God face to face.' Gen. xxxii. 24-30.

6. 'And the angel of the Lord appeared unto him (Moses) in a flame of fire,' and spoke to him. Exod. iii. 2.

7. Balaam '*saw* the angel of the Lord standing in the way,' and the angel spoke to him. Num. xxii. 31.

8. Joshua *saw* One who described Himself as 'Captain of the host of the Lord.' Josh. v. 13, 14.

9. 'And the angel of the Lord appeared unto him' (Gideon) in Ophrah, and spoke to him. Judg. vi. 12-18.

10. The angel of the Lord appeared unto Manoah and his wife, and spoke to them. Judg. xiii. 3-22.

11. Samuel was *seen*, after his death, by both Saul and the woman, in the cave at En-dor. 1 Sam. xxviii. 12-20.

12. David and Ornan both *saw* 'the angel that smote the people.' 2 Sam. xxiv. 17. 1 Chron. xxi 20.

13. 'And the Lord appeared to Solomon by night,' and spoke to him. 2 Chron. vii. 12.

14. Nebuchadnezzar *saw* One, whose 'form' was 'like the Son of God, walking in the midst of the fire.' Dan. iii. 25.

15. Daniel saw an angel in the den of lions. Dan. vi. 22.

16. Zechariah saw and talked with an angel of the Lord on several occasions. Zech.

New Testament.

1. 'And there *appeared* unto him (Zacharias) an angel of the Lord.' Luke i. 11.

2. 'The angel Gabriel . . . *came in* unto her (the Mother of Jesus). Luke i. 28.

3. 'The angel of the Lord *came upon*' the shepherds of Bethlehem. Luke ii. 9.

4. 'Suddenly *there was* with the angel a multitude of the heavenly host.' Luke ii. 13.

Matt. xvii. 3. Mark ix. 4. Luke ix. 30, 31. 5. Moses and Elijah *appeared* to the three Apostles at the Transfiguration.

Luke xxii. 43. 6. 'And there *appeared* an angel unto Him (Jesus) from heaven, strengthening Him.'

Matt. xxviii. 2, 4. 7. 'The angel of the Lord descended from heaven, . . . and for fear of him the keepers did shake, and became as dead men.'

Mark xvi. 5. 8. 'And entering into the sepulchre, they (the women) *saw* a young man.'

Matt. xxvii. 52, 53. 9. 'And many bodies of the saints which slept arose . . . and *appeared* unto many.'

Acts i. 10. 10. 'Two men,' evidently spiritual beings, '*stood by*' the disciples on Mount Olivet.

Acts v. 19. 11. 'But the angel of the Lord by night opened the prison doors, and brought them forth,' and he spoke to them.

Acts vii. 55. 12. Stephen 'looked up stedfastly into heaven, and *saw* the glory of God, and Jesus standing on the right hand of God.'

Acts viii. 26. 13. 'And the angel of the Lord *spake* unto Philip.'

Acts x. 3. 14. Cornelius *saw* 'an angel of God coming in to him.'

Acts xii. 7. 15. 'The angel of the Lord *came upon*' Peter in the prison, and spoke to him.

Acts xxvii. 23. 16. 'The angel of God' 'stood by' Paul on board a ship.

17–29. The thirteen appearances of Jesus after His crucifixion :

Mark xvi. 9-11. John xx. 11-18. (1) To Mary Magdalene.

Matt. xxviii. 9, 10. (2) To the other women who had taken spices to the tomb.

Luke xxiv. 34. 1 Cor. xv. 5. (3) To Peter : 'The Lord is risen indeed, and hath appeared to Simon.'

Mark xvi. 12-13. Luke xxiv. 13-35. (4) To two of the Apostles going to Emmaus.

(5) To all the Apostles, except Thomas. — Mark xvi. 14-18. Luke xxiv. 36-49. John xx. 19 23.

(6) To all the Apostles, including Thomas. — John xx. 24-29. 1 Cor. xv. 5.

(7) To seven of the Apostles, by the Sea of Galilee. — John xxi. 1-25.

(8) To 'the eleven disciples,' on a mountain in Galilee. — Matt. xxviii. 16-20.

(9) To above five hundred brethren. — 1 Cor. xv. 6.

(10) To the Apostle James. — 1 Cor. xv. 7.

(11) To the Apostles at Bethany, near Jerusalem. — Mark xvi. 19-20. Luke xxiv. 50-53. Acts i. 3-9.

(12) To St. Paul. — 1 Cor. ix. 1. 1 Cor. xv. 8-23. Acts ix. 1-30 Acts xxii. 1-21. Acts xxvi. 2-23.

(13) To St. John, in Patmos. — Rev. i. 13. 17, 18.

During the last century it is certain that there have been many well-authenticated cases of a spirit appearing to one or more human beings immediately after it has left its body, and in all these cases the spirit has been recognized by the resemblance to its late body.

APPENDIX

AUTHORS QUOTED: THE TITLES OF THEIR WORKS AND DATES OF THEIR PUBLICATION, WITH THE PUBLISHERS' NAMES.

AUTHORS QUOTED: THE TITLES OF THEIR WORKS AND DATES OF THEIR PUBLICATIONS, WITH THE PUBLISHERS' NAMES

AUTHOR.	YEAR.	TITLE.	PUBLISHER.
1.—Aked, C. F., Rev. ..	1892	Eternal Punishment	James Clarke and Co.
2.—Alger, W. R.	1878	Critical History of the Doctrine of a Future Life	Geo. W. Childs, Philadelphia.
3.—Antipas, F. D.	1885	Where are the Dead ?	J. Martin and Co.
4.—Argyll, Duke of.. ..	1866	The Reign of Law (People's edition, 1871)	Straham and Co.
5.—Arnold, Thomas, Rev., D.D.	1829	Sermons, Vol. I., Ser. 26	Rivington.
6.—Barrett, G. S., Rev., D.D.	1896	The Intermediate State and the Last Things	Elliot Stock.
7.—Bartle, G. W., Rev., D.D.	1869	The Scriptural Doctrine of Hades	Longmans, Green and Co.
8.—Beet, J. A., Rev., D.D.	1898	The Last Things	Hodder and Stoughton.
9.—Bickersteth, E., Rev. ..	1838	Christian Fathers of the First and Second Centuries—Justin Martyr	Seeley and Burnside.
10.—Binns, W., Rev. ..	1894	The Life to Come	Philip Green.
11.—Blunt, J. H., Rev. ..	1870	Theological Dictionary—" Purgatory "	Longmans, Green and Co.
12.—Body, G., Canon ..	1896	The Work of Grace in Paradise	Gardner, Darton.

AUTHORS QUOTED—*Continued*

AUTHOR.	YEAR.	TITLE.	PUBLISHER.
13.—Bosworth, Joseph, Rev.	1888	Anglo-Saxon and English Dictionary	Reeves and Turner.
14.—Brenan, R. H., Rev. ..	1887	Surpassing Fables, or Glimpses of Our Future Home	James Nisbet and Co.
15.—Brewer-Cobham, E., Rev., LL.D.	1894	Dictionary of Phrase and Fable	Cassell, Petter and Galpin.
16.—Bush, J., Rev.	1896	The Intermediate State	Methodist Publishing House.
17.—Canty, M.	1886	Purgatory	M. H. Gill and Son, Dublin.
18.—Carlisle, T. H., Rev. ..	1896	The Four Last Things	Elliot Stock.
19.—Putnam, F. W. ..	1890	*Century Magazine*, April, "The Serpent Mound of Ohio"	
20.—Chambers, A., Rev.	1894	1. Our Life after Death	Charles Taylor.
	1903	2. A revised edition of the above	
	1900	3. Man and the Spiritual World	
21.—Clarke, Thos., M.D. ..	1889	The Fate of the Dead	F. Norgate.
22.—Constable, H., Rev. ..	1878	Hades	Elliot Stock.
23.—Nichols and Co. ..	1889	The Unknown Country	C. A. Nichols and Co., Springfield, Mass.
24.—Cox, Samuel, Rev. ..	1877	Salvator Mundi	Kegan Paul.

AUTHOR.	YEAR.	TITLE.	PUBLISHER.
25.—Darwin, Charles ..	1871	Descent of Man	John Murray.
26.—Davidson, S., Rev., D.D.	1882	Doctrine of Last Things	Kegan Paul.
27.—Davis, T., Rev... ..	1866	Endless Suffering not the Doctrine of Scripture. (Edition of 1867)	Longmans, Green and Co.
28.—Dobney, H. H., Rev. ..	1844	Lectures on Future Punishment	T. Ward and Co.
29.—Dorner, J. A.	1883	The Future State. Introduction by Rev. Newman Smyth	Ch. Scribner's Sons, New York.
30.—Downes, R. P., Rev., LL.D.	1875	1. Man's Immortality argued from Reason	Smith's Publishing Company.
	1903	2. Man's Immortality and Destiny	
31.—Driver, S. R., Canon, B.D.	1904	Commentary on the Book of Genesis	Methuen.
32.—Edkins, Joseph, B.A. ..	1871	China's Place in Philology	Trübner.
33.—Ellicott, C. J., Bishop ..	1905	A Bible Commentary for English Readers	Cassell and Co.
34.—Emerson, G. H., Rev., 35. D.D.	1883	The Doctrine of Probation Examined	Universalist Publishing House, Boston, Mass.
		Encyclopædia Britannica, vols. ii., xi., and xx., "The Protestant Reformation," "The Schism in the Twelfth Century"	The *Times*.

AUTHORS QUOTED—*Continued*

AUTHOR.	YEAR.	TITLE.	PUBLISHER.
36.—Bruno, J. Faá di, Very Rev., D.D.	1884	Catholic Belief	Burns and Oates, Ltd.
37.—Farrar, F. W., Canon, D.D.	1878	1. Eternal Hope	Macmillan.
	1881	2. Mercy and Judgment	,,
	1899	3. Texts Explained	Longmans, Green and Co.
38.—Fergusson, J., D.C.L. ..	1873	Tree and Serpent Worship	India Office.
39.—Fetherston, W.	1890	Future Divine Punishment	Hodges, Figgis and Co., Dublin.
40.—Forbes, A. P., Bishop ..	1867	Explanation of the XXXIX. Articles (Article 22)	James Parker and Co.
41.—Forlong, J. G. R., Major-General	1883	Rivers of Life	B. Quaritch.
42.—The most eminent American scholars	1878	The Future Life	R. C. Dickinson, London.
43.—Glazebrook, M. G., Rev., late Headmaster of Clifton College		Lessons from the Old Testament, Senior Course.	
44.—Gordon-Cumming, Miss	1872	*Good Words*, March, "Loch Nell Serpent."	
45.—Griffith, W., Rev. ..	1882	Future Punishment	Elliot Stock.

AUTHOR.	YEAR.	TITLE.	PUBLISHER.
46.—Haley, J. W.	1881	Supplicium Æternum	Draper, Andover, U.S.A.
47.—Harold Browne, E., Bishop	1882	Exposition of the XXXIX. Articles (Article 3)	Longmans, Green and Co.
48.—Hartill, Isaac, Rev. ..	1896	Immortality	Alexander Shepheard.
49.—Hastings, J., Rev. ..	1899	Dictionary of the Bible (see No. 95, *post*)	T. and T. Clark, Edinburgh.
50.—Heard, J. B., Rev. ..	1866	The Tripartite Nature of Man. (Edition of 1870)	T. and T. Clark, Edinburgh.
51.—Hemphill, S., Rev., D.D.	1904	Immortality in Christ	Simpkin, Marshall.
52.—Hobart, J. H., Bishop, D.D.	1857	The State of the Departed	New York.
53.—	1563	Second Book of Homilies.	
54.—Hooper, F. J. B., Rev...	1877	Endless Suffering the Doctrine of Scripture	Elliot Stock.
55.—Horbery, M., Rev., D.D.	1744	An Inquiry into the Scripture Doctrine concerning the Duration of Future Punishment. (Reprinted)	Wesleyan Conference Office.
56.—Hunt, G. W., Rev. ..	1900	Salvation beyond Death	A. R. Mowbray and Co.
57.—Huntingdon, W. R., Rev., D.D.	1878	Conditional Immortality	E. P. Dutton and Co., New York.

AUTHORS QUOTED—*Continued*

AUTHOR.	YEAR.	TITLE.	PUBLISHER.
58.—Hutton, R. E., Rev. ..	1898	1. The Soul Here and Hereafter	Longmans, Green and Co.
	1901	2. The Soul in the Unseen World	Rivingtons.
59.—Ince, W., Canon, D.D...	1895	The Future Life. The Intermediate State	J. Parker and Co., Oxford.
60.—Joly, N.	1883	Man before Metals	Kegan Paul, Trench and Co.
61.—Jukes, Andrew, Rev. ..	1869	Restitution of all Things	Longmans, Green and Co.
62.—Kuenen, Dr.	1873	Religion of Israel (translated from the Dutch by A. H. May) (see No. 103, *post*)	Theological Translation Fund.
63.—Anonymous	1875	Life in the Invisible	Elliot Stock.
64.—Lindisfarne	1854-1865	Lindisfarne and Rushforth Gospels, in Latin and Saxon	Surtees Society of Durham, 1854-1865.
65.—Luckock, H. M., Canon, D.D. (Dean of Lichfield)	1879	1. After Death	Longmans, Green and Co.
	1890	2. The Intermediate State	
66.—Lyell, C., Sir	1863	Antiquity of Man	John Murray.
67.—Lyttelton, W. H., Canon, the Hon.	1893	The Life of Man after Death	Wells Gardner.

AUTHOR.	YEAR.	TITLE.	PUBLISHER.
68.—MacColl, M., Canon ..	1894	1. Life Here and Hereafter	Longmans, Green and Co.
	1896	2. Second edition, new Preface	
	1899	3. The Reformation Settlement	
69.—MacKim, R. H., Rev., D.D.	1883	Future Punishment	Thos. Whittaker, New York.
70.—McCausland, D., Q.C., LL.D.	1872	Adam and the Adamite	Macmillan.
71.—Milton	1667	Paradise Lost	John Kendrick, 1859.
72.—Minton, S., Rev. ..	1872	Harmony of Scripture on Future Punishment	Elliot Stock.
73.—Morison, James, Rev., D.D.		Commentary on the New Testament.	
74.—Murray, J. A. H. ..	1905	New English Dictionary	Clarendon Press, Oxford.
75.—	1895	*National Review*, September, Darwin's Letter to G. Bentham, dated May 22, 1863	
76.—Newman Smyth, Rev...	1881	The Orthodox Theology of To-day	Ward, Lock and Co.
77.—Oxenham, F. N., Rev., D.D.	1881	Everlasting Punishment	Longmans, Green and Co.
78.—Palmer, E. H., Rev. ..	1900	In White Robes	Skeffington.

AUTHORS QUOTED—*Continued*

AUTHOR.	YEAR.	TITLE.	PUBLISHER.
79.—Parry-Webley, E. ..	1879	Anglican Church History	Griffith, Farran and Co.
80.—Passmore, T. H., Rev...	1900	Things beyond the Tomb in a Catholic Light	Longmans, Green and Co.
81.—Peschel, O. F.	1876	The Races of Man	Beccles.
82.—Pétavel, E. Rev. ..	1892	Immortality (translated by F. A. Freer)	Elliot Stock.
83.—Pettingell, J. H., Rev...	1898	The Unspeakable Gift	Digby, Long and Co.
84.—Plumptre, E. H., Dean, D.D.	1884	The Spirits in Prison. (Edition of 1885)	Wm. Isbister.
85.—Pope, W. B., Rev., D.D.	1875	A Compendium of Christian Theology (second edition, 1881)	Wesleyan Conference Office.
86.—Porte, J. R., Rev., D.D.	1904	Whither ; or the Condition of the Soul after Death	Sampson, Low and Co.
87.—Prescott, W. H. ..	1874	Conquest of Mexico	G. Routledge and Sons.
88.—Pusey, E. B., Rev., D.D.	1880	Everlasting Punishment	James Parker and Co.
89.—Putnam, F. W.	1890	*Century Magazine*, April	
90.—Randles, M., Rev., D.D.	1904	After Death	Ch. H. Kelly.
91.—Rede, W., Rev... ..	1893	Communion of Saints	Longmans, Green and Co.
92.—Roberts, Alexander, Rev., D.D.	1868	Ante-Nicene Christian Library: Irenæus, Lactantius, Tertullian	T. and T. Clark, Edinburgh.

AUTHOR.	YEAR.	TITLE.	PUBLISHER.
93.—Row, C. A., Rev. ..	1889	Future Retribution	Wm. Isbister.
94.—Ryle, J. C., Bishop, D.D.	1883	Thoughts on Immortality	C. J. Thynne.
95.—Salmond, S. D. F., Rev., D.D.	1895 1899	1. Christian Doctrine of Immortality 2. Article on "Heaven" in Hastings' (49) Dictionary of the Bible	T. and T. Clark, Edinburgh.
96.—Sanday, W., Rev., D.D., LL.D.	1899	Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers: St. Hilary	James Parker, Oxford.
97.—Sanderson, R. E., Rev., D.D.	1896	Life of the Waiting Soul	Wells Gardner, Darton and Co.
98.—Savage, W. R., Rev. ..	1881	Souls of the Righteous	Chapman and Hall.
99.—Seymour, A. J.	1893	Glimpses of the Far-off Land (with Introduction by Rev. W. H. Hutchings)	Skeffington.
100.—Smith, U., Rev. ..	1897	Here and Hereafter, or Man in Life and Death	Review and Herald Publishing Association, Washington, U.S.A.
101.—Solly, H. S.	1893	Punishment for Sin: is it Eternal?	Philip Green.
102.—St. Augustine		The Enchiridion of Augustine to Laurentius	T. and T. Clark, Edinburgh.

AUTHORS QUOTED—*Continued*

AUTHOR.	YEAR.	TITLE.	PUBLISHER.
103.—Stebbins, R. P., Rev., D.D.	1881	A Study of the Pentateuch. Introductory on Dr. Kuenen's (62) Religion of Israel	Geo. H. Ellis, Boston, U.S.A.
104.—Taylor, John, of Norwich, Rev., D.D.	1754	Hebrew Concordance after Buxtorf	J. Waugh and W. Fenner.
105.—Tomlinson, W. R., Rev.	1888	Thoughts on Everlasting Death	Digby, Long and Co.
106.—Tupman, W.	1899	The Faith or Heresy ?	Digby, Long and Co.
107.—Urquhart, John, Rev.	1899	New Biblical Guide	S. W. Partridge.
108.—Webb, A. B., Bishop, D.D.	1879	The Presence and Office of the Holy Spirit	Skeffington.
109.—Welldon, J. E. C., Bishop	1898	The Hope of Immortality	Seeley and Co.
110.—Wellhausen, Professor	1891	History of Israel and Judah (third edition)	Adam and Charles Black.
111.—Whately, E., Archbishop	1829	The Future State, by a Country Pastor	B. Fellowes.
112.—White, Edward, Rev.	1846	Life in Christ	Elliot Stock.
113.—Williamson, A., Rev., B.D.	1890	The Intermediate State	Wells Gardner, Darton and Co.

AUTHOR.	YEAR.	TITLE.	PUBLISHER.
1.—Barnes, Albert, Rev., of Philadelphia	1854	Practical Sermons	T. and T. Clark, Edinburgh.
2.—Bland, J.	1884	The Keys of Hell: Who holds them and why? and when will they be used?	Robert Roberts, Birmingham.
3.—Brown, J. Baldwin, Rev. Minister of Brixton Independent Church	1875	Doctrine of Annihilation in the Light of the Gospel of Love.	Kegan Paul.
4.—Burnet, Gilbert, Bishop	1845	An Exposition of the XXXIX. Articles.	
5.—Cheever, H. T., Rev., D.D.	1893	Biblical Eschatology	Lee and Shepard, Boston.
6.—Dewes, Alfred, Rev., M.A.	1866	A Plea for a New Translation of the Scriptures	Longmans, Green and Co.
7.—Du Bose, W. P., S.T.D., Introduction by Right Rev. Thomas F. Gailor, D.D.	1897	The Ecumenical Councils	T. and T. Clark, Edinburgh.
8.—		Encyclopædia Britannica, vol. vi. "The Westminster Confession of Faith."	

ADDITIONAL AUTHORS QUOTED—*Continued*

AUTHOR.	YEAR.	TITLE.	PUBLISHER.
9.—	1825	Formularies of Faith put forth by Authority during the Reign of Henry VIII.	Clarendon Press, Oxford.
10.—Froude, J. A., M.A. ..	1858	History of England, vol. iii.	Longmans, Green and Co.
11.—Gilbert, Levi, Rev. ..	1903	Sidelights on Immortality	Fleming H. Revell, Chicago.
12.—Gurney, A., Rev., M.A.	1888	Our Catholic Inheritance in the Larger Hope	Kegan Paul.
13.—H., P., and R.	1896	Is Eternal Torment Scriptural ?	
14.—Hardwick, Charles, Archdeacon, B.D.	1884	History of the Articles of Religion	George Bell and Sons.
15.—	1859	The Two Books of Homilies appointed to be Read in Churches	Oxford University Press.
	1563	First published.	
16.—Hopkins, Samuel, Rev., D.D.	1852	The Works of Samuel Hopkins, vol. ii.	Doctrinal Tract and Book Society, Boston.
17.—Milman, Henry Hart, Dean, D.D.	1855	History of Latin Christianity	John Murray.
18.—Murdock, James, D.D., revised by James Seaton Reid, D.D.	1848	Mosheim's Institutes of Ecclesiastical History (twelfth edition)	Ward, Lock and Co.

AUTHOR.	YEAR.	TITLE.	PUBLISHER.
19.—Neal	1811	History of the Puritans.	
20.—Oxenham, F. N., Rev., D.D.	1878	Catholic Eschatology and Universalism (second edition)	W. H. Allen and Co.
21.—O. I.	1568	Switzerland Reformed Church: A Confession of Fayth The Confession of Helvetia.	H. Wykes, London.
22.—Percival, H. R., Rev., M.A., D.D.	1900	Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church, vol. xiv. The Seven Ecumenical Councils	James Parker, Oxford.
23.—Pettingell, J. H., Rev.	1881	1. Bible Terminology Relative to the Future Life	Bible Banner Association, Philadelphia.
	1882	2. The Life Everlasting	
24.—Plumptre, E. H., Dean, D.D.	1881	Ecclesiastes, or the Preacher	University Press, Cambridge.
25.—Pusey, E. B., Rev., D.D.	1864	Sermon on Matthew xxv. 46	J. H. and James Parker, Oxford.
26.—Reimensnyder, J. B., Rev.	1887	Doom Eternal: The Bible and Church Doctrine of Everlasting Punishment	Funk and Wagnalls, Chicago.

ADDITIONAL AUTHORS QUOTED—*Continued*

AUTHOR.	YEAR.	TITLE.	PUBLISHER.
27.—Rivington	1865	The Annual Register: A Review of Public Events at Home and Abroad for the Year 1864	Rivingtons.
28.—Roberts, R., Rev. ..	1883	Everlasting Punishment, not Eternal Torments	R. Roberts, Birmingham.
29.—Rogers, Henry, Professor	1857	Selections from the Correspondence of R. E. H. Greyson	Longmans, Green and Co.
30.—Snell, B. J., Rev., M.A., B.Sc. (Lond.).	1903	Sermons on Immortality	Arthur H. Stockwell.
31.—Stebbing, Henry, Rev., M.A.	1836	The Cabinet Cyclopædia: "The Reformation"	Longmans, Green and Co.
32.—Tinling, J. F. B., Rev.	1881	The Promise of Life, and the Doctrine of Everlasting Punishment	Elliot Stock.
33.—Taylor, Isaac	1852	Restoration of Belief	Macmillan, Cambridge.
34.—Westbury, Lord Chancellor	1865	Judgment in Appeal of Rev. H. Bristow Wilson (see Rivington)	Rivingtons.
35.—Wordsworth, Charles, D.D., Bishop of Lincoln	1875	The Old Testament, with Notes and Introduction Book of the Prophet Isaiah	Rivingtons.

Buckle, Henry

237 R
B 856

The after life.

1915 31 My	Rev. W.S. Bishop	July 3			

64433

237R
B856